



Article (refereed) - postprint

This is the peer reviewed version of the following article:

Smith-Martin, Chris M.; Muscarella, Robert; Ankori-Karlinsky, Roi; Delzon, Sylvain; Farrar, Samuel L.; Salva-Sauri, Melissa; Thompson, Jill; Zimmerman, Jess K.; Uriarte, María. 2022. **Hurricanes increase tropical forest vulnerability to drought.** *New Phytologist*, 235 (3). 1005-1017, which has been published in final form at <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/nph.18175</u>

This article may be used for non-commercial purposes in accordance with Wiley Terms and Conditions for Use of Self-Archived Versions.

© 2020 John Wiley & Sons Ltd

This version is available at https://nora.nerc.ac.uk/id/eprint/532942

Copyright and other rights for material on this site are retained by the rights owners. Users should read the terms and conditions of use of this material at https://nora.nerc.ac.uk/policies.html#access.

This document is the authors' final manuscript version of the journal article, incorporating any revisions agreed during the peer review process. There may be differences between this and the publisher's version. You are advised to consult the publisher's version if you wish to cite from this article.

The definitive version is available at https://onlinelibrary.wilev.com/

Contact UKCEH NORA team at noraceh@ceh.ac.uk

The NERC and UKCEH trademarks and logos ('the Trademarks') are registered trademarks of NERC and UKCEH in the UK and other countries, and may not be used without the prior written consent of the Trademark owner.

1	Title: HURRICANES INCREASE TROPICAL FOREST VULNERABILITY TO
2	DROUGHT
3	Chris M. Smith-Martin ¹ , Robert Muscarella ² , Roi Ankori-Karlinsky ¹ , Sylvain Delzon ³ , Samuel
4	L. Farrar ² , Melissa Salva-Sauri ^{1,4} , Jill Thompson ⁵ , Jess K. Zimmerman ⁴ , and María Uriarte ¹
5	
6	¹ Department of Ecology, Evolution and Environmental Biology, Columbia University, 1200
7	Amsterdam Avenue, New York, NY 10027, USA.
8	² Plant Ecology and Evolution, Evolutionary Biology Centre, Uppsala University, Uppsala 752

- 9 36, Sweden
- 10 ³ Université Bordeaux, INRA, BIOGECO, Pessac 33615, France
- ⁴Department of Environmental Sciences, University of Puerto Rico, San Juan, Puerto
- 12 Rico 00925, USA.
- ⁵UK Centre for Ecology & Hydrology Bush Estate, Penicuik, Midlothian EH26 0QB, UK.
- 14

15 Author for correspondence:

- 16 Chris M. Smith-Martin
- 17 Telephone: +1 651 354 3528
- 18 Email: chrismsmithmartin@gmail.com
- 19

20 ORCID and Twitter accounts

- 21 Chris M. Smith-Marin ORCID: 0000-0002-6557-1432; Twitter: @CMSmithMartin
- 22 Robert Muscarella ORCID: 0000-0003-3039-1076; Twitter: @BobMuscarella
- 23 Roi Ankori-Karlinsky ORCID: 0000-0002-8277-8136
- 24 Sylvain Delzon ORCID: 0000-0003-3442-1711; Twitter: @SDelzon
- 25 Samuel L. Farrar Twitter: @SamwiseFarrar
- 26 Jess K. Zimmerman Twitter: @JesterKZ
- 27
- Word count:
- 29 Introduction: 1313
- 30 Materials and Methods: 1761
- 31 Results: 842

32	Discussion: 1840
33	Acknowledgements: 90
34	5 figures (in color: Fig. 1, Fig. 2, Fig. 3, Fig 4, Fig. 5)
35	1 table (Table 1)
36	1 file of supporting information
37	
38	
39	
40	
41	Summary
42	• Rapid changes in climate and disturbance regimes, including droughts and hurricanes, are
43	likely to influence tropical forests, but our understanding of the compound effects of
44	disturbances on forest ecosystems is extremely limited. Filling this knowledge gap is
45	necessary to elucidate the future of these ecosystems under a changing climate.
46	• We examined the relationship between hurricane response (damage, mortality, and
47	resilience) and four hydraulic traits of 13 dominant woody species in a wet tropical forest
48	subject to periodic hurricanes.
49	• Species with high resistance to embolisms (low P ₅₀ values) and higher safety margins
50	(SM_{P50}) were more resistant to immediate hurricane mortality and breakage, whereas
51	species with higher hurricane resilience (rapid post-hurricane growth) had high
52	capacitance and P50 values and low SMP50. During 26-years of post-hurricane recovery,
53	we found a decrease in community weighted mean values for traits associated with
54	greater drought resistance (leaf turgor loss point, P50, SMP50) and an increase in
55	capacitance, which has been linked with lower drought resistance.
56	Hurricane damage favors slow-growing, drought-tolerant species while post-hurricane
57	high resource conditions favor acquisitive, fast-growing but drought-vulnerable species,
58	increasing forest productivity at the expense of drought tolerance and leading to higher
59	overall forest vulnerability to drought.
60	

- 61 Keywords: coastal tropical forests; cyclonic storm; Hurricane Hugo; forest succession; P₅₀
- 62 xylem optical vulnerability curves; plant-climate interactions; plant hydraulics; tropical trees and
- 63 palms
- 64
- 65

66 INTRODUCTION

67 Rapid changes in climate and disturbance regimes are likely to influence tropical forests 68 (Bonan, 2008; Chazdon, 2008; McDowell, N. G. et al., 2020). Most models predict stronger 69 droughts across large areas in the tropics, including the Amazon (Joetzjer et al., 2013), Central 70 America, and the Caribbean (Neelin et al., 2006; Herrera & Ault, 2017). Increases in tree 71 mortality and growth declines have been associated with severe drought across several tropical 72 forests (Chazdon et al., 2005; Uriarte, et al., 2016a; Leitold et al., 2018; Powers et al., 2020). 73 Given that these ecosystems account for the majority of terrestrial aboveground biomass (Pan et 74 al., 2011), declines in productivity coupled with high tree mortality could lead to large carbon 75 losses to the atmosphere, turning tropical forests from a carbon sink to a source, and creating a 76 positive feedback to climate warming (Gatti et al., 2014; Brienen et al., 2015; Hubau et al., 77 2020). Beyond its effects on precipitation, climate change is also altering the frequency and/or 78 intensity of disturbances, including fires, cyclonic storms, insect outbreaks, and floods (Dale et 79 al., 2001; Seidl et al., 2017; DOE, 2018; Brando et al., 2019; Knutson et al., 2019). 80 Understanding the compound effects of droughts and more severe natural disturbance on 81 tropical forests is necessary to elucidate the future of these ecosystems under a changing 82 climate.

83 Cyclonic storms (known as hurricanes in the Atlantic and typhoons or cyclones 84 elsewhere) represent the dominant natural disturbance in many coastal tropical and sub-tropical 85 forests in the Atlantic coastal regions of Central and South America, through the Caribbean, Gulf 86 Coast region, the Indian subcontinent, Southeast Asia, Indo-Malaysia, and northern Australia 87 (Boose et al., 1994; Everham & Brokaw, 1996; Lugo, 2008; Ibanez et al., 2019). Since these 88 storms derive their energy from ocean heat and sea surface temperatures have increased in the 89 North Atlantic during the past decades, maximum wind speeds and rainfall rates are expected to 90 rise and storms to intensify more rapidly (Webster, 2005; Knutson et al., 2010; Balaguru et al., 91 2018). The expected shifts in the frequency and intensity of tropical storms, and their potential 92 interaction with other climate change stressors such as severe droughts, have profound 93 implications for the long-term resilience of tropical forests in these regions. Yet our 94 understanding of the compound effects of severe droughts and hurricanes on forests is extremely 95 limited (Beard et al., 2005).

96 Forests undergoing post-hurricane disturbance may be particularly vulnerable to climate 97 stress from drought. Hurricanes cause widespread crown damage and mortality, opening up the 98 canopy and leading to rapid post-successional dynamics and community re-organization 99 (Vandermeer, 2000; Lugo, 2008; Tanner et al., 2014; Imbert, 2018; Uriarte et al., 2019). Canopy 100 damage results in elevated light and temperature in the understory (Comita et al., 2009; Vargas 101 et al., 2009), intensifying drought impacts. The high resource conditions that typically follow 102 hurricane disturbance result in large increases in seedling establishment and tree growth, 103 particularly for light-demanding species (Guzman-Grajales & Walker, 1991; Burslem et al., 104 2000; Uriarte et al., 2004; Uriarte et al., 2005; Comita et al., 2009). As a result, recovering 105 forests contain a greater proportion of pioneer and fast-growing tree species, whose 106 physiological characteristics may make them more vulnerable to drought (Bazzaz & Pickett, 107 1980; Phillips et al., 2010; Lohbeck et al., 2013; Greenwood et al., 2017). Competition for 108 water, which may intensify under drought, is particularly high in regrowing forests as a result of 109 fast growth rates of understory vegetation, high stem densities, and dominance of water-110 demanding species (Uriarte et al., 2016b). Despite these potential vulnerabilities, research on the 111 factors that determine how drought may influence post-hurricane ecosystem recovery is lacking 112 (Anderson-Teixeira et al., 2013; Uriarte et al., 2016; Bretfeld et al., 2018; McDowell, N. G. et 113 al., 2020).

114 The fate of tropical forests exposed to severe droughts and hurricanes depends on variation in species' responses to these events. Evidence suggests that forests subject to periodic 115 116 hurricane disturbance may have a greater proportion of species with traits (e.g., shorter height, 117 high resistance to damage) that have been selected to withstand these repetitive large-scale 118 disturbances (Boose et al., 2004; Griffith et al., 2008; Ibanez et al., 2019). Nevertheless, tree 119 species differ in their susceptibility to disturbance by a wind of a given intensity and the nature 120 of the damage they sustain (*i.e.*, resistance), as well in their recovery from wind disturbance, at 121 both the individual plant level through repair of damage, and at the population level through 122 reproduction, seedling establishment and growth response to enhanced light availability (*i.e.*, 123 resilience) (Boucher et al., 1994; Canham et al., 2010; Uriarte et al., 2009; Walker, 1991; 124 Zimmerman et al., 1994, Uriarte et al. 2019). Variability among species in their ability to resist 125 wind damage may not always align with life history classifications based on light-use strategies 126 (Zimmerman et al., 1994; Lugo & Scatena, 1996; Uriarte et al., 2004; Uriarte et al., 2012;

127 Uriarte et al., 2019). Although species with denser wood (Uriarte et al., 2019) and deeper root 128 systems (Gresham *et al.*, 1991) generally suffer less damage and mortality, there are many 129 exceptions to these patterns (Uriarte et al., 2019). Dense wood has also been associated with 130 greater drought tolerance (Powers et al., 2020; Liang et al., 2021), suggesting that resistance to 131 hurricanes and drought tolerance may be aligned across species. However, the fast-growing 132 light-demanding, hurricane resilient species are expected to possess a set of traits that make them 133 more vulnerable to drought. Species with strategies associated with greater resource 134 acquisitiveness that dominate post-disturbance recovery tend to have traits associated with 135 drought avoidance (high capacitance) and higher growth rates, whereas conservative species 136 favor greater drought tolerance (*i.e.*, low leaf turgor loss point, high resistance to xylem 137 embolisms, and larger safety margins) at the expense of lower growth (Oliveira et al., 2021). 138 Forests recovering from hurricanes are expected to favor resource acquisitive species over 139 conservative ones due to high light conditions in the understory (Carreño-Rocabado et al., 2012; 140 Subedi et al., 2019), potentially leading to an increase in the overall level of forest susceptibility 141 to drough. Yet species-level responses to drought, and how they align with their responses to 142 disturbances are extremely variable and poorly understood (Umaña & Arellano, 2021). 143 Here we examine the relationship between drought avoidance and tolerance with 144 hurricane resistance (resistant to immediate hurricane mortality and stem break) and resilience 145 (rapid post-hurricane growth) for 12 common and broadly distributed tree species and one

dominant palm species in a forest in El Yunque National Forest in northeastern Puerto Rico. The
forest is subject to repeated hurricane disturbance with a return interval of approximately 50
years for severe storms (category 3-4 in the Saffir-Simpson scale) (Boose et al. 2004). After 57
years without a major storm, two severe storms, Hurricane Hugo in 1989 and Georges in 1998
struck the forest. We ask the following questions and test associated hypotheses:

Q1. Do resistance to hurricane damage (hurricane-induced mortality and stem damage) and drought tolerance (embolism resistance and vulnerability to hydraulic failure) constitute independent axis of plant function? We expect species that are more resistant to immediate hurricane damage to also be more resistant to embolism and hydraulic failure.

Q2. Do resilience to hurricane damage (high post-hurricane growth) and drought
avoidance (high capacitance) constitute independent axes of plant function? We expect species

that are more resilient to hurricanes and grow more rapidly during post-hurricane recovery toalso be more vulnerable to embolisms and hydraulic failure and possess higher capacitance.

Q3. How does forest level vulnerability to drought change over 26 years of posthurricane recovery? We hypothesize that: 1) High light conditions in post-hurricane recovery will favor acquisitive fast-growing, drought-avoiding species (high capacitance), with leaves that wilt under lower drought stress (high turgor loss point— Ψ_{tlp}), are more vulnerable to embolisms, and hydraulic failure, thus increasing forest productivity at the expense of drought tolerance. We hypothesize that this change will lead to greater forest vulnerability to drought as the forest recovers from disturbance.

166

167 MATERIALS AND METHODS

168 Study site and species data

169 This study was conducted at the Luquillo Experimental Forest (LEF) in northeastern Puerto

170 Rico. The LEF is an evergreen forest classified as subtropical wet forest in the Holdridge life

171 zone system (Ewel & Whitmore, 1973) with a mean annual temperature of 25.2°C and mean

annual rainfall is 3,500 mm. Soils are from volcanic origin and are classified as Oxisols and

173 Ultisols (Soil Survey Staff 1995). Although land use was extensive when the US Forest Service

acquired the land in 1932, the majority of the forest is considered old-growth, particularly at

elevations >350 m. These forests have a well-documented history of hurricane damage, with a

176 return interval of approximately 50 years for severe storms (category 3-4 in the Saffir-Simpson

177 scale) (Boose et al., 2004), although hurricane activity exhibits oscillations linked to Atlantic

178 Multidecadal Variability (Goldenberg et al., 2001). Early in the last century, in 1928 and 1932,

179 major hurricanes struck the LEF. After 57 years without a major storm, two severe storms, Hugo

180 in 1989, a category 3 storm with winds up to 166 km hr^{-1} and Georges in 1998, also a category 3

181 storm with winds up to 144 km hr⁻¹, struck the forest. The compound effects of these two storms

- 182 led to rapid, post-hurricane dynamics (Uriarte et al., 2005; Uriarte et al., 2009; Zimmerman et
- 183 al., 2010; Hogan et al., 2016; Heartsill Scalley, 2017). Average canopy height is 30 m but
- 184 hurricane damage can lead to canopy height losses ranging between 5 and 10 m (Brokaw &

185 Grear, 1991; Leitold et al., 2021).

For our study, we selected 12 tree species and one palm species that encompass many of the dominant species at this site (Table 1; Thompson *et al.*, 2002). Demographic and immediate

188 hurricane damage data was collected in the Luquillo Forest Dynamics Plot (LFDP; 18°20' N, 189 65°49'N; Thompson et al., 2002). The LFDP is a 16-ha forest plot located near El Verde Field 190 Station in the LEF with an elevation range from 333 – 423 m. The plot was established in 1989 191 and censused at approximately 5-year intervals starting in 1990 through 2016 using standard 192 protocols (Condit, 1998). Briefly, all stems with diameter at breast height (DBH) of ≥ 1 cm are 193 mapped, measured, and identified to species. In each census, new stems are added, stems are re-194 measured and their status (alive/dead) is updated. Prior to 1934 parts of the lower elevation forest 195 of the LDFP (<350m) were subjected to light logging and agriculture, but the forest structure and 196 canopy cover had recovered by the time H. Hugo made landfall (Thompson et al., 2002). 197 The first LFDP census in 1990 included an initial survey of all stems ≥ 10 cm DBH to 198 prevent loss of data due to decomposition of trees killed or damaged by Hurricane Hugo 199 (Zimmerman et al., 1994; Thompson et al., 2002). During this census, immediate hurricane 200 mortality and damage (stem break) were also recorded (Zimmerman et al., 1994; Thompson et 201 al., 2002; Canham et al., 2010). Surveys of all stems ≥ 1 and ≤ 10 cm in DBH in the first census 202 were conducted from 1990–1993, and capture post-successional recruitment. For this reason, we 203 only use stems ≥ 10 cm DBH to calculate comparable basal area across all censuses (Q3). 204 However, we use all stems ≥ 1 cm DBH to calculate growth rates (Q2). As the forest was 205 recovering from Hurricane Hugo, Hurricane Georges struck Puerto Rico in September 1998 with 206 winds up to 144 km hr-1 (category 3; Miner Solá, 2000) but it was estimated to be a category 2 207 storm by the time it reached the forest. The effects of this second hurricane on the LFDP forest 208 area were less acute than those of Hugo (Uriarte et al., 2019) and it had a limited effect on forest 209 structure and composition (Uriarte et al., 2009; Uriarte et al., 2019). Basal area was estimated to average 36.7 m² ha⁻¹ at the time of Hurricane Hugo, 30.85 m² ha⁻¹ at the time Georges struck. 210 and 38.37 m² ha⁻¹ in 2016. Density of stems \geq 10 cm DBH has remained stable ca. 1,000 stems 211 ha⁻¹ while density of small stems (1-10 cm DBH) ranged between 6,841 in 1993 to 2,444 stems 212 ha⁻¹ in 2016, reflecting continuous stem thinning through post-hurricane succession (Fig. S1). 213 214 The forest has not been censused since the passage of Hurricane Maria in 2017 so we use census 215 data collected through 2016. Altogether, our 13 target species represent $\sim 50 - 60$ % of the basal 216 area of the LFDP depending on the census (Table 1). For each of the 13 species, we calculated 217 two metrics of growth for the first five years after the hurricane: annual absolute growth 218 quantified as the increments in tree DBH between the initial and the first post-hurricane census

divided by census interval and relative growth, calculated as absolute growth divided by theinitial tree DBH. We also calculated relative growth in the same way using basal area instead of

221 DBH.

222

223 Hydraulic traits

224 For each species, we measured hydraulic traits on 5 to 13 mature canopy trees (Table S1) for a 225 total of 123 trees measured. We collected canopy branches that were >1.5 m long with a pole 226 pruner, immediately sealed branches in large plastic bags with wet paper towels, placed the 227 branches in large black plastic garbage cans filled with water as soon as possible, recut the 228 branches under water, and covered them with black plastic bags to minimize transpiration until 229 further processing. At the end of each collecting trip, we immediately took samples to the 230 laboratory where we conducted the hydraulic measurements. All hydraulic measurements were 231 conducted between July 2019 and August 2020.

232

233 Leaf turgor loss point and leaf capacitance

234 We characterized leaf turgor loss point and leaf water storage capacity using pressure-235 volume curves. To do so, we used the bench dry method as described by Tyree and Hammel 236 (1972) and the protocol developed by Sack and Pasquet-Kok (2011). We let the branch rehydrate 237 overnight, excised a mature fully expanded healthy leaf from the branch with a sharp razor blade, 238 and immediately sealed it in a Whirl-Pak bag. As leaves dehydrated, we periodically measured 239 water potential (Ψ) with a Pressure Chamber Instrument (PMS Instrument Company, Albany, 240 OR, USA) and leaf weight. We continued to measure the leaves until $1/\Psi$ and water loss became 241 linear. Finally, we scanned the leaves, then oven-dried them at 65°C for at least 72 h and 242 weighed them to obtain leaf dry mass. We calculated leaf area with ImageJ software (National 243 Institute of Health, New York, NY, USA) and used the Sack and Pasquet-Kok (2011) 244 spreadsheet tool to construct pressure-volume curves from which we extracted leaf turgor loss 245 point (Ψ_{tlp}) and leaf capacitance at full turgor (C_{ft}).

246

247 *Leaf optical vulnerability curves*

We used the optical vulnerability technique to estimate xylem embolism accumulation in leaves (Brodribb *et al.*, 2016). Briefly, for each branch immediately after it was brought back

250 from the field, we secured a leaf inside a custom-built three-dimensional printed clamp

251 (OpenSourceOV—OSOV) fitted with a small 8-megapixel Raspberry Pi camera and light-

emitting diodes operated by a Raspberry Pi microcomputer. Once the leaf was secured in the clamps, we took a picture every two minutes of a 4 cm² leaf area until no embolism events were

recorded for at least 12 h (~72–96 h depending on the species). As the branch dehydrated, we used a stem psychrometer (ICT International, Armidale, Australia) to record water potential every 10 min. To attach the stem psychrometer, we removed a small section of bark from the branch and clamped the psychrometer to the exposed xylem and created an air-tight seal with

258 Parafilm sealing film.

259 We used ImageJ to analyze the pictures of leaf embolisms following Brodribb et al. 260 (2016). We stacked all the images and converted them to 8-bit grayscale with pixel values 261 ranging from black (0) to white (255). Each image was subtracted from the next image in the 262 sequence to reveal embolisms that appear as changes in light intensity. Embolism accumulation 263 in each leaf was quantified as a cumulative total of embolized pixels in each image divided by 264 the total number of embolized pixels in the fully dried sample. To determine the water potential 265 (Ψ_x) at the time of image capture, we fitted a linear regression to the Ψ_x over time and extracted 266 the values at which 50% of the cumulative embolisms had occurred (P₅₀; Fig. S2-S4). We also 267 measured xylem vulnerability in stems on the same branches at the same time as we measured 268 the leaves (Fig. S2-S4), however, we only use vulnerability curves from leaves because we 269 were unable, due to their stem anatomy, to measure stem xylem vulnerability for Cecropia 270 schreberiana, which has thick hollow stems and the palm, Prestoea acuminata var. montana. For 271 the 11 species for which we were able to measure P_{50} in both leaves and stems, there was no 272 significant difference between the two (Fig. S2-S4). Full details of the procedure, including an 273 overview of the technique, image processing, as well as ImageJ scripts, are available at 274 http://www.opensourceov.org.

275

276 (Ψ_{tlp}), which is a common proxy for stomatal closure (Brodribb *et al.*, 2003; Rodriguez-

277 Dominguez et al., 2016; Martin-StPaul et al., 2017; Ziegler et al., 2019), and the water potential

at which 50% of total embolisms had occurred as defined by Martin-St Paul et al. 2017:

- 279
- 280

10

 $SM_{P50} = \Psi_{tlp} - P_{50}$

We calculated safety margins (SM_{P50}) as the difference between leaf turgor loss point

281 Data analysis

282

We used linear regressions to evaluate if there were associations between species P_{50} and HSM and the metrics of hurricane response: hurricane damage (mortality and broken stems) and posthurricane absolute and relative growth. To evaluate if there was a tradeoff between storage of water in the tissue and embolism resistant and vulnerability to hydraulic failure, we fitted linear regressions of species leaf capacitance ($C_{\rm ft}$) vs. P₅₀ and SM_{P50}.

To assess changes in forest level drought responses during post-hurricane recovery, we calculated community-weighted mean (CWM) trait values for all of the species with measured hydraulic traits for each census under the assumption that these traits are static through time. We calculated CWM values for each trait *t* and each census *c* as: $CWM_{tc} = \sum_{i=1}^{S} a_{ic} \times t_i$, where *a_{ic}* is the relative basal area of each species *i* for census *c* based on the total basal area of the focal species. To evaluate how the individual CWM traits changed among censuses, we calculated the percent of relative change between each census *c* as:

295

$$[(CWM_c - CWM_{c-1}) \div CWM_{c-1}] \times 100.$$

We performed all analyses using R statistical software (Version 4.0.2; R Core Team, 2020).

298 **RESULTS**

299 Overall, our study species exhibited substantial variation in hydraulic traits. Turgor loss point 300 (Ψ_{tlp}) , a proxy for leaf wilting point and stomatal closure, had significant variation across species (Fig. 1a; Table S2,S3). Cecropia schreberiana had the highest Ψ_{tlp} values, meaning that this 301 302 species wilts at a higher water potential while Casearia arborea wilted at the lowest water 303 potential. Species also exhibited large variation in water storage capacity in leaves (Fig. 1b; 304 Table S2,S3), C. schreberiana and Cordia boringuensis had the highest capacitance followed by 305 the palm, Prestoea acuminata var. montana. C. arborea, Dacryodes excelsa, Drypetes glauca, 306 and *Micropholis guyanensis* had some of the lowest water storage capacitance. Resistance to 307 embolism formation (P₅₀) was also highly variable across species, with C. schreberiana, D. 308 excelsa, and Alchornea latifolia at the lowest range and C. arborea and M. guyanensis at the 309 highest end overall (Fig. 1c; Table S2,S3). Species safety margins (SMP50) also exhibited a broad 310 range of variation, with significant differences among species (Fig. 1d; Table S2,S3). C. 311 schreberiana was the only species that exhibited a slightly negative SM_{P50}, suggesting that it is

312 particularly vulnerable to severe drought. Several other species also had very low SM_{P50},

- 313 indicating that they operate at thresholds that are very close to hydraulic failure, making them
- 314 highly susceptible to droughts. Specifically, A. latifolia, Cyrilla racemiflora, D. excelsa, Inga
- 315 laurina, Ocotea leucoxylon, P. acuminata var. montana, and Sloanea berteroana all had SMP50 <
- 316 1 MPa while *C. arborea*, *C. borinquensis*, *D. glauca*, and *Tabebuia heterophylla* had SM_{P50} > 1
- 317 MPa, and *M. guyanensis* had the highest SM_{P50} of 2.6 MPa (Fig. 1d).

318 Across species, there was a trade-off between capacitance and P₅₀ (Fig S5a; Table S4) 319 and SM_{P50} (Fig. S5b; Table S4). Drought-avoiding species (*i.e.*, higher capacitance) were also 320 more vulnerable to embolisms (*i.e.*, higher P₅₀) and hydraulic failure (*i.e.*, lower SM_{P50}) and thus, 321 less drought-tolerance, while the more embolism and drought-tolerance species had lower 322 capacitance. There was an association between vulnerability to hurricane damage and resistance 323 to embolisms and hydraulic failure. Species that had more negative P₅₀ values also experienced a 324 lower percentage of immediate mortality (Fig. 2a) and stem breaks (Fig. 2b) during Hurricane 325 Hugo. Paralleling patterns observed for P50, again species that had higher SMP50 also had lower 326 percentage of hurricane-induced immediate mortality (Fig. 2c) and stem break (Fig. 2d). In the 327 case of hurricane resilience, we found the opposite trend. There was a trade-off between 328 hurricane resilience and resistance to embolisms and hydraulic failure. The species that had less 329 negative P₅₀ values also had the highest absolute and relative growth (Fig. **3a,b**; Fig. S6a) during 330 the first five years after Hurricane Hugo and these hurricane resilient species also had low SMP50 331 (Fig. 3c,d; Fig. S6b). However, we did not find this association between growth and capacitance $(R^2 = 0.01, p = 0.806)$. For example, C. schreberiana became more dominant during post-332 333 hurricane recovery had the highest P50 narrowest SMP50, and Prestoea acuminata var. montana 334 which had the highest hurricane resilience and eventually became the most dominant species 335 during post-hurricane recovery also had high P50 and low SMP50 (Fig. 4; Table S5). We also 336 found an association between percentage of hurricane-induced immediate mortality and absolute 337 (Fig. S7a) and relative growth (Fig. S7b).

In the first five years following Hurricane Hugo, basal area of stems ≥ 10 cm DBH of most of the target species decreased or stayed the same (Fig. 4; Table S5). However, after 10 to 15 years of post-hurricane recovery there was an increase in the basal area of many species. Three species in particular had very high hurricane resilience, *C. schreberiana*, *D. excelsa*, and *P. acuminata* var. *montana*, with dramatic increases in basal area that exceeded pre-hurricane

- 343 levels 15 to 20 years after the hurricane. After 26 years of post-hurricane recovery, the basal area
- 344 of two of these species *C. schreberiana* and *P. acuminata* var. *montana* declined while *D.*
- 345 *excelsa* continued to increase (Fig. 4; Table S6).
- 346 Hurricane disturbance increased forest susceptibility to drought. Over the 26 years of 347 post-hurricane recovery, CWM trait values associated with drought avoidance (capacitance) 348 increased whereas CWM trait values associated with drought tolerance (P₅₀ and SM_{P50}) declined. 349 CWM for leaf turgor loss point (Ψ_{tlp}) decreased by ~ 2.5% during the first 10 years post-350 disturbance, then leveled off, and started to increase during the last census interval (2011-2016; 351 Fig. 5a; Table S6). CWM capacitance (Cft) increased until it reached a peak in 2005, with a total 352 increase of $\sim 12.5\%$ over the 15-year period, and then started to decrease during the last census 353 (Fig. 5b; Table S6). CWM P_{50} decreased by ~ 11% during the 26-years of post-hurricane 354 recovery, although it leveled off and even started to increase by 2016 (Fig. 5c; Table S6). The 355 most pronounced post-hurricane change in our analyses was CWM hydraulic safety margins 356 (SMP50), with a 45% total decrease over the first 20 years post-hurricane, although it had leveled 357 off between the last two censuses (Fig. 5d; Table S6).
- 358

359 **DISCUSSION**

360 We examined the relationship between hurricane resistance and resilience and hydraulic traits of 361 13 dominant woody species in a wet tropical forest subject to periodic hurricane disturbance. We 362 found a large range in variation in hydraulic traits within the community and a trade-off between 363 capacitance and two metrics of drought tolerance, P₅₀ and SM_{P50}. Species that were more 364 resistant to embolisms (P₅₀) and hydraulic failure (SM_{P50}) were also less vulnerable to immediate 365 hurricane damage (mortality and stem break), whereas species that had higher hurricane 366 resilience and regenerated rapidly after the hurricane had hydraulic traits that made them more 367 vulnerable to drought (high P₅₀ values and low SM_{P50}). Over the first five years of post-hurricane 368 recovery, we found a trade-off between growth and hydraulic safety, confirming a recently 369 proposed trade-off between growth and SM_{P50} that had not been tested in other forests outside 370 the Brazilian Amazon (Oliveira et al., 2021). In particular, three species (C. schreberiana, D. 371 *excelsa*, and *P. acuminata* var. *montana*) with hydraulic traits linked to greater vulnerability to 372 drought also exhibited high hurricane resilience, with dramatic increases in basal area that 373 exceeded pre-hurricane levels. During 26-years of post-hurricane recovery, there was a decrease

in community weighted mean trait values associated with greater drought tolerance (Ψ_{tlp} , P₅₀,

375 SM_{P50}) and an increase in capacitance, a trait that has been linked with lower drought tolerance

376 (Christoffersen et al., 2016; Pivovaroff et al., 2018; Santiago et al., 2018; Oliveira et al., 2021).

377 Immediate hurricane damage in this forest favors slow-growing, drought-tolerant species.

378 However, the high resource conditions in the wake of a hurricane favors acquisitive, fast-

379 growing, drought-avoiding species that are more vulnerable to drought and hydraulic failure,

increasing forest productivity at the expense of potential higher forest vulnerability to drought.

381

382 Species exhibited large variation in hydraulic traits and a trade-off between drought avoidance383 and tolerance

384 Species within our community exhibited a large range of variation in embolism resistance 385 and hydraulic safety. We found over a five-fold difference in P50 values across species and SMP50 386 ranged from close to zero to around 2.5 MPa. Consistent with our findings, several studies have 387 observed a wide range in P₅₀ values within tropical forest communities elsewhere (Santiago et 388 al., 2018; Barros et al., 2019; Oliveira et al., 2019; Ziegler et al., 2019; Fontes et al., 2020; 389 Powers et al., 2020). The wide range in SMP50 indicates that not all the species within our 390 community function at the edge of their hydraulic capacity, a fact that does not support the 391 expectation that species should operate with narrow SM_{P50} to sustain CO₂ assimilation for as 392 long as possible before closing their stomata as water becomes more limited (Tyree & Sperry, 393 1988; Choat et al., 2012; Barros et al., 2019; Fontes et al., 2020). Although a growing number of 394 studies have found that wide SM_{P50} (1-5 MPa) are common within and across tropical forest 395 communities (Martin-StPaul et al., 2017; Benito Garzón et al., 2018; Barros et al., 2019; Ziegler 396 et al., 2019; Powers et al., 2020; Smith-Martin et al., 2020), eight of the 13 species we studied 397 had SM_{P50} < -1 MPa, indicating that the majority of species were operating close to their 398 maximum hydraulic capacity. C. schreberiana had slightly negative SMP50, which should be 399 further investigated by direct measurements of stomatal conductance in response to drought as 400 the expectation is that no embolism occurs before full stomatal closure has occurred (Creek et 401 al., 2020). Community-wide variation in turgor loss point was not as marked as for P₅₀. There 402 was only around a 1.5-fold difference in Ψ_{tlp} across species with 11 of our 13 species having Ψ_{tlp} 403 between -1.5 and -2 MPa suggesting greater convergence in this trait than embolism resistance 404 (over a five-fold difference in P_{50}). Our findings support the idea that the range in Ψ_{tlp} values is

405 lower than in P₅₀ and SM_{P50}. Ziegler *et al.* (2019) also found a range in $\Psi_{tlp} \sim -1.5 - -2.0$ MPa 406 further supporting that this trait is less variable at least in wetter forests.

407 Our findings imply a trade-off between drought avoidance (high capacitance) and 408 drought tolerance (high embolism resistance and large SMP50). Among the species we studied, 409 there was over a three-fold difference in leaf capacitance, and some of the species with the 410 greatest water storage in their leaves also had the least negative P₅₀ values and the lowest SM_{P50}. 411 This pattern was particularly marked in C. schreberiana, D. excelsa and P. acuminata var. 412 montana. Our results coincide with previous findings of a synthesis of data from multiple sites 413 which found a trade-off between capacitance and P₅₀ for tropical species (Christoffersen et al., 414 2016); here we show this pattern operates at the community level. Environmental conditions 415 after a hurricane favor fast-growing species that take advantage of the increase in light 416 availability (Guzman-Grajales & Walker, 1991; Burslem et al., 2000; Uriarte et al., 2004; Uriarte 417 et al., 2005; Comita et al., 2009). Fast-growing species also tend to have higher hydraulic 418 conductance (Markesteijn et al., 2011; McCulloh et al., 2012), which has been shown to be 419 correlated with capacitance (Santiago et al., 2018), potentially explaining the trade-off between 420 drought avoidance and drought tolerance in our forest.

421

422 Coordination between drought tolerance and hurricane resistance

423 We found that many of the species that suffered less immediate hurricane damage and 424 mortality were more drought tolerant. Wood density may be one of the species traits behind this association. Species resistance to hurricanes depends in part on the strength of the wood and 425 426 previous studies have found that hurricane-induced mortality and stem break are lower for 427 species with denser wood (Zimmerman et al., 1994; Uriarte et al., 2019). Previous research at 428 our study site found that Hurricane Hugo broke, uprooted, and killed fewer individuals of species 429 with dense wood, which could explain the association we found between drought and hurricane 430 resistance as densely wooded species have been shown to be more drought-tolerant (Powers et 431 al., 2020; Liang et al., 2021). Overall, this would mean that the direct effects of hurricanes and 432 drought favor the same group of old-growth, dense-wood, and drought-tolerant species.

433

434 Trade-off between drought tolerance and hurricane resilience

435 There was also a trade-off between post-hurricane growth and drought tolerance. 436 Specifically, we found a trade-off between stem diameter growth and the two metrics of drought 437 tolerance (P₅₀ and SM_{P50}) during the first five years after the hurricane. Even if immediate 438 hurricane damage favors more drought-tolerant species, rapid forest reorganization and high 439 post-hurricane growth benefit species that favor productivity over hydraulic safety. Oliveira et al. 440 (2021) argue that the fast-slow economic spectrum also applies to SM_{P50}, reasoning that species 441 with high SMP50 are not operating at maximum growth capacity to achieve higher safety, and 442 thus, have a lower return on their carbon investment making them slower growing and better 443 suited for low resource environments. In contrast, species with low SMP50 that operate at 444 maximum capacity have a high return on their carbon investment, leading to fast growth and a 445 competitive advantage in high resource environment. Our findings support the trade-off between 446 SMP50 and growth proposed by Oliveira et al. (2021), showing that this pattern applies to another 447 forest aside from the Brazilian Amazon where this idea was originally tested and also applies to 448 the trade-off between P₅₀ and growth. The degree to which this trade-off occurs in other tropical 449 forest ecosystems remains an open question.

450

451 Post-hurricane successional forests are more vulnerable to drought

452 Post-hurricane successional forests had high capacitance and low resistance to embolisms 453 and hydraulic failure. Assuming that traits remained stable over the 26-year period, we found a 454 decrease in community weighted mean trait values associated with drought tolerance (*i.e.*, Ψ_{tlp} , 455 P₅₀, and SM_{P50}) and an increase in capacitance. These shifts in forest level traits were most 456 pronounced during the first 15 years post-disturbance, and in general, leveled off or started to 457 revert 26-years after the hurricane. This increase in drought vulnerability was largely driven by 458 increases in three of the species with the most drought-vulnerable hydraulic traits, C. 459 schreberiana, D. excelsa, and P. acuminata var. montana, which dominate post-disturbance 460 communities (Uriarte et al., 2009; Uriarte et al., 2019). Umaña and Arellano (2021) et al. studied 461 six tree species at the same location in Puerto Rico and found that C. schreberiana was the 462 species that had the highest growth reduction during drought consistent with our findings. In 463 their study, D. excelsa was not affected by severe drought and responded favorably to moderate 464 droughts (Umaña & Arellano, 2021). D. excelsa is known to have extensive root grafting (Basnet et al., 1993) that could allow trees to redistribute water and make them less susceptible to 465

drought. Our findings could have consequences for forest post-disturbance dynamics since
forests in Puerto Rico and the Caribbean are subject to periodic hurricanes and our study site was
recently hit by another category 4 hurricane in 2017, H. María (Uriarte *et al.*, 2019). A warming
climate is expected to lead to more intense hurricanes (Knutson *et al.*, 2010; Balaguru *et al.*,
2018), which coupled with expected increases in extreme drought events (Khalyani *et al.*, 2015;
Ramseyer *et al.*, 2019) could drastically change dynamics and species composition of Caribbean
forests.

473 Compound disturbances can interact in ways that cannot be predicted by the study of a 474 single disturbance (Paine et al., 1998; Seidl et al., 2017), potentially altering forest species 475 composition and successional pathways (Wu & Loucks, 1995; McDowell, Nate G. et al., 2020). 476 Our results demonstrate that the temporal pattern of disturbance can play a key role in 477 determining forest vulnerability to drought. Hurricane disturbance favors species on the fast end 478 of the plant economic spectrum (Reich, 2014). Hurricane Hugo struck our study site in 1989 479 causing significant forest damage and favoring fast-growing but drought vulnerable pioneer 480 species. If this forest were to suffer a severe drought in the first few years after a recent 481 hurricane, this could result in rapid drought-induced mortality of hydraulically vulnerable species 482 and alter post-disturbance ecosystem successional trajectories (Beard et al., 2005). A previous 483 study at the site found a decline in tree growth during a 2015 drought, (Feng et al., 2018; 484 Schwartz et al. 2020), an effect that could potentially be exacerbated if the forest were in early 485 stages of recovery from severe hurricane damage. A substantial amount of research in temperate 486 forests has examined compound impacts of climate change stressors on ecosystems (Seidl et al., 487 2017; Gaiser et al., 2020). Disturbance can enhance resilience or increase vulnerability to other 488 global change factors (Turner, 2010). For example, drought exacerbates forest vulnerability to 489 bark beetle attacks (Negrón et al., 2009; Netherer et al., 2019) while insect damage can favor 490 species better adapted to warmer climates, reducing ecosystem vulnerability to subsequent 491 disturbances (Temperli et al., 2013). However much less is known about the effect of compound 492 disturbances on tropical forests, especially about the interaction between wind disturbance and 493 drought. Since climate change has multiple and varied effects on ecosystems, anticipating 494 whether a disturbance will change vulnerability to other environmental stressors is an issue 495 ecologists must address if they are going to forecast the future of the biosphere (Gaiser *et al.*, 496 2020).

498 ACKNOWLEDGMENTS 499 This work was supported by US National Science Foundation (NSF) DEB- 1753810 to M.U. and 500 R.M. Collection of tree demography data was supported by NSF DEB-1050957 to M.U. and 501 DEB-1546686 to the Department of Environmental Studies, University of Puerto Rico, working 502 with the International Institute of Tropical Forestry (USDA Forest Service), for the Luquillo 503 Long-Term Ecological Research Program. R.M. and S.L.F. were partly supported by grant 2019-504 03758 from the Swedish Research Council, Vetenskaprådet. We are indebted to the many 505 volunteers and El Verde technicians who collected the tree census data. 506 507 Author's contributions: C.M.S.-M and M.U. conceptualized the project. C.M.S.-M, R.M., R. 508 A.-K., S.D., S.L.F., M.S.-S., J.T., J.K.Z. and M.U collected the data. C.M.S.-M. and M.U. 509 analyzed the data. C.M.S.-M. and M.U. wrote the manuscript and R.M., R. A.-K., S.D., S.L.F., 510 M.S.-S., J.T. and J.K.Z. contributed to the final draft. 511 512 **Data availability statement:** All data that is not included in the main text and in the Supporting 513 Information can be found here: https://luquillo.lter.network/data-catalog/ 514 Luquillo Forest Dynamics Plot (LFDP) census data here: 515 https://portal.edirepository.org/nis/mapbrowse?packageid=knb-lter-lug.119.1545979 516 Tree damage by Hurricane Hugo in the LFDP here: 517 https://portal.edirepository.org/nis/mapbrowse?packageid=knb-lter-luq.57.583050 518 519 REFERENCES 520 Anderson-Teixeira KJ, Miller AD, Mohan JE, Hudiburg TW, Duval BD, DeLucia EH. 521 **2013.** Altered dynamics of forest recovery under a changing climate. *Global Change* 522 *Biology* **19**(7): 2001-2021. 523 Balaguru K, Foltz GR, Leung LR. 2018. Increasing magnitude of hurricane rapid 524 intensification in the Central and Eastern Tropical Atlantic. Geophysical Research Letters 525 **45**(9): 4238-4247. 526 Barros FdV, Bittencourt PRL, Brum M, Restrepo-Coupe N, Pereira L, Teodoro GS, 527 Saleska SR, Borma LS, Christoffersen BO, Penha D, et al. 2019. Hydraulic traits

- explain differential responses of Amazonian forests to the 2015 El Niño-induced drought. *New Phytologist* 223(3): 1253-1266.
- Basnet K, Scatena FN, Likens GE, Lugo AE. 1993. Ecological Consequences of Root Grafting
 in Tabonuco (*Dacryodes excelsa*) Trees in the Luquillo Experimental Forest, Puerto
 Rico. *Biotropica* 25(1): 28.
- Bazzaz FA, Pickett STA. 1980. Physiological Ecology of Tropical Succession: A Comparative
 Review. Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics 11: 287-310.
- Beard KH, Vogt KA, Vogt DJ, Scatena FN, Covich AP, Sigurdardottir R, Siccama TG,
 Crowl TA. 2005. Structural and functional responses of a subtropical forest to 10 years

```
537 of hurricanes and droughts. Ecological Monographs 75(3): 345-361.
```

538 Benito Garzón M, González Muñoz N, Wigneron J-P, Moisy C, Fernández-Manjarrés J,

- 539 Delzon S. 2018. The legacy of water deficit on populations having experienced negative
 540 hydraulic safety margin. *Global Ecology and Biogeography* 27(3): 346-356.
- 541 Bonan GB. 2008. Forests and climate change: Forcings, feedbacks, and the climate benefits of
 542 forests. *Science* 320(5882): 1444-1449.
- 543 Boose ER, Foster DR, Fluet M. 1994. Hurricane Impacts to Tropical and Temperate Forest
 544 Landscapes. *Ecological Monographs* 64(4): 369-400.
- 545 Boose ER, Serrano MI, Foster DR. 2004. Landscape and regional impacts of hurricanes in
 546 Puerto Rico. *Ecological Monographs* 74(2): 335-352.
- 547 Brando PM, Paolucci L, Ummenhofer CC, Ordway EM, Hartmann H, Cattau ME, Rattis
- 548 L, Medjibe V, Coe MT, Balch J 2019. Droughts, Wildfires, and Forest Carbon Cycling:
- A Pantropical Synthesis. In: Jeanloz R, Freeman KH eds. *Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Vol 47*, 555-581.
- Bretfeld M, Ewers BE, Hall JS. 2018. Plant water use responses along secondary forest
 succession during the 2015-2016 El Nino drought in Panama. *New Phytol* 219(3): 885899.
- 554 Brienen RJW, Phillips OL, Feldpausch TR, Gloor E, Baker TR, Lloyd J, Lopez-Gonzalez
- G, Monteagudo-Mendoza A, Malhi Y, Lewis SL, et al. 2015. Long-term decline of the
 Amazon carbon sink. *Nature* 519(7543): 344-348.

557	Brodribb TJ, Holbrook NM, Edwards EJ, Gutiérrez MV. 2003. Relations between stomatal
558	closure, leaf turgor and xylem vulnerability in eight tropical dry forest trees. Plant, Cell
559	& Environment 26 (3): 443-450.
560	Brodribb TJ, Skelton RP, McAdam SAM, Bienaimé D, Lucani CJ, Marmottant P. 2016.
561	Visual quantification of embolism reveals leaf vulnerability to hydraulic failure. New
562	Phytologist 209 (4): 1403-1409.
563	Burslem DFRP, Whitmore TC, Brown GC. 2000. Short-term effects of cyclone impact and
564	long-term recovery of tropical rain forest on Kolombangara, Solomon Islands. Journal of
565	<i>Ecology</i> 88 (6): 1063-1078.
566	Canham CD, Thompson J, Zimmerman JK, Uriarte M. 2010. Variation in Susceptibility to
567	Hurricane Damage as a Function of Storm Intensity in Puerto Rican Tree Species.
568	<i>Biotropica</i> 42 (1): 87-94.
569	Carreño-Rocabado G, Peña-Claros M, Bongers F, Alarcón A, Licona J-C, Poorter L. 2012.
570	Effects of disturbance intensity on species and functional diversity in a tropical forest.
571	Journal of Ecology 100(6): 1453-1463.
572	Chazdon RL. 2008. Beyond deforestation: Restoring forests and ecosystem services on
573	degraded lands. Science 320(5882): 1458-1460.
574	Chazdon RL, Brenes AR, Alvarado BV. 2005. Effects of Climate and Stand Age on Annual
575	Tree Dynamics in Tropical Second-Growth Rain Forests. <i>Ecology</i> 86 (7): 1808-1815.
576	Choat B, Jansen S, Brodribb TJ, Cochard H, Delzon S, Bhaskar R, Bucci SJ, Feild TS,
577	Gleason SM, Hacke UG, et al. 2012. Global convergence in the vulnerability of forests
578	to drought. Nature 491(7426): 752-755.
579	Christoffersen BO, Gloor M, Fauset S, Fyllas NM, Galbraith DR, Baker TR, Kruijt B,
580	Rowland L, Fisher RA, Binks OJ, et al. 2016. Linking hydraulic traits to tropical forest
581	function in a size-structured and trait-driven model (TFS v.1-Hydro). Geoscientific Model
582	Development 9(11): 4227-4255.
583	Comita LS, Uriarte M, Thompson J, Jonckheere I, Canham CD, Zimmerman JK. 2009.
584	Abiotic and biotic drivers of seedling survival in a hurricane-impacted tropical forest.
585	Journal of Ecology 97 (6): 1346-1359.
586	Condit R. 1998. Tropical Forest Census Plots. Berlin, Heidelberg: Springer Berlin Heidelberg.

587	Creek D, Lamarque LJ, Torres-Ruiz JM, Parise C, Burlett R, Tissue DT, Delzon S. 2020.
588	Xylem embolism in leaves does not occur with open stomata: evidence from direct
589	observations using the optical visualization technique. Journal of Experimental Botany
590	71(3): 1151-1159.
591	Dale VH, Joyce LA, McNulty S, Neilson RP, Ayres MP, Flannigan MD, Hanson PJ, Irland
592	LC, Lugo AE, Peterson CJ, et al. 2001. Climate Change and Forest Disturbances:
593	Climate change can affect forests by altering the frequency, intensity, duration, and
594	timing of fire, drought, introduced species, insect and pathogen outbreaks, hurricanes,
595	windstorms, ice storms, or landslides. Bioscience 51(9): 723-734.
596	DOE US. 2018. Disturbance and Vegetation Dynamics in Earth System Models; Workshop
597	Report SC-0196: Office of Biological and Environmental Research, U.S. Department of
598	Energy Office of Science. [WWW document] URL
599	https://ess.science.energy.gov/disturbance-workshop/ [accessed 24 July 2021]
600	Everham EM, Brokaw NVL. 1996. Forest damage and recovery from catastrophic wind. The
601	<i>Botanical Review</i> 62 (2): 113-185.
602	Ewel JJ, Whitmore JL. 1973. The ecological life zones of Puerto Rico and the U.S. Virgin
603	Islands. Rio Piedras, P.R.: Institute of Tropical Forestry.
604	Feng X, Uriarte M, González G, Reed S, Thompson J, Zimmerman JK, Murphy L. 2018.
605	Improving predictions of tropical forest response to climate change through integration of
606	field studies and ecosystem modeling. Global Change Biology 24(1): e213-e232.
607	Fontes CG, Fine PVA, Wittmann F, Bittencourt PRL, Piedade MTF, Higuchi N, Chambers
608	JQ, Dawson TE. 2020. Convergent evolution of tree hydraulic traits in Amazonian
609	habitats: implications for community assemblage and vulnerability to drought. New
610	Phytologist 228(1): 106-120.
611	Gaiser EE, Bell DM, Castorani MCN, Childers DL, Groffman PM, Jackson CR,
612	Kominoski JS, Peters DPC, Pickett STA, Ripplinger J, et al. 2020. Long-Term
613	Ecological Research and Evolving Frameworks of Disturbance Ecology. BioScience
614	70 (2): 141-156.
615	Gatti LV, Gloor M, Miller JB, Doughty CE, Malhi Y, Domingues LG, Basso LS,
616	Martinewski A, Correia CSC, Borges VF, et al. 2014. Drought sensitivity of

- 617 Amazonian carbon balance revealed by atmospheric measurements. *Nature; London*618 **506**(7486): 76-80.
- 619 Greenwood S, Ruiz-Benito P, Martínez-Vilalta J, Lloret F, Kitzberger T, Allen CD,
- Fensham R, Laughlin DC, Kattge J, Bönisch G, et al. 2017. Tree mortality across
 biomes is promoted by drought intensity, lower wood density and higher specific leaf
 area. *Ecology Letters* 20(4): 539-553.
- Gresham CA, Williams TM, Lipscomb DJ. 1991. Hurricane Hugo Wind Damage to
 Southeastern U.S. Coastal Forest Tree Species. *Biotropica* 23(4): 420.
- Griffith MP, Noblick LR, Dowe JL, Husby CE, Calonje MA. 2008. Cyclone Tolerance in
 New World Arecaceae: Biogeographic Variation and Abiotic Natural Selection. Ann Bot
 102(4): 591-598.
- Guzman-Grajales SM, Walker LR. 1991. Differential Seedling Responses to Litter After
 Hurricane Hugo in the Luquillo Experimental Forest, Puerto Rico. *Biotropica* 23(4): 407 413.
- Heartsill Scalley T. 2017. Insights on Forest Structure and Composition from Long-Term
 Research in the Luquillo Mountains. *Forests* 8(6): 204.
- Herrera D, Ault T. 2017. Insights from a New High-Resolution Drought Atlas for the
 Caribbean Spanning 1950-2016. *Journal of Climate* 30(19): 7801-7825.
- Hogan JA, Zimmerman JK, Thompson J, Nytch CJ, Uriarte M. 2016. The interaction of
 land-use legacies and hurricane disturbance in subtropical wet forest: twenty-one years of
 change. *Ecosphere* 7(8): e01405.
- Hubau W, Lewis SL, Phillips OL, Affum-Baffoe K, Beeckman H, Cuni-Sanchez A, Daniels
 AK, Ewango CEN, Fauset S, Mukinzi JM, et al. 2020. Asynchronous carbon sink
- 640 saturation in African and Amazonian tropical forests. *Nature* **579**(7797): 80-87.
- 641 Ibanez T, Keppel G, Menkes C, Gillespie TW, Lengaigne M, Mangeas M, Rivas-Torres G,
- 642 Birnbaum P. 2019. Globally consistent impact of tropical cyclones on the structure of
 643 tropical and subtropical forests. Journal of Ecology 107(1): 279-292.
- 644 Imbert D. 2018. Hurricane disturbance and forest dynamics in east Caribbean mangroves.
 645 *Ecosphere* 9(7): e02231.

646	Joetzjer E, Douville H, Delire C, Ciais P. 2013. Present-day and future Amazonian
647	precipitation in global climate models: CMIP5 versus CMIP3. Climate Dynamics 41(11-
648	12): 2921-2936.
649	Khalyani AH, Gould WA, Harmsen E, Terando A, Quinones M, Collazo JA. 2015. Climate
650	Change Implications for Tropical Islands: Interpolating and Interpreting Statistically
651	Downscaled GCM Projections for Management and Planning. Journal of Applied
652	Meteorology and Climatology 55(2): 265-282.
653	Knutson T, Camargo SJ, Chan JCL, Emanuel K, Ho C-H, Kossin J, Mohapatra M, Satoh
654	M, Sugi M, Walsh K, et al. 2019. Tropical Cyclones and Climate Change Assessment:
655	Part I: Detection and Attribution. Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society
656	100 (10): 1987-2007.
657	Knutson TR, McBride JL, Chan J, Emanuel K, Holland G, Landsea C, Held I, Kossin JP,
658	Srivastava AK, Sugi M. 2010. Tropical cyclones and climate change. Nature
659	<i>Geoscience</i> 3 (3): 157-163.
660	Leitold V, Morton DC, Longo M, dos-Santos MN, Keller M, Scaranello M. 2018. El Niño
661	drought increased canopy turnover in Amazon forests. New Phytologist 219(3): 959-971.
662	Liang X, Ye Q, Liu H, Brodribb TJ. 2021. Wood density predicts mortality threshold for
663	diverse trees. New Phytologist 229(6): 3053-3057.
664	Lohbeck M, Poorter L, Lebrija-Trejos E, Martinez-Ramos M, Meave JA, Paz H, Perez-
665	Garcia EA, Romero-Perez IE, Tauro A, Bongers F. 2013. Successional changes in
666	functional composition contrast for dry and wet tropical forest. <i>Ecology</i> 94 (6): 1211.
667	Lugo AE. 2008. Visible and invisible effects of hurricanes on forest ecosystems: an international
668	review. Austral Ecology 33 (4): 368-398.
669	Lugo AE, Scatena FN. 1996. Background and Catastrophic Tree Mortality in Tropical Moist,
670	Wet, and Rain Forests. Biotropica 28(4): 585.
671	Markesteijn L, Poorte L, Paz H, Sack L, Bongers F. 2011. Ecological differentiation in xylem
672	cavitation resistance is associated with stem and leaf structural traits. Plant, Cell &
673	<i>Environment</i> 34 (1): 137-148.
674	Martin-StPaul N, Delzon S, Cochard H. 2017. Plant resistance to drought depends on timely
675	stomatal closure. Ecology Letters 20(11): 1437-1447.

676 McCulloh KA, Johnson DM, Meinzer FC, Voelker SL, Lachenbruch B, Domec Jc. 2012.

- 677 Hydraulic architecture of two species differing in wood density: opposing strategies in
 678 co-occurring tropical pioneer trees. *Plant, Cell & Environment* 35(1): 116-125.
- McDowell NG, Allen CD, Anderson-Teixeira K, Aukema BH, Bond-Lamberty B, Chini L,
 Clark JS, Dietze M, Grossiord C, Hanbury-Brown A, et al. 2020. Pervasive shifts in
- forest dynamics in a changing world. *Science* **368**(6494): eaaz9463.
- 682 Miner Solá E. 2000. *Historia de los huracanes en Puerto Rico*: E. Miner Solá, Puerto Rico.
- Neelin JD, Munnich M, Su H, Meyerson JE, Holloway CE. 2006. Tropical drying trends in
 global warming models and observations. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 103(16): 6110-6115.

Negrón JF, McMillin JD, Anhold JA, Coulson D. 2009. Bark beetle-caused mortality in a
 drought-affected ponderosa pine landscape in Arizona, USA. *Forest Ecology and*

687 *Management* **257**(4): 1353-1362.

688 Netherer S, Panassiti B, Pennerstorfer J, Matthews B. 2019. Acute Drought Is an Important

- 689 Driver of Bark Beetle Infestation in Austrian Norway Spruce Stands. *Frontiers in Forests*690 *and Global Change* 2(39): 1-21.
- 691 Oliveira RS, Costa FRC, Baalen Ev, Jonge Ad, Bittencourt PR, Almanza Y, Barros FdV,
- 692 Cordoba EC, Fagundes MV, Garcia S, et al. 2019. Embolism resistance drives the
 693 distribution of Amazonian rainforest tree species along hydro-topographic gradients. *New*694 *Phytologist* 221(3): 1457-1465.
- Oliveira RS, Eller CB, Barros FDV, Hirota M, Brum M, Bittencourt P. 2021. Linking plant
 hydraulics and the fast–slow continuum to understand resilience to drought in tropical
 ecosystems. *New Phytologist* 230(3): 904-923.
- Paine RT, Tegner MJ, Johnson EA. 1998. Compounded Perturbations Yield Ecological
 Surprises. *Ecosystems* 1(6): 535-545.

Pan Y, Birdsey RA, Fang J, Houghton R, Kauppi P, Kurz W, Phillips O, Shvidenko A,
Lewis S, Canadell J, et al. 2011. A large and persistent carbon sink in the Worlds
forests. *Science* 333(6045).

- 703 Phillips OL, van der Heijden G, Lewis SL, López-González G, Aragão LEOC, Lloyd J,
- Malhi Y, Monteagudo A, Almeida S, Dávila EA, et al. 2010. Drought-mortality
 relationships for tropical forests. *The New Phytologist* 187(3): 631-646.

706	Pivovaroff AL, Cook VMW, Santiago LS. 2018. Stomatal behaviour and stem xylem traits are
707	coordinated for woody plant species under exceptional drought conditions. Plant, Cell &
708	Environment 41 (11): 2617-2626.
709	Powers JS, G GV, Brodribb TJ, Schwartz NB, Pérez-Aviles D, Smith-Martin CM, Becknell
710	JM, Aureli F, Blanco R, Calderón-Morales E, et al. 2020. A catastrophic tropical
711	drought kills hydraulically vulnerable tree species. Global Change Biology 26(5): 3122-
712	3133.
713	Ramseyer CA, Miller PW, Mote TL. 2019. Future precipitation variability during the early
714	rainfall season in the El Yunque National Forest. Science of The Total Environment 661:
715	326-336.
716	Reich PB. 2014. The world-wide 'fast-slow' plant economics spectrum: a traits manifesto.
717	Journal of Ecology 102: 275–301.
718	Rodriguez-Dominguez CM, Buckley TN, Egea G, Cires Ad, Hernandez-Santana V,
719	Martorell S, Diaz-Espejo A. 2016. Most stomatal closure in woody species under
720	moderate drought can be explained by stomatal responses to leaf turgor. Plant, Cell &
721	Environment 39 (9): 2014-2026.
722	Sack L, Pasquet-Kok J. 2011. Leaf pressure–volume curve parameters. [WWW
723	document] URL https://prometheusprotocols.net/function/water-relations/pressure-
724	volume-curves/leaf-pressure-volume-curve-parameters/ [accessed 16 July 2020] In
725	Prometheus.
726	Santiago LS, De Guzman ME, Baraloto C, Vogenberg JE, Brodie M, Hérault B, Fortunel
727	C, Bonal D. 2018. Coordination and trade-offs among hydraulic safety, efficiency and
728	drought avoidance traits in Amazonian rainforest canopy tree species. New Phytologist
729	218 (3): 1015-1024.
730	Scatena FN, Larsen MC. 1991. Physical Aspects of Hurricane Hugo in Puerto Rico. Biotropica
731	23 (4): 317.
732	Schwartz NB, Feng X, Muscarella R, Swenson NG, Umaña MN, Zimmerman JK, Uriarte
733	M. 2020. Topography and Traits Modulate Tree Performance and Drought Response in a
734	Tropical Forest. Frontiers in Forests and Global Change 3(136): 1-14.

735	Seidl R, Thom D, Kautz M, Martin-Benito D, Peltoniemi M, Vacchiano G, Wild J, Ascoli
736	D, Petr M, Honkaniemi J, et al. 2017. Forest disturbances under climate change. Nature
737	<i>Climate Change</i> 7 (6): 395-402.
738	Smith-Martin CM, Skelton RP, Johnson KM, Lucani C, Brodribb TJ. 2020. Lack of
739	vulnerability segmentation among woody species in a diverse dry sclerophyll woodland
740	community. Functional Ecology 34(4): 777-787.
741	Subedi SC, Ross MS, Sah JP, Redwine J, Baraloto C. 2019. Trait-based community assembly
742	pattern along a forest succession gradient in a seasonally dry tropical forest. Ecosphere
743	10 (4): e02719.
744	Tanner EVJ, Kapos V, Healey JR. 1991. Hurricane Effects on Forest Ecosystems in the
745	Caribbean. <i>Biotropica</i> 23 (4): 513.
746	Tanner EVJ, Rodriguez-Sanchez F, Healey JR, Holdaway RJ, Bellingham PJ. 2014. Long-
747	term hurricane damage effects on tropical forest tree growth and mortality. Ecology
748	95 (10): 2974-2983.
749	Temperli C, Bugmann H, Elkin C. 2013. Cross-scale interactions among bark beetles, climate
750	change, and wind disturbances: a landscape modeling approach. Ecological Monographs
751	83 (3): 383-402.
752	Thompson J, Brokaw N, Zimmerman JK, Waide RB, Everham EM, Lodge DJ, Taylor CM,
753	García-Montiel D, Fluet M. 2002. Land Use History, Environment, and Tree
754	Composition in a Tropical Forest. <i>Ecological Applications</i> 12 (5): 1344-1363.
755	Turner MG. 2010. Disturbance and landscape dynamics in a changing world. <i>Ecology</i> 91(10):
756	2833-2849.
757	Tyree MT, Hammel HT. 1972. The Measurement of the Turgor Pressure and the Water
758	Relations of Plants by the Pressure-bomb Technique. Journal of Experimental Botany
759	23 (1): 267-282.
760	Tyree MT, Sperry JS. 1988. Do Woody Plants Operate near the Point of Catastrophic Xylem
761	Dysfunction Caused by Dynamic Water Stress?: Answers from a Model. Plant
762	<i>Physiology</i> 88 (3): 574-580.
763	Umaña MN, Arellano G. 2021. Legacy effects of drought on tree growth responses to
764	hurricanes. <i>Ecography</i> 44 (11): 1686-1697.

765	Uriarte M, Canham CD, Thompson J, Zimmerman JK. 2004. Neighborhood analysis of tree
766	growth and survival in a hurricane-driven tropical forest. <i>Ecological Monographs</i> 74(4):
767	591-614.
768	Uriarte M, Canham CD, Thompson J, Zimmerman JK, Brokaw N. 2005. Seedling
769	recruitment in a hurricane- driven tropical forest: light limitation, density- dependence
770	and the spatial distribution of parent trees. Journal of Ecology. 93(2): 291-304.
771	Uriarte M, Canham CD, Thompson J, Zimmerman JK, Murphy L, Sabat AM, Fetcher N,
772	Haines BL. 2009. Natural disturbance and human land use as determinants of tropical
773	forest dynamics: results from a forest simulator. Ecological Monographs 79(3): 423-443.
774	Uriarte M, Clark JS, Zimmerman JK, Comita LS, Forero-Montaña J, Thompson J. 2012.
775	Multidimensional trade-offs in species responses to disturbance: implications for
776	diversity in a subtropical forest. <i>Ecology</i> 93 (1): 191-205.
777	Uriarte M, Lasky JR, Boukili VK, Chazdon RL. 2016a. A trait-mediated, neighbourhood
778	approach to quantify climate impacts on successional dynamics of tropical rainforests.
779	<i>Functional Ecology</i> 30 (2): 157-167.
780	Uriarte M, Schwartz N, Powers JS, Marín-Spiotta E, Liao W, Werden LK. 2016b. Impacts
781	of climate variability on tree demography in second growth tropical forests: the
782	importance of regional context for predicting successional trajectories. <i>Biotropica</i> 48(6):
783	780-797.
784	Uriarte M, Schwartz N, Powers JS, Marin-Spiotta E, Liao WY, Werden LK. 2016. Impacts
785	of climate variability on tree demography in second growth tropical forests: the
786	
/00	importance of regional context for predicting successional trajectories. <i>Biotropica</i> 48 (6):
787	importance of regional context for predicting successional trajectories. <i>Biotropica</i> 48 (6): 780-797.
787	780-797.
787 788	780-797. Uriarte M, Thompson J, Zimmerman JK. 2019. Hurricane María tripled stem breaks and
787 788 789	 780-797. Uriarte M, Thompson J, Zimmerman JK. 2019. Hurricane María tripled stem breaks and doubled tree mortality relative to other major storms. <i>Nature Communications</i> 10(1):
787 788 789 790	 780-797. Uriarte M, Thompson J, Zimmerman JK. 2019. Hurricane María tripled stem breaks and doubled tree mortality relative to other major storms. <i>Nature Communications</i> 10(1): 1362.
787 788 789 790 791	 780-797. Uriarte M, Thompson J, Zimmerman JK. 2019. Hurricane María tripled stem breaks and doubled tree mortality relative to other major storms. <i>Nature Communications</i> 10(1): 1362. Vandermeer J. 2000. Hurricane Disturbance and Tropical Tree Species Diversity. <i>Science</i>

- Webster PJ. 2005. Changes in Tropical Cyclone Number, Duration, and Intensity in a Warming
 Environment. *Science* 309(5742): 1844-1846.
- Wu J, Loucks OL. 1995. From Balance of Nature to Hierarchical Patch Dynamics: A Paradigm
 Shift in Ecology. *The Quarterly Review of Biology* 70(4): 439-466.
- 799 Ziegler C, Coste S, Stahl C, Delzon S, Levionnois S, Cazal J, Cochard H, Esquivel-
- 800 Muelbert A, Goret J-Y, Heuret P, et al. 2019. Large hydraulic safety margins protect
 801 Neotropical canopy rainforest tree species against hydraulic failure during drought.
- 802 Annals of Forest Science **76**(4): 115.
- Zimmerman JK, Comita LS, Thompson J, Uriarte M, Brokaw N. 2010. Patch dynamics and
 community metastability of a subtropical forest: compound effects of natural disturbance
 and human land use. *Landscape Ecology* 25(7): 1099-1111.
- 806 Zimmerman JK, Iii EME, Waide RB, Lodge DJ, Taylor CM, Brokaw NVL. 1994.
- Responses of Tree Species to Hurricane Winds in Subtropical Wet Forest in Puerto Rico:
 Implications for Tropical Tree Life Histories. *The Journal of Ecology* 82(4): 911.
- 809 Zimmerman JK, Wood TE, González G, Ramirez A, Silver WL, Uriarte M, Willig MR,
- 810 Waide RB, Lugo AE. 2021. Disturbance and resilience in the Luquillo Experimental
- 811 Forest. *Biological Conservation* **253**: 108891.

813 Supporting Information single sentence legends

- Fig. S1 Biomass and stem mortality from after Hurricane Hugo of the target species in the 16-ha
- 815 Luquillo Forest Dynamics Plot and over 26 years of post-hurricane succession.
- 816 Fig. S2 Leaf and stem optical vulnerability curves.
- 817 **Fig. S3** Leaf and stem optical vulnerability curves.
- 818 **Fig. S4** Leaf and stem optical vulnerability curves.
- 819 Fig. S5 Tradeoff between capacitance at full turgor and P50 and safety margins (SMP50) for all
- 820 measured individuals.
- Fig. S6 Associations between P₅₀ and safety margins and relative basal area growth during the
- 822 first five years after Hurricane Hugo.
- Fig. S7 Associations between the proportion of stems with $DBH \ge 10cm$ for each of the 13 tree
- species that were immediately killed by Hurricane Hugo and growth during the first five years
- 825 after H. Hugo.
- 826 **Table S1** Number of measured individuals per species for each of the hydraulic traits.
- Table S2 Mean and standard deviation of all the hydraulic traits and maximum tree height perspecies.
- 829 **Table S3** F, p-values, and degrees of freedom from ANOVAs of hydraulic traits by species.
- 830 **Table S4** Results of linear regressions of capacitance at full turgor by P₅₀ and safety margins.
- 831 **Table S5** Basal area of stems ≥ 10 cm DBH of the target species in the six censuses of the 16-ha
- 832 Luquillo Forest Dynamics Plot.
- 833 **Table S6** Percent of relative change of community-weighted mean trait values between each
- census and the preceding one.
- 835

836 Figures and Tables

- 837 **Table 1** List of species used in this study, the code we used to represent them in some figures,
- their families, and the range of the percent of the total basal area of each species across six
- censuses of the 16-ha LFDP.

Species	Code	Family	Range of basal area (%)
Alchornea latifolia	ALCLAT	Euphorbiaceae	1.43–1.95
Casearia arborea	CASARB	Flacourtiaceae	2.99–4.94
Cecropia schreberiana	CECSCH	Moraceae	3.87–6.54
Cordia borinquensis	CORBOR	Boraginaceae	0.10-0.25
Cyrilla racemiflora	CYRRAC	Cyrillaceae	0.17–0.24
Dacryodes excelsa	DACEXC	Burseraceae	12.04–16.82
Drypetes glauca	DRYGLA	Euphorbiaceae	0.38–0.73
Inga laurina	INGLAU	Fabaceae	3.07-5.25
Micropholis guyanensis	MICGUY	Sapotaceae	0.01-0.02
Ocotea leucoxylon	OCOLEU	Lauraceae	0.60–0.94
Prestoea acuminata var. montana	PREMON	Arecaceae	13.44–24.44
Sloanea berteroana	SLOBER	Elaeocarpaceae	2.72-3.85
Tabebuia heterophylla	TABHET	Bignonaceae	1.24–2.67
Total			50 - 60 %

840





safety margins (SM_{P50}) for all measured species. Letters indicate significant (P < 0.05)

845 differences among groups based on Tukey's HSD tests. Box plot midlines show medians, box

- 846 edges, first and third quartiles, whiskers, minima and maxima, and points, outliers. Each species
- 847 has a unique color to facilitate comparison across traits: *Alchornea latifolia* (ALCLAT),
- 848 Casearia arborea (CASARB), Cecropia schreberiana (CECSCH), Cordia borinquensis
- 849 (CORBOR), Cyrilla racemiflora (CYRRAC), Dacryodes excelsa (DACEXC), Drypetes glauca

- 850 (DRYGLA), Inga laurina (INGLAU), Micropholis guyanensis (MICGUY), Ocotea leucoxylon
- 851 (OCOLEU), Prestoea acuminata var. montana (PREMON), Sloanea berteroana (SLOBER),

and *Tabebuia heterophylla* (TABHET).





Fig. 2 Associations between P_{50} and safety margins (SM_{P50}) and proportion of stems with DBH \geq 10cm for each of the 13 tree species that were immediately killed (a,c) or broken (b,d) by Hurricane Hugo. Blue lines depict linear regressions and shaded areas represent 95% confidence intervals.



Fig. 3 Associations between P₅₀ and safety margins (SM_{P50}) and absolute annual diameter



862 Blue lines depict linear regressions and shaded areas represent 95% confidence intervals.



863

Fig. 4 Basal area of stems ≥ 10 cm DBH of the target species in the six censuses of the 16-ha
Luquillo Forest Dynamics Plot from before Hurricane Hugo (year 1990) and over 26 years of
post-hurricane succession. Plot censuses are conducted approximately every five years. Colors
indicate species codes: *Alchornea latifolia* (ALCLAT), *Casearia arborea* (CASARB), *Cecropia schreberiana* (CECSCH), *Cordia borinquensis* (CORBOR), *Cyrilla racemiflora* (CYRRAC), *Dacryodes excelsa* (DACEXC), *Drypetes glauca* (DRYGLA), *Inga laurina* (INGLAU), *Micropholis guyanensis* (MICGUY), *Ocotea leucoxylon* (OCOLEU), *Prestoea acuminata* var.

871 montana (PREMON), Sloanea berteroana (SLOBER), and Tabebuia heterophylla (TABHET).



Fig. 5 Community-weighted mean (CWM) trait values of (**a**) leaf turgor loss point (Ψ_{tlp}), (**b**) leaf capacitance at full turgor (Cft), (**c**) P50, (**d**) safety margins (SMP50) for 12 common tree species and one dominant palm species for each census from before Hurricane Hugo (year 1990) and then during 26 years of post-hurricane succession.