A 500 year sediment lake record of anthropogenic and natural inputs to Windermere (English Lake District) using double-spike lead isotopes, radiochronology and sediment microanalysis

Helen Miller<sup>a\*</sup>, Ian W. Croudace<sup>a</sup>, Jonathan M. Bull<sup>a</sup>, Carol J. Cotterill<sup>b</sup>, Justin K. Dix<sup>a</sup> and Rex N. Taylor<sup>a</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Ocean and Earth Science, University of Southampton, National Oceanography Centre, European Way, Southampton, SO14 3ZH, UK

<sup>b</sup> British Geological Survey, Murchison House, West Mains Road, Edinburgh, EH9 3LA, UK

\* Corresponding author: Helen.Miller@noc.soton.ac.uk; Tel +44 23805 96507

1 Abstract: A high-resolution record of pollution is preserved in recent sediments from Windermere, the largest lake in the English Lake District. Data derived from X-ray core 2 scanning (validated against WD-XRF), radiochronological techniques (<sup>210</sup>Pb and <sup>137</sup>Cs) and 3 ultra-high precision, double-spike mass spectrometry for lead isotopes are combined to 4 decipher the anthropogenic inputs to the lake. The sediment record suggests that while most 5 element concentrations have been stable, there has been a significant increase in lead, zinc 6 7 and copper concentrations since the 1930s. Lead isotope down-core variations identify three major contributory sources of anthropogenic (industrial) lead, comprising gasoline lead, coal 8 9 combustion lead (most likely source is coal-fired steam ships) and lead derived from Carboniferous Pb-Zn mineralisation (mining activities). Periods of metal workings do not 10 correlate with peaks in heavy metals due to the trapping efficiency of up-system lakes in the 11 12 catchment. Heavy metal increases could be due to flood-induced metal inwash after the cessation of mining and the weathering of bedrock in the catchment. The combination of 13 sediment analysis techniques used provides new insights into the pollutant depositional 14 history of Windermere and could be similarly applied to other lake systems to determine the 15 timing and scale of anthropogenic inputs. 16

- 17 Key Words: Lake sediments, heavy metal contamination, Itrax micro-XRF, double-spike
- 18 *lead isotopes, Windermere, 500 year sediment record*

# 19 Introduction

Lake sediments provide an archive of environmental change and may be used to examine 20 21 temporal changes in natural and anthropogenic element input allowing the reconstruction of 22 heavy metal pollution history within a catchment. Within the UK and Europe, a number of 23 studies attribute the enrichment of heavy metals in lacustrine sediments to human and 24 industrial activity during the late 19th and early 20th centuries, and leaded gasoline usage during the 20th century.<sup>1-3</sup> Lead isotope ratios have been increasingly used to yield 25 26 information on geochemical origin, to establish the principal sources of lead pollution and to identify the pathways by which lead enters the environment.<sup>4-7</sup> Local point sources of heavy 27 metals from mining activities have also been correlated with pollution records in lake 28 sediments.<sup>8,9</sup> These studies demonstrate that point sources (such as mining activities) have a 29 significant impact on the surrounding environment and local pollution history.<sup>10</sup> The 30 development of the high precision double-spike lead isotope technique now enables 31 significantly more sensitive environmental investigations.<sup>11</sup> 32

Within the English Lake District, significant amounts of heavy metal pollution linked to 33 changes in mining activity have been identified within the sediments of Ullswater,<sup>12,13</sup> 34 Bassenthwaite<sup>14,15</sup> and Brotherswater<sup>16</sup> to the north of Windermere (Figure 1). In the 35 36 recreationally important Windermere, there was interest in evaluating frequency of flood events and the extent of heavy metal pollution derived historically from the catchment.<sup>17</sup> In 37 the South Basin, low resolution analysis of 1 m sediment cores have previously identified 38 enriched levels of lead, zinc, copper and mercury which were attributed to anthropogenic 39 40 inputs such as mining activities, sewage discharge, denudation of land surfaces (erosion and surface runoff of sediment containing enriched levels of heavy metals), heavy industry and 41 burning of fossil fuels.<sup>18-20</sup> 42

This paper investigates the pollutant deposition of Windermere and the surrounding 43 44 catchment, and assesses the timing and scale of anthropogenic inputs in recent lacustrine sediments using two methods not previously applied. Non-destructive, high-resolution (200 45 micron scale) Itrax micro-XRF and micro-radiographic analysis has the potential to identify 46 fine scale compositional change (e.g. mining inputs and seasonal events). The data are 47 48 validated against conventional WD-XRF using centimetre-scale sub-samples. In addition, 49 high-precision, double-spike lead isotope measurements, offering ten times the precision of 50 the conventional single spike method, are used to examine multi-source inputs of lead. The 51 data interpretations are constrained by radiochronology and extensive historical research of 52 former mining landscapes.

#### 53 Study Site

54 Windermere is the largest freshwater lake in the English Lake District, occupying a radial pre-glacial river valley and as such represents a major recreational attraction in a UK 55 56 National Park. It comprises two basins (North and South) separated by an area of low islands 57 and shallow water (Figure 1). The lake is orientated NNW to SSW, measuring c. 17 km in length with a maximum width of c. 1.5 km. It has a total area of c. 14.7 km<sup>2</sup> and a maximum 58 depth of 62 m. The lake bed is characterised by several sub-basins separated by steps, ridges 59 60 and isolated topographic highs, interpreted as the surface expression of recessional moraines related to retreat of the British and Irish Ice Sheet.<sup>21,22</sup> The sedimentology of the lake bed is 61 dominated by gyttja (fine to very coarse organic rich silt).<sup>21</sup> 62

The bedrock of the catchment (area c. 242 km<sup>2</sup>) predominantly comprises the Borrowdale Volcanic Group (BVG) in the north, and the Silurian Windermere Supergroup (slates, shales and sandstones) in the south<sup>17</sup> (Figure 1). There are two major fault systems in the region, orientated NNW-SSE and ENE-WSW which produce kilometre-scale map offsets (Figure

1).<sup>23,24</sup> The two main inlets of Windermere (River Rothay and Brathay) are located at the 67 northern end of the lake and are sourced in the central Lake District, draining several streams 68 and small lakes, including Elterwater, Grasmere and Rydal Water. Troutbeck represents the 69 70 main river catchment to the east of the North Basin. In the South Basin, the predominant 71 inflow enters as flow from the North Basin and via Cunsey Beck. Except on the steeper and 72 denuded surfaces, land cover in the north is largely grassland on poor soils and acidified podsols, with mixed woodland and improved grassland to the west.<sup>25,26</sup> Land use to the east is 73 more urban, with the settlements of Ambleside and Bowness-on-Windermere. 74

# 75 Sewage Treatment

76 There are five existing sewage treatment works (STW) within the Windermere catchment: at 77 Grasmere; Elterwater and Ambleside in the North; Hawkshead and Tower Wood in the South 78 (Figure 1). Wastewater entering the North Basin was not treated until the opening of the STW at Ambleside in 1886, and the smaller Grasmere and Elterwater plants were later installed in 79 the early 1970s.<sup>27</sup> In the South Basin, wastewater was first treated in 1888 at Beemire and 80 81 subsequently diverted to Tower Wood in 1924, the largest STW in the catchment. Regular 82 monitoring since 1945 has assessed the level of nutrient enrichment and biological production in the water column, and has revealed a progressive change towards eutrophy.<sup>28</sup> Large 83 84 increases in nutrients from the mid-1960s are attributed to a growing human population, changes in agricultural practice and increased sewage discharge.<sup>29</sup> Centralisation of waste 85 86 water treatment in the 1960s led to an increase in direct discharge of treated sewage effluents, promoting algal growth, increasing phosphorus availability and reducing oxygen 87 concentration in deep water.<sup>25,28</sup> The implementation of a tertiary phosphate stripping 88 treatment in 1992 at Tower Wood and Ambleside STW helped reduce phosphate loading.<sup>29,30</sup> 89

## 91 Mining and quarrying in the Lake District

92 The Lake District has a long recorded history of metalliferous mining and quarrying that 93 dates back to the 16th century. Skilled systematic mineral exploration steadily increased until 94 the mid 18th century, followed by a large expansion due to the formation of private mining 95 companies. In the Windermere catchment, mining for copper, lead and iron was greatest in the latter half of the 19th century $^{25}$  and was followed by a rapid decline in 1870. During the 96 20th century there have been sporadic bursts of mining activity; however, all mining activity 97 has now ceased.<sup>31</sup> Quarrying for slate, building stone and aggregates was an important 98 99 commercial industry; however, many small quarries closed during the early 20th century and only a few commercial operators are currently active.<sup>32</sup> 100



101

102 Figure 1: Location map, showing Windermere catchment, rivers, lakes, valleys, Bowness-on-Windermere (black star), sewage treatment works, and BGS sediment cores. The location of disused 103 104 metal workings, currently active slate quarries, and stream sediment and WD-XRF samples with 105 elevated concentrations of Pb, Zn and Cu is also shown. Solid geology, stratigraphy and faults are from British Geological Survey.<sup>23</sup> BVG: Borrowdale Volcanic Group; catchment areas calculated 106 using 5 m resolution NEXTMap data. Insert shows location map of the study area in relation to the 107 108 Lake District and the British Isles. Figure contains British Geological Survey materials ©NERC 109 [2013].

#### 110 Methodology

#### 111 Historical research

Catchment boundaries were determined using onshore terrain data (5 m spatial resolution) 112 from NEXTMap Britain (a national IfSAR digital elevation database)<sup>33</sup> and spatial analyst 113 114 tools in ArcGIS. Information on metal workings was compiled from several sources, 115 including published books, reports and publications from local groups, such as the Cumbrian Amenity Trust Mining History Society and the Kendal and District Mine Research Society 116 (KDMRS) (for refs, see Supporting Information). Further information was acquired though 117 118 the BRITPITS Mineral Occurrence Database, the Lake District Historic Environment Record 119 (LDHER), the English Heritage Archive (PastScape Record) and the National Trust Historic 120 Buildings, Sites and Monuments Record. This paper represents the most extensive synthesis 121 to date of the former mining landscapes, mining sites and metal inputs into Windermere.

Active quarries were derived from the LDHER and refs 17 and 34. Stream sediment geochemical data (acquired in 1978 – 1980) were derived from BGS Geochemical Baseline Survey of the Environment (G-BASE) (analysis through direct current optical emission spectrometry).<sup>35-37</sup>

## 126 Sediment Analysis

Two piston cores from the North and South Basin were acquired in 2012 (core diameter 90 mm) using a piston corer designed by Uwitec.<sup>38</sup> The North Basin core +54-03/68 PC (53.7 m water depth, UTM coordinates 502900, 6029136, core length 10 m) and South Basin core +54-03/57 PC (37.3 m water depth, 503267, 6018702, core length 6 m) (Figure 1) were analysed using an Itrax micro-XRF core scanner (step size 200  $\mu$ m, counting time 30

#### **Environmental Science & Technology**

seconds, Mo anode X-ray tube, XRF conditions 30 kV, 50 mA) in accordance with themethodology detailed in ref 39.

134 The cores were also sub-sectioned at 1 cm resolution and 35 samples from each core were 135 analysed by WD-XRF to quantitatively determine compositional changes. Further analysis of 136 16 representative lake bed sediment samples acquired by a Van Veen F42A grab (lightweight 137 sediment sampler used to collect accurate representative samples of the top layer of sediment) 138 in 2011 (Figure 1) was also completed via WD-XRF analysis according to the same 139 methodology. The conventional WD-XRF data provide lower resolution compositional 140 variations on homogenised centimetre-scale sub-samples, whereas the Itrax micro-XRF core scanner provides continuous, non-destructive, high-resolution elemental profile data. The 141 high frequency compositional changes identified by the Itrax are often missed when using 142 143 lower resolution sub-samples. The Itrax produces elemental data in counts but numerous 144 studies (e.g. ref 40) have shown that these data highly correlate with quantitative analytical data (e.g. ICP-OES or WD-XRF). This aspect, along with its non-destructive analytical and 145 146 radiographic capability, combine to make the Itrax a unique high-resolution core scanner.

Additional analysis included using radiochronology (<sup>210</sup>Pb and <sup>137</sup>Cs) to determine 147 accumulation rates. <sup>210</sup>Pb activity was determined through the measurement of its 148 granddaughter <sup>210</sup>Po using alpha spectrometry. A Constant Flux - Constant Sedimentation 149 (CF:CS) model of <sup>210</sup>Pb dating was used.<sup>41</sup> The CF:CS model assumes that both the flux of 150 unsupported <sup>210</sup>Pb to the sediment and the sedimentation rate are constant. When the 151 assumptions are satisfied, the <sup>210</sup>Pb concentration will vary exponentially in accumulating 152 153 sediment due to the exponential nature of radioactive decay. The sedimentation rate is 154 calculated by plotting the natural logarithm of the unsupported lead concentration and determining the least squares fit. The <sup>137</sup>Cs activity of samples (sampled at 1 cm resolution) 155 156 was determined using a Canberra well-type HPGe gamma-ray spectrometer (counting for 100,000 seconds). High precision lead isotopic abundances were also determined to yield
 information on geochemical origin. Isotopic data were acquired using a Thermo Scientific
 NEPTUNE multi-collector ICP-MS. Instrumental mass bias was corrected using the SBL74
 <sup>207</sup>Pb-<sup>204</sup>Pb double spike developed at the University of Southampton.<sup>11</sup> For more details of
 sediment analysis, see Supporting Information.

162 **Results** 

#### 163 Mining and quarrying

164 Within the Windermere catchment, mining exploited mineral (copper, lead-zinc, haematite) 165 veins within the heavily faulted Ordovician (BVG) rocks around Grasmere and within 166 Tilberthwaite and Langdale Valley, particularly during the latter half of the 19th century (Figure 1). Copper mining mostly took place to the west of Windermere at Greenburn, 167 168 Skelwith and Hawkshead (See Table S1, Supporting Information). The largest mine was at Greenburn where five E-W copper veins yielding copper pyrites and a large quantity of oxide 169 of copper were worked.<sup>42</sup> Stream sediment geochemical data acquired in 1978 - 1980 170 171 identifies elevated levels of copper (above the background level of 10 - 25 ppm) near the 172 mine, most likely derived from spoil heaps and workings (Figure 1).

Veins in which lead and zinc minerals form the main metallic component have been mined 173 on a considerable scale in the Lake District.<sup>36</sup> In the Windermere catchment, two disused lead 174 175 mines (Greenhead Gill and Coniston United Mine) worked mineral veins within the fault system (Figure 1 and Table S1, Supporting Information). Greenhead Gill mine was worked 176 177 for lead and silver, and although zinc was present in higher quantities it was not mined because it had little commercial value.<sup>44</sup> Stream sediment geochemical data identifies 178 elevated levels of lead (>200 ppm) in this region. Iron ore mines exploited haematite-bearing 179 veins within the heavily faulted BVG rocks NE of Grasmere (Figure 1 and Table S1, 180

#### **Environmental Science & Technology**

Supporting Information). The mines were closed in 1877 due to low production, high transport costs and falling prices, but were later worked during the 1930s due to the high price of iron.<sup>42</sup> Quarrying for slate is the only active extractive industry in the catchment with five quarries (Elterwater, Peatfield, High Fell, Petts and Brathay) currently active (Figure 1).<sup>17,34</sup> The past quarrying has led to increased sediment loads of fine rock-flour entering Windermere, particularly in the North Basin.<sup>25,45</sup>

187 Historical research has revealed the greatest period of metalliferous output within the 188 Windermere catchment was in the latter half of the 19th century (see Table S1, Supporting 189 Information). These periods of metal workings do not correspond with notable increases in 190 heavy metals (Figures 2 and 3). In addition, elevated concentrations of lead, zinc and copper 191 in stream sediment geochemical data in the northern portion of the Windermere catchment 192 are also observed in headwater regions which are not influenced by mining activities 193 downstream (Figure 1). The high concentrations are possibly due to the weathering of bedrock, and it is likely that the presence of mineral veins acts as conduits for heavy metals. 194

## **195 Sediment accumulation rates**

Sediments were dated to determine accumulation rates using the CF:CS <sup>210</sup>Pb model. In the 196 North Basin (core +54-03/68 PC), the supported <sup>210</sup>Pb activity is estimated to be 0.019 Bq/g, 197 198 based on observing the activity in the deepest samples where the excess Pb activity tends towards a baseline of zero. The average sediment accumulation rate is 0.17 cm/yr (2 S.E. 199 limits 0.15 - 0.21 cm/yr). We were able to validate this accumulation rate over the last 49 200 years by measuring <sup>137</sup>Cs activity. The impact of the Chernobyl disaster (1986) is known to 201 202 be significant in the Lake District, with the input of most Chernobyl-derived Cs through 203 direct atmospheric deposition during a few hours of intense convective rainfall after the incident. A peak in <sup>137</sup>Cs activity at the top of the core is taken to correspond to the 1986 204

#### **Environmental Science & Technology**

205 Chernobyl incident<sup>46</sup>, and a peak at a depth of  $4.5 \pm 0.5$  cm is taken to correspond to the 1963 206 atmospheric testing of nuclear weapons (bomb maximum), suggesting an average sediment 207 accumulation rate from 1963 to 1986 of  $0.17 \pm 0.02$  cm/yr. This is consistent with the <sup>210</sup>Pb 208 determined accumulation rate (Figure 2).

In the South Basin (core +54-03/57 PC), no  $^{137}$ Cs activity was measured and results from  $^{210}$ Pb dating were more variable with several outlier values, particularly between 1 - 5 cm depth. Following removal of these values, supported  $^{210}$ Pb activity was estimated to be 0.033 Bq/g, and a linear fit through a plot of the natural logarithm of the determined excess  $^{210}$ Pb activities for each sample suggests an average accumulation rate of 0.14 cm/yr (2 S.E. 0.08 - 0.56 cm/yr) (Figure 3). In core +54-03/68 PC and +54-03/57 PC, the likely presence of erosion surfaces will be discussed further in the discussion section.

## 216 Heavy metal profiles

217 In the North Basin (core +54-03/68 PC), Itrax elemental profiles reflect conventional WD-XRF 218 compositional variations and show a lake catchment that has been fairly stable over the 219 period of sediment accumulation (Figure 2). However, there are significant deviations from 220 this stability within the top 12 cm of the recovered core (69 year period). In particular, the 221 Itrax data (which reveal much higher resolution variations at the sub-millimetre level 222 compared to the WD-XRF data) show a stepwise increase in lead from 1935 to 1960. In 223 addition, there is a significant increase in lead, zinc and copper from 1960 to 1968, a decline 224 from 1968 to 1978, and a subsequent increase from 1978 to 1984 (Figure 2). This co-225 variation of lead, zinc and copper indicates a common source for these contaminants, and 226 discounts the possibility that there have been separate Pb and Zn mineralisation episodes.



Figure 2: Pb, Zn and Cu profiles, <sup>137</sup>Cs activity and total <sup>210</sup>Pb activity profile with exponential fit in core +54-03/68 PC (North Basin), with periods of metalliferous output labelled. 4.52 cm is added to the sample depth to compensate for loss of sediment in the top of the core (see discussion section).
Continuous lines show Itrax peak areas, points show concentrations determined from sub-samples using WD-XRF and the X-ray image is from the Itrax core scanner.

234

228

In the South Basin, Itrax elemental profiles for lead and copper reflect conventional WD-235 236 XRF compositional variations and are relatively stable over the period of sediment 237 accumulation; however, an increase in lead is observed within the top of the recovered core 238 from 1935 to 1950 and a corresponding increase in copper is observed from 1940 to 1950 239 (Figure 3). The Itrax zinc profile shows an increase similar to lead and copper in the top of 240 the recovered core (validated by the WD-XRF data). Deeper in the core, the Itrax zinc profile shows deviation over the period of sediment accumulation, whereas corresponding WD-XRF 241 242 concentrations show a fairly stable profile with no significant deviation from the background

**ACS Paragon Plus Environment** 

level of c. 180 ppm (Figure 3). The disagreement between Itrax and WD-XRF data is caused by variations in iron. A clear negative correlation exists between iron (relatively high concentration) and zinc (trace concentration) which represents an inter-element effect. In WD-XRF fundamental parameter software corrects for inter-element effects and provides an authentic profile which is similar to that seen for lead and copper. This capability is not provided with the Itrax.

#### 249 Lead isotope analysis

In the North and South Basin core, <sup>206</sup>Pb/<sup>207</sup>Pb of excess lead shows a similar profile over 250 251 time (based on the sediment accumulation rates detailed above). In core +54-03/68 PC (North 252 Basin), 4.52 cm is added to the sample depth and in core +54-03/57 PC (South Basin), 8.4 cm 253 is added to the sample depth to compensate for loss of sediment in the top of the core (see 254 discussion section). The depth-shifted data reveals the oldest samples in both cores (ranging in age from 1810 to 1620) have a relatively constant <sup>206</sup>Pb/<sup>207</sup>Pb around 1.177 and trend 255 256 towards end-member ratios for early-/pre industrial sediments (taken as approximate to that of pre-industrial deposits from Windermere) (Figure 4). Samples with a <sup>206</sup>Pb/<sup>207</sup>Pb around 257 258 1.179 (ranging in age from the 1920s to the 1840s) trend towards end-member ratios for Carboniferous coal, and samples ranging in age from 1980 to the 1920s are characterised by 259 low <sup>206</sup>Pb/<sup>207</sup>Pb and trend towards the isotopically distinguishable UK gasoline end-member 260 ratio<sup>4</sup> (Figure 4). 261



Figure 3: Pb, Zn and Cu profiles, <sup>137</sup>Cs activity and total <sup>210</sup>Pb activity profile with exponential fit in core +54-03/57 PC (South Basin), with periods of metalliferous output labelled. 8.4 cm is added to the sample depth to compensate for loss of sediment in the top of the core (see discussion section).
Continuous lines show Itrax peak areas, points show concentrations determined from sub-samples using WD-XRF and the X-ray image is from the Itrax core scanner. Additional Itrax data from the top 6 cm of the recovered core is derived from further analysis to supplement incomplete Itrax data from the top of the core.

271



272

Figure 4: Upper panel: lead isotope ratios, showing change in <sup>206</sup>Pb/<sup>207</sup>Pb over time. Lower panel: Δ7/4 versus <sup>206</sup>Pb/<sup>204</sup>Pb showing the scale of the double-spike error (conventional for comparison).
The average end-member ratio for pre-/early industrial sediment<sup>47,48</sup> is taken as approximate to that of pre-industrial deposits from Windermere. The field for Carboniferous coal and galena ratios<sup>7</sup> were derived by conventional lead isotope measurement techniques. Insert shows Pre-Cambrian ore ratios from Australia (likely source of gasoline antiknock agent)<sup>49</sup> and end-member ratio for UK gasoline.<sup>4</sup>
See Table S2 and S3, Supporting Information, for details.

# 281 **Discussion**

The approach used for dating (using the CF:CS<sup>210</sup>Pb model) yielded an accumulation rate for 282 283 the sediment of 0.17 cm/yr in the North Basin (core +54-03/68 PC) and 0.14 cm/yr in the 284 South Basin (core +54-03/57 PC). In Windermere and other lakes in the catchment, a number 285 of studies have dated recent sediments using similar methods to provide a record of environmental change.<sup>18,50-52</sup> In the North Basin, <sup>210</sup>Pb dates from a 1997 mini-core located c. 286 600 m SW of core +54-03/68 PC suggest a mean accumulation rate of approximately 0.18 287 cm/yr,<sup>53</sup> which is in agreement (within the estimated uncertainty) with the accumulation rate 288 determined for core +54-03/68 PC. In the <sup>137</sup>Cs record, Appleby<sup>53</sup> identified two distinct 289 290 peaks at 4.5 cm and 10.5 cm, which are related to the 1986 Chernobyl incident and the 1963 atmospheric testing of nuclear weapons (bomb maximum). The <sup>137</sup>Cs record from core +54-291 292 03/68 PC also shows two peaks in activity at the top of the core and at a depth of  $4.5 \pm 0.5$ 293 cm. The peak at the top of the core is taken to correspond to the 1986 Chernobyl incident, 294 suggesting a loss of at least 4.52 cm (rate of 0.17 cm/yr over 26 years) of sediment from the 295 top of the core (Figure 2).

In the South Basin, given the lack of <sup>137</sup>Cs and outlier <sup>210</sup>Pb values, we infer disturbance and 296 likely loss of sediment from the top of core +54-03/57 PC. The absence of <sup>137</sup>Cs suggests a 297 loss of at least 60 years of accumulation (initial input of <sup>137</sup>Cs into the global environment 298 299 estimated to be 1952, related to atmospheric nuclear weapons testing). At our estimated accumulation rate of 0.14 cm/yr (based on <sup>210</sup>Pb activity) this equates to a loss of at least 8.4 300 301 cm (Figure 3). Sediment loss is possibly the result of the coring process. It is important to note that the accumulation rate for the North and South Basin core (derived from <sup>210</sup>Pb dating 302 and validated by reference to chronostratigraphic dates from the <sup>137</sup>Cs record), is only valid in 303 304 surface sediments, and the rate for surface sediments may not be representative at depth. The extrapolated chronology to 1600 is tentative, and therefore the depth in the core is alsodisplayed for comparison (Figures 2 and 3).

307 Reconstruction of the sediment record in the North Basin using high-resolution Itrax data 308 (validated against WD-XRF data) suggests that while most element concentrations have been 309 stable over the period of sediment accumulation, there was a stepwise increase in lead 310 concentration from 1935 to 1960, and a significant increase from 1960 to 1968. In the South 311 Basin, an increase in lead is similarly observed from 1935 to 1950 (Figures 2 and 3). In 312 addition, ultra-high precision, double-spike lead isotope measurements reveal a significant decline in <sup>206</sup>Pb/<sup>207</sup>Pb from the 1920s to 1980. This is attributable to the introduction and use 313 of (<sup>206</sup>Pb-depleted) leaded gasoline post-1923, demonstrating a significant anthropogenic 314 315 input of lead in recent sediments (Figure 4). Increased industrialisation, urbanisation and road 316 traffic at this time led to a dramatic increase in atmospheric lead emissions in other parts of the UK, particularly during the 1960s and 1970s.<sup>2,7,54</sup> The increases observed in stable lead, 317 particularly from 1960 to 1968 is the result of increased industrialisation and urbanisation at 318 319 this time. When using high-precision lead isotopes (measured by double spike, errors  $< \pm$ 0.002%),  $\Delta 7/4$  (calculated relative to the Northern Hemisphere Reference Line)<sup>55</sup> is used to 320 321 visualise the subtle differences which are difficult to observe in the traditional 64-74 plots. In 322 Windermere,  $\Delta 7/4$  further suggests leaded gasoline is a common source of lead in recent 323 sediments, and  $\Delta 7/4$  trend towards the isotopically distinguishable UK gasoline end-member ratio (Figure 4, lower panel).<sup>4</sup> 324

The double-spike lead isotope measurements further reveal samples ranging in age from the 1840s to the 1920s trend towards end-member ratios for Carboniferous coal (Figure 4). The most likely source of Carboniferous coal is coal-fired steam ships, the first of which was launched in Windermere in 1845.<sup>25,27,56</sup> The opening of the Kendal to Windermere railway in 1847 saw the introduction of additional steamers to the lake and led to a rapid expansion in

330 the use of these boats. In 1869, the railway was built as far as Lakeside, and round trips on 331 the streamers and trains were offered, further boosting tourist traffic. In 1872, the Furness 332 Railway Company combined the new railhead with a steam cargo service, further increasing use and transporting cargo such as coal, timber, saltpetre and sulphur.<sup>56</sup> By 1922, the roads 333 had improved and motor vehicles were common, and steamers were no longer required to 334 335 transport cargo. The age of steam on Windermere gradually came to a close, with most coal-336 fired steamers ceasing operation by 1956, after which some vessels were refitted with diesel 337 engines. In 1899, the first motor boat was used on the lake, and motor boats and steamers 338 operated alongside each other for several years. From the 1920s onwards, a decline in <sup>206</sup>Pb/<sup>207</sup>Pb is most likely due to the introduction and use of leaded gasoline, and the end of 339 340 coal-fired steamer operation on the lake. Other possible sources of Carboniferous coal 341 include coal combustion (coal ash associated with the Industrial Revolution), which entered 342 Windermere through two major pathways, via fluvial dispersal of finely ground coal waste 343 and through diffuse atmospheric emissions from heavy industry.

344 In addition to Carboniferous coal, analysis of  $\Delta 7/4$  identifies a further component of lead: 345 galena ore from mineral veins (Figure 4). Possible sources include mining activities and the 346 discharge of lead-rich waste from abandoned mines (lead derived from Carboniferous Pb-Zn 347 mineralisation). In addition, isotopic ratios trend towards end-member ratios for early-/pre industrial sediments (Figure 4, lower panel).<sup>47,48</sup> We infer a finite component of natural lead, 348 349 derived from surface weathering, soil erosion and Pb-Zn mineralisation is contained within 350 fine grained stream sediment entering Windermere. Elevated concentrations of lead, zinc and 351 copper in stream sediment data from headwater regions not influenced by mining activities 352 downstream further suggest weathering of bedrock has contributed to the stream sediment 353 entering Windermere. Thus, the elevated levels of lead in Windermere are considered to be a 354 mixture of natural lead, and three major components of anthropogenic (industrial) lead, comprising gasoline lead, coal combustion lead and lead derived from Carboniferous Pb-Znmineralisation.

The sediment record also identifies an increase in the concentration of copper: in the North 357 358 Basin, concentrations significantly increased from 1960 to 1968, declined from 1968 to 1978 359 and increased from 1978 to 1984 (Figure 4). Concentrations of lead and zinc show similar 360 variations, suggesting a co-variance of these contaminants, and a common source. In the 361 South Basin, concentrations of copper increased from 1940 to 1950 (Figure 3). The majority 362 of metal mining and smelting in the catchment is located to the north of Windermere (Figure 363 1) and given the location in relation to up-system sediment traps (e.g. Grasmere, Elterwater, Langdale Tarn, Rydal Water) it is unlikely that a significant amount of mining related heavy 364 365 metals would have been transported to Windermere. For example, copper contamination is recorded in sediments downstream from Greenburn Mine in Elterwater,<sup>25</sup> and stream 366 367 sediment data identifies elevated levels of copper near the mine (Figure 1), most likely derived from spoil heaps and workings. This indicates Elterwater acted as an efficient 368 369 sediment trap, limiting the amount of mining related heavy metals entering Windermere. As a 370 result of the trapping efficiency of up-system lakes, periods of metal workings in the 371 Windermere catchment do not correlate with peaks in mining related heavy metals. The more 372 recent increases in copper (and also lead and zinc) observed in the North and South Basin (in 373 the 1940s and 1960s) could instead be due to flood-induced metal inwash after the cessation of mining (similar to findings in other upland regions of Britain).<sup>57</sup> The higher concentrations 374 375 could also be due to weathering of bedrock in the catchment, which contributes to the stream 376 sediment load entering Windermere and leads to co-variation of lead, zinc and copper. In addition, increases in zinc can also be attributed to anthropogenic activity within the 377 378 catchment, in the form of processed waste and human sewage inputs. High-resolution data 379 from the North Basin reveal a marked increase in zinc in the 1960s (Figure 2), which

#### **Environmental Science & Technology**

corresponds with an increase in direct discharge of treated sewage effluents in the catchment
at this time. The decline in concentration from 1968 to 1978 (North Basin), and from 1940
onwards (South Basin) does not correspond with historical records of changes in sewage
treatment practices.

This study has shown that the application of a specific combination of non-destructive and high precision analytical techniques has enabled determination of the timing and scale of anthropogenic inputs to Windermere. High-resolution Itrax analysis (validated against WD-XRF), radiochronology (<sup>210</sup>Pb and <sup>137</sup>Cs) and ultra-high precision, double spike lead isotopes provide new insights into the pollutant depositional history of Windermere and demonstrate the effectiveness of an integrated approach when investigating pollution signals in lacustrine environments.

391

## 392 Acknowledgements

393 The authors acknowledge support of the Environment Agency, the Centre for Ecology & 394 Hydrology and the Freshwater Biological Association. PhD student HM is partially supported 395 by a British Geological Survey BUFI PhD studentship (reference S177). The authors thank: 396 Martin Dodgson, Elizabeth Haworth, Daniel Niederreiter and the Windermere Lake Wardens. 397 We thank Madeleine Cobbold, John Davis, Pawel Gaca, Alan Kemp, Suzanne Maclachlan, 398 Agnieszka Michalik, Andy Milton, Richard Pearce and Mark Vardy from The University of 399 Southampton, and the crew and hydrographic surveyors of the R/V White Ribbon and BGS 400 Marine Operations. CC publishes with the permission of the Executive Director, BGS 401 (NERC).

# **403** Supporting Information Available

Tables providing information on metal workings in the Windermere catchment and lead isotope ratios in Windermere core samples, major ore deposits and contemporary environmental materials. Details of sediment analysis and references are also included. This information is available free of charge via the Internet at http://pubs.acs.org/.

408

## 409 **References**

- 410 (1) Williams, T. A sedimentary record of the deposition of heavy metals and magnetic oxides
- 411 in the Loch Dee basin, Galloway, Scotland, since c. AD 1500. *The Holocene*. 1991, *1* (2),
  412 142–150.
- 413 (2) Farmer, J. G.; Eades, L. J.; Mackenzie, A. B.; Kirika, A.; Bailey-Watts, T. E. Stable Lead
- 414 Isotope Record of Lead Pollution in Loch Lomond Sediments since 1630 A.D. *Environ. Sci.*415 *Technol.* **1996** *30* (10), 3080–3083.
- 416 (3) Yang, H. D.; Rose, N. Trace element pollution records in some UK lake sediments, their
  417 history, influence factors and regional differences. *Environment International* 2005 *31* (1),
  418 63–75.
- (4) Monna, F.; Lancelot, J.; Croudace, I. W.; Cundy, A. B.; Lewis, J. T. Pb isotopic
  composition of airborne particulate material from France and the southern United Kingdom:
  implications for Pb pollution sources in urban areas. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 1997 *31*, 2277–
  86.

- 423 (5) Farmer, J. G.; Eades, L. J.; Graham, M. C. The lead content and isotopic composition of
  424 British coals and their implications for past and present releases of lead to the UK
  425 environment. *Environmental Geochemistry and Health* 1999 *21* (3), 257–272.
- 426 (6) Hansmann, W.; Köppel, V. Lead-isotopes as tracers of pollutants in soils. Chemical
- 427 *Geology* **2000** *171* (1-2), 123–144.
- 428 (7) Shepherd, T. J.; Chenery, S. R.; Pashley, V.; Lord, R. A.; Ander, L. E.; Breward, N.;
- Hobbs, S. F.; Horstwood, M.; Klinck, B. A.; Worrall, F. Regional lead isotope study of a
  polluted river catchment: River Wear, Northern England, UK. *Science of the Total Environment* 2009 407 (17), 4882–4893.
- (8) Farmer, J.; MacKenzie, A.; Eades, L.; Kirika, A.; Bailey-Watts, A. Influences on the
  extent and record of heavy metal pollution in sediment cores from Loch Tay in a mineralised
  area of Scotland. *Journal of Geochemical Exploration* **1997** *58* (2-3), 195–202.
- 435 (9) Wennrich, R.; Mattusch, J.; Morgenstern, P.; Freyer, K.; Treutler, H. C.; Stark, H. J.;
- 436 Bruggemann, L.; Paschke, A.; Daus, B.; Weiss, H. Characterization of sediments in an
- 437 abandoned mining area; a case study of Mansfeld region, Germany. *Environmental Geology*438 2004 45 (6), 818–833.
- (10) Renberg, I.; Bindler, R.; Brännvall, M-L. Using the historical atmospheric leaddeposition record as a chronological marker in sediment deposits in Europe. *The Holocene*2001 11 (5), 511–516.
- (11) Ishizuka, O.; Taylor, R. N.; Milton, J. A.; Nesbitt, R. W. Fluid-mantle interaction in an
  intra-oceanic arc: constraints from high-precision Pb isotopes. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 2003 *211*, 221–236.

- 445 (12) Kember, H. M. A study of metal contamination of sediments within Lake Ullswater and
- the Glenridding Beck catchment. Undergraduate Dissertation, Department of Environmental
- 447 Science, University of Lancaster, UK, 2001.
- 448 (13) Grayson, R. P.; Plater, A. J. A lake sediment record of Pb mining from Ullswater,
- English Lake District, UK. *Journal of Paleolimnology* **2009** *42* (2), 183–197.
- 450 (14) Hatfield, R. G.; Maher, B. A.; Pates, J. M.; Barker, P. A. Sediment dynamics in an
- 451 upland temperate catchment: changing sediment sources, rates and deposition. Journal of
- 452 *Paleolimnology* **2008** *40* (4), 1143–1158.
- 453 (15) Chiverrell, R. C.; Sear, D.; Dearing, J.; Warburton, J.; Schillereff, D.; Croudace, I. W.
- Farming, Mining and Extreme Floods: Impacts of accelerated sediment flux to Bassenthwaite
  Lake, International Palaeolimnology Conference (IPS2012), August 21-24th, 2012 Glasgow
  SECC.
- (16) Schillereff, D.; Chiverrell, R.; Macdonald, N.; Hooke, J. A multi-proxy lake sediment
  record of recent anthropogenic influence on catchment processes from Brotherswater,
  northwest England. European Geosciences Union General Assembly 2013, 7 12 April 2013,
  Vienna, Austria.
- 461 (17) Millward, D.; Johnson, E. W.; Beddoe-Stephens, B.; Young, B.; Kneller, B. C.; Lee, M.
- 462 K.; Fortey, N. J. British Geological Survey: Geology of the Ambleside district. Memoir for
- 463 1:50 000 Geological Sheet 38 (England and Wales). The Stationary Office, London, 2000.
- 464 (18) Aston, S. R.; Bruty, D.; Chester, R.; Padgham, R. C. Mercury in Lake Sediments: a
- 465 Possible Indicator of Technological Growth. *Nature* **1973** *241* (5390), 450–451.
- 466 (19) Hamilton-Taylor, J. Enrichments of zinc, lead, and copper in recent sediments of
- 467 Windermere, England. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* **1979** *13* (6), 693–697.

- 468 (20) Hamilton-Taylor, J. Heavy metal enrichments in the recent sediments of six lakes in
- 469 northwest England. *Environmental Technology Letters* **1983** *4*, 115–122.
- 470 (21) Miller, H.; Bull, J. M.; Cotterill, J. C.; Dix, J. K.; Winfield, I. J.; Kemp, A. E. S.; Pearce,
- 471 R. B. Lake bed geomorphology and sedimentary processes in glacial lake Windermere, UK.
- 472 *Journal of Maps* **2013** *9* (2), 299–312.
- 473 (22) Pinson, L. J. W.; Vardy, M. E.; Dix, J. K.; Henstock, T. J.; Bull, J. M.; Maclachlan, S. E.
- 474 Deglacial history of glacial lake Windermere, UK: implications for the central British and
- 475 Irish Ice Sheet. Journal of Quaternary Science 2013 28 (1), 83–94.
- 476 (23) British Geological Survey. Ambleside. England and Wales Sheet 38. Solid Geology.
- 477 *1:50,000.* Keyworth, Nottingham, 1996.
- 478 (24) Woodcock, N. H.; Soper, N. J. The Acadian Orogeny: the mid-Devonian phase of
- 479 deformation that formed slate belts in England and Wales. In *The Geology of England and*
- 480 *Wales, 2nd Edition*; Benchley, P. J., Rawson, F., Eds.; The Geological Society, 2006.
- 481 (25) Pickering, A. D. Windermere: restoring the health of England's largest lake. Freshwater
- 482 Biological Association, Ambleside Special Publication 2001, 11.
- (26) Barlow, D.; Harris, E.; McFarlane, A. Windermere Fluvial Audit. Report A: Catchment
  Scale Geomorphology Technical Report. Report to Environment Agency North West
  Region prepared by JACOBS Engineering UK Ltd. Tech. rep, 2009.
- 486 (27) McGowan, S.; Barker, P.; Haworth, E. Y.; Leavitt, P. R.; Maberly, S. C.; Pates, J.
- 487 Humans and climate as drivers of algal community change in Windermere since 1850.
- 488 *Freshwater Biology* **2012** *57* (2), 260–277.

- 489 (28) Reynolds, C. S.; Irish, A. E. The phytoplankton of Windermere (English Lake District).
- 490 Freshwater Biological Association, Far Sawrey, Ambleside, Cumbria, UK, 2000
- 491 (29) Talling, J. F. Some English lakes as diverse and active ecosystems: a factual summary
- 492 and source book. Freshwater Biological Association, Far Sawrey, Ambleside, Cumbria, UK,
- 493 1999.
- 494 (30) Parker, J. E.; Maberly, S. C. Biological response to lake remediation by phosphate
  495 stripping: control of Cladophora. *Freshwater Biology* 2000 *44*, 303–309.
- 496 (31) Adams, J. *Mines of the Lake District Fells, 2nd Edition*. Dalesman Publishing Company,
  497 1995.
- 498 (32) British Geological Survey. *Geology of the Ambleside district*. The Stationary Office,
- 499 London, 2000.
- 500 (33) Dowman, I.; Balan, P.; Renner, K.; Fischer, P. An Evaluation of Nextmap Terrain Data
- in the Context of UK National Datasets. Tech. Rep, 2003.
- 502 (34) Cameron, D. G.; Idoin, N. E.; Brown, T. J.; Patton, M. A. G.; McGinn, C.; Mankelow, J.
- 503 M. Directory of Mines and Quarries. British Geological Survey, 9th Edition, 2010.
- 504 (35) Geochemical Baseline Survey of the Environment (G-BASE);
  505 htttp://www.bgs.ac.uk/gbase
- 506 (36) British Geological Survey. Regional geochemistry of the Lake District and adjacent
- 507 *areas.* Keyworth, Nottingham, 1992.
- 508 (37) Johnson, C. C.; Breward, N.; Ander, E. L.; Ault, L. G-BASE: Baseline geochemical
- 509 mapping of Great Britain and Northern Ireland. Geochemistry: Exploration, Environment,
- 510 *Analysis* **2005** *5* (4), 347–357.

- 511 (38) Uwitec; http://www.uwitec.at/
- 512 (39) Croudace, I. W.; Rindby, A.; Rothwell, R. ITRAX: description and evaluation of a new
- 513 multi-function X-ray core scanner. In New Techniques in Sediment Core Analysis; Rothwell,
- R. Ed.; Geological Society Special Publication 267, 2006; pp.51–63.
- 515 (40) Croudace, I. W.; Warwick, P. E.; Morris, J. E. Evidence for the preservation of
- 516 technogenic tritiated organic compounds in an estuarine sedimentary environment. *Environ*.
- 517 Sci. Technol. 2012 46 (11), 5704–5712.
- 518 (41) Robbins, J. A. Geochemical and geophysical applications of radioactive lead isotopes. In
- 519 Biochemistry of Lead; Nriagu, J. O. Ed.; Elsevier, Amsterdam, 1978; pp. 285–393.
- 520 (42) Postlethwaite, J. Postlethwaite's Mines and mining in the English Lake District.
- 521 Michael Moon, Beckermet Cumbria, 1975.
- 522 (43) Tyler, I. *Thirlmere Mines and The Drowning of The Valley*. Blue Rock Publications, 2005.
- 523 (44) Shaw, W. T. Elizabethan Mining: An account of a visit paid to an old lead mine near
- 524 Grasmere, Lake District. Mine and Quarry Engineering, 1939
- 525 (45) Barlow, D.; Harris, E.; McFarlane, A. Windermere Fluvial Audit. Report B: Catchment
- 526 Action Plan. Report to Environment Agency North West Region prepared by JACOBS
- 527 Engineering UK Ltd. Tech. Rep, 2009.
- 528 (46) Ritchie, J. C.; McHenry, J. R. Application of radioactive fallout cesium-137 for
- 529 measuring soil erosion and sediment accumulation rates and patterns: A review. *Journal of*
- 530 *Environmental Quality* **1990** *19* (2), 215–233.
- 531 (47) Hamilton, E. I.; Clifton, R. J. Isotopic abundances of lead in estuarine sediments,
- 532 Swansea Bay, Bristol Channel. *Estuarine and Coastal Marine Science* **1979** *8* (3), 271–278.
- 533 (48) Croudace, I. W.; Cundy, A. B. Heavy metal and hydrocarbon pollution in recent
- sediments from Southampton water, Southern England: A geochemical and isotopic study.
- 535 Environ. Sci. Tech. 1995, 29, 1288–1296.

- 536 (49) Chow, T. J.; Snyder, C. B.; Earl, J. L. Isotope ratios of lead as pollutant source
- 537 indicators. In Isotope ratios as pollutant source and behaviour indicators; IAEA, Vienna,
- 538 1975, 95–108.
- 539 (50) Barker, P. A.; Pates, J. M.; Payne, R. J.; Healey, R. M. Changing nutrient levels in
- 540 Grasmere, English Lake District, during recent centuries. *Freshwater Biology* **2005** *50* (12),
- 541 1971–1981.
- 542 (51) Pennington, W.; Cambray, R. S.; Fisher, E. M. Observations on Lake Sediments using
- 543 Fallout 137Cs as a Tracer. *Nature* **1973** *242*, 324–326.
- 544 (52) Appleby, P. G.; Haworth, E. Y.; Michel, H.; Short, D. B.; Laptev, G.; Piliposian, G. T.
- 545 The transport and mass balance of fallout radionuclides in Blelham Tarn, Cumbria (UK).
- 546 *Journal of Paleolimnology* **2003** *29*, 459–473.
- 547 (53) Appleby, P. Three decades of dating recent sediments by fallout radionuclides: a review.
- 548 *The Holocene* **2008** *18* (1), 83–93.
- 549 (54) Komárek, M.; Ettler, V.; Chrastný, V.; Mihaljevic, M. Lead isotopes in environmental
- sciences: A review. Environment International 2008 34 (4), 562 577.
- (55) Hart, S. R. A large-scale isotope anomaly in the Southern Hemisphere mantle. *Nature*1984 309, 753–757.
- (56) Pattinson, G. H. *The Great Age of Steam on Windermere*. The Windermere Nautical
  Trust, 1981.
- 555 (57) Kelly, M. *Mining and the Freshwater Environment*. Elsevier Applied Science, 1991.



Figure 1: Location map, showing Windermere catchment, rivers, lakes, valleys, Bowness-on-Windermere (black star), sewage treatment works, and BGS sediment cores. The location of disused metal workings, currently active slate quarries, and stream sediment and WD-XRF samples with elevated concentrations of Pb, Zn and Cu is also shown. Solid geology, stratigraphy and faults are from British Geological Survey.<sup>23</sup> BVG: Borrowdale Volcanic Group; catchment areas calculated using 5 m resolution NEXTMap data. Insert shows location map of the study area in relation to the Lake District and the British Isles. Figure contains British Geological Survey materials ©NERC [2013]. 153x211mm (300 x 300 DPI)



Figure 2: Pb, Zn and Cu profiles, <sup>137</sup>Cs activity and total <sup>210</sup>Pb activity profile with exponential fit in core +54-03/68 PC (North Basin), with periods of metalliferous output labelled. 4.52 cm is added to the sample depth to compensate for loss of sediment in the top of the core (see discussion section). Continuous lines show Itrax peak areas, points show concentrations determined from sub-samples using WD-XRF and the Xray image is from the Itrax core scanner.

177x138mm (300 x 300 DPI)



Figure 3: Pb, Zn and Cu profiles, <sup>137</sup>Cs activity and total <sup>210</sup>Pb activity profile with exponential fit in core +54-03/57 PC (South Basin), with periods of metalliferous output labelled. 8.4 cm is added to the sample depth to compensate for loss of sediment in the top of the core (see discussion section). Continuous lines show Itrax peak areas, points show concentrations determined from sub-samples using WD-XRF and the Xray image is from the Itrax core scanner. Additional Itrax data from the top 6 cm of the recovered core is derived from further analysis to supplement incomplete Itrax data from the top of the core. 177x138mm (300 x 300 DPI)



Figure 4: Upper panel: lead isotope ratios, showing change in <sup>206</sup>Pb/<sup>207</sup>Pb over time. Lower panel: Δ7/4 versus <sup>206</sup>Pb/<sup>204</sup>Pb showing the scale of the double-spike error (conventional for comparison). The average end-member ratio for pre-/early industrial sediment<sup>47,48</sup> is taken as approximate to that of pre-industrial deposits from Windermere. The field for Carboniferous coal and galena ratios<sup>7</sup> were derived by conventional lead isotope measurement techniques. Insert shows Pre-Cambrian ore ratios from Australia (likely source of gasoline antiknock agent)<sup>49</sup> and end-member ratio for UK gasoline.<sup>4</sup> See Table S2 and S3, Supporting Information, for details. 161x211mm (300 x 300 DPI)



609x457mm (180 x 180 DPI)