- **1** A stratigraphical basis for the Anthropocene?
- 2
 3 Colin N. Waters¹, Jan A. Zalasiewicz², Mark Williams², Michael A. Ellis¹, & Andrea
 4 M. Snelling³
- 5 6

7

- ¹ Environmental Science Centre, British Geological Survey, Keyworth, Nottingham, NG12 5GG UK.
- ² Department of Geology, University of Leicester, Leicester LE 1 7RH, UK.
- 9 ³ NERC Isotope Geosciences Laboratory, British Geological Survey, Keyworth,
 10 Nottingham, NG12 5GG UK.
- 11
- 12 Abstract
- 13

Recognition of intimate feedback mechanisms linking changes across the atmosphere, biosphere, geosphere and hydrosphere demonstrates the pervasive nature of humankind's influence, perhaps to the point that we have fashioned a new geological epoch, the Anthropocene. To what extent will these changes be evident as long-lasting signatures in the geological record?

19

20 To establish the Anthropocene as a formal chronostratigraphical unit it is necessary to 21 consider a spectrum of indicators of anthropogenically-induced environmental change 22 and determine how these show as stratigraphic signals that can be used to characterise an 23 Anthropocene unit and to recognise its base. It is important to consider these signals against a context of Holocene and earlier stratigraphic patterns. Here we review the 24 25 parameters used by stratigraphers to identify chronostratigraphical units and how these could apply to the definition of the Anthropocene. The onset of the range of signatures is 26 27 diachronous, though many show maximum signatures which post-date1945, leading to 28 the suggestion that this date may be a suitable age for the start of the Anthropocene.

29

30 Keywords: Anthropocene, stratigraphy, global environmental change

- 31
- 32

33 The 'Anthropocene' is in many respects a novel potential geological unit. Stratigraphy, 34 which deals with the classification of geological time (geochronology) and material time-35 rock units (chronostratigraphy), has historically defined geological units based upon 36 significant, but temporally distant events. These events are typically, though not 37 exclusively, associated with major changes in the fossil contents of rocks below and 38 above a particular horizon and therefore with the temporal distribution of life-forms. It 39 was only following such observations that new stratigraphical units were proposed and 40 ultimately defined. For example, the major mass extinction at the end of the Permian was 41 used by J. Phillips in 1840 to recognise the beginning of both the Triassic Period and of 42 the Mesozoic Era. The ultimate definition, however, of the base of the Triassic was 43 accomplished only in 2001, when the Global Stratotype Section and Point was taken at 44 the base of a specific bed in a section in Meishan, China, coinciding with the lowest 45 occurrence of the primary marker, the conodont Hindeodus parvus (Yin et al. 2001). In 46 contrast, the Anthropocene was proposed as a term (Crutzen & Stoermer 2000) before 47 any consideration of the nature of the signature of this new stratigraphical unit was given. 48 For the first time in geological history, humanity has been able to observe and be part of 49 the processes that potentially may signal such a change from the preceding to succeeding 50 epoch.

51

60

62

63

64

66

67

71

72

73

52 What are the key 'events' over the last decades to millennia that have the potential to 53 leave a recognisable record in sediments/ice that could be used to define the base of the 54 Anthropocene? The options cover a diverse range of geoscientific fields and need not be 55 restricted to the biostratigraphical tools typically used throughout much of the geological 56 column to define chronostratigraphical units. Potential stratigraphical tools and 57 techniques that may be used to define the base of the Anthropocene include the following 58 (Fig. 1):

- 59 1) appearance and increased abundance of anthropogenic deposits;
 - artificial anthropogenic deposits
- anthropogenic soils (anthrosols)
 - novel minerals and mineraloids
 - anthropogenic subsurface structures ("trace fossils")
 - anthropogenic modification of terrestrial and marine sedimentary systems
- 65 2) biotic turnover;
 - megafauna
 - reef ecosystems
- 68 microflora
- 69 microfauna
- 70 3) geochemical;
 - evidence preserved in the cryosphere
 - records in speleothems
 - organic and inorganic contributions to sediments
- 74 4) climate change;
- ocean geochemistry
- 76 oceanic biodiversity
- continental to ocean sediment flux

- 78• sea-level change
- 79 5) catastrophic events;
 - radiogenic spikes from nuclear bomb tests/accidents
 - volcanic eruption
 - meteorite/asteroid (bolide) impact.
- 82 83

80

81

84



85

Fig. 1. Examples of key 'events' that could produce stratigraphical signatures that could
be used to define the base of the Anthropocene.

88 89

90 The 17 contributions to 'A Stratigraphical Basis for the Anthropocene' mainly cover 91 those events that have been directly the result of humanity's growing influence on the 92 Earth (1 to 3 above) and it is most likely that one or more of these signatures could be 93 used to define the basal boundary of the Anthropocene. In addition, the practical use of 94 tephrochronology, dating historical events through volcanic ash deposits, clearly provides 95 an important stratigraphical tool for quantifying Anthropocene events.

96

97 In this contribution, we begin by presenting a description of the process by which the 98 Anthropocene is being considered for ratification. We consider the hierarchical 99 stratigraphical level to which the Anthropocene might be applied, or remain a popular but 100 entirely informal unit which exists outside the formal Geological Time Scale. We outline 101 some of the techniques for dating sediments/ice, detail the three main suggestions 102 forwarded as potential ages for the start of the Anthropocene: pre-Industrial Revolution; 103 1800 and the start of the Industrial Revolution in parts of the planet; and 1950, the 'Great

Acceleration' in global economic activity following World War II (Steffen *et al.* 2007).
Potential future ages are also considered. A glossary of commonly used terms is also provided.

107

108 **Process of ratification of the proposed Anthropocene Epoch**

109 The Anthropocene Working Group (AWG) of the Subcommission on Quaternary 110 Stratigraphy (SQS) was established in 2009 to consider the informal proposal that we no 111 longer live in the Holocene Epoch, but in a time period which should be referred to as the 112 Anthropocene. The AWG is tasked to assess evidence that there are environmental 113 signatures preserved in sedimentary or cryospheric successions that can be attributed 114 uniquely to the Anthropocene. If accepted, the AWG would need to define a Global 115 Stratigraphic Section and Point (GSSP or 'golden spike') in a type locality, or to define a 116 Global Standard Stratigraphic Age (GSSA or numerical age), that defines the 117 Holocene/Anthropocene boundary.

118

119 The process by which a new epoch can be ratified is described by **Finney** (2013), who 120 also raises a series of pertinent questions that he feels need to be addressed by the AWG, 121 though many of these questions are unique to the Anthropocene. Zalasiewicz et al. (2014 122 a) describe some of the problems related to the short time-scales inherent in the definition 123 of the Anthropocene, such as bioturbation and pedogenesis. The ability to locate a 124 boundary through counting varves in sediments or layers in ice-core to the nearest year, 125 or at least decade, would provide a scale of rigour not previously faced during the 126 definition of older chronostratigraphical boundaries, where potential diachroneity of 127 many thousands of years cannot be resolved by current dating techniques.

128

129 Status as Epoch or Age

130 Given the hierarchical nature of chronostratigraphy (Salvador 1994), the higher the rank 131 of the Anthropocene, the greater the change has occurred between it and the previous 132 stratigraphical unit (Gibbard & Walker 2013). The term proposed, even if by accident (Steffen et al. 2004), implies by use of the ending 'cene' to be of Epoch status. 133 Stages/ages typically end in 'ian' and as such if the new division was considered to be of 134 135 this rank would need to be named as Anthroposian, or similar. To warrant Epoch status 136 the scale of changes in key criteria (biostratigraphical, sedimentological and 137 geochemical) need to be of comparable magnitude to those used as evidence for earlier Epoch boundaries, such as that between the Pleistocene and Holocene (Gibbard & 138 139 Walker 2013). Hence, consideration as a potential Epoch has the scientific benefit of 140 overtly testing the implicit hypothesis in Crutzen (2002): that the Holocene, defined by 141 fundamental aspects of the Earth system, has terminated.

142

143 The Holocene is being considered to be divided into three Stages/Ages along the lines of 144 'Early', 'Mid' and 'Late' Holocene, with internal boundaries at 8.2 ka and ~ 4.2 ka 145 (Walker *et al.* 2012). This does not leave open the option of the Anthropocene to be 146 considered a Late Holocene Stage/Age.

- 148 The base of the Quaternary Period is formally defined at a GSSP (**Gibbard** *et al.* 2010),
- although a concept associated with this definition is that it also reflects the onset of the
- 150 major northern hemisphere glaciation. **Wolff (2013)** faces the possibility that the end of
- 151 the sequence of northern hemisphere glaciations should signal the end of the Quaternary,
- 152 but he suggests that current evidence does not preclude glacial inception in the future
- 153 (timescales of 10 ka to 100 ka). Levels of atmospheric CO₂ (Lüthi *et al.* 2008)
- 154 CH₄ (Loulergue *et al.* 2008) and N₂O (Schilt *et al.* 2010) in ice cores are at levels higher
- 155 than observed for the last 800 ka (**Wolff** 2013), and in the case of CO_2 at levels
- 156 unprecedented since the warmer Pliocene Epoch (see Haywood *et al.* 2011). Such
- 157 signatures would distinguish the Anthropocene from the Holocene and part, if not all of
- 158 the Pleistocene.
- 159

160 Between the 1500's to 1700's the number of species extinctions (plants and animals) ran 161 at less than 50 per century, with extinctions rising to 125 in the 1800's and 500 in the 162 1900's (Barnosky 2013). Barnosky (2013) concludes that although extinction rates are 163 elevated at 3-12 times normal background rates, less than 1% of species have become 164 extinct. For vascular plants, at least 5% of native species appear to have been lost across 165 half of the terrestrial biosphere, but in many cases native plant species are able to 166 maintain viable populations even in heavily managed anthropogenic biomes (Ellis et al. 167 2012). Therefore, at present we are not experiencing something equivalent to the Big Five mass extinctions, where an estimated 75-96% of known species became extinct, or 168 169 as regards large terrestrial vertebrates the Late Quaternary Megafauna Extinction near the 170 Pleistocene-Holocene boundary (Barnosky et al. 2011, Barnosky 2013). This suggests 171 that, as Gibbard & Walker (2013) contend, the Anthropocene does not provide a 172 biostratigraphical signature equivalent to the epoch status defined for the Holocene. 173 However, this extinction threshold would be exceeded in the near future and in excess of 174 75% species loss can be predicted within 300-500 years at current extinction rates, unless 175 conservation methods become markedly more effective (Barnosky et al. 2011, Barnosky 176 2013). This would produce a biohorizon on a scale of the Big Five mass extinctions and 177 if this is to become reality, the Anthropocene would arguably be of Period/System scale. 178 Extinctions are not the only indicator of biostratigraphy, though, as the changes to 179 assemblages through species invasions (Barnosky 2013) are now considerable, globally 180 expressed and effectively permanent.

181

182 Absolute and relative dating techniques

Climatostratigraphy, or use of contrasting climatic conditions to characterise 183 stratigraphical units, is of primary importance for correlation within Quaternary 184 185 successions (Gibbard & Walker 2013). The Quaternary is subdivided into Marine Isotope Stages (MIS 1-104), reflecting orbitally-forced cooling (glacials) and warming 186 187 (interglacials) of the Earth's climate, the ages of which have been accurately constrained (Lisiecki & Raymo 2005). This is evident through the δ^{18} O signature of marine biogenic 188 calcite, which reflects the increased incorporation of the light ¹⁶O into expanding 189 190 icesheets (Shackleton & Opdyke 1973). MIS 1 ranges from the present to 11.7 ka, 191 coinciding with the Holocene Epoch, the current interglacial. The Anthropocene does not 192 fit within such a definition and clearly MIS stages are insufficient when it comes to 193 dating anthropogenic deposits. It is the disruption of such quasi-periodic signals that 194 makes the Anthropocene distinctive, potentially to the point that we no longer exist 195 within a regime of orbitally-dominated climate change. Alternative means need to be 196 found of characterising and defining the Anthropocene, as discussed below.

197

198 Radiometric dating has become an increasingly precise tool for determining the absolute 199 age of chronostratigraphical boundaries, e.g. the base of the Triassic is bracketed by two 200 dated volcanic-ash clays and constrained at 252.16 ± 0.2 Ma (Shen *et al.* 2010), an error 201 of only 0.001% of the total age. A number of radiometric techniques used to determine 202 Quaternary chronology are here considered for their suitability for dating the Anthropocene. Radiocarbon (¹⁴C), although routinely used by the archaeological 203 community to date organic remains has insufficient resolution. It has an error of several 204 205 decades, which is unsuitable if the beginning of the Anthropocene is chosen to have occurred during the last 200 years (Table 1). Radioisotopes such as ¹³⁷Cs and ⁹⁰Sr are 206 207 useful time markers that can be potentially linked to specific and temporally constrained 208 emissions, are laterally extensive and with a short half-life (Table 1), but in areas of low 209 fallout these radionuclides may already be approaching the limits of detection (Hancock 210 et al. 2013) and ice core β -radioactivity on isotopes (Dibb et al. 1990) is unsuitable for 211 dating signatures even for the start of the Industrial Revolution (Wolff 2013). Laminacounting techniques used in conjunction with ²¹⁰Pb-²²⁶Ra or ²³⁴U-²³⁰Th radiometric dating 212 (Table 1) is potentially of importance in the context of dating speleothems (Fairchild & 213 Frisia 2013). ²¹⁰Pb may also be useful for dating microfauna and microflora (Wilkinson 214 215 et al. 2014), marine or lacustrine clay sediments and peats. In the more distant future, dating techniques may rely upon more long-lived isotopes, such as ²³⁹Pu and ²⁴⁰Pu (Table 216 217 1), which also bind strongly to soil and sediment particles (Hancock et al. 2013). The longer-lived nature and greater abundance of ²³⁹Pu makes it the preferred chronometer, 218 219 and in many regions the signal is likely to be detectable in sediments for 100 kyr or 220 longer (Hancock et al. 2013).

221

222 Radiogenic methods such as Luminescence and Electron Spin Resonance (ESR) are 223 relatively new techniques becoming increasingly used by archaeologists and Quaternary 224 geoscientists. The Luminescence method dates the last time an object was heated 225 (particularly useful for pottery) or exposed to sunlight (potentially useful to delimit burial 226 of artificial deposits). It can provide dates that range from 10 years up to 1 Myr, but has 227 comparatively low accuracy, with errors of typically 5-10% (Duller 2008). ESR dates, 228 mainly used on corals, speleothems, teeth and bone, range from a few thousand years to 229 300 kyr and so may be of little practical use for dating the Anthropocene if it is to fall 230 within the last two centuries.

231

Cosmogenic Radionuclides (CRNs) dating relies upon the accumulation of ³He, ¹⁰Be, ²¹Ne, ²⁶Al and ³⁶Cl in response to the duration of exposure of the upper 1–2 m of sedimentary deposits or ice to cosmic rays (Gosse & Phillips 2001). The technique has the ability to date the timing of surface exposure through excavation using CRN production (range 100 years to 5 Ma) or the date of burial through decay of CRNs (range of ~0.1–5 Ma) (Akçar *et al.* 2008).

Radiometric dating of volcanic ash deposits has become an intrinsic part of the 239 240 characterisation of GSSPs. For example, the base of the Triassic Period at the Meishan 241 GSSP is bracketed by dated volcanic-ash clays 18 cm below and 8 cm above the base of 242 the Triassic (Shen et al. 2010). Such regionally extensive deposits could be used as 243 marker bands to demarcate the base of the Anthropocene. Each eruption can be 244 characterised by a distinctive geochemical 'fingerprint' and a combination of radiometric 245 dating and the historical documentation of events can lead to age constraints at annual 246 resolution (Smith 2013). Smith (2013) identifies a number of useful marker tephra 247 deposits, but suggests, in agreement with Zalasiewicz et al. (2008) that the 1815 CE 248 eruption of Tambora, Indonesia, the largest eruption in recorded history would be most 249 suitable of such markers, particularly as it aligns with the early phase of the Industrial 250 Revolution. Although the ash deposits were spatially restricted and constrained by wind 251 direction, the effects are evident globally with development of associated sulphate peaks 252 within ice cores and temporary climatic events evident in tree rings (Delmas 1992, Briffa 253 et al. 1998, Smith 2013).

254

| Isotope | Half-life (years) | Acceptable range | Accuracy | Suitability |
|----------------------------------|----------------------|------------------|----------------------|--|
| $^{14}C^{(1)}$ | 5568/5730 | 200–60 kyr | Decades-centuries | Peat, wood, charcoal, |
| | | | | bone, shells, soil, ice core, coral etc. (<i>Pre-Industrial</i>) |
| ¹³⁷ Cs ⁽²⁾ | 30.17 ± | 1954 AD- | Annual (if linked to | Terrestrial-marine |
| | 0.03 | Present | known emissions) – | sediments |
| | | | decades | (Mid 20 th Century) |
| 90 Sr $^{(3)}$ | 28.79 | 1950s AD- | Annual (if linked to | Terrestrial-marine |
| | | Present | known emissions) – | sediments |
| | | | decades | (Mid 20 th Century) |
| ²¹⁰ Pb- | 22.3 | <150 yr | Decades | Carbonates, speleothems, |
| 226 Ra $^{(4)}$ | (²¹⁰ Pb) | | | microflora, microfauna |
| | | | | (Mid 20 th Century) |
| 234 U- | 245 560 | <500 kyr | Centuries | Carbonates, speleothems, |
| 230 Th $^{(4)}$ | | | | bone, teeth |
| | | | | (Pre-Industrial) |
| 239 Pu ⁽⁵⁾ | 24110 | <100 kyr | Centuries; annual if | Soil, sediment (<i>Mid</i> 20 th |
| | | | linked to known | <i>Century</i>) |
| | | | emissions) | |
| 240 Pu ⁽⁵⁾ | 6563 | <30 kyr | Centuries; annual if | Soil, sediment (Mid 20 th |
| | | | linked to known | Century) |
| | | | emissions | |

255

256 Table 1. Commonly used radiometric dating techniques and their applicability to dating

257 Anthropocene deposits/artefacts. Text in italics indicates which of the three main options

of the age of the Anthropocene could be most usefully dated using the respective 258

isotopes. ⁽¹⁾ Stuiver & Polach (1977); ⁽²⁾ Unterweger (2013); ⁽³⁾ Browne (1997); ⁽⁴⁾ Elert 259 (2013): ⁽⁵⁾ cf. **Hancock** *et al.* (2013).

260

Prior to the introduction of radiometric dating techniques in the 20th century, the relative 262 age of deposits was constrained through biostratigraphy, which has formed the basis for 263 264 defining most pre-Quaternary chronostratigraphical units (e.g. Gradstein et al. 2012). 265 Assemblage and abundance biostratigraphical zones, based upon mixes of native and non-native species in both terrestrial and marine settings and lineage zones, based on the 266 267 evolution of crop plants, are likely to be most useful in defining the Anthropocene 268 (Barnosky 2013). Interval-zones based upon extinctions over recent centuries are of 269 limited use, as most extinct species were formerly not widespread and/or unlikely to 270 leave a fossil record (Ager 1993, Barnosky 2013). Biostratigraphical zones used to 271 recognise chronostratigraphical boundaries are diachronous to some degree as new taxa 272 take time to extend their distribution from a single source origination (**Barnosky** 2013). 273 Furthermore, there appears to be a time-lag between the onset of anthropogenic activity 274 and the resultant influence upon microbiota (Wilkinson et al. 2014). With a deep-time 275 perspective, these diachroneity and time-lag effects fall within the range of error of most 276 radiometric and biostratigraphic dating techniques, and are not considered significant. For 277 definition of the base of the Anthropocene, which is likely to be resolved at annual or 278 decadal accuracy, such diachroneity severely limits the use of biostratigraphy in our 279 current proximal view of events, but it is likely to become negligible in the future use of 280 biostratigraphy as a tool for recognising the Anthropocene.

281

282 Human artefacts, routinely used as an indicator of age in archaeological investigations, 283 could be used as an equivalent of the geological "type-fossils", with potentially greater resolution than biostratigraphical fossils (Barnosky 2013, Edgeworth 2013 & Ford et 284 285 al. 2014). The evolution of these artefacts, which may be considered human-produced 286 trace fossils (Barnosky 2013, Williams et al. 2013) or technofossils (Zalasiewicz et al. 2014b), is a function of cultural dynamics rather than natural selection (Edgeworth 287 288 2013). These artefacts are prone in recent decades, certainly since the 1950's, to evolve 289 from invention (equivalent to the biostratigraphical First Appearance Datum or FAD) to 290 global distribution (equivalent to biostratigraphical acme) and then to obsolescence 291 (equivalent to biostratigraphical rarity) within comparatively few years, as a function of 292 the globalisation of trade. Also, the lithological composition of wastes in landfills is 293 equivalent to the biostratigraphical assemblage zone and can be indicative of age, as 294 illustrated by Ford et al. (2014). Such artefacts and anthropogenic facies variations 295 provide a very high-resolution (potentially annual to decadal) tool for dating deposits 296 (Zalasiewicz et al. 2014b). However, the long-term preservation potential of such 297 artefacts and anthropogenic sediments will be variable (Price et al., 2011, Ford et al. 298 2014), such that only part of today's wide range of artefacts will be recognisable in the 299 distant future.

300

Annual layer counting techniques can produce very high precision dating, potentially to annual resolution. Potential techniques include dendrochronology, coral laminations, seasonally layered sediments in glacially influenced lakes, speleothem layers and ice cores. Details of the various techniques are summarised in Bradley (1999). Dendrochronology not only has anchored chronologies extending throughout most of the Holocene; the pattern of rings is indicative of local climatic conditions within temperate zones and can also potentially be used to determine wood provenance.

308

309 There is no single global palaeomagnetic spike that could be used to define the base of 310 the Anthropocene (Snowball et al. 2013). However, Snowball et al. (2013) note that 311 there is a global event, most strongly developed in mid to high latitudes coincident with a 312 low in dipole latitude and peak in dipole moment at 2.55 ka cal. BP (the European 'f-313 event') which may be a potential chronostratigraphic marker. A new archaeological 314 dating technique uses high frequency secular variation of the geomagnetic field. This 315 permits annual to decadal age resolution for Fe-oxide bearing materials, including 316 artefacts such as fired ceramics, formed in the last few thousand years (Snowball et al. 317 2013).

318

319 The significance of the history of excavation or 'cut' in archaeology in helping to 320 determine the history and timing of events (Edgeworth 2013) has analogues in the use of 321 geological unconformities to constrain the timing of events through allostratigraphy 322 (Ford *et al.* 2014). It is clear that the complexity of such 'cut' surfaces, though of value 323 at the local scale, makes regional-scale correlation of erosional/non-depositional surfaces 324 almost impossible. The only unconformity that can be correlated with any certainty is the 325 bounding surface between the lowermost artificial deposits from underlying natural 326 deposits that pre-date human modification of the immediate landscape. This bounding 327 surface is highly diachronous overall, although times of marked expansion of cities (e.g. 328 post the mid-twentieth century) represent traceable stratigraphic 'plateaux'.

329

Definition of a boundary stratotype or numerical age

331 The International Stratigraphic Guide (Hedberg 1976, Salvador 1994) requires that all 332 major chronostratigraphical subdivisions are defined with reference to boundary 333 stratotype localities in sedimentary reference sequences, designated as Global 334 Stratigraphic Sections and Points (GSSPs). Definition of the Holocene differed in that the 335 GSSP was defined in ice core rather than a sedimentary deposit (Walker et al. 2009), but 336 essentially followed principles outlined in the International Stratigraphic Guide. 337 Zalasiewicz et al. (2014 a) review how an Anthropocene signature may be recognized in 338 a range of terrestrial and marine settings. This is helpful when considering potential 339 environments to seek the location of a GSSP, if a traditional route to defining the base is 340 to be chosen.

341

342 It has recently been argued by Smith et al. (2014) that the precision in radiometric 343 techniques in the determination of the age of chronostratigraphical boundaries is such that 344 definition of a GSSP in a single section based upon the evolution of a specific indicator 345 faunal/floral species should be replaced by a Global Standard Stratigraphic Age (GSSA 346 or numerical age). With the definition of the base of the Anthropocene possibly at a time 347 of tens to hundreds of years before present, the resolution of dating techniques is at least 348 decadal if not annual and definition of a GSSA at a specific year is feasible and arguably 349 preferable to using a proxy indicator (Zalasiewicz et al. 2011). Smith et al. (2014) 350 propose that in general GSSAs should be decided based upon a spectrum of signatures. In 351 this section we consider four distinct options for the potential placement of the base of 352 the Anthropocene: (1) pre-Industrial Revolution age; (2) Industrial Revolution age; (3) 353 mid 20th century age; and (4) the future.

354

355 Evidence for a pre-Industrial Revolution age

Gibbard & Walker (2013) characterise the Holocene Epoch as a time in which there has been a progressive increase in the prominence of humans as an agent influencing natural environments and processes. They argue that the anthropogenic signature is a hallmark of the current Holocene interglacial and this is distinct from previous interglacials that occurred during the Pleistocene. They contend that it is not then possible to further use the activities of humans to define a post-Holocene Epoch.

362

363 If the Anthropocene is to be considered the Epoch that humanity has created, it is evident 364 that human influence on the planet in the form of directly deposited terrestrial 365 anthropogenic deposits are markedly diachronous in their nature, are laterally 366 impersistent, may include numerous disconformities, may be reworked by continued 367 human landscape modification and ultimately have relatively low propensity for 368 preservation in the geological record (Ford et al. 2014). The earliest signatures 369 approximate to the onset of the Holocene with Edgeworth (2013) describing a significant 370 and long-lived urban development which commenced some 11 ka BP (Fig. 2). It may be 371 misleading, though, to think of the Anthropocene just as the 'human epoch'. The key 372 factor is the level of geologically significant global change, with humans currently 373 happening to be the primary drivers: future, potentially yet more pronounced change (cf. 374 Wolff 2013) may be primarily driven by Earth system feedbacks such as methane release, 375 and yet would still clearly be part of the same phenomenon.

376

377 Anthropogenic influence is not necessarily first seen through urban development. More 378 often it is evident through the initiation of agricultural practices, with forest clearances 379 increasing atmospheric CO₂ levels from 8 ka BP and cultivation and irrigation techniques 380 increasing atmospheric CH₄ levels about 5 ka BP (Ruddiman 2003, 2005; Fig. 2). Prior to 381 1700 CE, the deforestation was almost exclusively of temperate forests (Food and 382 Agricultural Organisation of the United Nations 2010). However, CO₂ and CH₄ 383 concentrations, trends and rates of change fall within the range recorded in ice core over 384 the 800 kyr prior to 1800 CE, suggesting there is no strong evidence that humanity has 385 driven these cycles outside of their natural range prior to the Industrial Revolution (Wolff 386 2013). Also, it has been argued that the rise in CH_4 levels over the last 5 kyr does not 387 need to be linked to changes in agriculture, but could be the product of natural changes in 388 the Earth's orbit associated with precession-induced modification of seasonal rainfall in 389 the Southern Hemisphere tropics (Singarayer et al. 2011).

390

391 Human indirect influence upon rivers provides a recognisable signature in the fluvial 392 system, including coastal deltas. This is associated with increasing sediment loading in 393 response to erosion due to deforestation, animal grazing and changing agricultural 394 practices, mill development, transport networks and the influence upon global climate 395 systems including effects such as increased precipitation intensity or desertification and 396 sea-level rise resulting in coastal inundation (Merritts et al. 2011; Syvitski & Kettner 397 2011). In particular, the impact of introduction of intensive agricultural practices is noted 398 as causing a widespread stratigraphical marker across many continents associated with a transition from basal gravels with organic channel fills to a thick capping of sandy silt 399

400 (Brown *et al.* 2013). In two nearby river systems in the UK this boundary is dated at
401 3600–4400 years cal BP and 1300–220 years cal BP, showing that this boundary is
402 significantly time-transgressive and makes it difficult to consider as a sedimentary
403 boundary for the start of the Anthropocene (Brown *et al.* 2013).

404

405 Mineral magnetic studies in lake sediments, which are a strong indicator of deforestation 406 events and soil erosion, suggest a complex and diachronous history of clearance 407 (Snowball et al. 2013). The largest mineral magnetic signatures associated with 408 catchment disturbance during expansion of agriculture in Europe began around 1100 CE 409 ± 100 years (Fig. 2) with similar signatures evident in China and Mexico at broadly the 410 same time, though they are dependent on cultural and not geological controls and are not 411 isochronous (Snowball et al. 2013). Anthropogenic disturbance of soil horizons is also 412 clearly recorded in speleothems and is also notably diachronous (Fairchild & Frisia 413 2013). Although initiation of forest clearances can be discounted as an adequate signature 414 for recognising the base of the Anthropocene, it is clear that the expansion and 415 intensification of agricultural land-use has resulted in extensive clearances of native 416 vegetation and megafauna, and replacement with domesticates in excess of 3 ka ago 417 (Ellis et al. 2013). The onset of these agricultural practices also resulted in significant 418 modifications of fluvial systems, especially the rapid siltation and increase in 419 sedimentation rate (Dearing & Jones 2003, Poirier et al. 2011).

420

421 The influence of humanity on the generation of soils is vast. Anthropogenic influence 422 includes increasing atmospheric CO₂ leading to acidification, addition of lime or 423 fertilizers, management of biota through insecticides and herbicides, physical mixing and 424 movement of soils through ploughing and accelerating soil-forming processes (Richter 425 2007). It has been suggested that the base of such an extensive anthropogenic soil horizon 426 could make a suitable 'golden spike' at ~2 ka BP (Certini & Scalenghe 2011). However, 427 as for anthropogenic deposits, the age of onset of significant development of anthrosols is 428 highly diachronous. For example, the charcoal-enriched 'terra preta' of the Amazon 429 Basin is somewhat younger, potentially up to 500 BCE (Woods 2008). Much of Europe 430 includes evidence for development of plaggen soils, potentially up to 4 ka BCE in age (Simpson 1997), but mainly the product of a type of farming cultivation during the 431 432 medieval period and post-medieval times (Edgeworth 2013). Soils have low preservation 433 potential and represent an open system prone to modification and are probably the 434 product of numerous events or phases of modification, which are still ongoing. 435 Consequently, Gale & Hoare (2012) and Zalasiewicz et al. (2014 a) argue that the 436 resolution of the age of the base of gradational soil horizon is not suitable to define the 437 Anthropocene.

438

Human impacts on diatom assemblages in lakes, the product of eutrophication and/or alkalisation linked to deforestation and introduction of agriculture, extend back at least 5 kyr (Wilkinson *et al.* 2014; Fig. 2). Similarly, changes to land use and land cover and the resultant increase in soil erosion and transport of sediment into the near-shore setting result in changes to foraminiferal assemblages considerably earlier than other environmental drivers (Wilkinson *et al.* 2014). The impact of humans on coral reefs was minimal during the early Holocene, with first evidence of decreasing ecological diversity of the large marine herbivores and carnivores beginning around 3.5 ka BP (HoeghGuldberg 2014; Fig. 2).

448

It is clear that there are major anthropogenic signatures evident during pre-Industrial Revolution times. However, the range of signatures, their magnitude and spatial extent are typically less than that evident during later times. The timing of these impacts overall is more markedly diachronous across the Earth at the scale of our perspective and a single isochronous marker is not apparent prior to the Industrial Revolution.

454



455

456 Fig. 2. Relative significance of anthropogenic signatures with time. Note the non-linear

- 457 time-scale. (1) Edgeworth (2013), Ford *et al.* (2014); (2) Ford *et al.* (2014), Williams *et*
- 458 *al.* (2013); (3) Zalasiewicz *et al.* (2013); (4) Snowball *et al.* (2013); (5) Certini &
- 459 Scalenghe (2011), Edgeworth (2013); (6) Barnosky (2013); (7) Hoegh-Guldberg (2014);
- 460 (8) Wilkinson *et al.* (2014); (9) Church & White (2011); (10) Wolff (2013); (11)
- 461 Fairbanks & Frisia (2013); (12) Gałuzka *et al.* (2013); and (13) Hancock *et al.* (2013).
- 462
- 463

464 Evidence for an Industrial Revolution age

Early descriptions of the Anthropocene argued in favour of it starting coincident with the initiation of the Industrial Revolution in Western Europe (Crutzen 2002, Zalasiewicz *et al.* 2008). **Gibbard & Walker** (2013) consider the clearest marker horizon is a rise in atmospheric CO₂ levels above any previous Holocene level from around 1750 CE, coincident with the start of an upward rise in CH₄ and N₂O (Fig. 2), though it is important to recognise that this is not directly observed in the rock record. In the ice record, the 471 termination of the 'Little Ice Age', a time of modest cooling mainly of the Northern
472 Hemisphere from about 1350 to 1850 CE (Solomon *et al.* 2007), may be a response to
473 that change in atmospheric composition. Changes in the chemical and physical properties
474 of speleothems (Fairchild & Frisia 2013) can be linked to the start of this climate
475 amelioration (Fig. 2).

476

477 **Gibbard & Walker** (2013) argue that although the CO₂ signature is recognised globally, 478 including within polar ice cores (Lüthi et al. 2008, Wolff 2013), the cause of the 479 signature reflects industrialisation in only a small part of the Earth, mainly western 480 Europe and eastern North America. This is, however, not an argument raised against the 481 definition of the K-T boundary marking the base of the Cenozoic. Here, the crater 482 associated with bolide impact is only 180 km across, but the signature of this impact 483 through tektites, the iridum-rich clay layer, climatic change and biotic extinctions was 484 global. Barnosky (2013) contends that when all traces of humanity are considered it 485 forms a boundary layer more widespread than the iridium layer used to recognise the K-T 486 boundary.

487

488 The onset of the Industrial Revolution (Fig. 3) resulted in a marked change in the 489 characteristics of anthropogenic deposits (Price et al. 2011, Ford et al. 2014). These 490 include: increased use of building and construction materials; increased exploitation of 491 subsurface deposits; widespread inclusion of processed metals and associated 492 manufactured goods; increased human activities at depth, either for mineral exploitation 493 or subsurface infrastructure. However, the onset of the Industrial Revolution is diachronous, not reaching many developing countries until the middle of the 20th century 494 495 (Fig. 3) and consequently Gibbard & Walker (2013) argue it should not be used as a 496 criterion for defining the Anthropocene.

497

498 Williams et al. (2013) propose that the base of the Anthropocene should coincide not 499 with the start of the Industrial Revolution, but with the radical evolution of the urban environment in the mid-18th century. The increased size of conurbations resulted in the 500 need to evolve subsurface transport and sewerage systems in order to keep them 501 502 functioning. Such subsurface developments have greater long-term preservation potential 503 than surface urban deposits, but the cross-cutting, non-stratiform nature of these 504 subsurface structures precludes their use in recognition of a traditional GSSP. Williams 505 et al. (2013) use a particular event, the inception in London of the first Metro system in 506 1863, as the criterion for defining the start of the Anthropocene. Williams et al. (2013) 507 compare the increased complexity of the urban environment to be analogous to the 508 increasing complexity of the trace fossils used to define the base of the Cambrian System. 509 Such comparisons to an extent diminish some of the arguments made against definition 510 of the base of the Anthropocene. The base of the Cambrian was recognised initially 511 through a concept of increasing biological complexity and ultimately one ichnospecies 512 was chosen to represent this changing complexity. This first appearance has ultimately 513 proved to be diachronous over hundreds of thousands of years and sections where this 514 transition can be observed are few. In contrast, the complex urban environment has taken 515 only decades to promulgate globally and now covers about 1% of the Earth's surface. 516 This suggests that while the location of a worldwide, precisely synchronous boundary for 517 the Anthropocene is challenging, it is no less so in consideration of existing 518 chronostratigraphical units.

519



520
521 Fig. 3. Map showing the approximate age for the commencement of the Industrial
522 Revolution and subsequent industrialization across the planet. This is a subjective event,
523 here interpreted as the widespread growth of mechanisation in respect to manufacturing,
524 transport and innovation.

525 526

527 In European lakes, diatom assemblages show significant changes in response to human-528 induced acidification between 1800–1850, with the first evidence of eutrophication in 529 these lakes between 1850 and 1900 (Battarbee et al. 2011, Wilkinson et al. 2014). This 530 signature is also widespread in Arctic, northern European and North American lakes with 531 prominent changes to diatom assemblages since ~ 1850 , inferred to be a response to 532 global warming and atmospheric pollution (Fig. 2), but that the timing varied between 533 regions and lakes (Wilkinson et al. 2014). Whereas, in the oceans, increased nitrogen 534 fixation and elevated concentrations of soluble iron due to increased deposition of iron-535 rich desert dust since 1870 caused intensified growth of phytoplankton (Gałuszka et al. 536 2013). 537

538 In terrestrial environments there was an initial introduction of new plants and domestic 539 animals from the 1500's marking the early age of global exploration and trade, although 540 introduced species in Australasia began mainly in the 1800's (Barnosky 2013). There 541 were significant introductions of alien plant species from the 1800's in many continents 542 (**Barnosky** 2013), coinciding with scientific investigations during the Enlightenment, the 543 notable British attempts to develop plantations of important exotic commercial plants 544 within their colonies and the increased interest in horticulture. It is a feature of regional 545 plant species richness that the losses of native species are more than offset by the increases in exotic species (Ellis et al. 2012). Globally, the percentage abundance of 546 547 humans and domestic animals increased relative to wild megafauna in the 1750's, with a second acceleration in the mid-20th century (**Barnosky** 2013). 548

- 550 The relationship of black magnetic spherules and atmospheric pollution through fossil
- 551 fuel burning results in increased magnetic mineral abundance in sediments associated
- with the Industrial Revolution (**Snowball** *et al.* 2013). This is expressed by magnetic
- susceptibility or isothermal remanent magnetisation and is particularly preserved in peat
- bogs, soils, lakes, coastal and offshore sediments. They often occur in association with
- 555 increased heavy metal concentrations. These particles first become abundant in England 556 and eastern seaboard of North America around 1800, and a spread of industrial sources
- 557 during the 19th century. The largest number of sites shows initial increases of magnetic
- 558 pollution particles forming an 'AD 1900-event', representing an expression of major fuel
- 559 burning in these industrialized areas (Locke & Bertine 1986, **Snowball** *et al.* 2013;
- Fig.1). However, in other parts of the world signatures appear later, e.g. 1950's in eastern
 Asia (Snowball *et al.* 2013), noting also that there is a ~100 year lag in the appearance of
 these magnetic pollution signatures in lake sediments.
- 563
- 564 Evidence for a mid 20^{th} century age

565 This time interval coincides with the 'Great Acceleration' in global economic activity following World War II (Steffen et al. 2007). The extraordinary growth of cities and 566 567 megacities and major infrastructure projects (Fig. 4), and their associated deposits may be 568 considered a distinctive feature of the Anthropocene (Zalasiewicz et al. 2014 a, Williams 569 et al. 2013). This is perhaps the most apparent signature of anthropogenic impact in that 570 today some 52.4% of the global population live in urban areas (United Nations 571 Department of Economic & Social Affairs 2012). This represents an increase from c. 7% 572 in 1800. Despite their focus for human habitation, urban areas cover only about 1% of the 573 ice-free land surface (Klein Goldewijk et al. 2010; Fig. 4). This coverage increases to 574 about 91.9% in densely populated countries such as Japan (UNDESA 2012).

575

576 There has been a significant change in the nature and volume of physical artificial 577 anthropogenic deposits from 1945 onwards (Fig. 2). The natural gradient of sediment 578 transfer from high to low topographical areas has been overtaken by the anthropogenic 579 flux of materials from resources extracted mainly from rural areas to deposition in urban 580 areas in the form of construction schemes (Hooke 2000; Wilkinson 2005). There has been 581 a dramatic rise in overburden and spoil ratios associated with mineral extraction and 582 volumes of material worked and used for construction (Ford et al. 2014). This is a 583 response to increased demand through population growth and resource consumption and 584 to technical innovations such as the rapid spread in use of bulldozers from the 1950's. 585 Ford et al. (2014) argue that this time interval is characterised by electronic equipment, 586 extensive concrete manufacture, deep mining and generation of vast amounts of waste. 587 These stratigraphical signals are both sharp (to decadal level) and globally widespread.

588

589 Minerals such as mullite (present in fired brick and ceramics), ettringite, hillebrandite and 590 portlandite (found in cement and concrete) are present in archaeological times, but have 591 become significantly more common since the mid-20th century (Fig. 2) and are 592 sufficiently stable to provide a lasting signature (**Zalasiewicz** *et al.* 2013). New metal 593 alloys, mineraloid glasses, semiconductors, synthetic "minerals" and emerging 594 nanomaterials may be uniquely indicative of the Anthropocene (**Zalasiewicz** *et al.* 2013). 595 Plastics appeared in the environment in significant volumes since the mid 1940's, but by 596 2008 an estimated 260 million tonnes of plastic was produced, increasing annually by 9% 597 (Thompson *et al.* 2009). Much of this output finds its way to landfill or the sea, with 598 microplastics becoming an abundant trace fossil within marine sediments since the 599 1950's (**Barnosky** 2013). However, uncertainty exists as to their persistence following 500 burial or within the marine environment, though their decomposition would be associated 501 with release of toxic compounds which in themselves will result in a geochemical 502 signature.

603



604

Fig. 4. View of the Earth at night, 2012, showing the distribution of urban conurbations,
but not necessarily the most populated areas, through the presence of city lights. The
image shows the domination of city construction in coastal areas, particularly in South
America and Africa, and along major transport networks in North America, Europe,
Russia, India and China. From Earth Observatory, NASA

| 610 | http://earthobservatory.nasa.g | gov/Features/NightLights/page3.php | |
|-----|--------------------------------|------------------------------------|--|
| | | | |

- 611
- 612

613 Forests cover about 31% of the Earth's land surface (Food and Agricultural Organisation 614 of the United Nations 2010), but as human populations increase, so too does the rate of 615 deforestation. Since the 1950's, the scale of deforestation has increased by about 44% 616 compared with the average for the past 5 kyr, with the net loss of forest of 5.2 million hectares over the first decade of the new millennium (FAO 2010). However, it is too 617 618 early to see resultant increased mineral magnetic signatures as a consequence of 619 deforestation since the mid 20th Century (Snowball et al. 2013). The areal extent of 620 deforestation is now predominantly in tropical forests, in part due to demand for the 621 timber, but also the clearance of forests for agricultural development and fuel supply 622 (FAO 2010). Erosion of soils have undoubtedly increased as a result of this deforestation, (e.g. Dearing & Jones 2003 and references therein) and has resulted in increased 623 624 sediment input to fluvial systems. In contrast, the role of agriculture on the unintentional erosion of soils is considered to have declined dramatically since the 1950's in response 625 to modern soil conservation practices in developed countries (Hooke 2000). Since the 626 627 1940's there has been an increase in direct management of rivers, such as construction of 628 dams, channel maintenance and urbanisation of floodplains (Merritts et al. 2011, Syvitski 629 & Kettner 2011). The proliferation in building of major dam schemes across the globe 630 (Syvitski & Kettner 2011) has caused about 20% of sediment load to be retained by 631 reservoirs (Syvitski *et al.* 2005). As a result global river systems typically show a peak flux of sediments to the oceans by the early 20th century (Syvitski & Kettner 2011). Many 632 coastal deltas have seen net subsidence since the 1930's, partly in response to this 633 634 reduced sediment influx from the rivers, but also the impact of water and hydrocarbon 635 extraction from deltas (Syvitski & Kettner 2011). Increased development of urban areas 636 on deltas results in greater loading and compaction. Sediment flux is further reduced as a 637 result of the construction of flood-prevention schemes designed to prevent sediment 638 recharge of the inhabited parts of the delta top.

639

640 Traditional biostratigraphical signatures, used elsewhere in the stratigraphical column, 641 may continue to have applicability to the definition of the Anthropocene. Although the 642 introduction of exotic species are first documented following the onset of the Industrial 643 Revolution in parts of the globe (Fig. 3), there has been accelerated introductions during 644 increased global transportation during World War II and the subsequently in the 1970's 645 with the introduction of supertankers (Barnosky 2013; Fig. 2). The release of ballast 646 waters is now the main route of transporting invasive species, particularly with 647 colonisation within estuaries near to port facilities (Roberts 2012). It is perhaps in the 648 controlled evolution of crops that most precise biostratigraphical tools may be found. 649 Lineage zones based upon maize hybrids may be suitable as the crop is geographically 650 widespread, can only reproduce through human cultivation and may be preserved in 651 sediments for thousands of years (Barnosky 2013). Morphologically distinct and 652 widespread hybrids have been developed in the 1840's and 1930's, though if molecular 653 biology techniques are considered mutations ~1950 and genetically modified variants 654 marketed since 1998 may also be recognised (Barnosky 2013).

655

656 Microfaunal and microfloral signatures within the marine environment are the most widely used biostratigraphical tool in the Phanerozoic and signatures can also be 657 recognised which may help resolve the definition of the Anthropocene. Potential drivers 658 include increasing nutrient loading (N and P) and eutrophication, acidification, presence 659 of inorganic pollutants, alkalisation and climate change. In the Arctic and alpine lakes 660 661 there is evidence of diatom assemblage responses indicative of eutrophication coinciding 662 with increasing atmospheric N deposition since about 1950-1970 and after 1980 (Wolfe 663 et al. 2013, Wilkinson et al. 2014). Benthic Foraminifera are sensitive to eutrophication, heavy metal and organic pollutants, changes in water management practices, introduction 664 665 of non-indigenous species and land use changes. Foraminiferal records show a dramatic increase in the frequency and intensity of bottom-water hypoxia events since the mid-20th 666 century, coinciding with the increased use of N- and P-based fertilisers (Blackwelder et 667 668 al. 1996, Wilkinson et al. 2014). Ostracod abundance and diversity is related to 669 eutrophication in freshwater and marginal marine settings, industrial pollution, sewage 670 effluents, oil pollution, fish farming and salinity variations and a marked reduction in 671 diversity has become more widespread and profound during the mid 20th century 672 (Wilkinson et al. 2014).

During the latter half of the 20th century fish stocks have fallen dramatically. This is in 674 part the consequence of overfishing due to the increasing use of factory fleets using 675 676 improved technologies such as echo location and satellite data and increasingly larger 677 ships, drift nets and longlines (Roberts 2012). But, increasing artisanal fishing in coastal 678 areas is also an important factor. The consequence is likely to be evident in sediments as 679 reduced numbers and diversity of fish remains. In coastal and marine shelf/slope settings 680 down to ~ 1 km depth this biostratigraphical signature would coincide with extensive 681 anthropogenic modification of surface sediments (Puig et al. 2012, Roberts 2012) with bottom trawling and dredging affecting 15 million km^2/a , about half the area of global 682 683 continental shelves (Watling & Norse 1998). Contrast this with the early 19th century 684 when only about 1% of the oceans were exploited (Roberts 2012). The effect may be 685 most apparent in deep oceans where fish have low reproductive rates and stocks are 686 largely unprotected from overfishing. Other pressures, such as the increased introduction 687 of fish-farming in estuaries may also influence fish stocks through transmission of 688 disease and introduction of nutrients and pollution from antibiotics, pesticides and 689 fungicides (Roberts 2012). The massive growth of jellyfish populations, formerly in part 690 controlled by a healthy fish population, can also threaten fish numbers through 691 competition and consumption of fish eggs (Roberts 2012).

692

693 Coral reefs extend over only 0.1-0.2% of the oceans and are less extensive than the 694 urbanised zones are on land. Despite being of limited areal extent, modern reefs account 695 for a significant component of marine biotic diversity. Pollution, warming and 696 acidification of ocean waters, eutrophication, and reduction of light levels due to 697 increased sediment flux as coastal forests were removed, have seriously stressed coral 698 reefs (Hoegh-Guldberg 2014). The frequency and severity of mass coral bleaching 699 episodes, beginning in 1979, have increased with time (Hoegh-Guldberg 2014). There 700 has been a 50% reduction in the abundance of reef-building corals over the past 40-50 701 years (Fig. 2), with rates of change several orders of magnitude higher than for much of 702 the last million years (Hoegh-Guldberg 2014). The effects of oceanic acidification is 703 still, however, uncertain. Upper ocean pH across open oceans to coastal waters at various 704 latitudes is highly site-dependent with pH values that range markedly (0.024 to 1.43) 705 units) on a monthly basis (Hofmann et al. 2011). Even within the comparatively stable 706 open oceans, episodic variations in pH are greater than the annual rate of acidification, 707 meaning that the influence of ocean acidification on oceanic biota is unlikely to be simple 708 to predict in detail (Hofmann et al. 2011) and some organisms will be more sensitive to 709 pH change than others. However, as the entire range of pH variation will be shifted to 710 lower values by anthropogenic CO2 emissions, significant consequences are likely.

711

712 Anthropogenic production of carbon, nitrogen and phosphorus from activities such as

713 fossil fuel combustion, agriculture and fertilizer production increased (Fig. 2), both in

volume of output and spatial reach during the mid 20th century (**Gałuszka** *et al.* 2013).

715 One of the more significant signatures over the past century has been a doubling of

reactive nitrogen at the Earth's surface, particularly in response to the invention and

717 implementation of the Haber process from 1913 (Zalasiewicz *et al.* 2011).. Influx of

excess reactive nitrogen to the ocean has resulted in increased eutrophication, increasing

algal blooms and in turn causing oxygen deficiency changing the redox potential, with

- this process intensifying over the last 30 years (Gałuszka et al. 2013). Remote northern
- hemisphere lakes show depletion in δ^{15} N values (Holtgrieve *et al.* 2011, Wolfe *et al.*
- 2013) starting at 1895 CE \pm 10 years, but accelerating over the past 50 years (Fischer *et*
- *al.* 1998). In Greenland ice, the main phase of increase was 1950-1980, culminating in
- levels higher than observed for the previous 100 kyr (**Wolff** 2013; Fig. 2), representing a
- marker that is distinct from the Holocene background.
- 726

Sulphate concentrations in Greenland ice rose by a factor of 4 over pre-industrial levels with the main increases between 1900-1920 CE and 1940-1980 CE (Wolff 2013). Atmospheric disturbance of the sulphur cycle is also evident in both speleothems and trees (Fairchild & Frisia 2013). However, the increases in sulphate concentration fall within ranges possible from both large volcanic eruptions (Smith *et al.* 2013) and associated with the last glacial maximum, suggesting this is not a suitable primary marker for the Anthropocene.

734

735 Industrially-produced metal pollutants including Pb, Cd, Cu, Zn, can undergo long-range 736 atmospheric transport, commonly occur at levels above natural background across many 737 depositional environments and are likely to persist in the future geological record 738 (Gałuszka et al. 2013). Stable lead isotopes are particularly important for recognising the 739 global pollutant signature associated with alkylead additives in gasoline as an 740 antiknocking agent from 1940-1980 (Gałuszka et al. 2013). Lead concentrations in 741 Greenland snow in 1960 were a factor of 200 above the Holocene background level 742 (Boutron *et al.* 1991, **Wolff** 2013). Emerging pollutants that are uniquely associated with 743 modern technological advances may represent an important signature for the 744 Anthropocene. Rare earth elements, used in modern high-technology industries and 745 medicine, are now appearing in the environment and are very persistent and non-746 biodegradable (Gałuszka et al. 2013). Persistent organic pollutants (POP) also provide 747 potential signatures because of their long residence time in different environments and 748 resistance to degradation, but these would still not represent long-term signatures when 749 viewing the start of the Anthropocene several thousands of years hence.

750

751 Temporal trends in accumulation of pollutants in sediments will differ regionally, 752 dependent upon the diachronous expansion of industrialization (Fig.3). Signatures may 753 also be affected by changes in pH and redox potential of sediments, which may result in 754 remobilization of substances (Gałuszka et al. 2013). Ultimately, the diachroneity in 755 many geochemical anthropogenic signals may limit their use for defining the base of the 756 Anthropocene. However, the most dramatic isochronous contamination signature of the 757 mid 20th Century is the beginning of the nuclear age and the global spread of artificial 758 radionuclides. Global scale enrichment in artificial radioisotopes has resulted from 759 atmospheric nuclear weapon testing, mainly from 1945–1980 (Fig. 2), with more localised though still widespread signatures associated with discharges from nuclear 760 reactors (Hancock et al. 2013, Gałuszka et al. 2013). There is a ¹³⁷Cs fallout peak of 761 762 1963-64 (mainly in northern hemisphere sediments) and a more globally extensive peak 763 in 1964 for ²³⁹Pu. Ice cores show jumps in beta-radioactivity in 1954 and 1964 with a 764 peak in 1966 a factor of 100 above background levels (Wolff 2013). Speleothems record 765 a widespread and unambiguous radiocarbon signal that commenced in 1955 and peaked

- ⁷⁶⁶ in 1962, relating to atmospheric nuclear testing. Following the test-ban treaty levels of ⁷⁶⁷ 14 C in the atmosphere has declined exponentially (**Fairchild & Frisia** 2013). This ⁷⁶⁸ signature has been recorded in corals and salt marshes. However, it is probably the initial ⁷⁶⁹ post-1945 rise in concentrations that would be used to mark a putative base of the ⁷⁷⁰ Anthropocene, rather than the peak signature.
- 771
- Given the weight of evidence, including some of the issues described above, Zalasiewicz *et al.* (2014 a) argue the case for a ~1950 CE date for the onset of the Anthropocene.
- 774
- 775 *Future perspective*

776 There is a strong argument, forwarded by Wolff (2013) that the characteristics of the 777 fully-developed Anthropocene are still uncertain and that we may be living through a 778 transition towards a new epoch, rather than being fully within it. With the exception of 779 the definition of the Holocene, decisions made to ratify chronostratigraphical units have 780 been made with the understanding that the events or signatures characteristic of that time 781 period have finished. This is not true for the Anthropocene, but the erection of a new 782 Anthropocene Epoch can only be made on the basis of material evidence of elapsed 783 events. Projections of future trends are simply predictions: some are more robustly 784 founded than others and they can provide a sense of perspective when considering recent 785 patterns. Ultimately, if there is a consensus that the main environmental changes lie 786 ahead of us, it might be concluded that it is too early to judge the position of the base of 787 the Anthropocene, even if there is sufficient material evidence (including that detailed in 788 this volume) that the stratigraphic change to date is significant.

789

790 Each of the various events that have been proposed or discussed here as starting points 791 for an Anthropocene epoch is diachronous and spatially heterogeneous. But, the level of 792 diachroneity varies from several millennia (e.g. urbanization) to a very few years (e.g. 793 artificial radionuclide deposition). Virtually all stratigraphic boundaries are diachronous 794 and spatially heterogenous to an extent that would make any of the potential 795 Anthropocene bounding events seem effectively instantaneous, in a far-future 796 perspective. The key question here is whether the range of evidence currently existing 797 can enable contemporary Earth scientists to effectively and usefully demarcate and 798 correlate the Anthropocene as a stratigraphic unit.

799

800 There is also concern, rightly so, for the potential for preservation of an Anthropocene 801 bounding event (e.g. Ford et al. 2014). The traces of existing bounding events for deeptime stratigraphic boundaries are, of course, not universally preserved. Preservation 802 803 depends on many factors, but it can be reasonably predicted, say, that cities sited on 804 subsiding deltas are much more likely to enter the stratigraphic record in some form than 805 those sited in mountainous terrain. Ice core from Greenland has been used to define a 806 GSSP for the Pleistocene/Holocene boundary (Walker et al. 2009) and has the potential 807 to also be used for the Anthropocene (e.g. Smith 2013, Wolff 2013). However, with 808 extensive wasting of ice within a realm of increasing global temperatures, with greatest 809 increases in polar regions, the likely preservation of ice formed a little over half a century 810 ago is uncertain.

812 Despite the imposition of anthropogenically-induced environmental stresses on global 813 flora and fauna over recent centuries and decades, there is presently no justification for 814 associating a mass extinction horizon with this time interval (Barnosky et al. 2011, 815 **Barnosky** 2013). However, if currently elevated extinction rates continue, the sixth mass 816 extinction (75% species loss) would occur within three to five centuries and that an 817 extinction threshold exceeding the late Quaternary Megafaunal Extinction could occur 818 even sooner (**Barnosky** 2013). Probably the single most significant extinction event of a 819 single species would be that of mankind itself, but could not be used to justify the 820 introduction of a term such as the Anthropocene.

821

822 The extent to which current demands for environmental and biotic conservation can be 823 effective in the future are difficult to predict. However, locally, there is evidence that 824 measures to clean up once heavily polluted environments are having an effect. For 825 example, changes in local dinoflagellate cyst assemblages in response to human-induced eutrophication initially in the mid- to late-19th century and particularly during the early to 826 827 mid-20th century have shown trends of recovery in the 1980-1990's in response to 828 improvements in sewage treatment works (Wilkinson et al. 2014). A future reduction of 829 input of humanity's wastes into the oceans may at least allow recoveries of other micro-830 and macro-faunal communities in the future (Fig. 2), though perhaps not into the same 831 patterns as those that existed prior to human perturbation.

832

833 Ocean temperatures have increased by 0.1°c over the past century, though seasonal and 834 diurnal changes are greater. In the northern hemisphere there is already evidence of the 835 northward "march to the poles" of fish and plankton species in response to this warming 836 (Roberts 2012). There is a potential, with increased ocean temperatures in the future, for 837 a more marked affect on ostracod assemblages (Wilkinson et al. 2014). Perhaps most 838 susceptible to temperature increases are biota in high latitude regions. High northern 839 latitudes are likely to experience the greatest temperature increases over this century (see 840 Hayward *et al.* 2011) and fauna in this region may have no alternative environment for 841 retreat. With projected oceanic temperature rises it is realistic to envision the loss of 842 coral-dominated reef habitats by the middle of this century (Hoegh-Guldberg 2014; Fig. 843 2). The late Paleocene to early Eocene thermal maximum event (PETM), with associated 844 spike in CO_2 and ocean acidification, may be a close analogue to our current climate 845 trajectory. This event saw a stepwise transition of platform reef assemblages (Scheibner 846 & Speijer 2008). During the Paleocene, coralgal reef associations with diverse coral types 847 dominated in low and mid latitudes. A transitional late Paleocene stage is marked by 848 persistence or coralgal reefs in mid latitudes, but large foraminifers dominate in low 849 latitudes. By the start of the PETM larger foraminifers and encrusting foraminifers form 850 large reefs with coralgal buildups generally absent (Scheibner & Speijer 2008). Such 851 transitions appear to be recorded in modern reefs by Leinfelder et al. (2012) with the evolution of low-diversity reefs in Almirante Bay, Panama. This reef appears to be 852 853 thriving in an environment of increasing terrigenous run-off and reduced salinities, and 854 may reflect a pattern for evolution of Anthropocene reefs.

855

Global estimates of sea-level rise in response to thermal expansion and melting of landbased ice for the 20^{th} and 21^{st} centuries are ca. 1.8 mm a⁻¹ (Church & White 2011), 858 considered an acceleration on previous centuries. Precise determinations using satellite altimetry indicate rates of sea-level rise of 3.2±0.4 mm a⁻¹ from 1993–2009 (Church & 859 White 2011), which suggests a continuation of this acceleration. This should be compared 860 with the >40 mm yr⁻¹ during the last deglaciation ca. 14 ka BP (Fairbanks 1989). 861 Modelling limits predictions to 2100, and estimates for subsequent increased rates in sea-862 863 level elevation are difficult to quantify, but the extreme estimate would be melting of all 864 ice-sheets leading to a sea-level rise of 80 m (Williams & Hall 1993). By comparison 865 with the Cretaceous and Eocene 'greenhouse intervals' it is expected that with a doubling 866 of CO_2 from pre-Industrial levels there will be an increase in the precipitation rate 867 (Haywood et al. 2011), which would be expected to cause both increased soil erosion and 868 increased discharges in fluvial systems.

869

Increased output of anthropogenic CO_2 may result in future acidification of the oceans and significant under-saturation of $CaCO_3$. This may cause a shallowing in average carbonate compensation depth and production of a prolonged carbonate gap (for several thousand years) in deep marine deposits, such that paler coccolith and foraminifer oozes will become rare and darker clay and silicic deposits dominate (Tyrell 2011).

875

876 **Haff** (2013) suggests an alternative view of the Anthropocene as an age of technology, 877 with increasing domination of our environment by an emergent technosphere, of which 878 humans are components. Haff (op cit.) suggests that the technosphere has evolved into a 879 dynamic system, but as a juvenile system that has not reached equilibrium, being a poor 880 recycler of critical resources. Appropriation of energy by the technosphere has resulted in 881 disruption to the lithosphere, atmosphere, hydrosphere and biosphere. Time will tell if 882 this event is like the Great Oxidation Event about 2.4 Billion years ago, that resulted in a 883 shift in the global state. Or, if unsustainable, the evolution and demise of the 884 technosphere represents a brief episode, comparable to the K-T impact event.

885

886 Summary and conclusions

In summary, it is recognised that in order to define the Anthropocene as a formal chronostratigraphical unit, it is necessary to apply the same rigorous evidence-based approach to recognising key signatures as has been used for the definition of older units. However, there should be concerns if special criteria are being imposed to justify the definition that could not be met by these older units.

892

893 Ultimately, there is a requirement to identify a critical change to a new regime in which 894 anthropogenic influence is a dominant controlling factor upon aspects as diverse as biotic 895 abundance and variability, sediment flux and sediment composition, geochemical and 896 radiogenic signatures, climate change, sea-level rise, ice-cover loss etc. Ideally, the 897 definition of the Anthropocene should be based upon a single, globally-expressed 898 signature. This could be, for example the appearance of radiogenic fallout, though there 899 remains the questions as to whether the initial post-1945 rise or the peak signature some 900 two decades later be used. However, definition drawing upon a spectrum of signatures 901 would enable characterization of the unit to reflect a profound change across many 902 environmental indicators. As demonstrated in this contribution, the onset of the broad 903 range of signatures is diachronous, spanning almost 11 kyr or more (Fig. 2). Many, 904 though not all, of the indicators covered in this special publication show maximum 905 signatures which post-date 1945 leading to the suggestion that this date may be a suitable 906 age for the commencement of the Anthropocene should it prove useful and necessary to 907 define it (Fig. 2). What cannot be quantified is the extent that the acme of many of these 908 signatures lies ahead in the future, indicating that we lack the full perspective of geological time to review the total impact of humans on Earth. It is important to 909 910 recognise that human decision-making has the potential to shape the future geological 911 record. For the present, we must continue to work with a developing narrative, even as it 912 unfolds.

913

The authors wish to acknowledge the helpful comments from Simon Price and Vanessa
Banks and constructive feedback from Daniela Schmidt is also gratefully acknowledged.
Figure 1 was designed by Chris Wardle. This article is published with the permission of
the Executive Director of the British Geological Survey (NERC).

918

919 **References**

AGER, D.V. 1993. *The nature of the Stratigraphical record* (Third edition). John Wiley &Sons.

922

AKÇAR, N., Ivy-Ochs, S. & Schlüchter, C. 2008. Application of in-situ produced
terrestrial cosmogenic nuclides to archaeology: A schematic review. *Eiszeitalter und Gegenwart Quaternary Science Journal*, 57, 226-238.

926

BARNOSKY, A.D. 2013. Palaeontological evidence for defining the Anthropocene. *In*:
WATERS, C.N., ZALASIEWICZ, J., WILLIAMS, M., ELLIS, M.A. & SNELLING, A. (Eds) A *Stratigraphical Basis for the Anthropocene*. Geological Society, London, Special
Publications, **395**, doi:10.1144/SP395.6.

931

932 BARNOSKY, A.D., MATZKE, N., TOMIYA, S., WOGAN, G.O.U., SWARTZ, B., QUENTAL,

- T.B., MARSHALL, C., MCGUIRE, J.L., LINDSEY, E.L., MAGUIRE, K.C., MERSEY, B. &
 FERRER, E.A. 2011. Has the Earth/'s sixth mass extinction already arrived? *Nature*, 471,
- 935 51-57.
- 935 936

BATTARBEE, R.W., MORLEY, D., BENNION, H., SIMPSON, G.L., HUGHES, M. & BAUERE, V.
2011. A palaeolimnological meta-database for assessing the ecological status if lakes.
Journal of Paleolimnology, 45, 405-414.

940

941 BLACKWELDER, P., HOOD, T., ALVAREZ-ZARIKIAN, C., NELSEN, T.A. & MCKEE, B. 1996.

Benthic Foraminifera from the NECOP study area impacted by the Mississippi River
plume and seasonal hypoxia. *Quaternary International*, **31**, 19–36.

944

BOUTRON, C. F., GÖRLACH, U., CANDELONE, J.-P., BOLSHOV, M. A. & DELMAS, R. J.
1991. Decrease in anthropogenic lead, cadmium and zinc in Greenland snows since the
late 1960s. *Nature*, 353, 153-156.

- BRADLEY, R.S. 1999. Paleoclimatology: Reconstructing Climates of the Quaternary. Harcourt Academic Press. pp.613. BRIFFA, K.R., JONES, P.D., SCHWEINGRUBER, F.H., OSBORN, T.J., 1998. Influence of volcanic eruptions on Northern Hemisphere summer temperature over the past 600 years. Nature, **393**, 450–455. BROWN, A., TOMS, P., CAREY, C. & RHODES, E. 2013. Geomorphology of the Anthropocene: Time-transgressive discontinuities of human-induced alluviation. Anthropocene, 1, 3-13, doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ancene.2013.06.002. BROWNE, E. 1997. Nuclear Data Sheet, 82, 379. CERTINI, G. & SCALENGHE, R. 2011. Anthropogenic soils are the golden spikes for the Anthropocene. The Holocene, 21, 1269-1274. CHURCH, J.A. & WHITE, N.J. 2011. Sea-level rise from the late 19th to the early 21st century. Surveys in Geophysics, doi:10.1007/s10712-011-9119-1. CRUTZEN, P.J. & STOERMER, E.F. 2000. The "Anthropocene". Global Change Newsletter, , 17-18. CRUTZEN, P.J. 2002. Geology of Mankind. Nature, 415, 23. DEARING, J.A., & JONES, R.T. 2003. Coupling temporal and spatial dimensions of global sediment flux through lake and marine sediment records. Global and Planetary Change, , 147-168. DELMAS, R.J., 1992. Environmental information from ice cores. *Reviews in Geophysics*, , 1–21. DIBB, J., MAYEWSKI, P.A., BUCK, C.F. & DRUMMEY, S.M., 1990. Beta radiation from snow. Nature, 344, 6270, 25. DULLER, G.A.T. 2008. Luminescence Dating: guidelines on using luminescence dating in archaeology. Swindon: English Heritage, pp.44. EDGEWORTH, M. 2013. Archaeological stratigraphy and artificial ground. In: WATERS, C.N., ZALASIEWICZ, J., WILLIAMS, M., ELLIS, M.A. & SNELLING, A. (Eds) A Stratigraphical Basis for the Anthropocene. Geological Society, London, Special Publications, **395**, doi:10.1144/SP395.3. ELERT, G. The Physics Hypertextbook. http://physics.info/half-life/, accessed 2013-
- 994 09-18.

| ELLIS, E.C., ANTILL, E.C. & KREFT, H. 2012, All Is Not Loss: Plant Biodiversity in the |
|--|
| Anthropocene. <i>PLoS ONE</i> , 7, e30535, doi: 10.1371/iournal.pone.0030535. |
| , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , |
| Ellis, E.C., Kaplan, J.O., Fuller, D.O., Vavrus, S., Klein Goldewiik, K. & |
| VERBURG P H 2013 Used planet: A global history <i>Proceedings of the National</i> |
| Academy of Sciences 110 7978-7985 doi: 10 1073/pnas 1217241110 |
| readenty of Sciences, 110 , 7770 7905, doi: 10.1075/phus.12172/1110. |
| |
| FAIRCHILD II & FRISLA S 2013 Definition of the Anthropocene: a view from the |
| underworld In: WATERS C N ZALASIEWICZ I WILLIAMS M FILLS MA & |
| SNELLING Δ (Eds) Δ Stratigraphical Basis for the Anthropocene Geological Society |
| London Special Publications 395 doi:10.1144/SP395.7 |
| |
| FAIRBANKS R.G. 1989 A 17 000-year glacio-eustatic sea-level record: Influence of |
| alacial melting rates on the Younger Dryas event and deen-ocean circulation <i>Nature</i> |
| 342 637_642 |
| 5+2, 057-0+2. |
| FOOD AND AGRICULTURE ORGANIZATION OF THE UNITED NATIONS (EAO) 2010 Global |
| Forest Resources Assessment $2010 - main report FAO Forestry Paper No. 163 Rome$ |
| 107est Resources Assessment 2010 = main report. The Totestry Taper No. 105. Rome.www.fao.org/docrep/013/i1757e/i1757e00 htm |
| <u>www.rab.org/docrep/015/11/57e/11/57e00.ntm</u> . |
| FINNEY S C 2013 The 'Anthronocene' as a ratified unit in the ICS International |
| Chronostratigraphic Chart: fundamental issues that must be addressed by the Task |
| Group In : WATERS C N ZALASIEWICZ I WILLIAMS M FLLIS M A & SNELLING A |
| (Eds) A Stratigraphical Basis for the Anthronocene Geological Society London Special |
| Publications 305 doi:10.1114/SD305.0 |
| 1 uoncarions, 375 , uon 10.1144/51 375.7. |
| FISCHED H WACENDACH D & KIDESTILLI I 1998 Sulfate and nitrate firm |
| concentrations on the Greenland ice sheet 2 Temporal anthropogenic denosition |
| changes <i>Journal of Geophysical Research</i> 103 21035 21042 |
| changes. Journal of Geophysical Research, 105, 21955-21942. |
| FORD LP DRICE S.I. COODER A.H. & WATERS C.N. 2014 An assessment of |
| lithestratigraphy for anthronogonic denosite In: WATERS, C.N. 2014. All assessment of |
| Multians M Ellis M A & Shelling A (Eds) A Stratigraphical Basis for the |
| Authroposona Coological Society London Special Publications 205 *** |
| Animopocene. Geological Society, London, Special Fublications, 395, ···. |
| CALE S. L. & HOADE D.C. 2012. The stratigraphic status of the Anthroposona. The |
| Underer 32 1479 1491 |
| <i>Holocene</i> , 22, 1476-1461. |
| CALLEZKA A MICASZEWSKI 7 M & 7 ALASEWSKIZ I 2012 Assessing the |
| UAŁUSZKA, A., WIIGASZEWSKI, Z.WI. & ZALASIEWICZ, J. 2015. ASSESSING the |
| Anthropocene with geochemical methods. In: WATERS, U.N., ZALASIEWICZ, J., |
| williams, w., Ellis, W.A. & Snelling, A. (Eds) A Stratigraphical Basis for the |
| Anthropocene. Geological Society, London, Special Publications, 395, |
| uo1:10.1144/5Y393.3. |
| |
| |

- 1041 GIBBARD P.L., HEAD, M.J., WALKER, M.J.C, 2010. Formal ratification of the Quaternary 1042 System/Period and the Pleistocene Series/Epoch with a base at 2.58 Ma. *Journal of*
- 1043 Quaternary Science, 25 (2), 96-102.
- 1044

GIBBARD, P.L. & WALKER, M.J.C. 2013. The term 'Anthropocene' in the context of
formal geological classification. *In*: WATERS, C.N., ZALASIEWICZ, J., WILLIAMS, M.,
ELLIS, M.A. & SNELLING, A. (Eds) A Stratigraphical Basis for the Anthropocene.
Geological Society, London, Special Publications, **395**, doi:10.1144/SP395.1.

- 1049
- 1050 GOSSE, J.C. & PHILLIPS, F.M. 2001. Terrestrial in situ cosmogenic nuclides: Theory and application. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, **20**, 1475-1560.
- 1052
- 1053 GRADSTEIN, F.M., OGG, J.G., SCHMITZ, M. & OGG, G. 2012. *The Geological Time Scale* 1054 2012. No. 2 Volumes. (Elsevier.) ISBN 978-0-444-59425-9.
- 1055

HAFF, P. 2013. Technology as a geological phenomenon: Implications for human wellbeing. *In*: WATERS, C.N., ZALASIEWICZ, J., WILLIAMS, M., ELLIS, M.A. & SNELLING, A.
(Eds) *A Stratigraphical Basis for the Anthropocene*. Geological Society, London, Special
Publications, **395**, doi:10.1144/SP395.4.

1060

1065

HANCOCK, G.J., TIMS, S.G., FIFIELD, L. K. & WEBSTER, I.T. 2013. The Release and
Persistence of Radioactive Anthropogenic Nuclides. *In*: WATERS, C.N., ZALASIEWICZ, J.,
WILLIAMS, M., ELLIS, M.A. & SNELLING, A. (Eds) A Stratigraphical Basis for the
Anthropocene. Geological Society, London, Special Publications, 395,***.

- HAYWOOD, A.M., RIDGEWELL, A., LUNT, D.J., HILL, D.J., POUND, M.J., DOWSETT, H.J., DOLAN,
 A.M., FRANCIS, J.E. & WILLIAMS, M. 2011. Are there pre-Quaternary geological analogues for a
 future greenhouse warming? *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society, London, Series A*,
 369, 933-956.
- 1070

HEDBERG, H.D. (ed.) 1976. International Stratigraphic Guide--A Guide to Stratigraphic
Classification, Terminology, and Procedure. New York, John Wiley & Sons, 200 p.

1073

HOEGH-GULDBERG, O. 2014. Coral reefs in the Anthropocene: persistence or the end of
the line? *In*: WATERS, C.N., ZALASIEWICZ, J., WILLIAMS, M., ELLIS, M.A. & SNELLING,
A. (Eds) A Stratigraphical Basis for the Anthropocene. Geological Society, London,

- 1077 Special Publications, **395**,***.
- 1078

HOFMANN, G.E., SMITH, J.E., JOHNSON, K.S., SEND, U., LEVIN, L.A., MICHELI, F., PAYTAN,
A., PRICE, N.N., PETERSON, B., TAKESHITA, Y., MATSON, P.G., CROOK, E.D., KROEKER,
K.J., GAMBI, M.C., RIVEST, E.B., FRIEDER, C.A., YU, P.C. & MARTZ, T.R. 2011. HighFrequency Dynamics of Ocean pH: A Multi-Ecosystem Comparison. *PLoS ONE*, Vol. 6,
e28983.

- 1084
- HOLTGRIEVE, G.W., SCHINDLER, D.E., HOBBS, W.O., LEAVITT, P.R., WARD, E.J., BUNTING,
 L., CHEN, G., FINNEY, B.P., GREGORY-EAVES, I., HOLMGREN, S., LISAC, M.J., LISI, P.J.,
 NYDICK, K., ROGERS, L.A., SAROS, J.E., SELBIE, D.T., SHAPLEY, M.D., WALSH, P.B. &

- 1088 WOLFE, A.P. 2011. A Coherent Signature of Anthropogenic Nitrogen Deposition to 1089 Remote Watersheds of the Northern Hemisphere. *Science*, **334**, 1545-1548.
- 1090
- HOOKE, R. LeB. 2000. On the history of humans as geomorphic agents. *Geology*, 28, 843-846.
- 1093
- KLEIN GOLDEWIJK K., BEUSEN A. & JANSSEN P. 2010. Long-term dynamic modeling of
 global population and built-up area in a spatially explicit way: HYDE 3.1. *Holocene*,
 20(4), 565-573.
- 1097
- LEINFELDER, R.R., SEEMANN, J., HEISS, G.A. & STRUCK, U. 2012. Could 'Ecosystem
 Atavisms' Help Reefs to Adapt to the Anthropocene? *Proceedings of the 12th International Coral Reef Symposium, Cairns, Australia, 9-13 July 2012.* Online
 publication <u>http://www.reefbase.org/resource_center/publication/icrs.aspx.</u>
- 1102
- 1103 LISIECKI, L.E. & RAYMO, M.E., 2005. A Pliocene-Pleistocene stack of 57 globally 1104 distributed benthic δ^{18} O records. *Paleoceanography*, **20** (1), PA1003. 1105 doi:10.1029/2004PA001071. 1106
- LOCKE, G. & BERTINE, K.K. 1986. Magnetic sediments as an indicator of coal combustion. *Applied Geochemistry*, 1, 345–356.
- 1109
- 1110 LOULERGUE, L., SCHILT, A., SPAHNI, R., MASSON-DELMOTTE, V., BLUNIER, T.,
- LEMIEUX, B., BARNOLA, J. M., RAYNAUD, D., STOCKER, T. F. & CHAPPELLAZ, J. 2008.
 Orbital and millennial-scale features of atmospheric CH₄ over the last 800,000 years. *Nature*, 453, 383-386.
- 1114

LÜTHI, D., LE FLOCH, M., STOCKER, T. F., BEREITER, B., BLUNIER, T., BARNOLA, J. M.,
SIEGENTHALER, U., RAYNAUD, D. & JOUZEL, J. 2008. High-resolution carbon dioxide
concentration record 650,000-800,000 years before present. *Nature*, 453, 379-382.

1118

MERRITTS, D., WALTER, R., RAHNIS, M., HARTRANFT, J., COX, S., GELLIS, A., POTTER,
N., HILGARTNER, W., LANGLAND, M., MANION, L., LIPPINCOTT, C., SIDDIQUI, S.,
REHMAN, Z., SCHEID, C., KRATZ, L., SHILLING, A., JENSCHKE, M., DATIN, K., CRANMER,
E., REED, A., MATUSZEWSKI, D., VOLI, M., OHLSON, E., NEUGEBAUER, A., AHAMED, A.,
NEAL, C., WINTER, A. & BECKER, S. 2011. Anthropocene streams and base-level controls
from historic dams in the unglaciated mid-Atlantic region, USA. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society*, Series A, **369**, 976-1009.

- 1126
- POIRIER, C., CHAUMILLON, E. & ARNAUD, F. 2011. Siltation of river-influenced coastal
 environments: Respective impact of late Holocene land use and high-frequency climate
 changes. *Marine Geology*, **290**, 51-62, doi: 10.1016/j.margeo.2011.10.008.
- 1129 cha 1130
- 1131 PRICE, S.J., FORD, J.R., COOPER, A.H. & NEAL, C. 2011. Humans as major geological
- and geomorphological agents in the Anthropocene: the significance of artificial ground in

| 1133 1134 | Great Britain. <i>Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society</i> , A2011 369 , 1056-1084, doi: 10.1098/rsta.2010.0296. |
|--------------|---|
| 1135 | Durg D. Charles M. Construire I.D. Marstra L. Anstra D. Lastra G. |
| 1136 | PUIG, P., CANALS, M., COMPANY, J.B., MARTIN, J., AMBLAS, D., LASTRAS, G., |
| 113/ | PALANQUES, A. & CALAFAT, A.M. 2012. Plougning the deep sea floor. <i>Nature</i> , 489 , 286- |
| 1138 | 289. |
| 1139 | DEVICIN A 1002 Clobal warming: understanding the forecast American Museum of |
| 1140 1141 | Natural History, Environmental Defense Fund, Abbeville Press. |
| 1142 | |
| 1143 | ROBERTS, C. 2012. Ocean of Life: How our seas are changing. Allen Lane, 400pp. |
| 1144 | |
| 1145 1146 | RICHTER, D. DEB. 2007. Humanity's transformation of Earth's soil: Pedology's new frontier. <i>Soil Science</i> , 172 (12), 957-967. |
| 1147 | |
| 1148 | RUDDIMAN, W.F. 2003. The Anthropogenic Greenhouse Era began thousands of Years |
| 1149 | Ago. <i>Climatic Change</i> , 61 , 261-293. |
| 1150 | |
| 1151 | RUDDIMAN, W.F. 2005. Plows, Plagues and Petroleum. Princeton University Press: |
| 1152 | Princeton NJ. |
| 1153 | |
| 1154 | SALVADOR, A., 1994. International Stratigraphic Guide. A guide to stratigraphic |
| 1155 | classification, terminology, and procedure 2^{nd} Edition. The International Union of |
| 1156 | Geological Sciences and The Geological Society of America (Colorado). |
| 1157 | SCHEIDNER C & SDEHED B D 2008 Dealing of acrel reafs during late Delegange to carly |
| 1158 | Eocene global warming. <i>eEarth</i> , 3 , 19-26. |
| 1160 | |
| 1161 | SCHILT, A., BAUMGARTNER, M., BLUNIER, T., SCHWANDER, J., SPAHNI, R., FISCHER, H. |
| 1162 | & STOCKER, T. F. 2010. Glacial-interglacial and millennial-scale variations in the |
| 1163 | atmospheric nitrous oxide concentration during the last 800,000 years. Quaternary |
| 1164 | Science Reviews, 29, 182-192, doi: 10.1016/j.quascirev.2009.03.011. |
| 1165 | |
| 1166 | SHACKLETON, N.J. & OPDYKE, N.D., 1973. Oxygen isotope and palaeomagnetic |
| 1167 | stratigraphy of the equatorial Pacific core V28-238: Oxygen isotope temperatures and ice |
| 1168 | volumes on a 105 and 106 year scale. Quaternary Research, 3, 39-55. |
| 1169 | http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0033-5894(73)90052-5. |
| 1170 | |
| 1171 | SHEN, SZ., HENDERSON, C.M., BOWRING, S.A., CAU, CQ., WANG, Y., WANG, W., |
| 1172 | ZHANG, H., ZHANG, YC. & MU, L., 2010. High-resolution Lopingian (Late Permian) |
| 1173 | timescale of South China. Geological Journal, 45, 122-134. |
| 1174 | CREASING LA 1007 Delict annexica effection in the interview of |
| 11/5 | SIMPSON, I.A. 1997. Relict properties of anthropogenic deep top soils as indicators of |
| 1176 1177 | Science, 24 (4), 365-380. |

SINGARAYER, J.S., VALDES, P.J., FRIEDLINGSTEIN, P., NELSON, S. & BEERLING, D.J. 2011.
Late Holocene methane rise caused by orbitally controlled increase in tropical sources.

- 1181 *Nature*, **470**, 82-86.
- 1182

SMITH, A.G., BARRY, T., BOWN, P., COPE, J., GALE, A., GIBBARD, P., GREGORY, J.,
HOUNSLOW, M., KEMP, D., KNOX, R., MARSHALL, J., OATES, M., RAWSON, P. &
WATERS, C. 2014. GSSPs, global stratigraphy and correlation. *In*: Strata and Time:
Probing the Gaps in Our Understanding (Ed. Smith, D). *Proceedings of the William Smith meeting*, ***.

1188

SMITH, V. C. 2013. Defining the onset of the Anthropocene using tephrochronology. *In*:
WATERS, C.N., ZALASIEWICZ, J., WILLIAMS, M., ELLIS, M.A. & SNELLING, A. (Eds) *A Stratigraphical Basis for the Anthropocene*. Geological Society, London, Special
Publications, **395**, doi:10.1144/SP395.11.

1193

1194 SNOWBALL, I., HOUNSLOW, M.W. & NILSSON, A. 2013. Geomagnetic and mineral magnetic characterisation of the Anthropocene. In: WATERS, C.N., ZALASIEWICZ, J., 1195 1196 WILLIAMS, M., ELLIS, M.A. & SNELLING, A. (Eds) A Stratigraphical Basis for the 1197 Publications, Anthropocene. Geological Society, London, Special 395. doi:10.1144/SP395.13. 1198

1199

1204

SOLOMON, S. QIN, D., MANNING M., CHEN, Z., MARQUIS, M., AVERYT, K.B. TIGNOR M.
& MILLER H.L. (eds.) 2007. Contribution of Working Group I to the Fourth Assessment
Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, 2007. (Cambridge University
Press, Cambridge & New York).

STEFFEN, W., SANDERSON, A., TYSON, P.D., JAEGER, J., MATSON, P.A., MOORE, B.,
OLDFIELD, F., RICHARDSON, K., SCHNELLNHUBER, H.J., TURNER, B.L. & WASSON, R.J.,
2004. *Global Change and the Earth System: A Planet under Pressure*. Berlin, SpringerVerlag.

1209

STEFFEN, W., CRUTZEN, P.J. & MCNEILL, J.R., 2007, The Anthropocene: are humans now
overwhelming the great forces of Nature? *Ambio*, 36, 614-621.

- 1213 STOPPANI, A.1873. Corsa di Geologia. Milan, Bernardoni & Brigola.
- 1214
- STUIVER, M. & POLACH, H.A. 1977. Discussion: Reporting of ¹⁴C data. *Radiocarbon*, 19, 355-363.
- 1217
- SYVITSKI, J.P.M. & KETTNER, A. 2011. Sediment flux and the Anthropocene. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society*, A369, 957-975.
- 1220

¹²²¹ SYVITSKI, J.P.M, VÖRÖSMARTY, C.J., KETTNER, A.J., & GREEN, P. 2005. Impact of 1222 Humans on the Flux of Terrestrial Sediment to the Global Coastal Ocean. *Science*, **308**, 1223 376-380.

- 1225 THOMPSON, R.C., MOORE, C.J., VOM SAAL, F.S. & SWAN, S.H. 2009. Plastics, the 1226 environment and human health: current consensus and future trends *Philosophical* 1227 *Transactions of the Royal Society*, **B364**, 2153-2166, doi: 10.1098/rstb.2009.0053.
- 1228
- 1229 TYRRELL, T. 2011. Anthropogenic modification of the oceans. *Philosophical* 1230 *Transactions of the Royal Society*, **A369**, 887-908.
- 1231
- 1232 UNDESA 2012. World Urbanisation Prospects, 2011 Revisions. United Nations1233 Department of Economic and Social Affairs, New York.
- 1234 <u>http://hdrstats.undp.org/en/tables/displayByRow.cfm</u>
- 1235

UNTERWEGER, M.P. 2003. Radionuclide Half-Life Measurements of the National Institute
 of Standards and Technology (Version 3.0). [Online]. Available:
 <u>http://physics.nist.gov/Halflife</u>. Retrieved 18th September 2013. National Institute of
 Standards and Technology, Gainsburg, MD.

1240

WALKER, M., JOHNSEN, S., OLANDER RASMUSSEN, S., POPP, T., STEFFENSE, J-P., GIBBARD,
P., HOEK, W., LOWE, J., ANDREWS, J., BJÖRCK, S., CWYNAR, L.C., HUGHEN, K., NEWHAM,
R. & SCHWANDER, J. 2009. Formal definition and dating of the GSSP (Global Stratotype)

Section and Point) for the base of the Holocene using the Greenland NGRIP ice core, and selected auxiliary records. *Journal of Quaternary Science*, **24**, 3-17.

1246

1247 WALKER, M.J.C., BERKELHAMMER, M., BJÖRCK, S., CWYNAR, L.C., FISHER, D.A., LONG,

1248 A.J., LOWE, J.J., NEWNHAM, R.M., RASMUSSEN, S.O. & WEISS, H. 2012. Formal

1249 subdivision of the Holocene Series/Epoch: a Discussion Paper by a Working Group of

1250 INTIMATE (Integration of ice-core, marine and terrestrial records) and the

1251 Subcommission on Quaternary Stratigraphy (International Commission on Stratigraphy).

- 1252 *Journal of Quaternary Science*, **27**, 649-659, doi: 10.1002/jqs.2565.
- 1253

WATLING, L. & NORSE, E.A. 1998. Disturbance of the Seabed by Mobile Fishing Gear: A
Comparison to Forest Clearcutting. *Conservation Biology*, **12**, 1180-1197, doi:

- 1256 10.1046/j.1523-1739.1998.0120061180.x. 1257
- WILKINSON, B.H. 2005. Humans as geologic agents: A deep-time perspective. *Geology*,
 33, 161-164.
- 1260

1261 WILKINSON, I.P., POIRIER, C., HEAD, M.J., SAYER, C.D. & TIBBY, J. 2014. 1262 Micropalaeontological signatures of the Anthropocene. *In*: WATERS, C. N., ZALASIEWICZ,

- 1263 J., WILLIAMS, M., ELLIS, M. A. & SNELLING, A. (Eds) A Stratigraphical Basis for the
- 1264 Anthropocene. Geological Society, London, Special Publications, **395**,***.
- 1265

- WILLIAMS, M., ZALASIEWICZ, J., WATERS, C.N. & LANDING, E. 2013. Is the fossil record of complex animal behaviour a stratigraphical analogue for the Anthropocene? *In*:
 WATERS, C. N., ZALASIEWICZ, J., WILLIAMS, M., ELLIS, M. A. & SNELLING, A. (Eds) *A Stratigraphical Basis for the Anthropocene*. Geological Society, London, Special Publications, **395**, doi:10.1144/SP395.8.
- 1271
- WILLIAMS, R.S. & HALL, D.K. 1993. Glaciers. *In*: Gurney, R.J., Foster, J.L. & Parkinson,
 C.L. (eds.) *Atlas of Satellite observations related to global change*. Cambridge University
 Press, Cambridge, U.K., 401-422.
- 1275
- WOLFE, A.P., HOBBS, W.O., BIRKS, H.H., BRINER, J.P., HOLMGREN, S.U., INGÓLFSSON, Ó.,
 KAUSHAL, S.S., MILLER, G.H., PAGANI, M., SAROS, J.E. & VINEBROOKE, R.D. 2013.
 Stratigraphic expressions of the Holocene–Anthropocene transition revealed in sediments
 from remote lakes. *Earth-Science Reviews*, **116**, 17-34.
- 1280
- WOLFF, E.W. 2013. Ice Sheets and the Anthropocene. *In*: WATERS, C. N., ZALASIEWICZ,
 J., WILLIAMS, M., ELLIS, M. A. & SNELLING, A. (Eds) A Stratigraphical Basis for the *Anthropocene*. Geological Society, London, Special Publications, **395**,
 doi:10.1144/SP395.10.
- 1286 WOODS, W.I. 2008. *Amazonian Dark Earths: Wim Sombroek's vision* (Springer, New 1287 York), pp. 504.
- 1288

- YIN, H., ZHANG, K., TONG, J., YANG, Z. & WU, S., 2001. The Global Stratotype Section
 and Point (GSSP) of the Permian-Triassic boundary. *Episodes*, 24, 102-114.
- 1291
- ZALASIEWICZ, J., WILLIAMS, M., SMITH, A., BARRY, T.L., COE, A.L., BOWN, P.R.,
 BRENCHLEY, P., CANTRILL, D., GALE, A., GIBBARD, P., GREGORY, F.J., HOUNSLOW, M.,
 KERR, A.C., PEARSON, P., KNOX, R., POWELL, J., WATERS, C., MARSHALL, J., OATES, M.,
 RAWSON, P. & STONE, P. 2008. Are we now living in the Anthropocene? *Geological Society of America Today*, 18, 4-8.
- 1298 ZALASEIWICZ, J., WILLIAMS, M., FORTEY, R., SMITH, A., BARRY, T.L., COE, A.L., BOWN,
- 1299 P.R., GALE, A., GIBBARD, P., GREGORY, F.J., HOUNSLOW, M.W., KERR, A.C., PEARSON, P.,
- 1300 KNOX, R., POWELL, J., WATERS, C., MARSHALL, J., OATES, M., RAWSON, P., & STONE, P.
- 1301 2011. Stratigraphy of the Anthropocene. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society*1302 *A*, **369**, 1036-1055.
- 1303
- ZALASIEWICZ, J., WILLIAMS, M. & WATERS, C.N. 2014 a. Can an Anthropocene Series be
 defined and recognised? *In*: WATERS, C. N., ZALASIEWICZ, J., WILLIAMS, M., ELLIS, M.
 A. & SNELLING, A. (Eds) *A Stratigraphical Basis for the Anthropocene*. Geological
 Society, London, Special Publications, **395**,***.
- 1308
- 1309 ZALASIEWICZ, J., KRYZA, R. & WILLIAMS, M. 2013 b. The mineral signature of the 1310 Anthropocene. *In*: WATERS, C. N., ZALASIEWICZ, J., WILLIAMS, M., ELLIS, M. A. &

- 1311 SNELLING, A. (Eds) A Stratigraphical Basis for the Anthropocene. Geological Society,
- 1312 London, Special Publications, 395, doi:10.1144/SP395.2.
- 1313

ZALASIEWICZ, J., WILLIAMS, M., WATERS, C.N., BARNOSKY, A.D. & HAFF, P. 2014 b. The 1314 DOI:

1315 technofossil Anthropocene record of humans. Review, 1, 10.1177/2053019613514953.

- 1316 1317
- 1318
- 1319

1320 Glossary of key terms

Anthropocene (derived from anthropos 'human being' and kainos 'new') was first
proposed as an epoch by Crutzen & Stoermer (2000) to denote the present time interval,
in which human activities have profoundly altered the global environment. The term is
currently undefined and is used only informally.

1325

Anthropozoic (derived from anthropos 'human being' and zoion 'animal' or zoic 'life') was proposed as an era by Antonio Stoppani (1873) in the 1870s in recognition of the increasing power and effect of humanity on the Earth's systems. The epithet of –zoic is used to name units of era ranking, e.g. Palaeozoic, Mesozoic, Cenozoic, i.e. the rank above that of period, in turn an order above epoch.

1331

Anthrocene is a term proposed by Revkin (1992) which had essentially the same meaningas Anthropocene.

1334

Anthropocene deposits refer to those sediments and contained materials of various
sources (e.g. plastics, metals, glass etc.) created by processes that reflect either human or
natural agents, or a combination of the two, that accumulated during the time interval
known as the Anthropocene.

1339

1340 Anthropogenic deposits refer to those sediments that have been created either directly or 1341 indirectly by human activities, but in which there is a dominant proportion of redeposited 1342 or novel material (Price et al. 2011, Ford et al. 2014). Such deposits may include 1343 artificial deposits/artificial ground (direct anthropogenic deposits). If natural processes 1344 are present, such as erosion and deposition within river systems, these may be considered 1345 to be *indirect anthropogenic deposits*, where human interaction, such as agriculture, 1346 deforestation, modification of river systems, influences the location and rates of such 1347 natural processes (Ford et al. 2014). The above terms are purely descriptive and none of 1348 have any time connotations and do not indicate whether they relate to Anthropocene or 1349 pre-Anthropocene time. Similarly the Anthropocene will include 'natural deposits' such 1350 as desert dune deposits, with no perceptible human influence.

1351

Artificial deposits reflecting those sediments deposited directly and purposely by human
activity and which may be associated with *artificial ground*, in which the ground surface
has been modified either through deposition or excavation, or a combination of the two
(Price *et al.* 2011, Ford *et al.* 2014). Edgeworth (2013) distinguishes the dominance of a
cultural agency as the primary force in the production of artificial ground.

1357

1358 *Made Ground* and *Worked Ground* represent physical extents of, respectively, artificial 1359 deposits accumulated above the natural ground surface and excavations into this natural 1360 ground (Price *et al.* 2011, **Ford** *et al.* 2014). These terms are used as part of a morpho-1361 stratigraphical scheme used by the British Geological Survey to classify artificial 1362 deposits. **Ford** *et al.* (2014) consider the potential of developing truly lithostratigraphical 1363 schemes to classify artificial deposits.