1	Palaeogeography of tropical seasonal coastal wetlands in
2 3	northern Britain during the early Mississippian Romer's Gap
4 5	David Millward <sup>1</sup> *, Sarah J. Davies <sup>2</sup> , Peter J. Brand <sup>1</sup> , Michael A. E. Browne <sup>1</sup> , Carys E. Bennett <sup>2</sup> , Timothy I. Kearsey <sup>1</sup> , Janet E. Sherwin <sup>2</sup> and John E. A. Marshall <sup>3</sup>
6	<sup>1</sup> British Geological Survey, The Lyell Centre, Edinburgh EH14 4AP, UK (Email: <u>dmill@bgs.ac.uk</u> )
7	<sup>2</sup> School of Geography, Geology and the Environment, University of Leicester, Leicester LE1 7RH, UK
8 9 10	<sup>3</sup> Ocean and Earth Sciences, University of Southampton, National Oceanography Centre, European Way, Southampton SO14 3ZH, UK
11	*Corresponding author: David Millward, <u>dmill@bgs.ac.uk</u>
12	
13	Running head: Romer's Gap palaeogeography
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19 20 21	This is the authors' version of the manuscript accepted (2 August 2018) for publication in the Vertebrate Evolution part of Earth & Environmental Science Transactions of the Royal Society of Edinburgh, published by Cambridge Journals.
22	The published version can be accessed through the following doi

23 Doi:10.1017/S1755691018000737

#### 24 Abstract

25 The lower Mississippian Ballagan Formation of northern Britain is one of only two successions 26 worldwide to yield the earliest known tetrapods with terrestrial capability, following the end-27 Devonian mass extinction event. Studies of the sedimentary environments and habitats in which these beasts lived have been an integral part of a major research project into how, why and under 28 29 what circumstances this profound step in the evolution of life on Earth occurred. Here, a new 30 palaeogeographic map is constructed from outcrop data integrated with new and archived borehole 31 material. The map shows the extent of a very low-relief coastal wetland developed along the tropical 32 southern continental margin of Laurussia. Coastal floodplains in the Midland Valley and Tweed 33 basins were separated from the marginal marine seaway of the Northumberland – Solway Basin to 34 the south by an archipelago of more elevated areas. A complex mosaic of sedimentary environments 35 is juxtaposed, and included fresh and brackish to saline and hypersaline lakes, a diverse suite of 36 floodplain palaeosols and a persistent fluvial system in the east of the region. The strongly seasonal 37 climate led to the formation of evaporite deposits alternating with flooding events, both meteoric 38 and marine. Storm surges drove marine floods from the SW into both the western Midland Valley and Northumberland – Solway Basin; marine water also flooded into the Tweed Basin and Tayside in 39 40 the east. The Ballagan Formation is a rare example in the geological record of a tropical, seasonal 41 coastal wetland that contains abundant, small-scale evaporite deposits. The diverse sedimentary 42 environments and palaeosol types indicate a network of different terrestrial and aquatic habitats in 43 which the tetrapods lived.

44

45

46 Key words:

47 Ballagan Formation; coastal wetlands; Midland Valley of Scotland; palaeoenvironment; Tournaisian;

48 Tweed Basin

49

Page **3** of **36** 

#### 50 (Introduction)

51 The Mississippian (Tournaisian) Ballagan Formation of northern Britain hosts a diverse assemblage of 52 vertebrate fossils, including the earliest known tetrapods with terrestrial capability (Clack 2002; 53 Clack & Finney 2005; Smithson et al. 2012; Clack et al. 2016; Smithson & Clack, in press). This is one 54 of only two successions in the world where such fossils have been found within the period of about 15 million years at the beginning of the Carboniferous that has become known as Romer's Gap. The 55 56 other is the Horton Bluff Formation in Nova Scotia, Canada (Anderson et al. 2015), which at this time 57 was relatively close along the southern margin of Laurussia. The emergence of tetrapods on land and 58 their subsequent diversification follows the mass extinction events in late Devonian times (Kaiser et 59 al. 2015). Understanding how, why and under what conditions this step change in the evolution of 60 life on Earth occurred was part of the remit of the TW:eed Project led by Jenny Clack from 2012 until 61 2016. So, what were the landscape, palaeoenvironments and habitats like at this time?

62 Francis et al. (1970) and later studies have all inferred a coastal floodplain setting, though 63 earlier, Belt et al. (1967) had proposed a marginal marine to restricted marine environment for 64 dolostone deposition in the Ballagan Formation of the Midland Valley of Scotland. Anderton's (1985) 65 conceptual facies model for the important fish-bearing succession at Foulden in the Tweed Basin 66 was based on detailed sedimentary logging. This type of model has been developed further by 67 Bennett et al. (2016, 2017), Kearsey et al. (2016), and Millward et al. (2018) from detailed 68 investigations of sandy siltstones, ichnofacies, palaeosols and evaporite-rocks displayed in the 69 successions through the formation exposed at Burnmouth and in the cores from the Norham West 70 Mains Farm Borehole, near Berwick upon Tweed (Fig. 1). All of these models show the rapidly 71 changing character of the sedimentary environments in the rock record, suggesting the juxtaposition 72 of a mosaic of distinctive habitats within a strongly seasonal, tropical coastal wetland. These studies 73 are applicable particularly to the Tweed Basin (Fig. 1), but how do they extend across the broader 74 region of northern Britain? This is important because the palaeogeography of the region and its 75 control on the distribution of palaeoenvironments and habitats may have played a role in shaping 76 vertebrate evolution.

The Tournaisian palaeogeography of the Midland Valley, and the Tweed and Northumberland – Solway basins presented here has its origins in the seminal atlases of the UK by Wills (1951) and Cope *et al.* (1992). The TW:eed Project studies have provided greater clarity of detail and connections across the region between the sedimentary environments, habitats and the tetrapods that lived in them (Clack *et al.* 2016). The new map combines data from field sections and borehole records through the Ballagan Formation in the Midland Valley and Tweed Basin and includes reflections on published interpretations of the Northumberland – Solway Basin. These

Page 4 of 36

84 investigations provide new insights into this rare example in the geological record of an equatorial85 seasonal coastal wetland.

## 86 1. Regional setting and stratigraphy

87 During the early Mississippian, interconnected strike-slip fault-controlled sedimentary basins opened 88 across northern Britain as a result of the breakup of the equatorial, southern part of the Laurussian 89 continental margin (Coward 1993; Domeier & Torsvik 2014). The northern basins include those in 90 the Midland Valley, Tweed and Northumberland–Solway regions. Volcanism accompanied opening 91 of the Tweed and Northumberland–Solway basins (Leeder 1974a; Chadwick et al. 1995). The early 92 sedimentary fill to the basins comprises the Ballagan Formation, which was preceded by the upper 93 Devonian Kinnesswood Formation and succeeded in various parts of the region by the Clyde 94 Sandstone, Garleton Hills Volcanic, Lyne and Fell Sandstone formations (Figs 1, 2).

95 The Ballagan Formation is preserved at outcrop and in the subsurface across the Midland 96 Valley and Tweed Basin, and this passes southward and stratigraphically upward into the Lyne 97 Formation in the Northumberland-Solway Basin (Fig. 2). The Ballagan Formation consists of grey 98 siltstone and thin beds of argillaceous ferroan dolostone (historically referred to as 'cementstone'), 99 with varying proportions of sandstone, flood-deposited sandy siltstone, palaeosols and evaporite-100 rock (Anderton 1985; Scott 1986; Andrews et al. 1991; Andrews & Nabi 1994, 1998; Bennett et al. 101 2016; Kearsey et al. 2016; Millward et al. 2018). The formation is best exposed in the 520 m thick, 102 vertically dipping, coastal section at Burnmouth (Fig. 1). Though a late Tournaisian, CM Miospore 103 Biozone age (e.g. Neves et al. 1973; Neves & Ioannides 1974; Stephenson et al. 2002) has been 104 determined for the formation in central Scotland, Smithson et al. (2012) recorded earliest 105 Tournaisian, VI Biozone miospores from the base of the formation at Burnmouth. Most recently, 106 Marshall et al. (this volume) provide evidence that in the Tweed Basin the formation spans the 107 Tournaisian. In East Lothian, the upper part of the formation has yielded early Visean Pu Biozone 108 miospores (Neves et al. 1973; Neves & Ioannides 1974); these upper beds are therefore laterally 109 equivalent to the Clyde Sandstone Formation of the west of the Midland Valley which is inferred to 110 be lower Visean (Waters et al. 2011).

111 The thickness of the Ballagan Formation ranges from a few tens of metres on the Isle of 112 Bute, to 80 m in north Arran (Young & Caudwell 2012), 150 m in the west of the Midland Valley and 113 in Fife, up to 355 m in Ayrshire (Stephenson *et al.* 2002), and possibly up to 900 m west of Edinburgh 114 (Fig. 1; Mitchell & Mykura 1962). At least 418 m are present in East Lothian, but only 200 m at 115 Birnieknowes at the NE margin of the Southern Upland massif. Approximately 520 m occur in the 116 Tweed Basin whereas in the Northumberland – Solway Basin Tournaisian and Chadian strata may be

Page 5 of 36

- up to 3400 m thick in the centre of this asymmetric graben (Chadwick *et al.* 1995). The formation is
- absent from the central part of the Midland Valley, having been eroded during mid-Visean
- (Arundian) uplift prior to the Clyde Plateau volcanism (Millward & Stephenson 2011).
- In stark contrast to the Ballagan Formation, the Kinnesswood and Clyde Sandstone
  formations comprise braided fluvial sandstone in upward-fining cycles, interbedded with overbank
  red and purple mudstone, multiple intervals with carbonate nodules and thin beds of concretionary
  limestone ('cornstones'; Eyles *et al.* 1949; Read & Johnson 1967; Francis *et al.* 1970; Leeder 1976;
  Leeder & Bridges 1978; Young & Caldwell 2011, 2012). The 'cornstones' are palaeosols with
  pedogenic carbonate nodules (Burgess 1961; Leeder 1976; Andrews *et al.* 1991; Wright *et al.* 1993).
- In the Northumberland Solway Basin the Lyne Formation (formerly Lower Border Group of
  e.g. Lumsden *et al.* 1967; Leeder 1975a, b) is Tournaisian and early Visean in age, and contains
  significant marine clastic and carbonate sedimentary rocks and fossils (Leeder 1974b; Brand 2018).
  The Lyne and Ballagan formations are overlain unconformably by the Fell Sandstone Formation in
  the Tweed Basin and eastern part of the Northumberland Solway Basin. The Fell Sandstone is
  composed of a stacked succession of mainly coarse-grained sandstone deposited from the first
  major Carboniferous fluvio-deltaic system to cross the region (Kearsey *et al.* 2018).

### 133 2. Methods

The palaeogeography is reconstructed using data from field exposures across the Midland Valley and
Tweed basins, and from about 40 borehole logs from the BGS archive that proved significant
occurrences of Tournaisian strata. A sub-set of twelve boreholes, commissioned by BGS as part of
the stratigraphical investigation of Upper Devonian and Mississippian rocks of the region from 196781, provide descriptions and consistent information on the spatial and temporal occurrence, context
and general form of the different lithofacies. Cores have been retained for only one of these, the
Glenrothes Borehole and visual inspection of these provided additional information.

141 It is to be expected that the archived logs vary in amount and quality of information they 142 contain because they were made over more than 100 years. The BGS sub-set provides the greatest 143 volume of data though even here variations in data quantity and quality arise because they were 144 logged by different geologists. Information is particularly sparse on palaeosols and sandy siltstones. 145 Palaeosols are under-described in UK geology generally, though rooted 'seat-earths' have long been 146 recognized by Geological Survey staff because of extensive work in the coalfields. Sandy siltstone is a 147 facies only recently identified from the Ballagan Formation and so is not recorded (Bennett et al. 148 2016). Therefore, interpretation of the facies from these boreholes (Table 1) is informed and

Page 6 of 36

benchmarked against the facies analysis of the Norham West Mains Farm Borehole undertaken by
Bennett *et al.* (2016; table 1). This borehole is located in the Tweed Basin, about 10 km south-west
of Berwick upon Tweed, and fully cored 491 m of the Ballagan Formation (Fig. 1; Millward *et al.*2013).

153 The BGS collections contain macrofossils from the Ballagan and Lyne formations from 235 154 localities, including many of the boreholes, collected over a period of more than 100 years. The 155 fossils have been re-examined for this study to ensure taxonomic consistency (Brand 2018). The 156 biogeographical distribution of marine taxa and 'Estheria' are included herein as they provide 157 additional insight alongside the sedimentary data. Raymond (1946, p 219) noted that 'Estheria' is an 158 invalid name for a conchostracan genus as the name was pre-occupied, and he erected a number of 159 genera in which to allocate the known species. Unfortunately, he did not allocate all the Scottish 160 described species to his genera, and preservation of the material from the Ballagan Formation often 161 precludes even a generic allocation.

#### 162 3. Sedimentary facies

Facies identified in selected exposures and the archived borehole logs are described in Table 1, and examples illustrated in Figure 3. Summary statistics for selected features in the borehole logs are given in Table 2. The stratigraphical variation of facies across the Midland Valley is shown in Figures 4 and 5.

167 The succession in the west and north of the Midland Valley mostly comprises small-scale 168 intercalations of packages of dolostone and grey siltstone, along with heterogeneous siltstone and 169 fine-grained sandstone, and locally, evaporite-rock; these abruptly interdigitated facies constitute 170 the saline and hypersaline lake and overbank facies associations (Figs 3, 4). Laterally continuous 171 distinctive units that might be suitable for correlation across the region are not present, though the 172 uppermost part of the formation is sand-rich in parts. At the base of the formation in Fife and Tayside, a unit of distinctive dolostone beds, 32 m-thick, comprises the Mains of Errol Member 173 174 (Browne 1980). By contrast, in the east, the succession is more heterogeneous with thick distinctive packages of, for example, fluvial sandstone and floodplain-lake siltstones within a mixed assemblage 175 176 of fluvial and overbank facies associations (Figs 3, 5). The position of the base of the Pu Miospore 177 Biozone suggests that some of the packages in East Lothian may be correlated, at least over a 178 distance of about 15 km.

Page 7 of 36

#### 179 3.1. Siltstone, dolostone and evaporite facies

180 Thin beds of micritic ferroan dolostone interbedded with planar laminated, grey siltstone are the 181 defining characteristic of the Ballagan Formation. Siltstone occurs in both the saline and hypersaline 182 lake facies association, and the overbank facies association (Fig. 3). Laminated grey siltstone comprises a high proportion of the fines component in some of the boreholes, for example 99% in 183 184 Blairmulloch and 89% in Loch Humphrey (Table 2), but is generally lower in the East Lothian 185 boreholes. Thick packages of laminated grey siltstone in the boreholes with high proportions of fine 186 sediment likely represent floodplain-lake deposits, though these may include misidentified thin beds 187 of sandy siltstone. Laminated grey siltstone associated with the upper part of massive and cross-188 bedded sandstone may fill fluvial channels. The overbank facies association includes grey, yellow, 189 red and purple siltstone, only some of which is described as having traces of bedding; these may be 190 palaeosols, but the descriptions are insufficient for a diagnosis.

191 After removing the sandstone component from each borehole, dolostones comprise 3 to 192 21% of the thickness of the remainder of the succession. The number of dolostone beds varies from 193 nine in the Ascog Borehole to 277 in Norham, with the average thickness ranging from 9 cm in Ascog 194 to 34 cm in East Linton (Table 2). Thus, in the boreholes of the western and northern part of the 195 region, dolostone beds occur on average every 0.9 m (Glenrothes) to 1.7 m (Knocknairshill, 196 Blairmulloch; Fig. 3). By contrast, dolostone beds are, on average, less common in the East Lothian 197 boreholes, but there the concentration of dolostone beds within packages of laminated grey 198 siltstone up to 35 m thick is strongly evident, with significant packages of overbank siltstone and 199 fine-grained sandstone devoid of dolostone beds (Fig. 5).

Apart from the thickness, few descriptive details of the dolostone beds are typically given, though some are described as ironstone (Davies *et al.* 1986; Greig 1988). Belt *et al.* (1967), Francis *et al.* (1970) and Scott (1986) identified dolostone nodules, laminated beds (Fig. 8D), evaporite-bearing beds and massive beds; the last of these become more argillaceous at the base and top. Identification of these differing facies is aided by slicing the cores, but information from the borehole logs is insufficient to make the distinctions in all but the evaporite-bearing dolostones.

206 Small-scale evaporite deposits are a characteristic of the Ballagan and other Tournaisian 207 formations in the British Isles (Millward *et al.* 2018). They are distributed spatially and temporally 208 throughout the succession in the Midland Valley and Tweed Basin, though they are absent from the 209 Lothians and from the area bordering the Highlands (Figs 4, 5). Nodules of gypsum occur in siltstone 210 and dolostone; calcite and dolomite pseudomorphs occur in the latter at Burnmouth and in some of 211 the boreholes (Scott 1986; Millward *et al.* 2018). Siltstone pseudomorphs after hopper crystals of

Page 8 of 36

- halite are recorded locally in boreholes (Fig. 4) and in exposures, for example in the Langholm area,
- Chattlehope Burn, Northumberland and Willie's Hole, Scottish Borders (Leeder 1974b; Cater *et al.*1989).

#### 215 3.2. Mains of Errol Member

216 The Mains of Errol Member (Fig. 4; Browne 1980) comprises beds of hard dolomicrite, with a 217 characteristic reddened, cracked and 'pseudobrecciated' profile (Fig. 6). The top of each profile is a 218 sharp planar contact. Roots and burrows are absent; ostracods and fish fragments are rare and other 219 fossils absent. Dolostone beds, 0.22-1.70 m thick, are either stacked on top of each other, or they 220 are intercalated with units of laminated siltstone or sandy siltstone. The dolostone is composed of 221 planar-textured subhedral dolomite with crystal size up to 10 µm. A pseudobrecciated texture shows 222 'clasts' of finer grained dolomite set in coarser grained dolomite. Quartz grains scattered throughout the rock are etched, suggesting corrosion in alkaline fluids. A few rhombohedra composed of 223 224 dolomite aggregates are probably pseudomorphs after gypsum. Scattered clasts up to 500 μm 225 composed of chlorite and feldspar may be volcanic in origin.

226 From just above each dolostone unit base, isolated, narrow sinuous cracks widen upwards as 227 they unite with adjacent ones (Fig. 6). At their upper termination against subhorizontal planar 228 dislocations these cracks are polygonal and up to 20 mm across on the bedding surface. The cracks 229 are filled with Fe-rich claystone. Above the cracked zone, 20-40 cm of dolostone are intensely 230 brecciated, with poorly sorted, angular clasts of dolostone from 1 to 20 mm across, set in a Fe-rich 231 claystone. In this zone and the top part of the underlying cracked zone, low-angle, concave-upwards 232 dislocations resemble pedogenic slickensides. In the most fully preserved profiles the uppermost 5-233 10 cm are composed mainly of red-brown, Fe-rich claystone, with sporadic dolostone clasts, 1-5 mm 234 across. Similar beds have been reported from a borehole in the Stirling area (Francis et al. 1970, 235 plate 4, fig.7).

#### 236 **3.3. Sandstone**

237 Sandstone facies occur within the fluvial and overbank facies associations (Bennett et al. 2016). All 238 sandstone contains abundant partings of mica and carbonaceous detritus. The proportion of 239 sandstone in the succession varies across the region (2-46 %; Table 2), with the higher amounts in 240 East Lothian and the Tweed Basin (24 % in East Linton Borehole, 32 % in Spilmersford and 46 % in 241 Birnieknowes (Fig. 7). By contrast, in boreholes in the north of the Midland Valley, sandstone is most 242 commonly seen at the base and top to the formation, though in the Ascog Borehole it occurs 243 throughout (Fig. 4). Units up to 3 m thick occur in all the boreholes, with the median occurrence less 244 than 50 cm thick (Fig. 7). Typically, these thin units of sandstone are described as fine-grained and

ripple-laminated or cross-laminated. Many are interbedded with siltstone and are interpreted as
deposited by overbank flooding and crevasse-splays. A few units in this interval are recorded as
having a sharp, erosive base and massive or cross-bedded and may represent channel sandstone
bodies.

By contrast, the Blairmulloch and East Lothian boreholes also contain sandstone units more 249 250 than 3 m thick (Fig. 7). Though the number of such units is small, they comprise a high proportion of 251 the total thickness of the sandstone component in the succession; for example three units in 252 Spilmersford comprise 31 % of the sandstone thickness and in Birnieknowes 63 % (Table 2). These 253 sandstone bodies are described as sharp-based, medium and coarse grained, massive or cross-254 bedded (Fig. 3) and may include mudstone rip-up clasts and conglomerate layers in the lower part. A 255 thin upper part typically is finer grained and planar laminated to ripple laminated. Thicknesses vary 256 from just a few metres up to 15 m in the Spilmersford, East Linton and Birnieknowes boreholes. The 257 11.4 m thick sandstone unit illustrated in Figure 3 is typical of many, comprising stacked subunits 258 separated by a thin bed of siltstone, suggesting that the thicker sandstone bodies represent 259 multiple-storey channel fills. Lenticular beds of conglomerate at the base of sandstone units at 260 Burnmouth host disarticulated vertebrate bones.

261 The geometry of one of these sandstone units is seen in the river cliff of the Whiteadder 262 River at Edington Mill [NT 894 548] (Fig. 8A, C). The lower part of the channel cuts sharply down about 4 m into the underlying siltstone-dolostone succession. Rotated blocks of siltstone-dolostone 263 264 suggest that the channel margin collapsed during formation (Fig. 8C). The channel fill shows 265 lenticular units of cross-bedded sandstone with lateral accretion at the channel base. Clasts of 266 dolostone in the thalweg can be traced to a bed cut by the channel. Beds in the upper part of the channel thicken to the right in Figure 8A. Another unit, more than 20 m thick, near the top of the 267 268 formation, and exposed along the SE bank of the River Tweed at Norham is strongly trough cross-269 bedded with sediment transport consistently towards the SW.

At the coastal locality of Burnmouth in the Tweed Basin, a number of sandstone fluvial bodies are exposed in the almost vertical strata of the wave-cut platform and cliff. Depicted on a geological excursion map, Scrutton & Turner (1995) numbered the large sandstone bodies 1(youngest) -14 (oldest). Analysis of these bodies indicates that a number are multistorey and multilateral, and can be traced across the wave-cut platform for up to a kilometre. Lateral accretion deposits (2-3 m thick) are recognized in several bodies. Whereas individual channels may only reach 3 m in thickness, one or two of the multistorey systems comprise a total in excess of 30 m. In general, the erosive bases to the channels cut into the underlying floodplain sedimentary rocks, butsome systems cut into the dolostones, representing lake deposits.

Poorly bedded volcaniclastic rocks within the Ballagan Formation are described here for the first time from the Spilmersford and East Linton boreholes (Fig. 5). They occur both within, and at the top, of the formation, interbedded with sandstone and siltstone. A unit in the lower part of the East Linton Borehole is 7.9 m thick with beds ranging from 24 cm to 1.5 m thick. They are composed of multi-coloured fragments of volcanic rock of medium sand through gravel grade, with some dolostone, siltstone and sporadic chert clasts. These rock types have not been reported from elsewhere in the formation.

#### 286 3.4. Emergent surfaces and palaeosols

287 Desiccation cracks and brecciated, upper parts of beds, both at outcrop and in boreholes represent 288 short-lived episodes of emergence and drying out of the sediment. At least 5 horizons are seen, for 289 example, in the upper part of the shallowly dipping succession in the well exposed coastal section at 290 Belhaven Bay, west of Dunbar (Fig. 8), but there is great variation in abundance across the Midland 291 Valley (Fig. 9; Table 2). Glenrothes and East Dron borehole logs contain 138 and 110 horizons 292 respectively, comparable to 131 in the Norham core of the Tweed Basin (Figs 3, 9). By contrast, the 293 very low numbers of desiccated surfaces in the other boreholes may inversely relate to the high 294 proportion of laminated grey mudstone present, representing extended periods of sedimentation in 295 perennial bodies of standing water. Alternatively, the low numbers may reflect under-recording of 296 detail.

297 The preservation of plant roots and palaeosols indicate established episodes of emergence 298 and vegetation cover. Carpenter et al. (2015) interpreted the mottled red mudstone beds containing 299 carbonate nodules and vertic cracks within the thin succession on the Isle of Bute as well drained, 300 seasonally dry palaeosols. Near Foulden, Retallack & Dilcher (1988) inferred that gleyed inceptisols 301 were populated by small shrubby ferns such as Lyrasperma scotica and vertisols by tall forest trees 302 such as the reconstructed Stamnostoma huttonense. Kearsey et al. (2016) described 216 palaeosols 303 from the Norham core and 64 from the exposed section at Burnmouth in the Tweed Basin. Nineteen 304 vertisols occur in the Norham core and 15 at Burnmouth, representing extended periods of 305 stabilized floodplain. Some 60 % of the vertisols have a gleyed top indicating that the soils were 306 finally flooded by surface waters (Kearsey *et al.* 2016).

Few palaeosols are described in the archived borehole logs (Table 2). In the Glasgow and
 Ayrshire logs there are sporadic mentions of 'seatearths' and 'seat clay', typically associated with
 carbonized root traces; the absence of coals capping these suggest that they probably equate to the

Page **11** of **36** 

310 gleyed inceptisols of Kearsey et al. (2016). Roots in the top of sandstone beds are likely the entisols 311 described by Kearsey et al. (2016). However, the depth and form of rooting is not given. Massive, 312 red-, brown- and yellow-mottled siltstone, particularly in the East Lothian boreholes and sporadically 313 elsewhere, might suggest that vertisols are also present there, but indicative evidence of vertic 314 cracks and pedogenic slickensides is missing. However, in many of the logs from the west and north 315 of the Midland Valley, the high proportion of laminated grey siltstone present would seem to 316 preclude the presence of well-developed palaeosols from those parts of the succession. This is also 317 the case with the Glenrothes core, visual inspection of which showed the presence of very few 318 palaeosols of any type.

#### 319 3.5. Sandy siltstone

Matrix-supported sandy siltstone with millimetre-sized rock clasts and bioclasts was first described 320 321 from the Ballagan Formation from the Norham core and at Burnmouth by Bennett et al. (2016). The 322 146 and 71 beds respectively from the two sections are mostly less than 1 m thick; sandy siltstone 323 comprises about 6 % of the succession and typically overlies palaeosols or desiccated horizons. The 324 deposits have lateral extents of up to several tens of metres at Burnmouth. The beds are inferred to 325 have been generated by episodes of high rainfall and deposited as unconfined, cohesive flows across 326 the floodplain, forming temporary pools and small lakes. Bennett et al. (2016) suggested that 327 because of the small size of the clasts, the facies could be misinterpreted as a massive siltstone, with 328 colour varying from black, grey and red to light green. Thus, it is likely that the sandy siltstone facies 329 is more widespread in the Ballagan Formation than hitherto reported. This facies is not described in 330 many of the borehole logs throughout the Midland Valley, but inspection of the Glenrothes core revealed at least three beds in the Mains of Errol Member. Described in the logs as 'mudstone 331 332 breccia', these are 10-44 cm thick and composed of greenish grey (?)dolomitic siltstone with 333 elongate irregular clasts of dark grey siltstone (Fig. 8E).

#### 334 3.6. Fauna and flora

335 The Ballagan Formation has a generally sparse and low-diversity invertebrate fauna dominated by 336 bivalves (particularly Modiolus latus), ostracods, shrimps and other arthropods (Cater et al. 1989), along with rarer occurrences of Spirorbis, Serpula and scolecodonts (Bennett et al. 2017). In a few 337 338 beds invertebrates may be locally common (Brand 2018), and Modiolus and ostracods can occur in 339 large numbers (Williams et al. 2005, 2006). By contrast, the vertebrate fauna appears to have been 340 diverse with actinopterygians, dipnoans, chondrichthyans, acanthodians and tetrapods (e.g. 341 Andrews 1985; Gardiner 1985; Clack 2002; Clack & Finney 2005; Smithson et al. 2012, 2016; 342 Carpenter et al. 2015; Clack et al. 2016; Richards et al. in press; Smithson & Clack in press). A varied 343 flora has been reported from plant elements and palynomorphs (Scott & Meyer-Berthaud 1985;

344 Retallack & Dilcher 1988; Bateman & Scott 1990; Stephenson et al. 2004); furthermore,

indeterminate plant debris is a ubiquitous component of many lithofacies.

In the BGS fossil collections (Brand 2018), most of the invertebrate species from the Ballagan Formation are considered to be either non-marine or euryhaline. Important indicators of terrestrial lakes are the sporadic conchostracans which occur in the Midland Valley and Tweed Basin, but which are absent from the Northumberland – Solway Basin (Fig. 10). Recorded from several levels in most of the boreholes (Figs 4, 5, 9), they are particularly abundant in the East Linton Borehole (340.66-347.50 m depth), where specimens were recorded from 8 levels within 8 m of dark purple and grey, bedded or poorly bedded, mudstone and siltstone.

353 There is no sedimentary evidence for fully established open marine conditions across the 354 Midland Valley and Tweed Basin: for example, carbonate rocks of this type are absent, as are 355 successions indicative of the upward transition from storm wave-base to shore face. Beach and tidal 356 deposits have also not been reported. However, marine fossils are recorded sporadically. Typically, 357 the occurrences are restricted to a single taxon per interval and include orthocone nautiloids, the 358 bivalves Schizodus pentlandicus?, Phestia traquairi, Sanguinolites cf. clavatus, S. aff. 359 striatolamellosus and S. cf. roxburgensis, Cardiomorpha, very rare rhynchonellid brachiopods and 360 Lingula mytilloides. The shells are disarticulated or fragmentary, except at one level (496.17 m 361 depth) from the Norham Borehole where an articulated Phestia traquairi was found vertical to bedding, in life position. Sanguinolites, Cardiomorpha, orthocones and brachiopods occur in the 362 363 west of the Midland Valley, notably in Ayrshire but also near Glasgow (Fig. 10). Also, four marine 364 intervals are present in the lower part of the Blairmulloch Farm Borehole. Similarly, an orthocone 365 and Sanguinolites occur near the top of succession in the East Dron Borehole. Larger marine 366 macrofossils occur at five intervals in the Norham core. In stark contrast, at outcrop along the 367 northern flank of the Northumberland Basin, records of marine species are more widespread and 368 assemblages from individual localities are more varied (Fig. 10; Brand 2018).

369 A significantly greater cryptic marine influence has been demonstrated from 128 thin beds in 370 the Norham core of a Chondrites ichnofacies, particularly within dolostones of the saline-hypersaline 371 lake facies association (Bennett et al. 2017). These occurrences are described as single-tier 372 colonisations, with a high ichnofabric index. By contrast, very few bioturbated cementstone beds 373 were recorded in the Midland Valley borehole logs, where burrows and bioturbation are most 374 commonly recorded in mudstone and siltstone (Table 2; Figs 3, 4, 5). 'Flat' burrows were noted in 375 some finer grained rocks and simple vertical burrows in sandstone, but there are few records of the 376 ichnotaxa present. Exceptions are in the East Linton Borehole where ?Monocraterion and Planolites

Page 13 of 36

- 377 were recorded from ripple-bedded sandstone. Eighteen beds containing scolecodont (marine
- polychaete) jaws were identified from grey siltstones in the Norham core (Bennett *et al.* 2017)
  providing more evidence of cryptic marine incursions.

### 380 4. Palaeogeography

381 The new map (Fig. 11) combines elements of the palaeogeography from throughout the Tournaisian, 382 a period of some 12 million years. The map shows areas of more elevated land with a coastal 383 floodplain occupying a broad swath through the Midland Valley into the Tweed Basin, and 384 connected east of the Southern Uplands and Cheviot massifs to a shallow seaway in the 385 Northumberland – Solway Basin. The western Midland Valley is connected through Northern Ireland 386 to full marine conditions in the south of Ireland (Clayton & Higgs, 1979; Clayton et al. 1986). At 387 times, shallow saline lagoons were established in the Belfast Lough area, as evidenced by the 388 presence of stromatolites at Cultra (Clayton 1986), and the thick succession of dolostone and 389 evaporite containing marine invertebrates proved in the Belfast Harbour Borehole suggest restricted 390 marine conditions (Smith 1986). The coastlines migrated from time to time in the Northumberland – 391 Solway Basin (Sherwin 2018), but storm-driven marine flooding (Bennett et al. 2017) reached much 392 greater extents into the western Midland Valley and in the east.

393 Over most of the region, floodplain lakes and overbank facies are juxtaposed. Three 394 floodplain-lake successions hosting significant fish communities are indicated on the Isle of Bute 395 (Carpenter et al. 2015) in the Midland Valley, at Foulden in the Tweed Basin (Wood & Rolfe 1985; 396 Clarkson 1985) and in Coomsdon Burn on the flanks of the Northumberland – Solway Basin (Fig. 11; 397 Moy-Thomas 1938). Detailed distributions are given where known for small-scale temporary inland 398 ponds (see below), sabkhas and perennial hypsersaline lakes; the early Tournaisian Mains of Errol 399 alkaline lakes in Fife and Tayside are also shown. Forested areas are known from the Tweed Basin 400 and on the Isle of Bute, but were probably more extensive, particularly adjacent to upland massifs. 401 The approximate likely extent of the belt of fluvial sandbodies that dominated the east of the 402 Midland Valley and Tweed Basin in the upper part of the succession is indicated (Fig. 11). Alluvial 403 fans along the margin of the Southern Uplands and Cheviot massifs are early features. The 404 environments of the Northumberland – Solway Basin are described only briefly for context.

#### 405 **4.1. Massifs**

Tournaisian strata are absent from the isolated outcrops of Carboniferous rocks in the western part of the Highlands of Scotland, which has long been regarded as terrestrial in the Tournaisian. This upland may have extended south to the Ochil Fault (Figs 1, 11), though this is difficult to prove. The Lower Devonian Ochil Volcanic Formation, which today forms the eponymous hills, comprises

Page 14 of 36

2400 m of largely subaerial volcanic rocks that interdigitate north-eastwards with fluvial and
lacustrine rocks of the Arbuthnott Group (Stephenson *et al.* 1999). Though the sedimentary strata
may have been buried by up to about 3 km of later strata by the late Carboniferous (Marshall *et al.*1994), it is possible that the core of the volcanic massif in what is now Fife and Tayside remained
elevated through early Carboniferous times.

415 South of the Midland Valley, an upland massif of Lower Palaeozoic rocks is inferred to approximate to the area of the modern-day Southern Uplands, extending south-westwards to 416 417 include the Longford–Down massif in Northern Ireland. The Sanguhar and Thornhill coalfields crop out in a northerly trending half graben within the Southern Uplands. The oldest Carboniferous rocks 418 419 are Pendleian in the former coalfield and upper Visean in the latter (Davies 1970; McMillan 2002). 420 Furthermore, on the northern margin of the Northumberland – Solway Basin northerly derived 421 palaeocurrent directions in the Whita Sandstone at the base of the Ballagan Formation suggest that 422 the massif was a source of sediment and probably remained significantly elevated for much of the 423 Tournaisian (Nairn 1958; Leeder 1974b).

424 Though the lower Tournaisian basalts of the Northumberland – Solway Basin margin were 425 rapidly buried by the Ballagan Formation (Leeder 1974a), the eroded remains of the Middle 426 Devonian Cheviot volcano probably stood above the floodplain. Relict outcrops of Ballagan 427 Formation in the intervening ground suggest that the Cheviot massif was separated from the 428 Southern Uplands. On the flanks of the Cheviot massif, alluvial fan conglomerates at Roddam Dene, 429 Ramshope Burn and Windy Gyle reworked the volcanic rocks and granite (Purnell & Cossey 2004). 430 These rocks are thought to be coeval with the Kinnesswood Formation (Stone et al. 2010) and are 431 therefore latest Devonian in age (Marshall et al. this volume). Seismic mapping and borehole 432 interpretation across the Mid North Sea High suggest that several small elevated areas also persisted 433 eastwards across the coastal plain (Arsenikos et al. 2018; Kearsey et al. 2018), like an archipelago 434 separating the Tweed and Northumberland – Solway basins. To the south of the latter basin, the 435 Manx – Lake District – Alston Block was also terrestrial at this time, with fluvial (possibly as valley 436 fills) and alluvial fan deposits of the Marsett Formation on the northern flank of the Lake District and 437 on the present day Pennine escarpment suggesting that that block had some relief (Burgess & 438 Holliday 1979).

Pointers to the location of the margins of upland areas are indicated in the uppermost part
of the underlying Kinnesswood Formation, by local occurrences of massive carbonate-rock, several
metres thick and typically associated with stringers, nodules and irregular masses of chert; these
have been interpreted as super-mature calcretes (Wright *et al.* 1993). Examples occur in Bute (Young

443 & Caldwell 2011), Ayr (Burgess 1961), at Pease Bay [NT 795 712], east of Dunbar (Clough et al. 1910; 444 Andrews et al. 1991) and in the Tweed valley, about 5 km SW of Coldstream, where the Carham 445 Limestone is at least 7.5 m thick (Carruthers et al. 1932). These are highly significant as they may 446 represent disconformity with a significant time span (Etthenson *et al.* 1988; Wright *et al.* 1993; 447 Alonso-Zarza 2003). The calcrete-bearing palaeosols may have formed in areas elevated above the 448 floodplain for a long time, perhaps up to several million years, for example as terraces adjacent to upland areas or through tectonic uplift, or on terraces formed by uplift associated with volcanism 449 450 (Leeder 1976; Leeder & Bridges 1978).

#### 451 4.2. Coastal floodplain of the Midland Valley and Tweed basin

452 Over the western and northern parts of the Midland Valley boreholes show abrupt intercalations of 453 facies belonging to the saline – hypersaline and overbank facies associations. Long core runs of grey 454 laminated siltstone suggest perennial floodplain lakes dominated much of the area through the 455 Tournaisian. The common fauna of these rocks are ostracods, which were locally monospecific and 456 in great abundance (Stephenson et al. 2004a; Williams et al. 2006). Stable isotope analysis of the 457 ostracod shells from different communities indicates that salinity of the lakes varied from brackish to 458 saline and hypersaline (Williams et al. 2006), though later work indicated that the ostracods' calcite 459 carapace had been recrystallized as a result of diagenetic alteration (Bennett et al. 2011).

460 It is difficult to estimate the size of the floodplain lakes. Unpublished studies of the 461 laminated siltstone beds and dolostones at Burnmouth and in the Norham core by the authors 462 suggest deposition in very shallow lakes up to a few kilometres across, based on the outcrops of 463 planar beds of dolostone and their thickness on the foreshore at Burnmouth. Dolostones can be 464 traced some 500 m or so, though some are less extensive, but no beds can be correlated between 465 Burnmouth and Norham, a distance of about 10 km. None of the lakes was thought to have been 466 long-lived, with mud-cracks at the top of many of the thin units indicating drying out of the surface. 467 However, the area west and north of Glasgow was repeatedly occupied by lakes throughout most of 468 the formation. Similar lacustrine-dominated successions are recorded in the middle of the formation 469 in the area between Spilmersford and East Linton in East Lothian, some 15 km apart suggesting a 470 substantial area that was persistently occupied by lakes.

Thin intervals of overbank flood and crevasse-splay deposits become dominant sedimentary environments in the upper part of the formation around the Isle of Bute and west of Glasgow. Few palaeosols are recorded from this area though in the East Dron and Glenrothes boreholes in the NE, dried out surfaces are common (Table 2; Fig. 3). Vegetated land seems to have been sparse as indicated by the dominance of floodplain lakes. These features are well demonstrated by Figures 3

Page 16 of 36

476 (Glenrothes Borehole) and 4. Correlation between boreholes is not possible, suggesting a mosaic of
477 juxtaposed and ever-changing sedimentary environments. No aeolian deposits are known, though
478 differentiating these in fine-grained successions may be difficult.

479 A more complex picture occurs in the SE of the Midland Valley and in the Tweed Basin where 480 overbank facies dominate and fluvial channel systems developed (Figs 3, 5). Brackish to saline 481 floodplain lakes continue throughout, but are particularly concentrated in two 30-40 m thick 482 intervals of strata in the upper Tournaisian, as indicated by the base of the Pu Miospore Biozone 483 (Neves & Ioannides 1974; McAdam & Tulloch 1985). Waterlogged palaeosols appear to be more 484 common in this region. Recognition of these is important because these are the likely habitat of the 485 creeping lycopod Oxroadia, the spores of which are abundant where tetrapods have been located in 486 the Burnmouth section (Clack et al. 2016). In the upper part of the succession in the Tweed Basin 487 (Kearsey et al. 2016) and on the Isle of Bute (Carpenter et al. 2015), well developed reddened 488 vertisols indicative of forests demonstrate areas of greater floodplain stability. Reddened siltstone 489 and mudstone constitute a significant proportion of boreholes in the SE of the Midland Valley, 490 suggesting that vertisols may have developed more widely in this region, but descriptions are 491 insufficient to be secure in the interpretation.

492 4.2.1. Perennial floodplain lakes with vertebrate communities. Fragmentary 493 vertebrate material including teeth, scales and spines is a common component of many of the 494 floodplain lake successions. However, at least three of these successions have revealed more 495 abundant and complete specimens within diverse communities that included bivalves, 496 malacostracan crustacea and Spirorbis and these sites are located in Figure 11. The best studied of 497 these is the Foulden Fish Bed which occurs at the top of a lacustrine succession that began 498 development as a lycopod wetland, became a semi-permanent floodplain lake and finally was silted-499 up to return the area to a floodplain environment (Clarkson 1985; Wood & Rolfe 1985). The 500 abundant complete fish remains and beds of shrimps likely represent mass mortality events. Kills of 501 this sort are well known in the seasonal tropics today, for example in northern Australia, where they 502 result from sudden changes in water quality caused by the influx of sediment at the onset of the wet 503 season (e.g. Townsend et al. 1992). The precise position of the Foulden Fish Bed within the Ballagan 504 Formation is not known, though its outcrop location and its CM Miospore Biozone age (Clayton 505 1985) suggest the upper part.

506 Moy-Thomas (1938) described six species of fish from Coomsdon Burn [NY 710 038], in north 507 Northumberland that resemble those seen at Foulden. Exposure in the stream banks today is poor 508 and it is difficult to interpret the sedimentary context of these fossils from the two contrasting

Page 17 of 36

published sedimentary logs of the succession by Day (1970, p. 280) and Cater *et al.* (1989, fig. 6).
However, the presence of nearly complete specimens of both fish and shrimps suggests similar
palaeoenvironments in the upper part of the formation. Carpenter *et al.* (2015) described two fish
beds, possibly from two different stratigraphical levels, on the Isle of Bute. Though the material is
mostly fragmentary, it contains possible juveniles and the community occupied shallow fresh- to
brackish water lakes.

515 4.2.2. Temporary inland ponds. The presence of abundant, small temporary lakes is 516 revealed from the widespread occurrence of conchostracans across the Midland Valley and Tweed 517 Basin (Fig. 10). Tasch (1969, 146-149) described the main habitat of modern conchostracans as small 518 temporary inland ponds, generally no larger than about 0.4 hectares (1 acre) in extent. Modern 519 forms have also been recorded from spring water, from the margins of large lakes in Africa and from 520 coastal salt flats in Brazil. Further, he found that fossil forms may have inhabited temporary pools 521 close to coastal areas subject to fluctuating tides, possibly in lagoons or at shorelines subject to 522 marine inundations. Gueriau et al. (2016) also suggested that conchostracans typically inhabit 523 temporary freshwater environments. Their discovery of resting eggs associated with conchostracans 524 in a late Famennian deposit at Strud in Belgium suggests a mechanism of dispersal from such 525 temporary environments and offers a capability of surviving seasonal desiccation.

526 4.2.3. Sabkhas and hypersaline lakes. In the Tweed Basin evaporite-rocks are most 527 abundant in the lower part of the succession, but elsewhere these rocks occur throughout the 528 formation (Fig. 4). In contrast, evaporite-rocks are notably absent from the SE part of the Midland 529 Valley. Most of the evaporite occurrences are located within areas where there is evidence for 530 marine flooding (see below). Millward et al. (2018) have described this unusual feature of seasonal 531 coastal wetlands that developed in evaporative closed hypersaline lakes and perennial brine pans. 532 Sabkhas, marsh and microbial mats surrounded some of these. Floodplain lake - evaporite cycles 533 were illustrated from the Tweed Basin by Millward et al. (2018, fig 6) whereby flooding events over a 534 palaeosol surface established a floodplain lake with a low diversity ichnofauna and invertebrate 535 assemblage. Subsequent evaporation led to deposition of dolomite and hypersalinity ultimately to 536 gypsum; saline groundwater and marine flooding events recharged the lakes.

4.2.4. Mains of Errol alkaline lakes. The reddened and pseudobrecciated dolostone beds
that comprise most of the Mains of Errol Member in the NE of the Midland Valley probably
represent similar lakes that were hypersaline and alkaline: repeated episodes of dolomite
precipitation in shallow evaporating lakes, which dried out and desiccated. The very sparse, low-

diversity fauna and lack of bioturbation suggest that these lakes were not conducive to life. Theabsence of roots suggests that the dried out lake beds were barren.

543 4.2.5. Fluvial systems. The occurrence of thick packages of fluvial sandstone and 544 dominance of overbank siltstones over floodplain lakes suggests that a major fluvial system persisted 545 for much of the Tournaisian in the east of the Midland Valley. Palaeocurrent indicators show 546 sediment transport to the SW in the Tweed Basin, presumably contributing to the sediment budget 547 of the Northumberland – Solway Basin. The fluvial systems appear to be integral components of the 548 palaeoenvironment (Bennett et al. 2016), and no valley systems are recognized at outcrop. Lateral 549 accretion deposits characterize some of the sandstone bodies, suggesting that meandering systems 550 dominated, though braided systems were also present. At times, sand appears to have also been 551 diverted by the NE extent of the Southern Uplands massif along its Midland Valley margin. However, 552 the SW extent of these sandstone bodies is unclear, as very little sand characterizes the Ayrshire 553 succession. Though the source of the sand is not known because no heavy mineral studies have been 554 published yet, derivation is likely from somewhere northwards along the North Sea to the Greenland 555 or Norway Caledonides mountains (Cliff et al. 1991; Coward 1993).

In the rest of the Midland Valley fine sand appears to have been distributed mostly by overbank flooding and small streams. In the area north of Glasgow, the small proportion of fine sand suggests that there was no significant volume of sediment supplied from the north. Late in the Tournaisian in Fife, overbank flooding and small streams supplied sediment, either from the north, or more likely from the major river system. Some alluvial fan deposits were likely localized along the northern flank of the Southern Uplands massif in Ayrshire for example (Monaghan 2004).

562 The intercalations of volcaniclastic rocks are localized to a small area adjacent to the NE extent of the Southern Upland massif. In the written logs, use of the terms tuff and agglomerate 563 564 implies that these rocks represent primary pyroclastic deposits rather than contemporaneously re-565 sedimented ash or eroded and reworked older volcanic rocks. Such a distinction is difficult to make 566 from the descriptions, particularly as other sedimentary lithologies form a component of some beds 567 and could have been included as pyroclasts or through erosion of substrate material. However, the 568 volcaniclastic beds intercalated with Ballagan facies at the top of the formation, beneath the 569 Garleton Hills Volcanic Formation (Fig. 5), probably represents the initial explosive eruptions, or 570 contemporaneous fluvial reworking of such deposits.

571 The derivation of the volcaniclastic rocks at lower levels in the formation in the East Linton 572 and Spilmersford boreholes (Fig. 5) is enigmatic. Though basaltic volcanism preceded the Ballagan Formation in the Northumberland – Solway Basin, the only record of contemporary volcanism
elsewhere in northern Britain during the Tournaisian is at Heads of Ayr (Stephenson *et al.* 2002).
Thus, it seems likely that the volcaniclastic rocks in the east of the Midland Valley were eroded from
older outcrops, transported and re-deposited in river systems. The closest source is the Lower
Devonian volcanoes near Eyemouth and these may have had a more extensive outcrop at the time.
However, no palaeocurrent or geochemical data are available to support this inference.

4.2.6. Marine flooding. The sporadic occurrences in the succession of this area yielding
low diversity marine taxa suggest cryptic marine events. Bennett *et al.* (2017) clearly demonstrated
that such intervals were abundant in the Tweed Basin from the presence of 128 beds containing
single tier colonizations of *Chondrites* in the 500 m thick succession of the Norham Borehole. They
attributed emplacement of the burrowing fauna to storm surges.

The marine taxa seen in the western part of the Midland Valley include Cardiomorpha and 584 585 brachiopods such as Lingula, which are not seen in the Tweed Basin and Fife. This suggests that their marine connections were from different directions; their emplacement may represent true marine 586 587 transgressions, rather than surges. A pathway from Ayrshire to the SW is likely, on the grounds that 588 brachiopods are recorded from the coeval and sedimentologically similar Ballycultra Formation in 589 Northern Ireland (Griffith & Wilson 1982). The Tweed Basin is, by contrast, much closer to the more 590 marine Northumberland – Solway Basin and here the storm surges could have been funnelled inland 591 along drowned river systems. The presence of two marine intervals near the top of the East Dron 592 succession is more difficult to understand, though here again access could have been via the same 593 route and these two events probably represent the most energetic storms seen.

### 594 4.3. Marginal marine Northumberland – Solway Basin.

595 A narrow coastal floodplain existed along the southern margin of the Southern Uplands massif 596 (Leeder 1974b). The basalt lavas of the Birrenswark Volcanic Formation were buried beneath fluvial 597 sands of the Whita Sandstone Member at the base of the Ballagan Formation. The sandstone unit 598 comprises up to 500 m of massive and cross-bedded, fine to coarse-grained sandstone in typically 599 fining upwards units up to 6 m thick (Lumsden et al. 1967; Leeder 1974b). It is clean, carbonate 600 cemented and without the characteristic micaceous and carbonaceous partings of most other 601 Ballagan sandstones. Leeder (1974b) interpreted these as fluvial channel deposits derived from the 602 Southern Uplands massif. Floodplain siltstones and thin dolostones are interbedded with the Whita 603 sandstone units, but there are very few palaeosols. Surface exposures reveal little evidence of 604 evaporite deposits in this belt, with the exception of the Hoddom Borehole, near Ecclefechan, which

Page 20 of 36

proved abundant layers and nodules of gypsum deposited in a perennial brine pan (Millward *et al.*2018).

To the SW, bordering the Solway Firth, Maguire *et al.* (1996) interpreted early Mississippian environments. Coarsely clastic alluvial fan deposits built up adjacent to the active syn-depositional Solway – Gilnockie faults marking the southern margin of the Southern Uplands massif and were bordered by low relief coastal plains. Prograding deltas, supplied with sediment along the axis of the basin, along with lime muds and storm emplaced sheet sands were deposited in a shallow offshore region. Biostratigraphical control on some of the sections in this area is poor and only some of these rocks may be Tournaisian in age.

614 Sherwin (2018) described mixed marginal marine and vegetated floodplain environments 615 with vertebrate remains from three sites along the northern edge of the basin that further illustrate 616 the proximity and migration of contemporary coastlines. The succession in Whitrope Burn [NY 507 617 965], near Langholm comprises carbonate rocks, deposited by high density turbidity currents into a sheltered lagoon (Richards et al. in press). Some beds contain an abundant and diverse assemblage 618 619 of shark teeth. At Coldstream (Fig. 1), and in the River Coquet, south of the Cheviot massif, shallow 620 marine carbonate, coarsening-upward bay-fill, and near-shore facies assemblages are intercalated 621 with a vegetated floodplain facies assemblage.

Further southward toward the basin depocentre, there is increasing evidence of marine conditions, which are characteristic of the Lyne Formation. There are coarsening upward siltstone to fine sandstone units, interpreted as bay fills (Leeder 1974b). The dolostones are replaced by carbonate rocks, some including stromatolitic bioherms and oncolite beds, whereas others contain an abundant and diverse marine fauna including crinoids, foraminifera and brachiopods (Fig. 10; Leeder 1975a, b; Brand 2018).

628 In the centre of the Northumberland–Solway Basin, 1153 m of anhydrite-bearing carbonate 629 rocks and mudstone within the Lyne Formation were proved in the Easton No 1 well, north of 630 Carlisle (Fig. 1; Ward 1997). The uppermost part of the evaporite succession is upper Chadian -631 lower Arundian (Ward 1997), but the age of the lower part is not well constrained biostratigraphically and may be of Tournaisian age. The succession contains about 120 anhydrite 632 633 beds ranging from 30 cm to 7.9 m thick with some of the thickest evaporite units in the lower part. 634 The subsurface extent of these evaporites mapped by Ward (1997) may extend eastwards to the 635 Newcastle area. Sulphate deposits cementing Permian breccias along the Ninety-Fathom Fault and 636 from brines encountered in the local collieries (Younger et al. 2016) may have been derived from

Page 21 of 36

this deep source. Ward (1997) suggested that the evaporites were deposited in salinas, but thethickness and association with carbonate rocks suggests a restricted marine environment.

#### 639 5. Discussion

640 The facies change at the base of the Ballagan Formation signals a profound change in the 641 paleoenvironments along this part of the southern margin of Laurussia. The upper Devonian 642 Kinnesswood Formation represents braided or meandering river channels filling several small 643 depocentres in the Midland Valley (Read et al. 2002), while in southern Scotland rivers fed sediment 644 from the catchments into an elongate, north-eastwards orientated endorheic basin (Leeder 1976). 645 Throughout, calcrete-bearing palaeosols developed on stable alluvial terraces in a semi-arid seasonal 646 climate (Burgess 1961; Leeder 1976; Wright et al. 1993). In late Famennian times (Marshall et al. this 647 volume), basalt lava and pyroclastic rocks were erupted from volcanoes during rapid extension along 648 the northern margin of the Northumberland – Solway Basin. The change to a wetland regime was 649 likely brought about by a combination of events related to the juxtaposition of Gondwana and 650 Laurussia causing fragmentation of the continental margin and opening of strike-slip basins through 651 the region, and to climate change (Coward 1993; Falcon-Lang 1999; Domeier & Torsvik 2014). 652 Contemporary faulting played a significant role in the particularly thick accumulation of Tournaisian to Chadian strata in the Northumberland – Solway Basin (Chadwick et al. 1995). Subsidence related 653 654 to the major faults bounding the Southern Uplands is inferred from the presence of alluvial fan 655 deposits, and at Dunbar, for example by local thickening of the flood-plain sedimentary rocks toward 656 the fault.

657 The analysis presented here of the Ballagan Formation extends the detailed picture that has 658 emerged from recent studies of the Norham cores and the coastal section at Burnmouth by Bennett et al. (2016, 2017), Kearsey et al. (2016) and Millward et al. (2018) across the Tweed and Midland 659 660 Valley basins. The spatially and temporally diverse set of palaeoenvironments defines a tropical, 661 strongly seasonal, coastal wetland with very low relief landscape, developed in the hinterland of an 662 archipelago of more elevated landmasses. Abundant fresh to brackish water, saline and hypersaline 663 floodplain lakes co-existed on the floodplain. Evaporation of some of the closed saline and 664 hypersaline lakes during the dry season, or drier intervals formed sabkhas. Microbial mats were 665 associated with these areas (Millward et al. 2018). A persistent, dominantly meandering, fluvial 666 system in the east of the region hosts the greatest diversity of terrestrial habitats with the riparian 667 strip extensively vegetated as indicated by a diverse suite of palaeosols ranging from ephemeral 668 plant colonies to marsh and forest (Retallack & Dilcher 1988; Kearsey et al. 2016). Forest habitats 669 were also present at times along the northern margin in the Isle of Bute (Carpenter et al. 2015), but

the true extent of such habitats is poorly known because of low confidence in the interpretation of
palaeosols in the archived borehole data. Other areas were dominated by perennial floodplain lakes.
By contrast, rainfall, overbank and marine flooding distributed sediment across the floodplain during
the wet season, forming and recharging lakes (Bennett *et al.* 2016, 2017). The large lateral extents
reached during the storm surges suggest that the floodplain had very low relief and was only just
above sea level.

676 High rainfall during tropical storms likely formed many of the floodplain lakes. However, 677 storm surges caused marine flooding from the SW and northward into the east of the region, 678 reaching significant parts of the Midland Valley and at times as far north as Fife and Tayside, some 679 140 km due north of the nearest likely coastline. Are such distances supported from modern 680 examples? Williams (2009) and Goodbred & Hine (1995) documented the transport by storm surges 681 of sediment containing sporadic marine fossils inland from the Louisiana and Florida coasts 682 respectively for distances up to 6 km. However, far greater distances have been recorded 683 occasionally. The storm surge associated with the category 1 hurricane Isaac in Louisiana in 2012 684 caused the Mississippi river to flow upstream for a distance of 480 river kilometres and at about two-thirds of this distance the river level was still 2.6 m above normal (Berg 2012). Substantial areas 685 686 were flooded to depths up to 5 m, though the deepest water was recorded adjacent to man-made 687 levees.

Another factor may have contributed to the extensive existence of saline and hypersaline lakes. Evaporation in the coastal lagoons and marshes during the dry season may have initiated the upstream flow of saline water when there is low fresh water runoff. This was demonstrated for example by Barusseau *et al.* (1985) to occur in the Salum and Gambia rivers of West Africa. There the effects of a 'salinity tide' and increasing salinity inland are seen up-river for up to 250 km.

693 Many equatorial coastal zones, for example around the Gulf of Mexico, in Florida and Ghana, are barred with barrier islands protecting lagoons. Breaching of the barriers during tropical storms 694 695 can increase the flooded area hugely and this could have been a further mechanism of flooding the 696 Ballagan wetlands. However, barrier island deposits have low preservation potential and their 697 recognition in the geological record is difficult. Sherwin (2018) considered the possibility of such an 698 origin for a succession of planar bedded, wave-rippled sandstones in Coquetdale, though these rocks 699 overlie floodplain strata and were more likely to have represented transgression, establishing more 700 open bay conditions.

Page 23 of 36

701 Though the Ballagan floodplain was dynamic in that local sedimentary environments 702 changed from time to time, probably instigated by river flooding events, the coastal wetland regime 703 remained remarkably constant for the duration of the Tournaisian, a period of at least 12 million 704 years. The succession is aggradational, in which a delicate balance was maintained between 705 subsidence, compaction and sedimentation rates to keep the floodplain just above sea level. Few 706 hiatuses in the succession are seen and are mostly evident in erosive channels at the base of fluvial 707 sandstone units. Another exception is the floodplain terraces represented in the succession at 708 Eastern Hole near Pease Bay on the NE margin of the Southern Uplands massif where the formation 709 is substantially thinner than in nearby areas (Andrews et al. 1991). Preservation of delicate 710 desiccated and cracked surfaces (Bennett et al. 2016; Kearsey et al. 2016), and abundant palaeosols 711 testify to continued 'passive' burial of the floodplain. Time gaps of centuries to thousands of years 712 are mostly evident in the substantial number of vertisols that are seen in the upper part of the 713 succession in the Norham Borehole and at Burnmouth (Kearsey et al. 2016).

Johnson (1982) likened the landscape of northern England during Mississippian times to that of the Gulf Coast plain of SE USA today. However, the picture that has emerged during Tournaisian times is not of a floodplain associated with a major delta system. That scenario was initiated in Arundian times with the onset of the Fell Sandstone fluvial distributive system and the overlying Yoredale facies (Kearsey *et al.* 2018). Modern analogues for the Ballagan Formation appear to be few, despite an extensive search.

The Everglades of southern Florida demonstrate some aspects in common. This area has a seasonal climate and is frequently inundated by tropical storms. Freshwater and brackish lakes and marshes are abundant; palustrine carbonates and peats are accumulating; and desiccation features and pedogenic overprinting are widespread (Platt & Wright 1992). These give way at the coast to marginal marine conditions, and offshore in the Bahamas, gypsum precipitates within the carbonate system (Glunk *et al.* 2011).

726 The seasonal wetlands of the Pantanal of Brazil in South America has a precipitation rate of 727 about 1100 mm per year, similar to that estimated for the Ballagan Formation by Kearsey et al. 728 (2016); during the wet season the wetland is flooded through the major rivers (Costa et al. 2015). 729 The landscape is gently undulating with variations in elevation of up to 5 m, but the overall gradient 730 across the region is less than 1%. A major feature of the southern part of the region is the juxtaposition on the floodplain of round to elongate freshwater and saline lakes; the latter are 731 732 locally concentrated. Typically, the saline lakes have surface areas of less than 0.15 km<sup>2</sup> and are at a 733 slightly lower elevation than the freshwater lakes covering areas of up to 0.8 km<sup>2</sup> (Costa *et al.* 2015).

Page 24 of 36

The pH of the saline lakes is greater than 9 and, though carbonate minerals are precipitated, the
lakes never dry out and gypsum or halite is unknown. Seasonal drainage channels provide
connections between the lakes and rivers and the intervening areas are covered in forest or open,
mainly herbaceous, cover vegetation.

The vast expanse of the northern Great Plains of western Canada is characterized by undulating topography and hosts many hyposaline to hypersaline and alkaline lakes with surface areas that vary from a few tens of metres across to the immense Lake Manitoba (Last & Slezak 1988). Some of the hypersaline lakes are meromictic; carbonate sediment accumulation is common with gypsum and other evaporitic salts in some. Large rivers traverse the region and there are many regions of endorheic drainage. The climate is cold and semi-arid.

Comparative examples in the geological record are sparse too. The lower Cretaceous Leza Formation of the Cameros Basin in NE Spain contains evidence for a coastal wetland setting, with a low diversity biota, terrestrial sediments with a range of edaphic features, lacustrine environments from freshwater to hypersaline, and leading into a transition to the marine environment; alluvial fans fed clastic detritus into some lakes (Suarez-Gonzalez *et al.* 2015).

The Late Miocene Solimoes Formation in the Amazon Basin comprises a thick vertebratebearing succession of typically red or blue-grey, fine-grained sandstones and mudstones (Latrubesse *et al.* 2010). The sandstones are stacked river-channel deposits of avulsive Andean megafans and floodplain distributaries. The mudstones are lacustrine and floodplain deposits with pedogenic layers, abundant desiccation cracks and some gypsum veins. Latrubesse *et al.* (2010) interpreted the succession as an extensive wetland that lay between the Andes and the Purus Arch, prior to development of the current Amazon River system.

756 Fluvial and lacustrine environments are intercalated in the Miocene Siwalik Group in 757 northern Pakistan. Laminated siltstones, decimetres to several metres thick, were deposited in lakes 758 estimated to have water depths of no more than 14 m and many less than 10 m; the lakes were from 759 a few hundred metres to 25 km across (Zaleha 1997). Desiccation cracks are common and siltstone 760 beds typically overlie palaeosols. Units of very fine- to medium-grained sandstone are generally 5-10 m thick, though some exceed 100 m and comprise up to 10 storeys. The sedimentary 761 762 characteristics indicate these to be river-channel deposits. Thin sandstone beds intercalated with 763 mudstone are thought to have been deposited from non-channelized and channelized flows during 764 flood episodes (Zaleha 1997).

Page 25 of 36

765 None of these examples is a particularly good fit for the early Mississippian Ballagan 766 palaeoenvironments. The Northern Great Plains, Pantanal, Siwalik Group and Solimoes Formation 767 are all located in tectonic settings different from that of the Ballagan Formation. A coastal setting 768 with transition to marginal marine is present only in the Everglades and the Leza Formation. Tropical 769 seasonal climates are present in the Siwalik Group, Pantanal and the Everglades. However, none of 770 these successions hosts evaporites in abundance comparable with the Ballagan Formation. Primary 771 dolostones are absent from all, though palustrine carbonates are a characteristic of the Everglades. 772 However, the Great Plains, Siwalik Group and Solimoes Formation are examples of the association of 773 lacustrine and fluvial systems. Furthermore, lakes of various salinities characterize both the Great 774 Plains and Pantanal regions. The Leza Formation has perhaps the best range of comparable 775 palaeoenvironments, though the wetland was small, estimated to have been about 10 x 30 km, was 776 not equatorial and evaporites are a minor component; though alluvial fans fed sediment into lakes, 777 established fluvial systems were absent. These examples serve to illustrate the unusual nature of the 778 Ballagan wetlands.

#### 779 6. Conclusions

780 The Ballagan Formation is an unusual example in the geological record of a succession with 781 abundant lacustrine deposits of various scales and salinities, interspersed with fluvial and evaporitic 782 facies within a tropical, seasonal, coastal wetland palaeoenvironmental setting. It has few parallels in 783 the literature, particularly with the abundance of small-scale evaporite deposits. An extensive, very 784 low-relief coastal wetland developed along the equatorial southern continental margin of Laurussia 785 and lasted for the 12 million years of the Tournaisian. The Midland Valley and Tweed basins were 786 separated from the marginal marine seaway of the Northumberland – Solway Basin to the south by 787 an archipelago of upland areas.

788 The new palaeogeographical map constructed from borehole and outcrop data across the 789 Midland Valley and Tweed Basin shows the juxtaposition of a mosaic of sedimentary environments 790 from fresh and brackish to saline and hypersaline lakes, a diverse suite of floodplain palaeosols and a 791 persistent fluvial system in the east of the region. The strongly seasonal climate led to episodic 792 flooding, both meteoric and marine, the latter driven from the SW into both the western Midland 793 Valley and Northumberland – Solway Basin; marine flooding also reached the Tweed Basin and 794 Tayside in the east via the river floodplain. The sedimentary environments and palaeosol types 795 indicate a broad mosaic of different terrestrial and aquatic habitats that hosted a diverse vertebrate 796 fauna that included tetrapods which had, for the first time, terrestrial capability. The areal size of the 797 region is comparable to that of coastal wetlands today, such as the Everglades of southern Florida.

## 798 Acknowledgements

- 799 This research formed part of the TW:eed Project (Tetrapod World: early evolution and
- 800 diversification), led by Jenny Clack (University Museum of Zoology, Cambridge) and funded by
- 801 N.E.R.C. consortium grants to the British Geological Survey (NE/J021067/1) and the Universities of
- 802 Leicester (NE/J020729/1) and Southampton (NE/J021091/1). The authors are grateful for the helpful
- 803 comments of two anonymous referees. DM, PJB, TIK and MAEB publish with the permission of the
- 804 Executive Director, British Geological Survey (N.E.R.C.).
- 805

# 806 **REFERENCES**

- Alonso-Zarza, A. M. 2003. Palaeoenvironmental significance of palustrine carbonates and calcretes in
   the geological record. *Earth-Science Reviews* 60, 261-298.
- Anderson, J. S., Smithson, T., Mansky, C. F., Meyer, T. & Clack, J. 2015. A diverse tetrapod fauna at
  the base of 'Romer's Gap'. *PLoS ONE*, **10**, 1-27.
- Anderton, R. 1985. Sedimentology of the Dinantian of Foulden, Berwickshire, Scotland. *Transactions*of the Royal Society of Edinburgh: Earth Sciences **76**, 7-12.
- Andrews, J. E. & Nabi, G. 1994. Lithostratigraphy of the Dinantian Inverclyde and Strathclyde Groups,
  Cockburnspath Outlier, East Lothian–North Berwickshire. *Scottish Journal of Geology* **30**, 105-119.
- Andrews, J. E. & Nabi, G. 1998. Palaeoclimatic significance of calcretes in the Dinantian of the
- 816 Cockburnspath Outlier (East Lothian-North Berwickshire). *Scottish Journal of Geology* **34**, 153-164.
- Andrews, J. E., Turner, M. S., Nabi, G. & Spiro, B. 1991. The anatomy of an early Dinantian terraced
  floodplain: palaeo-environment and early diagenesis. *Sedimentology* 38, 271-287.
- 819 Andrews, S. M. 1985. Rhizodont crossopterygian fish from the Dinantian of Foulden, Berwickshire,
- 820 Scotland, with a re-evaluation of this group. *Transactions of the Royal Society of Edinburgh: Earth*
- 821 Sciences **76**, 67-95
- Arsenikos, S., Quinn, M. F., Kimbell, G., Williamson, P., Pharaoh, T., Leslie, G. & Monaghan, A. A.
- 823 2018. Structural development of the Devono-Carboniferous plays of the UK North Sea. In Monaghan,
- A. A., Underhill, J. R., Hewett, A. J. & Marshall, J. E. A. (eds) *Paleozoic plays of NW Europe* Geological
- Society of London Special Publication 471. https://doi.org/10.1144/SP471.3
- 826 Bateman, R. M. & Scott, A. C. 1990. A reappraisal of the Dinantian floras at Oxroad Bay, East Lothian,
- 827 Scotland. 2. Volcanicity, palaeoenvironments and palaeoecology. *Transactions of the Royal Society of*
- 828 Edinburgh: Earth Sciences **81**, 161-194.
- Belt, E. S., Freshney, E. C. & Read, W. A. 1967. Sedimentology of Carboniferous cementstone facies,
  British Isles and Eastern Canada. *The Journal of Geology* **75**, 711-721.
- 831 Bennett, C. E., Williams, M., Leng, M. J., Siveter, D. J., Davies, S. J., Sloane, H. J. & Wilkinson, I. P.
- 832 2011. Diagenesis of fossil ostracods: implications for stable isotope based palaeoenvironmental
- reconstruction. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* **305**, 150-161.

- 834 Bennett, C. E., Kearsey, T. I., Davies, S. J., Millward, D., Clack, J. A., Smithson, T. R. & Marshall, J. E. A.
- 835 2016. Early Mississippian sandy siltstones preserve rare vertebrate fossils in seasonal flooding
- 836 episodes. *Sedimentology* **63**, 1677-1700.

837 Bennett, C. E., Howard, A. S., Davies, S. J., Kearsey, T. I., Millward, D., Brand, P. J., Browne, M. A. E.

838 Reeves, E. J. & Marshall, J. E. A. 2017. Ichnofauna record cryptic marine incursions onto a coastal

839 floodplain at a key early Mississippian tetrapod site. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology,* 

- 840 *Palaeoecology* **468**, 287-300.
- Berg, R. 2012. Tropical Cyclone Report: Hurricane Isaac (AL092012). National Hurricane Center, 78
  pp. www.nhc.noaa.gov
- Brand, P. J. 2018. A list of fossil specimens in the BGS biostratigraphy collections from the Ballagan
  Formation in Scotland and from the former Lower Border Group of the Northumberland-Solway
- 845 Basin. British Geological Survey Internal Report IR/18/03.

Browne, M. A. E. 1980. The Upper Devonian and Lower Carboniferous (Dinantian) of the Firth of Tay,
Scotland. Institute of Geological Sciences Report series 80/9.

Browne, M. A. E., Dean, M. T., Hall, I. H. S., McAdam, A. D., Monro, S. K. & Chisholm, J. I. 1999. A

849 lithostratigraphical framework for the Carboniferous rocks of the Midland Valley of Scotland. British

- 850 Geological Survey Research Report RR/99/07.
- Burgess, I. C. 1961. The fossil soils of the Upper Old Red Sandstone of South Ayrshire. *Transactions of the Geological Society of Glasgow* 24, 138-153.
- 853 Burgess, I. C. & Holliday, D. W. 1979. *Geology of the country around Brough-under-Stainmore*.

Memoir of the Geological Survey of Great Britain, sheets 31 and parts of sheets 25 and 30, England and Wales 131 pp. London: HMSO.

Carpenter, D. K., Falcon-Lang, H. J., Benton, M. J. & Henderson, E. 2015. Carboniferous (Tournaisian)
fish assemblages from the Isle of Bute, Scotland: systematics and palaeoecology. *Palaeontology* 57,
1215-1240.

- Carruthers, R. G., Burnett, G. A. & Anderson, W. 1932. *The geology of the Cheviot Hills*. Memoir of
  the Geological Survey England & Wales, explanation of sheets 3 & 5. 174 pp. London: HMSO.
- 861 Cater, J. M. L., Briggs, D. E. G. & Clarkson, E. N. K. 1989. Shrimp-bearing sedimentary successions in
- the Lower Carboniferous (Dinantian) Cementstone and Oil Shale groups of northern Britain.
- Transactions of the Royal Society of Edinburgh: Earth Sciences **80**, 5-15.
- Chadwick, R. A., Holliday, D. W., Holloway, S. & Hulbert, A. G. 1995. *The structure and evolution of the Northumberland-Solway Basin and adjacent areas*. Subsurface memoir of the British Geological
  Survey. 90 pp. London: HMSO.
- Chisholm, J. I. & Dean J. M. 1974. The Upper Old Red Sandstone of Fife and Kinross: a fluviatile sequence with evidence of marine incursion. *Scottish Journal of Geology* **10**, 1-30.

- 869 Chisholm, J. I., McAdam, A. D. & Brand, P. J. 1989. Lithostratigraphical classification of Upper
- British Geological Survey Technical Report
  WA/89/26, 31 pp.
- 872 Clack, J. A. 2002. An early tetrapod from 'Romer's Gap'. *Nature* **418**, 72–76.
- Clack, J. A. & Finney, S. M. 2005. *Pederpes finneyae*, an articulated tetrapod from the Tournaisian of
  western Scotland. *Journal of Systematic Palaeontology* 2, 311-346.
- 875 Clack, J. A., Bennett, C. E., Carpenter, D. K., Davies, S. J., Fraser, N. C., Kearsey, T. I., Marshall, J. E. A.,
- 876 Millward, D., Otoo, B. K. A., Reeves, E. J., Ross, A. J., Ruta, M., Smithson, K. Z., Smithson, T. R. &
- Walsh, S.A. 2016. Phylogenetic and environmental context of a Tournaisian tetrapod fauna. *Nature Ecology and Evolution* 1, 11 pp.
- Clarkson, E. N. K. 1985. Palaeoecology of the Dinantian of Foulden, Berwickshire, Scotland.
   *Transactions of the Royal Society of Edinburgh: Earth Sciences* **76**, 97-100.
- Clayton, G. 1986. Late Tournaisian miospores from the Ballycultra Formation at Cultra, County
  Down, Northern Ireland. *Irish Journal of Earth Sciences* 8, 73-79.
- Clayton, G., Graham, J. R., Higgs, K., Sevastopulo, G. D. & Welsh, A. 1986. Late Devonian and early
  Carboniferous palaeogeography of southern Ireland and southwest Britain. *Annales de la Société géologique de Belgique* 109, 103-111.
- Clayton, G. & Higgs, K. 1979. The Tournaisian marine transgression in Ireland. *Journal of Earth Sciences, Royal Dublin Society* 2, 1-10.
- 888 Cliff, R. A., Drewery, S. E. & Leeder, M. R. 1991. Sourcelands for the Carboniferous Pennine river
- system: constraints from sedimentary evidence and U-Pb geochronology using zircon and monazite.
- 890 In Morton, A. C., Todd, S. P. & Haughton, P. D. W. (eds) Developments in Sedimentary Provenance
- 891 *Studies*. Geological Society of London Special Publication **57**, 137-159.
- Clough, C. T., Barrow, G., Crampton, C. B., Maufe, H. B., Bailey, E. B. & Anderson, E. M. 1910. *The*
- *Geology of East Lothian, including the counties of Edinburgh and Berwick.* Memoir of the Geological
   Survey of Scotland, Explanation of sheet 33 with parts of 34 and 41. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. 226 pp. Edinburgh:
- 895 HMSO.
- 896 Cope, J. C. W., Guion, P. D., Sevastopulo, G. D. & Swan, A. R. H. 1992. Carboniferous In Cope, J. C. W.,
- Ingham, J. K. & Rawson, P. F. (eds) *Atlas of palaeogeography and lithofacies*. Geological Society,
  London, Memoir **13**, 67-86.
- Costa, M., Telmer, K. H., Evans, T. L., Almeida, T. IR. & Diakun, M. T. 2015. The lakes of the Pantanal:
  inventory, distribution, geochemistry, and surrounding landscape. *Wetlands Ecology and*
- 901 *Management* **23**, 19-39.
- 902 Coward, M. P. 1993. The effect of Late Caledonian and Variscan continental escape tectonics on
- 903 basement structure, Paleozoic basin kinematics and subsequent Mesozoic basin development in NW
- Europe. *Geological Society of London Petroleum Geology Conference* **4**, 1095-1108.

- Davies, A. 1970. Carboniferous rocks of the Sanquhar outlier. *Geological Survey of Great Britain Bulletin* 31, 37-87.
- Davies, A., McAdam, A. D. & Cameron, I. B. 1986. *Geology of the Dunbar district*. Memoir of the
  British Geological Survey, Sheet 33E and part of 41(Scotland). 69 pp. London: HMSO.
- Day, J. B. W. 1970. *Geology of the country around Bewcastle*. Memoir Geological Survey, Great
  Britain, England and Wales Sheet 12. 357 pp. London: HMSO.
- 911 Dean, M. T., Browne, M. A. E., Waters, C. N., & Powell, J. H. 2011. A lithostratigraphical framework
- 912 for the Carboniferous rocks of northern Great Britain (onshore). British Geological Survey Research
- 913 Report, RR/10/07, 165 pp.
- Domeier, M. & Torsvik, T. H. 2014. Plate tectonics in the late Paleozoic. *Geoscience Frontiers* 5, 303350.
- Etthenson, F. R., Dever Jr., G. R. & Grow, J. S. 1988. A paleosol interpretation for profiles exhibiting
- subaerial exposure "crusts" from the Mississippian of the Appalachian Basin. In Reinhart, J. & Sigleo,
- 918 W.R. (eds) *Paleosols and weathering through geologic time.* Geological Society of America Special
- 919 Paper **216**, 49–79.
- Eyles, V. A., Simpson, J. B. & MacGregor A. G. 1949. *Geology of Central Ayrshire*. Memoir Geological
   Survey, Scotland (sheet 14). 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. 160 pp. Edinburgh: HMSO.
- Falcon-Lang, H.J. 1999. The Early Carboniferous (Courceyan–Arundian) monsoonal climate of the
  British Isles: evidence from growth rings in fossil woods. *Geological Magazine* 136, 177-187.
- Francis, E. H., Forsyth, I. H. Read, W. A. & Armstrong, M. 1970. *The geology of the Stirling district*.
  Memoir Geological Survey, Scotland (sheet 39). 357 pp. Edinburgh: HMSO.
- Gardiner, B. G. 1985. Actinopterygian fish from the Dinantian of Foulden, Berwickshire, Scotland.
   *Transactions of the Royal Society of Edinburgh: Earth Sciences* 76, 61-66.
- 928 Glunk, C., Dupraz, C., Braissant, O., Gallagher, K. L., Verrecchia, E. P. & Visscher, P. T. 2011.
- Microbially mediated carbonate precipitation in a hypersaline lake, Big Pond (Eleuthera, Bahamas).
   Sedimentology 58, 720-738.
- Goodbred, S. L. & Hine, A. C. 1995. Coastal storm deposition: salt-marsh response to a severe
  extratropical storm, March 1993, west-Central Florida. *Geology* 23, 679–682.
- Greig, D. C. 1988. *Geology of the Eyemouth district*. Memoir British Geological Survey, Scotland sheet
  34. 78 pp. London: HMSO.
- Griffith, A.E. & Wilson, H.E. (1982) Geology of the country around Carrickfergus and Bangor. Memoir
  Geological Survey Northern Ireland (sheet 29). 118 pp. HMSO, Belfast.
- 937 Gueriau, P., Rabet, N., Clement, G., Lagebro, L., Vannier, J., Briggs, D. E. G., Charbonnier, S., Olive, S.
- 938 & Berthoux, O. 2016. A 365-million-year-old freshwater community reveals morphological and
- ecological stasis in Branchiopod crustaceans. *Current Biology* **26**, 383-390.

- Johnson, G. A. L. 1982. Geographical change in Britain during the Carboniferous Period. *Proceedings*of the Yorkshire Geological Society 44, 181-203.
- 942 Kaiser, S. I., Aretz, M. & Becker, R. T. 2015. The global Hangenberg Crisis (Devonian–Carboniferous
- transition): review of a first-order mass extinction. *In* Becker, R. T. Königshof P.& Brett C. E. (eds)
- 944 Devonian Climate, Sea Level and Evolutionary Events Geological Society of London Special
- 945 Publication **423**, 423–429.
- 946 Kearsey, T., Millward, D., Ellen, R., Whitbread, K. & Monaghan, A. A. 2018. Revised stratigraphic
- 947 framework of pre-Westphalian Carboniferous petroleum system elements from the Outer Moray
- 948 Firth to the Silverpit Basin, North Sea, UK. *In* Monaghan, A. A., Underhill, J. R., Hewett, A. J. &
- 949 Marshall, J. E. A. (eds) *Paleozoic plays of NW Europe* Geological Society of London Special Publication
- 950 471. https://doi.org/10.1144/SP471.11
- 951 Kearsey, T. I., Bennett, C. E., Millward, D., Davies, S. J., Gowing, C. J. B., Kemp, S. J., Leng, M. J.,
- 952 Marshall, J. E. A., & Browne, M. A. E. 2016. The terrestrial landscapes of tetrapod evolution in
- 953 earliest Carboniferous seasonal wetlands of S.E. Scotland. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology*,
  954 *Palaeoecology* 457, 52-69.
- Last, W. M. & Slezak, L. A. 1988. The salt lakes of western Canada: a paleolimnological overview. *Hydrobiologia* 158, 301-316.
- 257 Latrubesse, E. M., Cozzuol, M., da Silva-Caminha, S. A. F., Rigsby, C. A., Absy, M. L. & Jaramillo, C.
- 2010. The Late Miocene paleogeography of the Amazon Basin and the evolution of the Amazon River
  system. *Earth-Science Reviews* 99, 99-124.
- Leeder, M. R. 1974a. Origin of the Northumberland Basin. *Scottish Journal of Geology* **10**, 283-296.
- 961 Leeder M. R. 1974b. Lower Border Group (Tournaisian) fluvio-deltaic sedimentation and
- 962 palaeogeography of the Northumberland Basin. *Proceedings of the Yorkshire Geological Society* 40,963 129-180.
- Leeder, M. R. 1975a. Lower Border Group (Tournaisian) limestones from the Northumberland Basin.
   Scottish Journal of Geology 11, 151-167.
- Leeder, M. R. 1975b. Lower Border Group (Tournaisian) stromatolites from the Northumberland
  Basin. *Scottish Journal of Geology* 11, 207-226.
- Leeder, M. R. 1976. Palaeogeographic significance of pedogenic carbonates in the topmost Upper
  Old Red Sandstone of the Scottish Border Basin. *Journal of Geology* **11** 21-28.
- Leeder, M. R. & Bridges P. H. 1978. Upper Old Red Sandstone near Kirkbean, Dumfries and Galloway. *Scottish Journal of Geology* 14, 267-272.
- Lumsden, G. I., Tulloch, W., Howells, M. F. & Davies, A. 1967. *The geology of the neighbourhood of Langholm*. Memoir of the Geological Survey, Scotland (Sheet 11). 255 pp. Edinburgh: HMSO.
- 974 McAdam, A. D. & Tulloch, W. 1985. *Geology of the Haddington district.* Memoir Geological Survey of
- 975 Scotland, sheet 33W and part of Sheet 41. 99 pp. London: HMSO.

- 976 McMillan, A. A. 2002. *Geology of the New Galloway and Thornhill district*. Memoir of the British
  977 Geological Survey, Sheets 9W and 9E (Scotland). 126pp. Norwich, UK: The Stationary Office.
- Maguire, K., Thompson, J. & Gowland, S. 1996. Dinantian depositional environments along the
  northern margin of the Solway Basin, UK. *In* Strogen, P., Somerville, I. D. & Jones G. Ll. (eds) *Recent advances in Lower Carboniferous geology*. Geological Society of London, Special Publication 107,
  163-182.
- Marshall, J. E. A., Haughton, P. D. W. & Hillier, S. J. 1994. Vitrinite reflectivity and the structure and
  burial history of the Old Red Sandstone of the Midland Valley of Scotland. *Journal of the Geological Society, London* 151, 425-438.
- 985 Marshall, J. E. A., Reeves, E. J., Bennett, C. E., Davies, S. J., Kearsey, T. I., Millward, D., Smithson, T. R.,
- 886 & Browne, M. A. E. 2018. Reinterpreting the age of the uppermost 'Old Red Sandstone' and Early
  987 Carboniferous in Scotland. *Earth and Environmental Transactions of the Royal Society of Edinburgh*,
  988 this volume.
- Miller, H. 1887. *The geology of the country around Otterburn and Elsdon*. Memoir Geological Survey,
  England and Wales, sheet 8. 147 pp. London: HMSO.
- Millward, D., Kearsey, T. I., & Browne, M. A. E. 2013. Norham West Mains Farm Borehole: operations
   report. British Geological Survey Internal Report IR/13/033, 39 pp.
- 993 Millward, D., Davies, S. J., Williamson, F., Curtis, R., Kearsey, T. I., Bennett, C. E., Marshall, J. E. A. &
- Browne, M. A. E. 2018. Early Mississippian evaporites of coastal tropical wetlands. *Sedimentology*. 34
  pp. https://doi.org/10.1111/sed.12465
- Millward, D. & Stephenson, D. 2011. Bedrock GSI3D models from interpreted data in geologically
  complex Carboniferous terrains: A work in progress from the Clyde catchment area, Midland Valley
  of Scotland. British Geological Survey Internal Report, IR/11/052. 58 pp.
- 999 Mitchell, G. H. & Mykura, W. 1962. *The geology of the neighbourhood of Edinburgh*. Memoir of the 1000 Geological Survey of Great Britain, Sheet 32, Scotland. 3rd Edition, 159 pp.
- Monaghan, A. 2004. Geology of the Dailly area, Ayrshire. British Geological Survey Internal Report,
   IR/04/035. 24 pp.
- Moy-Thomas, J. A. 1938. Carboniferous Palaeoniscids from Northumberland and Berwickshire.
  Geological Magazine **75**, 308-318.
- Nairn, A. E. M. 1958. Petrology of the Whita Sandstone, Southern Scotland. *Journal of Sedimentary Petrology* 28, 57-64.
- 1007 Neves, R., Gueinn, K. J., Clayton, G., Ioannides, N. S., Neville, R. S. W. & Kruszewska, K. 1973.
- Palynological correlations within the Lower Carboniferous of Scotland and Northern England. *Transactions of the Royal Society of Edinburgh* 69, 23-70.
- 1010 Neves, R. & Ioannides, N. 1974. Palynology of the Lower Carboniferous (Dinantian) of the
- 1011 Spilmersford Borehole, East Lothian, Scotland. *Geological Survey of Great Britain Bulletin* **45**, 73-98.

- Platt, N. H. & Wright, V. P. 1992. Palustrine carbonates and the Florida Everglades: towards an
  exposure index for the freshwater environment. *Journal of Sedimentary Petrology* 62, 1058-1071.
- 1014 Purnell M. A. & Cossey P. J. 2004. Northumberland Trough. Chapter 3 In Cossey, P. J., Adams, A. E.,
- 1015 Purnell, M. A., Whiteley, M. J., Whyte, M. A. & Wright, V. P. (eds) *British Lower Carboniferous*
- 1016 *stratigraphy*. Geological Conservation Review Series **29**, Joint Nature Conservation Committee,
- 1017 Peterborough, 109-166.
- 1018 Raymond P. E., 1946. The Genera of fossil Conchostraca, an order of bivalve Crustacea. *Harvard*1019 University of Comparative Zoology Bulletin **96** (3), 218-307.
- Read, W. A. & Johnson, S. R. H. 1967. The sedimentology of sandstone formations within the Upper
  Old Red Sandstone and lowest Calciferous Sandstone Measures west of Stirling, Scotland. *Scottish Journal of Geology* 3, 242-267.
- Read, W. A., Browne, M. A. E., Stephenson, D. & Upton, B. G. J. 2002. Carboniferous. Chapter 9 *In* Trewin, N. H. (ed.) *The Geology of Scotland*. 4<sup>th</sup> edition. The Geological Society, London, 251-299.
- 1025 Retallack, G. J. & Dilcher, D. L. 1988. Reconstructions of selected seed ferns. *Annals of the Missouri*1026 *Botanic Garden* **75**, 1010-1057.
- 1027 Richards, K. R., Sherwin, J. E., Smithson, T. R., Bennion, R. F., Davies, S. J., Marshall, J. E. A. & Clack, J.
- 1028 A. in press. Diverse and durophagous: early Carboniferous chondrichthyans from the Scottish
- 1029 Borders. Earth and Environmental Transactions of the Royal Society of Edinburgh
- Scott, A. C. & Meyer-Berthaud, B. 1985. Plants from the Dinantian of Foulden, Berwickshire,
  Scotland. *Transactions of the Royal Society of Edinburgh: Earth Sciences* 76 13-20.
- Scott, W. B. 1986. Nodular carbonates in the Lower Carboniferous, Cementstone Group of the
   Tweed Embayment, Berwickshire: evidence for a former sulphate evaporite facies. *Scottish Journal of Geology* 22, 325-345.
- 1035 Scrutton, C. & Turner, B. 1995. The geology of Eyemouth and Burnmouth. Excursion 2 *In* Scrutton, C.
- 1036 (ed.) Northumbrian Rocks and Landscape: a field guide. Yorkshire Geological Society, Ellenbank
  1037 Press, Maryport, 31-41.
- Sherwin, J. E. 2018. *In an alternating marine and non-marine depositional setting, where and how are early Carboniferous tetrapods preserved?* M. Phil thesis, University of Leicester.
- Smith, R. A. 1986. Permo-Triassic and Dinantian rocks of the Belfast harbour Borehole. BritishGeological Survey Report 18, No 6.
- Smithson, T. R. & Clack, J. A. In press. A new tetrapod from Romer's Gap reveals an adaptation for
  walking. *Earth and Environmental Transactions of the Royal Society of Edinburgh*.
- 1044 Smithson, T. R., Wood, S. P., Marshall, J. E. A. & Clack, J. A. 2012. Earliest Carboniferous tetrapod and
- arthropod faunas from Scotland populate Romer's Gap. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Science of America* 109, 4532-4537.

- Smithson, T. R., Richards, K. R. & Clack, J. A. 2016. Lungfish diversity in Romer's Gap: reaction to the
  end-Devonian mass extinction. *Palaeontology* 59, 29-44.
- 1049 Stephenson, D., Bevins, R. E., Millward, D., Highton, A. J., Parsons, I., Stone, P. & Wadsworth, W. J.
- 1050 1999. *Caledonian Igneous Rocks of Great Britain*. Geological Conservation Review Volume 17, 648
- 1051 pp. Peterborough, UK: Joint Nature Conservation Committee.
- Stephenson, M. H., Williams, M., Monaghan, A. A., Arkley, S. & Smith, R. A. 2002. Biostratigraphy and
   palaeoenvironments of the Ballagan Formation (Lower Carboniferous) in Ayrshire. *Scottish Journal of Geology* 38, 93-111.
- Stephenson, M. H., Williams, M., Leng, M. J., & Monaghan, A. A. 2004a. Aquatic plant microfossils of
  probable non-vascular origin from the Ballagan Formation (Lower Carboniferous), Midland Valley,
  Scotland. *Proceedings of the Yorkshire Geological Society* 55, 145-158.
- 1058 Stephenson, M. H., Williams, M., Monaghan, A. A., Arkley, S., Smith, R. A., Dean, M., Browne, M. A.
- 1059 E. & Leng, M. 2004b. Palynomorph and ostracod biostratigraphy of the Ballagan Formation, Midland
- 1060 Valley of Scotland, and elucidation of intra-Dinantian unconformities. *Proceedings of the Yorkshire*
- 1061 *Geological Society* **55** 131-143.
- Stone, P., Millward, D., Young, B., Merritt, J. W., Clarke, S. M., McCormac, M. & Lawrence, D. J. 2010.
  British Regional Geology: Northern England. 5th edition. (Keyworth, Nottingham: British Geological
  Survey.) 294 pp.
- Suarez-Gonzalez, P., Quijada, I. E., Benito, M. I. & Mas, R. 2015. Sedimentology of ancient coastal
  wetlands: insights from a Cretaceous multifaceted depositional system. *Journal of Sedimentary Research* 85, 95-117.
- Tasch, P. 1969. *In* Moore R. C. (ed) *Treatise on Invertebrate Palaeontology, Conchostraca*. Part R
  Arthropoda Vol. 4 (1) Crustacea (except Ostracoda) Myriopoda- Hexapoda. Lawrence, Kansas,
  University of Kansas and Geological Society of America.
- Townsend, S. A., Boland, K. T. & Wrigley, T. J. 1992. Factors contributing to a fish kill in the Australian
  wet / dry tropica. *Water Research* 26, 1039-1044.
- Ward, J. 1997. Early Dinantian evaporites of the Easton-1 well, Solway Basin, onshore, Cumbria,
  England. *In* Meadows, N. S., Trueblood, S. P., Hardman M. & Cowan G. (eds) *Petroleum Geology of*
- 1075 *the Irish Sea and adjacent areas.* Geological Society of London Special Publication **124**, 277-296.
- 1076 Waters, C. N., Somerville, I. D., Jones, N. S., Cleal, C. J., Collinson, J. D., Waters, R. A., Besly, B. M.,
- 1077 Dean, M. T., Stephenson, M. H., Davies, J. R., Freshney, E. C., Jackson, D. I., Mitchell, W. I., Powell, J.
- H., Barclay, W. J., Browne, M. A. E., Leveridge, B. E., Long, S. L. & McLean, D. (eds) 2011. *A revised correlation of Carboniferous rocks in the British Isles.* Geological Society of London Special Report 26,
  186 pp.
- Williams, H. F. L. 2009. Stratigraphy, sedimentology, and microfossil content of hurricane Rita storm
   surge deposits in Southwest Louisiana. *Journal of Coastal Research* 25, 1041–1051.

Williams, M., Leng, M. J., Stephenson, M. H., Andrews, J. E., Wilkinson, I. P., Siveter, D. J., Horne, D. J.
& Vannier, J. M. C. 2006. Evidence that Early Carboniferous ostracods colonised coastal flood plain
brackish water environments. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 230, 299-318.

Williams, M., Stephenson, M. H., Wilkinson, I. P., Leng, M. J. & Miller, C. G. 2005. Early Carboniferous
(Late Tournaisian-Early Viséan) ostracods from the Ballagan Formation, central Scotland, UK. *Journal of Micropalaeontology* 24, 77-94.

- Wills, L. J. 1951. *A palaeogeographical atlas of the British Isles and adjacent parts of Europe*. London:
  Blackie and Son Ltd.
- Wood, S. P. & Rolfe, W. D. I. 1985. Introduction to the palaeontology of the Dinantian of Foulden,
  Berwickshire, Scotland. *Transactions of the Royal Society of Edinburgh: Earth Sciences* 76, 1-6.
- Wright, V. P., Turner, M. S., Andrews, J. E. & Spiro, B. 1993. Morphology and significance of supermature calcretes from the Upper Old Red Sandstone of Scotland. *Journal of the Geological Society of London* 150, 871-883.
- Young, G. M., & Caldwell, W. G. E. 2011. Early Carboniferous stratigraphy in the Firth of Clyde area:
  new information from the Isle of Bute. *Scottish Journal of Geology* 47, 143-156.
- Young, G. M. & Caldwell, W. G. E. 2012. The Northeast Arran Trough, the Corrie conundrum and the
  Highland Boundary Fault in the Firth of Clyde, SW Scotland. *Geological Magazine* 149, 578-589.
- 1100 Younger, P. L, Manning, D. A. C., Millward, D., Busby, J. P., Jones, C. R. C. & Gluyas, J. G. 2016.
- 1101 Geothermal exploration in the Fell Sandstone Formation (Mississippian) beneath the city centre of
- 1102 Newcastle upon Tyne, UK: the Newcastle Science Central Deep Geothermal Borehole. *Quarterly*
- 1103 *Journal Engineering Geology and Hydrogeology* **49**, 350-363.
- Zaleha, M. J. 1997. Fluvial and lacustrine palaeoenvironments of the Miocene Siwalik Group, Khaur
  are, northern Pakistan. *Sedimentology* 44, 349-368.

1106

# 1107 Figures

Outcrop and subsurface map of Tournaisian rocks in the Midland Valley of Scotland, Tweed
 and Northumberland Solway basins. These strata include the Ballagan Formation and part of the
 Lyne Formation in the last basin. Major boreholes and thickness of the formation are shown.
 Outcrop data from the British Geological Survey DiGMapGB © NERC 2015; subcrop extent in the
 Northumberland – Solway basin from Chadwick *et al.* (1995).

Stratigraphy chart for the region (after Waters *et al.* 2011). KCBV Kelso, Cottonshope and
 Birrenswark volcanic formations; W Whita Sandstone Member. Ballagan Formation (Browne 1980)
 subsumes the Tyninghame Formation (Chisholm *et al.* 1989), Cementstone Group (Miller 1887; Greig
 1988) and part of the Lower Border Group (Lumsden *et al.* 1967; Day 1970; Leeder 1974b). The
 Kinnesswood, Ballagan and Clyde Sandstone formations comprise the Inverclyde Group (Browne *et al.* 1999). The miospore biozones of the Ballagan Formation are from Stephenson *et al.* (2002,
 2004a, b), Williams *et al.* (2005) and Smithson *et al.* (2012).

Sedimentary logs of sections drawn up from the archived BGS borehole logs to illustrate
 features of the facies associations. Glenrothes Borehole: flood-plain lake facies, saline and
 hypersaline lake facies association intercalated with overbank facies association; original written log
 by D. N. Halley, A. A. McMillan and M. A. E. Browne. East Linton Borehole: overbank facies
 association, with subordinate saline and hypersaline lake facies association; original written log by A.
 D. McAdam. Birnieknowes Borehole: fluvial facies associations, with overbank facies association and
 floodplain lakes; author of original written log not recorded.

4. Summary lithological logs and environmental interpretations for selected boreholes in the
west and north of the Midland Valley of Scotland. Borehole locations are shown in Figure 1. The
black curves within the stratigraphical columns represent the proportional thickness of grey,
laminated siltstone/ mudstone per 10 m interval through the succession. The key to the lithology
colours is given in Figure 5.

5. Summary lithological logs and environmental interpretations for selected boreholes in the
east of the Midland Valley of Scotland. Borehole locations are shown in Figure 1. The miospore
biozones CM, Pu and TC are from Davies *et al.* (1986).

1135 6. Sedimentary logs through selected dolostone units in the Mains of Errol Member in the1136 Glenrothes cores.

1137 7. Histograms for key Midland Valley boreholes showing the frequency of sandstone bodies of
a given thickness interval. The percentages shown for the thicker units are of the total sandstone
thickness in the borehole succession.

Images illustrating features of the Ballagan Formation. A. Fluvial channel cut into
 interbedded siltstone, fine-grained sandstone and dolostone alongside the Whiteadder Water at
 Edington Mill [NT 894 548]. Detail in white rectangle in C. Fisherman, bottom centre, for scale; B.
 desiccation cracks, Dunbar shore; C. detail of channel side, showing multiple dislocations probably
 caused by collapse of the channel bank; D. Laminated dolostone, Glenrothes borehole, depth
 305.65 m; core 95 mm wide; E. sandy siltstone in Mains of Errol Member – dolomitized siltstone
 containing small dark fragments of siltstone; Glenrothes borehole, depth 358.21 m; core 78 mm

diameter; F. Scan of thin section of oncolite-bearing limestone. Located at top of the formation, justbeneath the Fell Sandstone, Coomsdon Burn [NY 710 038].

9. Occurrence of sedimentary features and fossils recorded in selected boreholes across theeast of the Midland Valley.

1151 10. Map showing the locations of fossil records from the Ballagan Formation in the BGS

biostratigraphy collections. The distribution of marine taxa (see section 3.6) and 'Estheria' and Leaia

1153 (conchostracan genera) are highlighted.

1154 11. Palaeogeographic map of the Ballagan Formation.

1155

1156



	Stage	Regional sub-stage	Miospore biozone	Glasgow & Ayrshire	West Lothian	East Lothian	Northumberland -Solway Basin
MISSISSIPPIAN		Arundian	Pu CM PC BP HD VI	Clyde Plateau Volcanic Formation			Fell Sandstone Formation
	VISEAN	Chadian		Clyde Sandstone Formation	Arthur's Seat Volcanic Fm Clyde Sandstone Formation	Garleton Hills Volcanic Fm	Lyne Formation
	TOURNAISIAN	Courceyan		Ballagan Formation	Ballagan Formation	Ballagan Formation	Ballagan Formation W KCBV
DEV		Famennian		Kinnesswood Formation	Kinnesswood Formation	Kinnesswood Formation	Kinnesswood Formation

#### GLENROTHES BOREHOLE



#### EAST LINTON BOREHOLE



#### **BIRNIEKNOWES BOREHOLE**





# Spilmersford NT46NE73



# Birnieknowes NT77SE9

		GARLETON HILLS VOLCANIC FORMATION		GULLANE FORMATION		m	netres
659 m	•	thin tuffaceous mudstone beds	9 m *	small streams, reworking volcanic detritus; overbank ζ flooding; floodplain and carbonate lakes		TC	
	•	overbank flooding dominant; possibly vegetated floodplain; sporadic saline lakes	•	fluvial channels		mixed fluvial channels, small streams deposits, overbank flooding	
Pu	*	major fluvial channels floodplain lakes, saline lakes; minor overbank sands	P •	overbank flooding + floodplain lakes; probable vegetated floodplain	*	Pu floodplain + saline lakes; overbank flooding major fluvial channels	 
c S	*	major fluvial channels, volcaniclastic input overbank flooding	3	overbank flooding major fluvial channels + overbank flooding Hoverbank flooding	•	overbank flooding major fluvial channels	
CM 3	*	large and small fluvial channels floodplain lakes + overbank flooding saline lakes		overbank flooding, small streams; S floodplain lakes S A S A S	•	overbank & storm flooding floodplain + saline lakes; minor small streams + overbank flooding; vegetated floodplain	
	*	overbank flooding/ floodplain lakes		saline lakes; overbank flooding; vegetated floodplain C fluvial channels; overbank C flooding: ephemeral channel 200 m		overbank flooding + floodplain lakes fluvial channels saline lakes	_ 200
S C C S S S	*	fluvial channels overbank & storm flooding/ floodplain lakes		floodplain and saline lakes; overbank & storm flooding		KINNESSWOOD FORMATION fluvial channel + braidplain sands; overbank flooding + calcrete development	- 200
3 3 3	*	vegetated floodplain		fluvial/ overbank volcaniclastic sandstone	Ballaga	n Formation sandstone	
924 m l	FAULT		•	overbank flooding; minor floodplain lakes		sandstone-rich units	
		? DEVONIAN conglomerate + sandstone S	č	floodplain lake sporadic small streams depositing volcaniclastic sandstone; vegetated floodplain		siltstone & dolostone dominant	
				saline lake volcaniclastic sandstone input		siltstone, sandstone & dolostone siltstone, bedded	— 300
		S	5 • { {	overbank flooding; vegetated floodplain		volcaniclastic sandstone & mudstone	
				saline lake	•	dolostone roots	
				vegetated floodplain	s ?Р с	palaeosol (seatearth) palaeosol (inferred) conchostracans	
		F		overbank flooding + floodplain lakes	ξ	burrows/ bioturbated	400
		489	m				





Thickness of sandstone unit (cm)









**Table 1.** Facies, facies associations and environments in the Ballagan Formation of the Midland Valley of Scotland and Tweed Basin. The marginal marine facies of the Lyne Formation Northumberland – Solway Basin are omitted. Facies descriptions are from the archived borehole logs in the BGS collections and from key exposures. Facies association after Bennett *et al.* (2016).

Facies	Facies description	Where seen	Depositional environment	Facies association
Dolostone	Parallel beds of ferroan dolostone ('cementstone') and dolomitized siltstone; grey but some reddish brown; hard, compact, splintery; sporadic records of ostracods, some with shell fragments and <i>Chondrites</i> ; some beds nodular or with bulbous base; varieties include laminated dolostone, others with diffuse top and base; tops may be cracked or brecciated; commonly hosts evaporite nodules	In all boreholes and exposures, varying abundance	Saline - hypersaline flood- plain lakes, cryptic marine flooding	Freshwater, saline and hypersaline lake
Reddened pseudobrecciated dolostone	Dolomicrite, bluish to greenish grey, pseudobrecciated, cracked and reddened profile; Fe-rich claystone fills to cracks; low-angle, concave upwards fractures in upper part of profile resemble pedogenic slickensides	Mains of Errol Member, Glenrothes, East Dron	Desiccated hypersaline, ?alkaline lakes	
Limestone	Grey limestone, porcellaneous, in part pseudobrecciated; or sandy, cross-bedded; with ostracods, fish scales and teeth, Spirorbids	Spilmersford, East Linton (top part), Tantallan	Flood-plain lakes	
Evaporite	Diverse suite of subfacies of gypsum and anhydrite nodules, chicken-wire masses, evaporite-rock and laminae, hosted by dolostone and laminated grey siltstone facies. Pseudomorphs after halite in siltstone facies	Widespread, except in East Lothian	Hypersaline lakes, brine pans and sabka	
Laminated grey siltstone	Planar laminated grey and dark grey siltstone and mudstone; disseminated pyrite; ostracods, bivalves, fish scales, conchostracans and burrows; sporadic marine taxa; desiccation cracks and roots generally absent; typically interbedded with dolostone	All boreholes and exposures	Flood-plain lakes, cryptic marine flooding	
Heterogeneous siltstone	Grey, purple-grey, mottled grey and brown, red-brown or red and purple; massive to laminated, some rippled or disturbed bedding; some rooting and Stigmaria. Interbedded with laminated or ripple-laminated sandstone	In all boreholes and exposures	Overbank flooding	Overbank
Ripple-laminated sandstone	Ripple-laminated or cross-laminated, fine-grained with siltstone laminae; plant, shell and fish debris; bioturbation in some beds, sporadic records of ?Monocraterion and Planolites; interbedded with siltstone; units typically <3 m	In all boreholes and exposures	Overbank and storm flooding into lakes; small stream deposits	
Palaeosols	Few identified in logs; best indicator is record of carbonized root traces in grey siltstone and 'seatclay' or 'seatearth' (?gleyed inceptisols) but depth of rooting and thickness not given; also rooted fine-sandstone (?entisols); unbedded mottled red-brown siltstone may represent vertisols	Most boreholes; Bute, Burnmouth	Vegetated flood-plain	
'Mudstone breccia' (sandy siltstone?)	Greenish grey dolomitized siltstone with irregular dark grey siltstone clasts up to 10mm. Beds 10-84cm. (described similarly as 'Clast-rock' in Ascog)	Glenrothes, East Dron, Ascog	Unconfined debris-flow deposit	
Conglomerate	Round dolostone clasts 1-20mm diameter with calcareous mudstone matrix; plant fragments; beds 18 cm, siltstone above and below	East Linton, Everton	Unconfined debris-flow deposit	
Cross-bedded sandstone	Fine, medium and coarse-grained sandstone, trace siltstone; conglomerate at base in some units; carbonaceous and micaceous coatings to laminae; massive or cross-bedded, some convolute bedded; some units ripple laminated towards top; sporadic beds with mudstone flakes. Units 3 - 15 m thick. Unit base sharp, irregular, erosive. Minor bioturbation, rooting at top. Plant debris, 'Stigmaria' pieces.	Spilmersford, East Linton, Birnieknowes, Marshall Meadows, Blairmulloch; Edington Mill	Fluvial channels	Fluvial
Volcaniclastic sandstone	'Tuff', 'agglomerate', and tuffaceous siltstone and sandstone; grain size from medium to coarse sand, granules and pebbles, coarsest up to 15 cm; clasts of green amygdaloidal 'lava'; dolostone, siltstone; bedded units up to 2.5 m thick, occurring sporadically and in packages up to 8 m.	East Linton, Spilmersford	Reworked older volcanic deposits and ripped-up substrate, probably fluvial	

	BGS	BGN thickness metres			Sandstone % of formation		Dolostone	s (cementstone	s)	Number desiccation crack horizons	Number beds burrowed/ bioturbated	Number rooted horizons/ palaeosols	Number evaporite units	% fines grey and bedded
Borehole name	Registered number		Unit above	Unit below		No of beds	As % of fines	average bed thickness centimetres	bed frequency, metres, sand free					
Ascog	NS06SE 8	33.09	CYD	KNW	27.8	9	3.4	9.1	2.65	0	0	0	0	n.d.*
Knocknairshill	NS37SW10	70.87	CYD	KNW	20.6	33	7.5	12.9	1.70	8	0	0	17	49
Barnhill	NS47NW 2	123.08	CYD	KNW	8.0	82	11.4	15.7	1.38	2	6	0	30	85
Loch Humhrey	NS47NE 1	162.95	CYD	Not reached	6.7	126	12.4	15.1	1.21	6	2	0	64	89
East Dron	NO11NW 24	209.54	Not seen	KNW	9.7	127	10.9	16.3	1.49	110	45	10	114	57
Glenrothes	NO20SE 385	157.43	PDB	KNW	7.5	159	18.0	16.5	0.92	137	21	2	47	83
Deaconhill	NS43SE 81	150.03	LLGS	KNW	1.9	94	16.0	25.1	1.57	4	9	2	12	94
Blairmulloch	NS52NE 21	166.58	CYD	Not reached	14.8	83	11.5	19.65	1.71	3	21	1	34	99
Spilmersford	NT46NE 73	258.24	GHV	Fault	31.9	63	8.3	23.1	2.82	7	24	2	0	44
East Linton	NT57NE 2	418.17	GHV	Not reached	23.8	59	6.6	34.1	5.41	15	62	26	0	42
Birnieknowes	NT77SE 9	200.21	GUL	KNW	46.5	33	5.0	16.3	3.24	2	20	1	0	59
Norham	NT94NW 20	490.50	Not seen	Not reached	35.5	277	21.5	24.5	1.14	131	128	216	50	16

# 1 **Table 2.** Summary statistics for Ballagan Formation in selected BGS boreholes

2 Unit codes: BGN Ballagan Formation; CYD Clyde Sandstone Formation; FESD Fell Sandstone Formation, GHV Garleton Hills Volcanic Formation, GUL Gullane Formation, KNW Kinnesswood

3 Formation, LLGS Lower Limestone Formation

4 \*Log descriptions of mudstone and siltstone units in the Ascog Borehole contain insufficient detail for analysis

5