



Article (refereed) - postprint

Facey, Sarah L.; Fidler, David B.; Rowe, Rhiannon C.; Bromfield, Lisa M.; Nooten, Sabine S.; Staley, Joanna T.; Ellsworth, David S.; Johnson, Scott N.. 2017 Atmospheric change causes declines in woodland arthropods and impacts specific trophic groups. *Agricultural and Forest Entomology*, 19 (1). 101-112. <u>10.1111/afe.12190</u>

© 2016 The Royal Entomological Society

This version available http://nora.nerc.ac.uk/514755/

NERC has developed NORA to enable users to access research outputs wholly or partially funded by NERC. Copyright and other rights for material on this site are retained by the rights owners. Users should read the terms and conditions of use of this material at http://nora.nerc.ac.uk/policies.html#access

This document is the author's final manuscript version of the journal article, incorporating any revisions agreed during the peer review process. Some differences between this and the publisher's version remain. You are advised to consult the publisher's version if you wish to cite from this article.

The definitive version is available at http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com

Contact CEH NORA team at <u>noraceh@ceh.ac.uk</u>

The NERC and CEH trademarks and logos ('the Trademarks') are registered trademarks of NERC in the UK and other countries, and may not be used without the prior written consent of the Trademark owner.

# Atmospheric change causes declines in woodland arthropods and impacts specific trophic groups

- 3 S. L. Facey <sup>a</sup>\*, D. B. Fidler <sup>b</sup>, R. C. Rowe <sup>a</sup>, L. M. Bromfield <sup>a</sup>, S. S. Nooten <sup>a</sup>, J. T. Staley <sup>c</sup>, D. S.
- 4 Ellsworth <sup>a</sup> and S. N. Johnson <sup>a</sup>
- <sup>5</sup> <sup>a</sup> Hawkesbury Institute for the Environment, Western Sydney University, NSW, Australia
- <sup>6</sup> <sup>b</sup> School of Life Sciences, Cardiff University, Cardiff, United Kingdom
- <sup>7</sup> <sup>c</sup> Centre for Ecology & Hydrology, Wallingford, Oxfordshire, United Kingdom
- 8 \*Corresponding author: email sarah.facey@westernsydney.edu.au; telephone +61 (0)2 4570 1014; fax

9 +61 (0)2 4570 1103

- 11 **Running head:** Arthropod declines under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>
- 12 **Key-words:** Ecosystem functioning; ecosystem processes; feeding guilds; global change;
- 13 invertebrate assemblages

# 14 Abstract

15	1.	Arthropod assemblages form a fundamental part of terrestrial ecosystems, underpinning
16		ecosystem processes and services. Yet, little is known about how invertebrate
17		communities, as a whole, respond to climatic and atmospheric changes, including
18		predicted increases in carbon dioxide concentrations (CO <sub>2</sub> ).
19	2.	To date, woodland Free Air CO <sub>2</sub> Enrichment (FACE) studies have focused entirely on
20		northern hemisphere managed plantations. We manipulated atmospheric CO2 in a
21		mature, native <i>Eucalyptus</i> woodland (0.15ha, >32,000m <sup>3</sup> ) in Australia, using the
22		EucFACE facility. We used three complementary sampling methods (vacuum sampling,
23		pitfall and sticky trapping) to record invertebrate abundances under ambient and elevated
24		levels of CO <sub>2</sub> (400 vs. 550 ppm).
25	3.	Based on the collection of over 83,000 invertebrates, we found significant declines in the
26		overall abundance of ground-dwelling (14.7%) and aerial (12.9%) arthropods under
27		elevated CO <sub>2</sub> , with significant decreases in herbivore, omnivore, scavenger and
28		parasitoid functional groups. Even though several groups showed varying declines in
29		abundance, elevated CO <sub>2</sub> did not measurably affect community composition.
30	4.	Our results indicate that atmospheric CO <sub>2</sub> predicted within the next 35 years may cause
31		declines in arthropod abundances in Eucalyptus woodland. Declines found in several
32		functional groups suggest that elevated atmospheric CO2 has the potential to affect
33		ecosystem processes, possibly including nutrient cycling by herbivores and omnivores
34		and biocontrol by parasitoids.

#### 35 Introduction

36 With over one million described species, arthropods comprise the majority of terrestrial 37 multicellular life on Earth (Mora et al. 2011; Scheffers et al. 2012) and are the main players in 38 the bulk of terrestrial plant-based food-webs (Price, 2002). Aside from their impressive 39 contribution to biodiversity, arthropod communities are important in a functional context, 40 underpinning a variety of ecosystem processes (Wilson 1987). For instance, invertebrates 41 perform substantial roles in nutrient cycling through the consumption and break down of plant 42 material (Hunter, 2001). 43 Arthropod communities are shaped by complex combinations of abiotic and biotic factors, as well as biotic interactions including trophic associations (Polis 1998), which are themselves 44 45 sensitive to environmental change (Tylianakis et al. 2008). Consequently, perturbations 46 occurring in either the biotic or abiotic environment have the capacity to alter the structure of 47 communities, and the interactions occurring between the species that form them, by virtue of the 48 fact that not all species in a system will respond to change in the same way (Sanders et al., 2003; 49 Raffaelli, 2004; Pocock et al., 2012).

50 While previous community-level studies have shown that the responses of different taxa to 51 environmental change can be highly individualistic and species-specific (e.g. Altermatt 2003; 52 Sanders, Belote & Weltzin 2004), invertebrate taxa sharing the same feeding strategy are likely 53 to be affected by change in similar ways to each other, allowing some generalisations to be made 54 (Altermatt, 2003; Hillstrom & Lindroth, 2008). For instance, sap-feeding invertebrates may be 55 positively affected by changes in the quality of their food plants under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (Bezemer & 56 Jones, 1998). Conversely, folivores, by virtue of their different feeding habits, tend to have

57	reduced performance under elevated CO <sub>2</sub> (Stiling <i>et al.</i> , 2003; Stiling & Cornelissen, 2007),
58	leading to reductions in folivory (Hamilton et al., 2004; Knepp et al., 2005). Organisms at higher
59	trophic levels, including predators, may be more sensitive to environmental perturbations,
60	perhaps as a result of higher metabolic costs and their dependency on the responses of organisms
61	at lower trophic levels (Voigt et al. 2003; Hance et al. 2007). Moreover, specialist species such
62	as endoparasitoid wasps may be more at risk from changes to the environment than generalists
63	because they are dependent on a smaller group of hosts and therefore might be disproportionately
64	affected if they cannot utilise alternative hosts (Hance et al., 2007; Vanbergen et al., 2010).
65	The concentration of carbon dioxide (CO <sub>2</sub> ) in the atmosphere now exceeds the range the Earth
66	has seen in the last 800,000 years (IPCC 2013), and as such is considered an abiotic perturbation
67	with the potential to alter ecological communities. Numerous studies have reported CO2-induced
68	changes in plant biomass and morphology (Pritchard et al., 1999; Stiling & Cornelissen, 2007;
69	Zhu et al., 2016), altered botanical composition (Vasseur & Potvin, 1998), coupled with
70	reductions in plant quality (Robinson et al. 2012). Elevated CO <sub>2</sub> -related changes in plants could
71	therefore have crucial implications for invertebrate herbivores (Hentley et al., 2014) and their
72	arthropod consumers, as well as the ecosystems these communities support (Tylianakis et al.,
73	2008). In spite of their recognised importance, relatively little is known about how invertebrate
74	communities, as a whole, will respond to climatic and atmospheric changes (Jamieson et al.,
75	2012; Facey et al., 2014). In order for us to adequately predict the consequences of climatic and
76	atmospheric change on ecosystems, large scale experiments considering community-level
77	responses to change will be necessary, complementing work in more controlled settings (Stiling
78	et al., 2003; Facey et al., 2014). Free Air CO <sub>2</sub> Enrichment (FACE) experiments have been
79	invaluable for assessing the impacts of elevated CO <sub>2</sub> for plants and invertebrates in temperate

forest systems (Hamilton *et al.*, 2004; Knepp *et al.*, 2005; Stiling & Cornelissen, 2007; Couture
& Lindroth, 2012; Couture *et al.*, 2015; Facey & Gherlenda, 2016).

82 Thus far, however, forest FACE invertebrate community studies have been limited to 83 experiments on relatively young, managed plantation trees in the northern hemisphere. Gaining 84 an adequate understanding of the responses of the terrestrial biosphere to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> will 85 require greater habitat representation among the next generation of FACE experiments 86 (Ainsworth & Long 2005; Facey & Gherlenda 2016; Norby et al., 2016). The present study 87 redresses this gap two ways. Firstly, it is the first field-based experiment investigating arthropod 88 responses to atmospheric change in a southern hemisphere forest system, allowing comparisons 89 and generalisations to be made across studies in other systems. Secondly, our study is the first 90 experiment established in native mature natural woodland. The site consists of *Eucalvptus* 91 woodland, the second most dominant habitat type in Australia, after grasslands. This habitat is 92 estimated to cover over 890, 000km<sup>2</sup> of the continent (Department of the Environment and Water 93 Resources 2007). Further, the *Eucalyptus* genus is the most widely planted hardwood globally 94 (Frew et al., 2013), yet information concerning the responses of Eucalyptus communities to 95 climatic and atmospheric change is scant owing to a lack of field studies.

96 The aim of this study was to characterise the arthropod community occurring in this woodland 97 study system and assess the extent to which this community may be affected by rising 98 atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations. We used a variety of sampling methods applied from ground-99 level to the forest canopy, to obtain representative samples of the invertebrate community. We 90 focused on how different functional groups (i.e. feeding guilds) responded to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> i.e. if 91 specialists like parasitoids were more sensitive than generalist predator groups.

Given the generally negative effects of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> on plant quality, we predicted that *i*)
folivorous herbivores would decline in abundance under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, whereas those in different
feeding guilds including sap-suckers would be positively affected by alterations in food quality; *ii*) arthropods at higher trophic levels would show greater declines than groups from lower
trophic levels; *iii*) specialised taxa (e.g. parasitoids) would be more strongly affected by CO<sub>2</sub>
manipulation than generalists, and; *iii*) As a result of changes in the abundances of different taxa,
invertebrate community composition would be altered under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> conditions.

109

#### 110 Materials and methods

#### 111 **Experimental site**

112 The study was carried out at the Eucalyptus Free-Air CO<sub>2</sub> Enrichment ('EucFACE') site in 113 western Sydney, Australia (33°36'59"S, 150°44'17"E), described in Duursma et al. (2015). In 114 brief, the site consists of ~15 ha within a 167 ha tract of mature, native Cumberland Plain 115 woodland, dominated by E. tereticornis (over 90% coverage). There are six 25m diameter ring 116 arrays; since September 2012, the CO<sub>2</sub> levels have been manipulated in three randomly selected 117 rings (ambient +150ppm, corresponding to the concentration predicted by the middle of this 118 century under the emission scenario A1F1 (IPCC, 2007)), with the other three receiving ambient 119 CO<sub>2</sub> levels. Diluted CO<sub>2</sub> or air (in ambient plots) is released into the vegetation within the ring 120 from valves in the vertical vent pipes around the outside edge of the ring during the day time.

#### 121 Invertebrate collections

122 We collected invertebrates using three different methods across seasons to obtain a broad, 123 representative, sample of the arthropod community occupying different niches. Pitfall traps were 124 used to sample ground-dwelling arthropods, with suction sampling to capture invertebrates from 125 understorey vegetation and sticky traps to sample aerial (canopy) invertebrates. Suction sampling 126 is a proven quantitative technique for sampling invertebrate populations (Brook et al. 2008). 127 Sticky and pitfall trapping allow for relative comparisons of invertebrate abundance between 128 CO<sub>2</sub> treatments, within sampling method (Buntin 1993; Woodcock 2005). Pitfall traps were first 129 used in November 2013; pitfall and suction sampling was then carried out quarterly from January 130 2014 to January 2015 (six pitfall campaigns, five suction sampling campaigns). Sticky trapping 131 was carried out six times throughout the experiment, on a monthly basis between the end of 132 September and the start of December during 2013 and 2014, when most flying arthropods would 133 be active. In each of the three niche-types, sampling was carried out in fixed locations across all 134 sampling dates.

#### *i) Ground-dwelling arthropods (pitfall sampling)*

136 Within each ring, two locations were selected at random on the woodland floor. In each of these, 137 a 500ml 9cm diameter plastic pot was buried flush with the soil level. Traps were left dry and 138 open for one week prior to the initial sampling period in November 2013 in order to account for 139 digging-in effects (Woodcock 2005). Thereafter, traps were active for two weeks at the 140 beginning of each of the six sampling periods; for this they were filled to approximately one 141 third full with water, with a droplet of scentless detergent to break surface tension. A piece of 142 chicken-wire mesh was pegged over the mouth of the trap to prevent by-catch of non-target 143 mammals and reptiles (Woodcock 2005), whilst only potentially excluding the very largest of

beetle species. A transparent plastic roof was suspended above each trap for protection duringrain events. A lid was placed over each trap in between sampling events.

- 146 *ii)* Understorey arthropods (Suction sampling)
- 147 Two 1×1m plots (selected at random) within each ring were used on the woodland floor. A
- 148 petrol-powered vacuum 'G-Vac' device (SH 86C, Stihl AG & Co. KG, Germany, Bell et al.

149 2000), fitted with an organza bag to capture dislodged debris and invertebrates, was passed over

150 the understorey herbaceous vegetation in a zig-zag pattern for 20 seconds during each sampling

151 event. Sampling was carried out when the vegetation was dry to the touch.

## 152 *iii) Aerial arthropods (Sticky trapping)*

In each of the six rings, 16 yellow card sticky traps (Bugs for Bugs, Mundubbera, Australia) were secured to the central scaffold at four height intervals (2, 5, 10 and 20m) facing each compass direction. This allowed a full range of arthropods occurring at different strata to be sampled. Traps were left in place for one week prior to collection.

#### 157 Identification and processing

Arthropods were counted and identified under a dissecting microscope (SZ51, Olympus, Japan) to at least Order level (except for three groups taken to Subclass only – Acari, Collembola and Chilognatha), and in some cases, Family level, to more reliably determine functional guild in as many cases as possible (Hamilton *et al.* 2012; for a full list of identified groups and guild assignments, see Table S1). Psyllidae (Hemiptera) were excluded from the study as they are the focus of a concurrent study occurring at the site (Gherlenda *et al.*, 2016). Better estimations of the energy flow occurring through different trophic levels within communities can be achieved

- through the assessment of biomass (Saint-Germain *et al.* 2007). Thus, after abundances were
- taken, pitfall and suction samples were dried at 60°C to constant weight before weighing using a
- 167 microbalance with 1µg accuracy (model XP6, Mettler-Toledo GmbH, Germany).

#### 168 Statistical analyses

- 169 All statistics were performed in R, version 3.2.0 (R Core Team 2015). To avoid
- 170 pseudoreplication, the subplots in each ring were pooled for all analyses, giving one sample per
- 171 ring, per time point (n = 6, 36 plot-time samples in total for pitfall and sticky traps, 30 for
- 172 suction). Separate analyses were carried out on data from each of the three sampling methods to
- 173 enable assessment of the effect of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> on the arthropod communities in the different
- 174 niches.

#### 175 Abundance analyses

176 Total arthropod abundance, and the abundance of individual taxa and functional groups, was 177 analysed firstly using generalized liner mixed models (GLMM) with Poisson error distributions 178 using glmer. Models contained CO<sub>2</sub> treatment as a fixed effect and date sampled as a random 179 factor. Model fit was verified by inspection of residual plots and overdispersion parameters from 180 the overdisp fun function (specified at http://glmm.wikidot.com/faq). In the majority of 181 cases, data were overdispersed and so models were refitted using the negative binomial extension of GLMM, glmer.nb, in lme4 (Bates et al. 2014). The significance of CO<sub>2</sub> treatment as a 182 183 predictor was assessed using likelihood ratio tests between the full model and a reduced model 184 without the fixed effect of CO<sub>2</sub> treatment (Faraway 2006).

Orders which were poorly represented – found in fewer than ten percent of samples or had fewer
than 50 individuals - were removed from the individual Order analyses. Sanguivores were also

not analysed due to small sample size. In one case (aerial Thysanoptera), a negative binomial
model did not adequately fit the data and so an observation-level random effect was included in
the model to account for overdispersion (Harrison 2014).

190 Biomass analyses

191 Similar to the abundance analyses, arthropod biomass data (in terms of total sample biomass, not 192 individual biomass) were analysed for separate functional guilds and Orders, with the same 193 poorly-represented groups removed. Total arthropod biomass across all groups was also analysed 194 for each sampling method. Data were modelled using linear mixed models (LMM) with the 195 lmer function, with  $CO_2$  treatment as a fixed effect and date sampled as a random factor. In all 196 cases, biomass was rank transformed prior to analysis in order to meet assumptions of 197 homoscedasticity of residuals. For groups with tied ranks (where zeros were present in the 198 variable), the analysis was iterated 1000 times on retransformed data with randomly broken ties to attain stable average P and  $\chi^2$  values. 199

#### 200 Community composition

201 To assess the effects of elevated  $CO_2$  on overall community composition, we used permutational 202 multivariate analysis of variance (PERMANOVA) coupled with non-metric multidimensional 203 scaling (NMDS) to visualise the data (Hillstrom et al. 2014), with the package vegan 204 (adonis and metaMDS functions, Oksanen et al. 2015). For community-level analyses, poorly-205 represented taxa were included. PERMANOVA was carried out on the three niche-types 206 separately, with the fixed effect of CO<sub>2</sub> treatment, on both functional guild and Order-level 207 abundance data. Analyses were carried out on Bray-Curtis dissimilarity matrices, permuted 999 208 times. The number of dimensions, k, used in each NMDS analysis was determined by visual

209 inspection of stress plots and stress values. Stress values were <0.2 across multiple runs for all</li>
210 analyses.

211 Due to the low replication inherent in FACE designs, we set a critical *P* value of 0.1 to avoid

212 type II errors, as recommended by Lindroth & Raffa (2016) and consistent with previous studies

of this type (Sanders *et al.* 2004; Villalpando *et al.* 2009; Hamilton *et al.* 2012).

214

## 215 Results

216 A total of 83,528 arthropods from 19 different taxa (16 Orders and three Subclasses) were

collected and identified during the experiment (14,459 ground-dwelling, 19,153 understorey and

49,916 aerial arthropods; Table S1). Total arthropod abundance was lower in elevated CO<sub>2</sub> in all

three of the sampled niches; this effect was significant for ground-dwelling and aerial

invertebrates (Table 1), which decreased by 14.7% and 12.9% respectively (ground-dwelling

total individuals  $\pm$  SD: ambient 7,803  $\pm$  280.17, elevated 6,656  $\pm$  280.11; understorey: ambient

222  $11,362 \pm 792.56$ , elevated 7,791  $\pm 437.55$ ; aerial: ambient  $26,672 \pm 384.29$ , elevated  $23,244 \pm 1000$ 

403.32, Table 1). Across all groups, total arthropod biomass did not significantly differ between

224 CO<sub>2</sub> treatments (p > 0.1, Table 1).

#### 225 Ground-dwelling arthropods

- 226 The abundance of ground-dwelling chewing herbivores was significantly reduced under elevated
- 227 CO<sub>2</sub> conditions (Fig. 1b, Table 2), though their biomass remained unchanged (p > 0.1).
- 228 Detritivores and omnivores showed a decrease in biomass under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, but did not show
- 229 measurable declines in abundance (Fig. 1a, b, Table 2).

230 The abundances of ground-dwelling Hymenoptera, Isopoda and Orthoptera were significantly

reduced under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (Fig. 1c and d, Table 1), with latter two groups also showing

decreases in biomass (Fig. 1c, d, Table 1). Acarina showed an increase in biomass (Fig. 1c, Table

233 1), with no evidence of change in abundance (p > 0.1).

#### 234 Understorey arthropods

Declines were also seen in the abundance of certain groups in the understorey, though different groups were affected. Omnivores showed a significant decrease in average abundance and this was coupled with a marked decline in population biomass (Fig. 2, Table 2). None of the other feeding guilds showed a significant response to elevated  $CO_2$  in this niche (p > 0.1).

At Order-level, Coleoptera were significantly decreased in abundance under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, but their biomass was not significantly different from ambient CO<sub>2</sub> (Fig. 2d, Table 1). While the data for understorey Isopoda could not be accurately modelled, this group appeared to show a trend towards lower abundance under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, as found for the same group in ground-dwelling samples (Fig. 2d vs. Fig. 1c).

#### 244 Aerial arthropods

245 Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> generally resulted in decreased abundances of aerial arthropods. At feeding guild

level, both scavengers and parasitoids experienced a significant decline in abundance (Fig. 3a, b,

Table 2). At Order-level, significant decreases were seen for four of the recorded taxa;

248 Hymenoptera, Neuroptera, Acari and Collembola (Fig. 3c, d, Table 1). However, in contrast to

these declines, aerial Psocoptera showed a significant increase in abundance under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>

250 (Fig. 3d, Table 1).

#### 251 *Community composition*

While elevated CO<sub>2</sub> resulted in significant changes in the abundances of several different feeding
guilds and Orders (summarised in Fig. 4), this did not significantly affect the community
composition occurring in any of the three niche types, either in terms of functional guild or Order
composition (Table S2, Fig. S1).

256

257

#### 258 **Discussion**

#### 259 Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> caused widespread changes in arthropod abundance and biomass

260 To our knowledge, this is the first study of its kind to find significant declines in the abundance 261 of a wide range of woodland arthropods under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>; out of the 21 taxonomic and 262 functional groups which satisfied our analysis criteria, over half (11 groups) experienced 263 significant declines in abundance. Previous work on soil micro-arthropod communities has found 264 similar decreases (Hansen et al. 2001; Loranger et al. 2004), yet most previous studies looking at 265 aboveground invertebrate communities have revealed no significant changes in abundance as a 266 result of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (Sanders et al. 2004; Hillstrom & Lindroth 2008; Hillstrom et al. 2014). 267 The declines in total arthropod abundance did not translate into overall declines in total biomass, 268 though this is not unexpected as the two metrics are known to not necessarily correlate well 269 (Saint-Germain et al. 2007). However, we did find significant changes in arthropod biomass at 270 the individual functional group/Order level, five out of six of which were negative. This 271 reinforces the findings from the abundance analyses and indicates the potential for changes in

272 ecosystem functioning. Reductions in biomass point to the loss of larger bodied organisms, 273 especially in groups which did not see a corresponding reduction in abundance, such as ground-274 dwelling detritivores and omnivores. Larger organisms are likely to be of greater importance for 275 trophic interactions occurring within the ecosystem (Saint-Germain et al. 2007), as energy flow 276 through trophic levels is tied to body mass (Brown et al., 2004). Conversely, in cases where 277 declines in abundance were not reflected by biomass data (e.g. chewing herbivores and 278 Coleoptera), there may be a greater proportion of larger-bodied individuals occurring under 279 elevated CO<sub>2</sub> compared with ambient conditions, suggesting that ecological functionality may be 280 more likely to be maintained for these groups, despite population declines.

#### 281 Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> had variable effects on feeding guilds

282 We predicted that chewing herbivores would suffer a decrease in abundance under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> 283 compared with other feeding guilds with different feeding methods, such as sap-suckers, which 284 may even stand to benefit from such conditions via changes in phloem chemistry (Bezemer & 285 Jones 1998). We found significant reductions in the abundances of ground-dwelling chewing 286 herbivores, though this effect was not seen in either the understorey or aerial niches. We found 287 declines in the abundance and biomass of omnivorous taxa in the understorey and at ground 288 level; these animals will also have partially plant-based diets. These findings are consistent with 289 those reported in other studies of this type (Stiling et al., 2002, 2003; Hamilton et al., 2012), and 290 could indicate a reduction in herbivore-pressure and herbivore-mediated nutrient cycling in the 291 system.

Given the decline in parasitoids and stable levels of other predatory taxa, the reduction in the abundance of herbivorous taxa at ground and understorey level is unlikely to be explained by 294 changes in top-down regulation. We based our prediction that herbivore abundance would be 295 reduced under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> conditions on the widely reported decrease in plant resource quality 296 observed elsewhere under the same conditions (Robinson et al. 2012). However, work carried 297 out at the EucFACE site concurrently with this study has revealed no change in various plant 298 quality metrics, including canopy C:N ratios (Gherlenda et al. 2015) and leaf area index 299 (Duursma et al., 2015). This is not entirely unexpected: Hamilton et al. (2012) also observed 300 changes in arthropod populations under elevated conditions with no accompanying alteration in 301 C:N ratios of plant tissues. One as yet undetermined plant-mediated mechanism for these 302 declines could be alterations in plant secondary chemistry occurring under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, as 303 found in other studies and known to affect invertebrate herbivores (Robinson et al. 2012). 304 Further work is needed to link the observed changes in invertebrate abundance with plant quality 305 changes occurring in the woodland at EucFACE.

306 In contrast to the declines in chewing herbivores and omnivores, sap-sucking herbivores (Order 307 Hemiptera) did not decline in any of the three niche types. However, work by other researchers 308 at EucFACE has shown decreased abundance in the abundance of three species of psyllids under 309 elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (Gherlenda et al., 2016). While controlled environment studies tend to report 310 enhanced abundance and performance of sap-feeders, linked with CO<sub>2</sub>-induced changes in 311 phloem and sap chemistry (Bezemer & Jones, 1998), these often do not consider natural 312 enemies. Hentley et al. (2014) showed that aphid populations under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> were supressed 313 to population levels at ambient CO<sub>2</sub> when a predatory ladybird was also included in the 314 experiment. On the other hand, Percy et al. (2002) found that the severity of aphid infestations 315 on aspen was increased under long-term CO<sub>2</sub> exposure, as a result of asynchrony between aphid 316 and natural enemy populations. In our study, given the significant reduction found in parasitoid

abundance in the canopy, there is the potential for reduced top-down regulation of sap-feeding
insects in the future, and thus population growth. Such growth could increase herbivory levels
under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, as found by Couture *et al.* (2015). Long term monitoring would be needed
at the EucFACE experimental site to substantiate this. Presently, however, the decline in
chewing herbivores and omnivores and comparable levels of (non-psyllid) Hemiptera suggests
that herbivory will decline in *Eucalyptus* woodland as emissions of CO<sub>2</sub> rise, as found in other
northern hemisphere systems (Hamilton *et al.*, 2004; Knepp *et al.*, 2005).

We also found a significant decline in the abundance of scavengers in the canopy, likely driven by the significant decrease in the abundance of mites (Acari) under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. The significant reduction in mites is consistent with findings from other studies (Hansen *et al.* 2001; Loranger *et al.* 2004). However, the same decline was not seen in the ground-dwelling and understorey samples which contained far greater abundances of this group; indeed, the total biomass of ground dwelling mites actually increased under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, potentially as a result of larger individuals of greater body size.

#### 331 Specialist vs. generalist natural enemies

We predicted that arthropods at higher trophic levels would show greater declines in abundance than groups from lower trophic levels, given the generally greater sensitivity of higher trophic levels to environmental change (Voigt *et al.* 2003). We expected this to be particularly true for more specialised feeding groups such as parasitoids, because they are more restricted by tightlycoupled relationships with a limited number of host species compared with generalist predators which can exploit a greater range of prey species. We found significant reductions in the abundance of aerial parasitoid wasps, as expected, and as such this study adds to the body of

339 evidence that specialised taxa may be more susceptible to environmental change (e.g. Hance et 340 al. 2007). Conversely, previous studies from similar sites have found increases in the numbers of 341 parasitoids or parasitism rates under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (Percy et al., 2002; Stiling et al., 2002, 2003; 342 Hillstrom & Lindroth, 2008). Stiling et al. (2003) attributed their findings to the host plant 343 quality-mediated increases development time of host species, leaving them vulnerable to 344 parasitoid attack for longer periods. In our study, host species may well be experiencing reduced 345 development rates – this would require further work to determine – but the reductions seen in 346 absolute host abundance may be more important for parasitoids. The declines found across a 347 range of groups from lower trophic levels, both in terms of abundance and biomass, could be 348 responsible for the declines seen in parasitoid abundance, as their larval food sources become 349 limited.

350 Contrary to our expectations, the abundance and biomass of generalist predators such as spiders 351 did not decline in any of the niche types, despite declines in the number of many of the groups 352 likely to constitute their prey. We did find a significant decline in the abundance of aerial 353 Neuroptera, though this was the only predatory Order to show a response. Previous findings 354 concerning the responses of predatory taxa to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> are mixed, with some studies finding 355 increases in the abundance of carnivorous groups (Sanders et al. 2004; Hamilton et al. 2012) and 356 one reporting no change (Hillstrom & Lindroth, 2008). In our study, it is possible that highly 357 mobile predators, such as ground-walking spiders and carabid beetles could access prey external 358 to the rings from which they were caught, enabling the maintenance of ambient population levels 359 within elevated rings; however this is also true of winged parasitoids for which we still detected 360 an effect. Alternatively, the effects of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> at the plot level may have deterred certain 361 insects from entering the rings, resulting in the population declines seen for many of the groups

studied; this is an inherent issue in plot-level experiments of this type (Moise & Henry 2010) that needs consideration when interpreting our results. Either way, reduced densities of these invertebrate groups in elevated CO<sub>2</sub> suggest that conditions were less favourable for them than those under ambient CO<sub>2</sub> levels. In addition, it could be possible that the predator population is yet to respond to declines in prey availability under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, given the relatively short fumigation time (since late 2012).

368 Our level of taxonomic identification (Order/Family) did not allow for estimations of the 369 abundance of arthropods from the fourth trophic level (intra-guild predators). The inclusion of 370 intra-guild predators within the predator group could potentially mask any CO<sub>2</sub> effects on the 371 abundance of third-level predatory taxa, though we might expect that fourth-level predatory taxa 372 would be negatively impacted by elevated CO<sub>2</sub> over the long term. The design of our study also 373 did not allow for the level of host specificity of herbivorous arthropods to be determined – this 374 could be an interesting consideration for further study, particular in the plant species-rich 375 understorey, as monophagous specialist herbivores have been shown to be more strongly 376 negatively affected by increases in CO<sub>2</sub> than polyphagous species (Stiling & Cornelissen, 2007).

#### 377 Community composition did not change under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>

Despite widespread overall declines within individual trophic groups and Orders, we found no evidence for an effect of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> on community composition, contrary to our predictions. Similarly, other studies of this type have shown weak to non-existent effects of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> on community composition (Sanders *et al.* 2004; Hillstrom *et al.* 2014). Given that the majority of the responses of the different groups to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> in our study, both in terms of abundance and biomass, were negative in nature, this could have resulted in a compositionally-similar

384 communities comprised of fewer total individuals compared with those under ambient385 conditions.

The range of sampling methods used in this study mean that we gained a broad, representative sample of the community occurring in *Eucalyptus* woodland. We found many differences in the responses of the individual trophic and taxonomic groups to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> between sampling methods, indicating the potential for studies using only one sampling technique to overlook effects of elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. We therefore stress the importance of using multiple sampling methods in future work in such studies, to ensure that the results more accurately reflect the responses occurring in the system.

#### 393 Conclusions

394 There is a growing body of evidence from community-level studies that the responses of 395 invertebrates to climatic and atmospheric change will likely be taxon-specific and idiosyncratic 396 (Sanders et al. 2004; Hamilton et al. 2012; Hillstrom et al. 2014). In support of this, we found 397 differences in the directions and/or strength of change for certain groups between niche types, as 398 well as differences in the responsiveness of the taxa comprising the individual feeding guilds, 399 highlighting the importance of studies across multiple trophic levels (Pocock *et al.*, 2012). 400 However, overall we found evidence for a consistent decline across a broad range of groups 401 under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. Particularly for those groups showing corresponding declines in biomass 402 such as detritivorous Isopoda and omnivores, these declines could indicate reductions in the 403 energy flow attributed to these organisms in the system. Significant reductions in the abundance 404 and biomass of several groups with roles in nutrient cycling and biocontrol suggest that

405	woodland ecosystem processes could potentially be affected as global concentrations of
406	atmospheric CO <sub>2</sub> continue to rise.
407	References
408	Ainsworth EA, Long SP (2005) What have we learned from 15 years of free-air CO <sub>2</sub> enrichment
409	(FACE)? A meta-analytic review of the responses of photosynthesis, canopy properties and
410	plant production to rising CO <sub>2</sub> . The New Phytologist, 165, 351–372.
411	Altermatt F (2003) Potential negative effects of atmospheric CO <sub>2</sub> enrichment on insect
412	communities in the canopy of a mature deciduous forest in Switzerland. Mitteilungen
413	der Schweizerischen Entomologischen Gesellschaft, 76, 191–199.
414	Barker GM (2004) Millipedes (Diplopoda) and centipedes (Chilopoda)(Myriapoda) as predators
415	of terrestrial gastropods. In: Natural Enemies of Terrestrial Molluscs (ed Barker, GM),
416	pp. 405–426, CABI Publishing, Wallingford, UK.
417	Bates D, Maechler M, Bolker B, Walker S (2014) lme4: Linear mixed-effects models using
418	Eigen and S4. R package version 1.1-7. https://cran.r-
419	project.org/web/packages/lme4/index.html.
420	Bezemer TM, Jones TH (1998) Plant-insect herbivore interactions in elevated atmospheric CO <sub>2</sub> :
421	quantitative analyses and guild effects. Oikos, 82, 212–222.
422	Brook AJ, Woodcock BA, Sinka M, Vanbergen AJ (2008) Experimental verification of suction
423	sampler capture efficiency in grasslands of differing vegetation height and structure.

*Journal of Applied Ecology*, **45**, 1357–1363.

425	Brown, J.H., Gillooly, J., Allen, A., Savage, V. & West, G. (2004) Toward a metabolic theory of
426	ecology. <i>Ecology</i> , <b>85</b> , 1771–1789.
427	Buntin GD (1993) Developing a sampling program. In: Handbook of sampling methods for
428	arthropods in agriculture (eds Pedigo LP, Buntin GD) CRC Press, Florida, US.
429	Costanza R, d'Arge R, de Groot R et al. (1997) The value of the world's ecosystem services and
430	natural capital. <i>Nature</i> , <b>387</b> , 253–260.
431	Couture, J.J. & Lindroth, R.L. (2012) Atmospheric change alters performance of an invasive
432	forest insect. Global Change Biology, 18, 3543-3557.
433	Couture, J.J., Meehan, T.D., Kruger, E.L. & Lindroth, R.L. (2015) Insect herbivory alters impact
434	of atmospheric change on northern temperate forests. <i>Nature Plants</i> , <b>1</b> , 1–5.
435	CSIRO (1991) The Insects of Australia: A textbook for students and research workers.
436	Melbourne University Press, Melbourne, Australia.
437	Department of the Environment and Water Resources (2007) Australia's Native Vegetation: A
438	summary of Australia's Major Vegetation Groups. Accessed online:
439	https://www.environment.gov.au/resource/australias-native-vegetation-summary-
440	australias-major-vegetation-groups
441	Duursma RA, Gimeno TE, Boer MM, Crous KY, Tjoelker MG, Ellsworth DS (2016) Canopy
442	leaf area of a mature evergreen Eucalyptus woodland does not respond to elevated
443	atmospheric CO <sub>2</sub> but tracks water availability. <i>Global Change Biology</i> , <b>22</b> , 1666-1676.

444	Facey SL, Ellsworth DS, Staley JT, Wright DJ, Johnson SN (2014) Upsetting the order: how
445	climate and atmospheric change affects herbivore-enemy interactions. Current Opinion
446	in Insect Science, 5, 66–74.
447	Facey SL, Gherlenda AN (2016) Forest invertebrate communities and atmospheric change. In:
448	SN Johnson, TH Jones (eds) Global Climate Change and Terrestrial Invertebrates, in
449	press.
450	Faraway JJ (2006) Extending the linear model with R: generalized linear, mixed effects and
451	nonparametric regression models. Chapman & Hall/CRC, Florida, US.
452	Frew A, Nielsen UN, Riegler M, Johnson SN (2013) Do eucalypt plantation management
453	practices create understory reservoirs of scarab beetle pests in soil? Forest Ecology and
454	Management, <b>306</b> , 275–280.
455	Gherlenda AN, Crous KY, Moore BD, Haigh AM, Johnson SN, Riegler M (2015) Precipitation,
456	not CO2 enrichment, drives insect herbivore frass deposition and subsequent nutrient
457	dynamics in a mature Eucalyptus woodland. Plant and Soil, doi: 10.1007/s11104-015-
458	2683-2.
459	Gherlenda, A.N., Esveld, J.L., Hall, A.G., Duursma, R.A. & Riegler, M. (2016) Boom and bust:
460	rapid feedback responses between insect outbreak dynamics and canopy leaf area
461	impacted by rainfall and CO <sub>2</sub> . Global Change Biology, doi: 10.1111/gcb.13334.
462	Hamilton, J.G., Zangerl, A.R., Berenbaum, M.R., Pippen, J., Aldea, M. & DeLucia, E.H. (2004)
463	Insect herbivory in an intact forest understory under experimental CO <sub>2</sub> enrichment.
464	<i>Oecologia</i> , <b>138</b> , 566–573.

465	Hamilton J, Zangerl AR, Berenbaum MR, Sparks JP, Elich L, Eisenstein A, DeLucia EH (2012)
466	Elevated atmospheric CO <sub>2</sub> alters the arthropod community in a forest understory. Acta
467	<i>Oecologica</i> , <b>43</b> , 80–85.
468	Hance T, van Baaren J, Vernon P, Boivin G (2007) Impact of extreme temperatures on
469	parasitoids in a climate change perspective. Annual Review of Entomology, 52, 107-
470	126.
471	Hansen RA, Williams RS, Degenhardt DC, Lincoln DE (2001) Non-litter effects of elevated CO <sub>2</sub>
472	on forest floor microarthropod abundances. Plant and Soil, 236, 139-144.
473	Harrison XA (2014) Using observation-level random effects to model overdispersion in count
474	data in ecology and evolution. PeerJ, doi: 10.7717/peerj.616.
475	Hentley WT, Hails RS, Johnson SN, Jones TH, Vanbergen AJ (2014) Top-down control by
476	Harmonia axyridis mitigates the impact of elevated atmospheric CO2 on a plant-aphid
477	interaction. Agricultural and Forest Entomology, doi: 10.1111/afe.12065.
478	Hillstrom ML, Lindroth RL (2008) Elevated atmospheric carbon dioxide and ozone alter forest
479	insect abundance and community composition. Insect Conservation and Diversity, 1,
480	233–241.
481	Hillstrom ML, Couture JJ, Lindroth RL (2014) Elevated carbon dioxide and ozone have weak,
482	idiosyncratic effects on herbivorous forest insect abundance, species richness, and
483	community composition. Insect Conservation and Diversity, 7, 553–562.
484	Hunter MD (2001) Insect population dynamics meets ecosystem ecology: effects of herbivory on
485	soil nutrient dynamics. Agricultural and Forest Entomology, 3, 77-84.

- 486 IPCC (2007) Climate Change 2007: The Physical Science Basis: Working Group I Contribution
- 487 to the Fourth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
- 488 (eds Solomon S, Qin D, Manning M, Chen Z, Marquis M, Averyt KB, Tignor M, Miller
- 489 HL). Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.
- 490 IPCC (2013) Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science Basis: Contribution of Working Group
- 491 *I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change*
- 492 (eds Stocker TF, Qin D, Plattner G-K, Tignor M, Allen SK, Boschung J, Nauels A, Xia
- 493 Y, Bex V, Midgley PM). Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.
- 494 Jamieson MA, Trowbridge AM, Raffa KF, Lindroth RL (2012) Consequences of climate
- 495 warming and altered precipitation patterns for plant-insect and multitrophic interactions.
  496 *Plant Physiology*, **160**, 1719–1727.
- 497 Knepp, R.G., Hamilton, J.G., Mohan, J.E., Zangerl, A.R., Berenbaum, M.R. & Delucia, E.H.
- 498 (2005) Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> reduces leaf damage by insect herbivores in a forest community.
  499 *The New Phytologist*, **167**, 207–18.
- 500 Lindroth RL, Raffa KF (2016) Experimental approaches for assessing invertebrate responses to

501 global change factors. In: SN Johnson, TH Jones (eds) *Invertebrates and Global*502 *Climate Change*, in press.

Loranger GI, Pregitzer KS, King JS (2004) Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3t</sub> concentrations differentially
affect selected groups of the fauna in temperate forest soils. *Soil Biology & Biochemistry*, **36**, 1521–1524.

506	Moise ERD, Henry HAL (2010) Like moths to a street lamp: exaggerated animal densities in
507	plot-level global change field experiments. Oikos, 119, 791–795.
508	Mora C, Tittensor DP, Adl S, Simpson AGB, Worm B (2011) How many species are there on
509	earth and in the ocean? <i>PLoS Biology</i> , <b>9</b> , 1–8.
510	Moran VC, Southwood TRE (1982) The guild composition of arthropod communities in trees.
511	Journal of Animal Ecology, <b>51</b> , 289–306.
512	Norby, R.J., Kauwe, M.G. De, Domingues, T.F., Duursma, R.A., Ellsworth, D.S., Goll, D.S., et
513	al. (2016) Model-data synthesis for the next generation of forest free-air CO <sub>2</sub>
514	enrichment (FACE) experiments. New Phytologist, 209, 17-28.
515	Oksanen J, Blanchet FG, Kindt R et al. (2015) vegan: Community Ecology Package. R package
516	version 2.2-1. https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/vegan/index.html.
517	Percy KE, Awmack CS, Lindroth RL et al. (2002) Altered performance of forest pests under
518	atmospheres enriched by CO <sub>2</sub> and O <sub>3</sub> . <i>Nature</i> , <b>420</b> , 403–408.
519	Pocock, M.J.O., Evans, D.M. & Memmott, J. (2012) The robustness and restoration of a network
520	of ecological networks. Science, <b>335</b> , 973–977.
521	Polis G (1998) Stability is woven by complex webs. <i>Nature</i> , <b>395</b> , 744–745.
522	Price PW (2002) Resource-driven terrestrial interaction webs. <i>Ecological Research</i> , <b>17</b> , 241–
523	247.
524	Pritchard SG, Rogers HH, Prior SA, Peterson CM (1999) Elevated CO <sub>2</sub> and plant structure: a
525	review. Global Change Biology, 5, 807–837.

526	R Core Team (2015) R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for
527	Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. URL https://www.R-project.org/.
528	Raffaelli, D. (2004) How extinction patterns affect ecosystems. Science, 306, 1141–1142.
529	Robinson EA, Ryan GD, Newman JA (2012) A meta-analytical review of the effects of elevated
530	CO2 on plant-arthropod interactions highlights the importance of interacting
531	environmental and biological variables. The New Phytologist, 194, 321-336.
532	Saint-Germain M, Buddle CM, Larrivée M et al. (2007) Should biomass be considered more
533	frequently as a currency in terrestrial arthropod community analyses? Journal of
534	<i>Applied Ecology</i> , <b>44</b> , 330–339.
535	Sanders NJ, Gotelli NJ, Heller NE, Gordon DM (2003) Community disassembly by an invasive
536	species. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of
537	America, <b>100</b> , 2474–2477.
538	Sanders NJ, Belote RT, Weltzin JF (2004) Multitrophic Effects of Elevated Atmospheric CO2 on
539	Understory Plant and Arthropod Communities. Environmental Entomology, 33, 1609-
540	1616.
541	De Sassi C, Lewis OT, Tylianakis JM (2012) Plant-mediated and nonadditive effects of two
542	global change drivers on an insect herbivore community. <i>Ecology</i> , <b>93</b> , 1892–1901.
543	Scheffers BR, Joppa LN, Pimm SL, Laurance WF (2012) What we know and don't know about
544	Earth's missing biodiversity. Trends in Ecology and Evolution, 27,501-510.

545	Stiling P, Cornelissen T (2007) How does elevated carbon dioxide (CO <sub>2</sub> ) affect plant-herbivore
546	interactions? A field experiment and meta-analysis of CO2-mediated changes on plant
547	chemistry and herbivore performance. Global Change Biology, 13, 1823–1842.
548	Stiling P, Cattell M, Moon DC, Rossi A, Hungate BA, Hymus G, Drake B (2002) Elevated
549	atmospheric CO <sub>2</sub> lowers herbivore abundance, but increases leaf abscission rates.
550	Global Change Biology, 8, 658–667.
551	Stiling P, Moon DC, Hunter MD, Colson J, Rossi AM, Hymus GJ, Drake BG (2003) Elevated
552	CO2 lowers relative and absolute herbivore density across all species of a scrub-oak
553	forest. Oecologia, 134, 82–87.
554	Stiling P, Forkner R, Drake B (2010) Long-term exposure to elevated CO <sub>2</sub> in a Florida scrub-oak
555	forest increases herbivore densities but has no effect on other arthropod guilds. Insect
556	<i>Conservation and Diversity</i> , <b>3</b> , 152–156.
557	Tylianakis JM, Didham RK, Bascompte J, Wardle DA (2008) Global change and species
558	interactions in terrestrial ecosystems. <i>Ecology Letters</i> , <b>11</b> , 1351–1363.
559	Vanbergen, A.J., Woodcock, B.A., Koivula, M., Niemelä, J., Kotze, D.J., Bolger, T., et al.
560	(2010) Trophic level modulates carabid beetle responses to habitat and landscape
561	structure: A pan-European study. <i>Ecological Entomology</i> , <b>35</b> , 226–235.
562	Vasseur L, Potvin C (1998) Natural pasture community response to enriched carbon dioxide
563	atmosphere. Plant Ecology, 135, 31-41.

564	Villalpando SN, Williams RS, Norby RJ (2009) Elevated air temperature alters an old-field
565	insect community in a multifactor climate change experiment. Global Change Biology,
566	<b>15</b> , 930–942.
567	Voigt W, Perner J, Davis AJ et al. (2003) Trophic levels are differentially sensitive to climate.
568	<i>Ecology</i> , <b>84</b> , 2444–2453.
569	Wilson EO (1987) The Little Things That Run the World (The Importance and Conservation of
570	Invertebrates). Conservation Biology, 1, 344–346.
571	Woodcock BA (2005) Pitfall trapping in ecological studies. In: Insect sampling in forest
572	ecosystems (ed Leather S), pp. 37–58, Blackwell Science Ltd, Oxford, UK.
573	Zimmer M (2002) Nutrition in terrestrial isopods (Isopoda: Oniscidea): an evolutionary-
574	ecological approach. Biological Reviews of the Cambridge Philosophical Society, 77,
575	455–493.
576	Zhu, Z., Piao, S., Myneni, R.B., Huang, M., Zeng, Z., Canadell, J.G., et al. (2016) Greening of

577 the Earth and its drivers. *Nature Climate Change*, **6**, 791–795.

#### 578 Acknowledgements

- 579 We thank V. Kumar, S. Wohl, C. McNamara, C. Barton, G. Lopaticki, B. May and S. Pulumbarit
- 580 for their assistance. We thank K. Barnett, J. Powell and R. Duursma for statistical advice. This
- 581 work was supported by a Hawkesbury Institute for the Environment Higher Degree Research
- 582 Award to S.L.F. and a British Ecological Society Small Project Grant awarded to L.M.B.
- 583 EucFACE is supported by the Australian Commonwealth Government through the Education
- 584 Investment Fund, the Department of Industry and Science, and the Australian Research Council
- 585 in partnership with Western Sydney University. The facilities at EucFACE were built as part of
- 586 the Australian Government's Nation-building Economic Stimulus Package.

Table 1: Results from likelihood ratio tests performed on GLMMs (abundance) and LMMs (rank-transformed biomass) with and without the fixed effect of CO<sub>2</sub> treatment, with the abundance or biomass of each of the groups collected over the course of the experiment as the dependent variable. † denotes that for this taxa, strong variation in the data made analysis unreliable. Those groups with sample sizes too small for analysis in all three niches are not shown. Significant *P* values are highlighted in bold ( $\alpha = 0.1$ ).

593 Table 2: Results from likelihood ratio tests performed on GLMMs (abundance) and LMMs

(rank-transformed biomass) with and without the fixed effect of CO<sub>2</sub> treatment, with the

abundance of the arthropods in each of the recognised guilds as the dependent variable.

596 Significant *P* values are highlighted in bold.

# 597 Table 1

Creare		Abundance		Bior	Biomass	
Group	Niche Type	$\chi^{2}$ 1	P	$\chi^{2}$	P	
Overall	Ground-dwelling	3.442	0.064	0.190	0.66	
	Understorey	2.412	0.12	0.087	0.77	
	Aerial	3.878	0.049	-	-	
Coleoptera	Ground-dwelling	1 1 2 2	0.29	0 219	0.64	
colcoptera	Understorey	3 1 2 9	0.27	2 540	0.04	
	Aerial	0.493	0.077	2.540	0.11	
Dintera	Ground-dwelling	0.493	0.48	0.623	0.43	
Diptera	Understorey	2 002	0.51	2.005	0.45	
	Aprial	2.002	0.10	2.003	0.10	
Aronaca	Cround dwalling	0.194	0.00	-	-	
Alalleae	Understeres.	1.340	0.21	0.000	1.00	
	Aprial	0.023	0.88	0.558	0.30	
Assains	Aerial	0.058	0.42	-	-	
Acarina	Ground-dweiling	0.085	0.77	2.785	0.095	
	Understorey	1.854	0.1/	2.624	0.11	
<b>TT</b>	Aerial	16.486	<0.001	-	-	
Hemiptera	Ground-dwelling	0.047	0.83	0.046	0.83	
	Understorey	1.188	0.28	0.163	0.69	
	Aerial	1.989	0.16	-	-	
Hymenoptera	Ground-dwelling	4.646	0.031	0.785	0.38	
	Understorey	2.580	0.11	0.941	0.33	
	Aerial	3.441	0.064	-	-	
Thysanoptera	Understorey	0.367	0.55	0.013	0.91	
	Aerial	2.418	0.12	-	-	
Orthoptera	Ground-dwelling	11.347	<0.001	5.356	0.021	
Isopoda	Ground-dwelling	9.010	0.0027	14.469	<0.001	
	Understorey	ţ	†	ţ	+	
Blattodea	Understorey	0.205	0.65	0.141	0.71	
Collembola	Ground-dwelling	0.824	0.36	0.081	0.78	
	Understorey	0.148	0.70	0.014	0.91	
	Aerial	2.708	0.10	-	-	
Lepidoptera	Aerial	1.190	0.28	-	-	
Psocoptera	Aerial	26.389	<0.001	-	-	
Neuroptera	Aerial	5.982	0.014		-	

601	Table	2

Creare	Ni ale a tama	Abun	dance	Bio	Biomass		
Group	Niche type	$\chi^{2}$	Р	$\chi^{2}$	Р		
Scavengers	Ground-dwelling	2.661	0.10	0.003	0.96		
-	Understorey	2.619	0.11	1.709	0.19		
	Aerial	9.961	0.0016	-	-		
Detritivores	Ground-dwelling	1.712	0.19	3.379	0.066		
	Understorey	0.116	0.73	1.005	0.32		
	Aerial	< 0.001	0.98	-	-		
Omnivores	Ground-dwelling	1.643	0.11	3.481	0.062		
	Understorey	3.448	0.063	8.471	0.0036		
	Aerial	1.303	0.25	-	-		
Chewing herbivores	Ground-dwelling	2.845	0.092	1.419	0.24		
-	Understorey	0.091	0.76	0.323	0.57		
	Aerial	0.252	0.62	-	-		
Sucking herbivores	Ground-dwelling	0.751	0.39	0.800	0.38		
-	Understorey	1.095	0.30	0.078	0.78		
	Aerial	1.989	0.16	-	-		
Predators	Ground-dwelling	0.597	0.44	0.069	0.79		
	Understorey	0.890	0.35	0.149	0.70		
	Aerial	0.535	0.47	-			
Parasitoids	Ground-dwelling	0.305	0.58	0.296	0.59		
	Understorey	0.026	0.87	0.012	0.91		
	Aerial	3.422	0.064	-	-		

**Fig. 1** Mean abundance of different functional guilds (a, b) and taxonomic groups (c, d) of ground-dwelling arthropods, split by CO<sub>2</sub> treatment (across all dates). Ambient samples are shown with white bars; those from elevated conditions are in grey. To the right of each bar total average biomass  $\pm$  SE is shown for the corresponding group. Significant differences (from GLMMs (abundance) and LMMs (biomass), Table 1 and Table 2) are denoted by asterisks (\* *P* < 0.1, \*\*P < 0.05, \*\*\*P < 0.01). Error bars show  $\pm$  SE of the mean.

610 Fig. 2 Mean abundance of different functional guilds (a, b) and taxonomic groups (c, d) of

611 understorey arthropods, split by CO<sub>2</sub> treatment (across all dates). Ambient samples are shown

612 with white bars; those from elevated conditions are in grey. To the right of each bar total average

613 biomass ± SE is shown for the corresponding group. Significant differences (from GLMMs

(abundance) and LMMs (biomass), Table 1 and Table 2) are denoted by asterisks (\* P < 0.1, \*\*P

615 < 0.05, \*\*\* P < 0.01). Error bars show  $\pm$  SE of the mean.

**Fig. 3** Mean abundance of different, the functional guilds (a, b) and taxonomic groups (c, d) of aerial arthropods, split by CO<sub>2</sub> treatment (across all dates, with no biomass data due to the sampling method). Ambient samples are shown with white bars; those from elevated conditions are in grey. Significant differences (from GLMMs, Table 1 and Table 2) are denoted by asterisks (\* P < 0.1, \*\*P < 0.05, \*\*\* P < 0.01). Error bars show ± SE of the mean.

**Fig. 4** a schematic diagram summarising the main findings in this study, and showing a scaled drawing of one of the EucFACE arrays. CO<sub>2</sub> (or air in the case of ambient rings) is pumped in to the ring from the vertical vent pipes surrounding each array. The crane is used to access the tree canopy. Arrows show the direction of significant changes in the abundances of the taxa shown, in response to elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. The widths of the arrows indicate their level of significance, with

- 626 wider arrows representing smaller *P* values, and thus greater evidence against the null
- 627 hypothesis.









# 1 Electronic Supplemental Material

- 2 Table S1: a list of the total abundances of the groups identified in this study and their
- 3 functional guild classifications (from Barker, 2004; CSIRO, 1991; Moran & Southwood,
- 4 1982; Zimmer, 2002). Those groups marked with an asterisk were identified to Subclass level
- 5 only.

	Total abundance				
Groups identified	ground- dwelling understorey		aerial	classification	
			acriai		
Diptera:	(520	1576	14605)	-	
Sciaridae	179	368	8144	Detritivores	
Mosquitoes	0	9	0	Sanguivores	
Psychodidae	1	7	38	Detritivores	
Syrphidae	0	0	29	Predators	
Asilidae	0	0	1	Predators	
Other Diptera	340	1192	6393	Omnivores	
Coleoptera:	(342	224	1314)	-	
Elateridae	8	0	12	Omnivores	
Carabidae	157	7	0	Predators	
Tenebrionidae	2	0	0	Scavengers	
Stapylinidae	45	32	109	Predators	
Scarabaeidae	23	0	0	Detritivores	
Curculionidae	66	32	66	Chewing herbivores	
Cantharidae	0	1	12	Omnivores	
Coccinellidae	0	0	72	Predators	
Other Coleoptera	41	152	1043	Omnivores	
Hymenoptera:	(4833	1966	21711)	-	
Non-ant Hymenoptera	290	637	21540	Parasitoids	
Formicidae	4543	1329	171	Scavengers	
Neuroptera	3	0	114	Predators	
Lepidoptera	9	22	54	Chewing herbivores	
Hemiptera:	(209	673	2784)	-	
Predatory Hemiptera (e.g. Reduviidae)	26	14	0	Predators	
Other (non-psyllid) Hemiptera	183	659	2784	Sucking herbivores	
Thysanoptera	9	715	7317	Omnivores	
Orthoptera	57	45	5	Chewing herbivores	
Psocoptera	4	23	51	Detritivores	
Blattodea	32	57	21	Scavengers	
Mantodea	0	1	4	Predators	
Lithobiomorpha	25	1	0	Predators	
Scolopendromorpha	15	0	0	Predators	
Chilognatha*	1	0	0	Detritivores	
Araneae	1644	598	1028	Predators	
Pseudoscorpiones	8	21	0	Predators	
Acari*	2191	10531	346	Scavengers	
Isopoda	1788	85	0	Detritivores	
Collembola*	2769	2615	562	Detritivores	
GRAND TOTAL:		83,528			
6					

Ŭ

- 9 Table S2: Results from multivariate permutational analysis (PERMANOVA) of the effect of
- 10 CO<sub>2</sub> treatment on community data from the three different niche-types, partitioned by Order
- 11 identity and functional feeding guild classification (FG).
- 12

Niche type	Community	d.f.	SS	MS	Pseudo-F	<b>R</b> <sub>2</sub>	P (perm)
	tested	(treatment,					
		residual)					
Ground-dwelling							
invertebrates	Order	1, 34	0.204	0.204	1.119	0.032	0.326
	FG	1, 34	0.124	0.124	0.837	0.024	0.479
Understorey							
invertebrates	Order	1,28	0.068	0.068	0.372	0.013	0.823
	FG	1,28	0.055	0.055	0.323	0.011	0.812
Aerial							
invertebrates	Order	1, 34	0.064	0.064	0.882	0.025	0.421
	FG	1, 34	0.066	0.066	1.076	0.031	0.338

Fig. S1: NMDS plots of arthropod community data in each of the three niche types, partitioned by functional guild classification and Order identity. Ambient CO<sub>2</sub> samples are shown in white, with elevated CO<sub>2</sub> in dark grey/black. Ellipses show the standard deviation around each community centroid. All sampling dates were included in the analysis. Pr Predators, Pa Parasitoids, Sc Scavengers, De Detritivores, Om Omnivores, Su Suckers, Ch Chewers, Sa Sanguivores; Di Diptera, Co Coleoptera, Ar Araneae, Ac Acarina, He Hemiptera, Th Thysanoptera, Bl Blattodea, Is Isopoda, Col Collembola, Hy Hymenoptera, Pse Pseudoscorpiones, Or Orthoptera, Le Lepidoptera, Li Lithobiomorpha, Ma Mantodea, Pso Psocoptera, Ne Neuroptera, Mi Millipedes (Chilognatha), Sc Scolopendromorpha. Stress values remained below 0.2 for all analyses, with k=3 dimensions.

