A direct comparison of three palynological preparation techniques

James B. Riding *, Jane E. Kyffin-Hughes

British Geological Survey, Kingsley Dunham Centre, Keyworth, Nottingham NG12 5GG, United Kingdom

* Corresponding author. Tel. +44 (0)115 9363447.
E-mail addresses: jbri@bgs.ac.uk (J.B. Riding), jeky@bgs.ac.uk (J.E. Kyffin Hughes).

ABSTRACT

Two samples of palynomorph-rich Upper Jurassic (Lower Oxfordian) mudstone from western Scotland were quantitatively prepared using the traditional hydrochloric and hydrofluoric acid based palynological preparation technique and two non-acid procedures. The latter are protocols using sodium hexametaphosphate [$(NaPO_3)_6$] and hydrogen peroxide (H_2O_2). These non-acid techniques have previously been validated only in terms of the absolute numbers of palynomorphs extracted. By contrast, this study aimed to assess the numbers of palynomorphs extracted in terms of absolute numbers of the individual taxa present to test for any taxonomic biases. The $(NaPO_3)_6$ method proved around 50% as efficient as acid digestion in terms of absolute numbers of palynomorphs extracted. It produced clean residues, which are eminently suitable for most palynological studies. The majority of the taxa present were recovered in representative relative proportions, and no taxonomic biases were noted. The absolute numbers of most taxa decrease in a stepwise fashion from acid digestion via the $(NaPO_3)_6$ procedure to the H_2O_2 method. However, the concentrations of bisaccate pollen were apparently relatively unaffected by the three methods used. Similarly, the *Meiourogonyaulax catytonensis* group appears to be unusually resistant to oxidation damage by H_2O_2. It is considered that the $(NaPO_3)_6$ preparation method is an eminently viable alternative to acid digestion, especially in remote operational settings such as rigsites. The H_2O_2 technique proved to be significantly less effective, at approximately 10% of the extraction level of acid digestion which appears to be largely due to oxidation. Hydrogen peroxide is an aggressive oxidant. Therefore the

$(NaPO_3)_6$ technique is deemed to be both safer and more effective than the H_2O_2 method.

Keywords: palynomorphs; preparation techniques; Upper Jurassic (Oxfordian); United Kingdom (Scotland).

1. Introduction

This study aimed to test whether the sodium hexametaphosphate [$(NaPO_3)_6$] and hydrogen peroxide (H_2O_2) methods of extracting palynomorphs from sedimentary rocks and sediments are effective alternatives to the traditional technique of hydrochloric and hydrofluoric acid (HCl/HF) digestion and, in particular, do not introduce any taxonomic biases. It is acknowledged that some practitioners may be somewhat resistant to change in working practices. Consequently these 'proof of concept' studies should help to overcome any entirely understandable inertia to change and stimulate further research on, and testing of, non-acid methods of palynomorph preparation.

Two samples of palynomorph-rich Upper Jurassic mudstone from the Isle of Skye, western Scotland, were prepared quantitatively using the acid-based palynological preparation technique and two non-acid methods. The palynomorph assemblages extracted were thoroughly examined and counted. The two non-acid procedures use $(NaPO_3)_6$ and H_2O_2, and were first described by Riding and Kyffin-Hughes (2004) and Riding et al. (2007) respectively. This investigation aimed to assess the concentrations per gram of the individual palynomorph taxa across the entire taxonomic spectrum extracted using these three procedures in order to assess the relative effectiveness of the two non-acid techniques. Previous studies have concentrated wholly on the absolute numbers of palynomorphs extracted, and not on the concentrations of individual taxa. This approach should identify any biases, in terms of absolute numbers of palynomorphs and diversity, inherent with the $(NaPO_3)_6$ and H_2O_2 preparation techniques.

2. Background

69
70 The standard technique for the extraction of palynomorphs from sedimentary
71 rocks and sediments uses acid digestion of the mineral matrix normally followed by
72 oxidative maceration. Here HCl and HF separately remove the carbonate and silicate
73 minerals respectively and nitric acid (HNO_3) is subsequently used for oxidation
74 (Gray, 1965; Doher, 1980; Phipps and Playford, 1984; Wood et al., 1996; Green,
75 2001). Recently the present authors have developed techniques for palynomorph
76 separation without the use of these highly hazardous acids. These non-acid techniques
77 use $(NaPO_3)_6$, and H_2O_2 (Riding and Kyffin-Hughes, 2004; 2006; 2010; Riding et al.,
78 2006; 2007).
79 Sodium hexametaphosphate, also known as Calgon and Graham's Salt, is a
80 non-hazardous substance; it is neutral (pH 7) and non-oxidising. Sodium
81 hexametaphosphate solution is used as a detergent, a deflocculant and a dispersent.
82 The highly ionic solution breaks up the clay fraction due to the high charges of
83 phosphate ions which are adsorbed onto the clay. This reduction of the coherence of
84 the clay results in the production of sub-10 μm particles which can be separated from
85 the palynomorphs and the other organic phytoclasts by sieving using a 20 μm mesh.
86 Hydrogen peroxide is used as a bleach and a disinfectant. It is a powerful
87 oxidant and is weakly acidic, hence is significantly hazardous (Riding et al., 2007, p.
88 21, 22). Furthermore, it readily dissociates and the resultant hydrogen and oxygen can
89 potentially form explosive mixtures with combustible substances. Hence H_2O_2 should
90 always be used in a fume cupboard. Hydrogen peroxide disaggregates clay-bearing
91 sediments and sedimentary rocks both physically and chemically. It causes 'deposit
92 swelling' in fine-grained siliciclastic lithotypes. As H_2O_2 soaks into the sample
93 material, hydrogen and oxygen bubbles are produced by dissociation. The resultant
94 expansion pressure caused by these gases physically breaks up the rock matrix.
95 Because H_2O_2 is an oxidising agent, it breaks down amorphous organic material
96 (AOM). This destruction of AOM occurs simultaneously with deposit swelling, and
97 hence can liberate palynomorphs from suitable material. Therefore organic-rich
98 lithotypes which are rich in AOM are especially suitable for the H_2O_2 method.
99 However, H_2O_2 should be used very carefully because oxidation can damage or
100 entirely destroy palynomorphs (Hopkins and McCarthy, 2002).
101 The palynomorph extraction techniques using $(NaPO_3)_6$ and H_2O_2
102 fundamentally differ from acid digestion in that the mineral matrix is disaggregated

103 and sieved away, rather than simply being dissolved. Both non-acid protocols work
104 well on most relatively soft clay-rich materials. However, they are significantly less
105 effective on indurated mudstones and carbonates (Riding and Kyffin-Hughes, 2004;
106 2006).
107 All the palynology laboratory operations in this study were undertaken with
108 strict reference to the appropriate and up-to-date health and safety guidelines (see
109 http://www.hse.gov.uk/coshh), the manufacturer's safety data sheets and internal
110 British Geological Survey risk assessments. In particular, protective clothing and
111 footwear should be worn at all times, great care should be taken with all mineral
112 acids, and hydrogen peroxide should be heated with great caution in a fully
113 operational fume cupboard (see Riding et al., 2007, p. 21-22).
114
115
116 **3. Material and methods**
117
118 Two samples of Upper Jurassic mudstone were prepared using the three
119 techniques. The material is from coastal (foreshore) outcrops at Dunans, Isle of Skye,
120 western Scotland, United Kingdom (NG 472 708) (Fig. 1). The samples were
121 collected from Bed 8 of Sykes and Callomon (1979) from the Lower Oxfordian part
122 of the Dunans Clay Member of the Staffin Shale Formation; they are referable to the
123 Cardioceras scarburgense Subzone of the Quenstedtoceras mariae Zone (Riding and
124 Thomas, 1997, fig. 2). The samples are informally termed DUN 42 and DUN 43; they
125 are from 32.12 m and 33.31 m from the base of the section at Dunans respectively.
126 The Dunans Clay Member is known to be extremely rich in well-preserved
127 dinoflagellate cysts, pollen and spores (Riding and Thomas, 1997).
128 The six subsamples prepared each used 5 g of rock. Two control subsamples
129 were prepared using the standard HCl/HF digestion method (e.g. Wood et al., 1996)
130 without pre-treatment or oxidation. The durations of the hydrochloric and
131 hydrofluoric acid treatments were until the respective reactions were complete. The
132 four non-acid subsamples were prepared using the methods described by Riding and
133 Kyffin-Hughes (2004; 2006) and Riding et al. (2007) (Appendix 1). It was ensured
134 that all the sample material was disaggregated.
135 To allow the relative effectiveness of each of the three protocols, the
136 concentrations of palynomorphs were calculated using the exotic marker technique

137 using a spike of *Lycopodium clavatum* tablets (Benninghoff, 1962; Stockmarr, 1971).
138 Five *Lycopodium* tablets were added to each of the six subsamples prior to the
139 preparation procedures. At least 250 Jurassic palynomorphs were counted (Table 1).
140 Damaged palynomorphs were considered; fragments which represented ca. 50% of
141 the grain were counted as such and aggregated into the count. However any portions
142 below 25% were disregarded. The absolute abundances of palynomorphs were
143 calculated using the equation of Benninghoff (1962), i.e.:
144

145 $$c = \frac{m_c \times L_t \times t}{L_c \times w}$$

146
147 This is where:
148 c = the number of indigenous palynomorphs per gram of dry rock (= concentration)
149 m_c = the number of indigenous palynomorphs counted
150 L_t = the number of *Lycopodium* spores in each tablet (the mean for the batch of tablets
151 used is 18,583)
152 t = the number of tablets added to the sample (i.e. 5)
153 L_c = the number of *Lycopodium* spores counted
154 w = the weight of dry sediment processed in grams (i.e. 5)
155
156 It should be remembered that exotic *Lycopodium* spores may be lost during the
157 preparation procedure, largely during the decantation and sieving stages (Mertens et
158 al., 2009). Selected photomicrographs of the organic residues are presented in Plates I
159 and II. The palynomorphs identified in this study at and below species level are listed
160 in Appendix 2. The sample material, organic residues, microscope slides, primary data
161 and illustrated materials are all housed in the collections of the British Geological
162 Survey, Keyworth, Nottingham NG12 5GG, United Kingdom.
163
164

165 4. Results

166
167 The samples both produced abundant and well-preserved dinoflagellate cysts,
168 pollen and spores (Tables 1, 2; Plates I, II). Dinoflagellate cysts are significantly more
169 abundant than pollen and spores. The dinoflagellate cyst assemblages are moderately

170 diverse and are entirely typical of the Early Oxfordian of Europe. The associations are
171 overwhelmingly dominated by *Mendicodinium groenlandicum*, with common
172 *Gonyaulacysta jurassica* subsp. *adecta*, the *Meiourogonyaulax caytonensis* group,
173 *Rigaudella aemula*, the *Sentusidinium rioultii* group and *Wanaea* spp. (Tables 1, 2).
174 The presence of taxa such as *Evansia deflandrei*, *Gonyaulacysta centriconnata*,
175 *Gonyaulacysta dentata, Gonyaulacysta jurassica* subsp. *jurassica, Rigaudella aemula*
176 and *Trichodinium scarburghense* is characteristic of the Late Callovian-Early
177 Oxfordian interval. Comparable palynofloras have been described by Woollam
178 (1980), Riding (1982; 1987; 2005), Smelror (1988a,b), Kunz (1990) and Riding and
179 Thomas (1997). The association is assigned to the earliest Oxfordian DSJ20 Zone of
180 Poulsen and Riding (2003).
181 The prepared organic residues from the six subsamples were each examined
182 and the indigenous Jurassic palynomorphs and the exotic *Lycopodium* spores counted.
183 All numerical data and the concentrations of the indigenous palynomorphs are
184 presented as Tables 1 and 2 respectively. The results of this study are discussed
185 below, both sample-by-sample and in general terms. In summary, the two non-acid
186 procedures extracted significantly fewer palynomorphs than acid digestion, with the
187 $(NaPO_3)_6$ method proving far more effective than the H_2O_2 technique.
188
189 *4.1. Sample DUN 42*
190
191 Sample DUN 42 produced an abundant, moderately diverse palynoflora
192 (Tables 1, 2). The acid digestion method produced a concentration of 159,960
193 palynomorphs per gram (Table 2). This concentration is by far the highest of the three
194 techniques, and is comparable to other palynomorph-rich material (Riding and Kyffin-
195 Hughes, 2010, table 1). The $(NaPO_3)_6$ method yielded a significantly lower
196 concentration of in situ palynomorphs, i.e. 71,781 grains per gram. This figure is
197 44.9% of the concentration of the acid digestion subsample. This marked reduction in
198 productivity is virtually identical (45.4%) in terms of the indigenous marine
199 palynomorphs. By contrast, the concentration of in situ terrestrial palynomorphs with
200 the $(NaPO_3)_6$ method is 37.5% of that produced by the acid digestion procedure. The
201 H_2O_2 technique proved to be the least effective of the three techniques, yielding
202 15,356 palynomorphs per gram (Table 2). This represents 9.6% and 21.4% of the
203 concentrations achieved with acid digestion and the $(NaPO_3)_6$ method respectively.

204 This reduction in palynomorph productivity from the acid digestion method using
205 H_2O_2 is far more for the indigenous marine palynomorphs, than the reduction in the
206 level of in situ terrestrial palynomorphs. This strongly suggests that dinosporin is
207 generally more susceptible to oxidation than the sporopollenin in pollen and spores. It
208 appears that the diminution in the concentration of in situ pollen and spores is less
209 using the H_2O_2 technique than with the $(NaPO_3)_6$ method (Table 2).
210 For the most common dinoflagellate cysts, i.e. *Gonyaulacysta jurassica* subsp.
211 *adecta,* the *Meiourogonyaulax caytonensis* group, *Mendicodinium groenlandicum*, the
212 *Sentusidinium rioultii* group and *Wanaea* spp., the diminutions in concentration
213 between acid digestion and the $(NaPO_3)_6$ method are similar. Generally, this reduction
214 in concentration is around 50%. The further reductions with the H_2O_2 technique are
215 normally very high, but are significantly more variable. For example the
216 *Meiourogonyaulax caytonensis* group is 54.1% of the concentration derived using the
217 $(NaPO_3)_6$ method, and no specimens of *Wanaea* spp. were recorded in the H_2O_2
218 preparation (Table 2). Generally, however, the numbers of dinoflagellate cyst taxa per
219 gram decrease in a stepwise fashion from acid digestion via the $(NaPO_3)_6$ procedure to
220 the H_2O_2 method. An exception to this is *Batiacasphaera* spp., which proved most
221 concentrated in the H_2O_2 preparation. Similarly, *Evansia deflandrei* was more
222 relatively abundant in the H_2O_2 preparation than in the $(NaPO_3)_6$ method subsample.
223 Species which are more concentrated using the $(NaPO_3)_6$ method are *Gonyaulacysta*
224 *dentata* and *Pareodinia ceratophora*. Trends such as this based on low counts are less
225 reliable than for the abundant species, for example the concentrations of *Pareodinia*
226 *ceratophora* are relatively similar in both samples for all three methods (Table 2).
227 The trend of decreasing concentrations from acid digestion through $(NaPO_3)_6$
228 and H_2O_2 in the miospores is only followed by *Cerebropollenites macroverrucosus*.
229 The concentrations of undifferentiated bisaccate pollen and *Classopollis classoides*
230 appear to be relatively unaffected by the preparation method used. The concentrations
231 of *Callialasporites* spp. per gram were markedly less using the two non-acid
232 techniques, but this diminution is relatively similar. Furthermore, the concentration of
233 *Perinopollenites elatoides* appears to have increased using the H_2O_2 method (Table
234 2).
235 Similarly, the diversity of palynomorphs diminishes using the two non-acid
236 techniques. This trend is most marked in the marine forms, reducing from 30 to 20

237 taxa between acid digestion and the H_2O_2 method. The diversity of terrestrially-
238 derived forms is reduced, but not as significantly (Table 1).
239 In terms of the percentages of the main kerogen macerals, the most marked
240 trends are the increase in black/brown wood and the decrease in AOM and non-woody
241 plant fragments from acid digestion through the $(NaPO_3)_6$ and the H_2O_2 methods. The
242 percentages of palynomorphs are relatively similar in the acid and $(NaPO_3)_6$
243 preparations, but these are significantly sparser in the H_2O_2 slides (Table 1; Plates I,
244 II).
245
246
247 *4.2. Sample DUN 43*
248
249 DUN 43 also produced an abundant and moderately diverse palynomorph
250 assemblage (Tables 1, 2). The acid digestion method yielded 126,413 palynomorphs
251 per gram; this concentration is by far the highest for all the three protocols employed
252 (Table 2). The $(NaPO_3)_6$ method yielded 73,494 in situ grains per gram, which
253 represents 58.1% of the density produced by the acid digestion method. This
254 reduction in concentration is virtually identical (57.0%) for the indigenous marine
255 palynomorphs. However, the concentration of in situ terrestrial palynomorphs
256 produced using the $(NaPO_3)_6$ method is 73.5% of that produced by the acid digestion
257 procedure. The H_2O_2 protocol was the least effective method, yielding 17,532
258 palynomorphs per gram; this represents 13.9% and 23.9% of the densities produced
259 using the acid and $(NaPO_3)_6$ techniques respectively. This reduction in productivity
260 using the H_2O_2 technique rather than the acid digestion method is far more for the in
261 situ marine palynomorphs by comparison with the indigenous terrestrial
262 palynomorphs. In marked contrast with DUN 42, the reduction in the concentrations
263 of in situ miospores reduces stepwise from acid digestion through the $(NaPO_3)_6$ and
264 H_2O_2 methods (Table 2).
265 For the majority of the most common dinoflagellate cysts, i.e. the
266 *Meiourogonyaulax caytonensis* group, *Mendicodinium groenlandicum*, *Rigaudella*
267 *aemula*, the *Sentusidinium rioultii* group and *Wanaea* spp., the concentrations
268 produced reduced markedly between the acid and the $(NaPO_3)_6$ methods. These
269 diminutions varied somewhat in magnitude, i.e. 38.2% for *Wanaea* spp. and 69.4%
270 for *Rigaudella aemula*. However the concentration of *Gonyaulacysta jurassica* subsp.

271 *adecta* proved similar (Table 2). The concentrations of the majority of these abundant
272 dinoflagellate cysts also reduce significantly with the H_2O_2 technique, and most of
273 these reductions are relatively large. The reductions between the H_2O_2 and $(NaPO_3)_6$
274 methods are normally between 78.7% (for the *Sentusidinium rioultii* group) and
275 96.9% (for *Rigaudella aemula*). However, the reduction in the concentration of the
276 *Meiourogonyaulax caytonensis* group between the H_2O_2 and $(NaPO_3)_6$ protocols is
277 only 28.7% (Table 2). Hence *Meiourogonyaulax caytonensis* appears to be relatively
278 resistant to oxidation with H_2O_2 (see above). This may be due to the relatively thick,
279 robust autophragm. Typically, the concentrations of dinoflagellate cysts decrease in a
280 stepwise fashion from acid digestion through the $(NaPO_3)_6$ method to the H_2O_2
281 technique. Examples of these forms include *Endoscrinium galeritum, Pareodinia*
282 *ceratophora* and *Rhynchodiniopsis cladophora*. Exceptions to this trend are *Evansia*
283 *deflandrei* and *Surculosphaeridium*? *vestitum*, which proved slightly more
284 concentrated in the $(NaPO_3)_6$ preparation (Table 2). However, phenomena such as
285 these that are based on low counts are less significant than analagous trends for the
286 more abundant taxa.
287 The trend of decreasing concentrations from the acid technique through the
288 $(NaPO_3)_6$ and H_2O_2 methods for the miospores is followed by *Cerebropollenites*
289 *macroverrucosus, Cyathidites* spp. and *Perinopollenites elatoides*. The concentration
290 of undifferentiated bisaccate pollen however, seems to be unaffected by the
291 preparation method used; this is a similar trend seen in sample DUN 42 (see above).
292 Of the two non-acid methods, the concentration of *Classopollis classoides* appears to
293 be greater using the H_2O_2 technique (Table 1).
294 Palynomorph diversity diminishes using the two non-acid techniques. This
295 phenomenon is greatest in the marine forms, reducing from 26, to 15 and 16 taxa
296 between acid digestion and the $(NaPO_3)_6$ and H_2O_2 methods respectively. The
297 diversity of terrestrially-derived forms is similar for all three preparation methods
298 (Table 2).
299 The percentages of black/brown wood increased and the relative proportions
300 of AOM and non-woody plant fragments decreased through the acid digestion,
301 $(NaPO_3)_6$ and H_2O_2 techniques. By contrast the percentages of palynomorphs are
302 comparable in the acid and $(NaPO_3)_6$ slides, but are significantly reduced in the H_2O_2
303 preparations (Table 1; Plates I, II).
304

305
306 *4.3. Overview of samples DUN 42 and 43*
307
308 This study has shown that, for these palynomorph-rich Jurassic marine
309 claystones, acid digestion produces organic microfossil concentrations which are
310 reduced by between 41.9% and 55.1% using the $(NaPO_3)_6$ technique. This reduction is
311 reflected in the marine palynomorphs more than in the pollen and spores. The H_2O_2
312 preparations yield sparser palynomorph assemblages than the acid digestion and the
313 $(NaPO_3)_6$ techniques. This reduction occurs in a stepwise fashion, and the H_2O_2
314 preparations produced between 9.6% and 13.9% of the concentrations produced by
315 acid digestion. The palynomorph diminution in the H_2O_2 preparations, by comparison
316 to the acid-based preparations, are most profound for the marine palynomorph
317 associations (largely dinoflagellate cysts). However, the *Meiourogonyaulax*
318 *caytonensis* group appears to be more resistant to oxidation damage by H_2O_2. Most
319 miospores are also reduced in concentration stepwise from acid digestion through the
320 $(NaPO_3)_6$ technique to the H_2O_2 protocol. However, the concentrations of
321 undifferentiated bisaccate pollen and *Classopollis classoides* seem to be relatively
322 unaffected by the preparation method used. The diversity of palynomorphs was
323 diminished with the two non-acid techniques. This reduction was consistently higher
324 in the marine palynomorphs. By contrast, the diversity of terrestrially-derived forms is
325 substantially similar for all three preparation methods. This phenomenon may be a
326 function of total diversity, which is significantly greater in the marine forms.
327 Consistent trends were perceived in the kerogen macerals. The percentages of
328 black/brown wood increased, and the relative proportions of AOM and non-woody
329 plant fragments decreased through the acid digestion, $(NaPO_3)_6$ and H_2O_2 protocols.
330 However, the percentages of palynomorphs are broadly comparable in the acid and
331 $(NaPO_3)_6$ preparations, but these are reduced in the H_2O_2 preparations.
332
333
334 **5. Discussion**
335
336 This study has confirmed the conclusions of Riding et al. (2007) that the
337 traditional acid digestion procedure is normally the most effective for extracting all

338 palynomorph groups. Clearly, the chemical removal of the calcareous and silicate
339 mineral matrix maximises the concentration of the organic materials.
340
341
342 *5.1. The sodium hexametaphosphate technique*
343
344 The reduction in palynomorph productivity of the acid digestion method of
345 approximately 50% with the $(NaPO_3)_6$ technique is most likely to be due to the
346 incomplete dissagregation of the clay fraction, coupled with losses during the
347 extensive sieving away of the small (<10 µm) clay particles. Notwithstanding the
348 reduced palynomorph concentrations using the $(NaPO_3)_6$ technique, it unequivocally
349 produces eminently workable palynofloras which are only slightly reduced in
350 diversity compared to those produced by acid digestion. The marine palynomorphs
351 are more reduced in diversity than the miospores, however this may be due to the
352 greater diversity of dinoflagellate cysts in the material studied herein. It is highly
353 likely that the full diversity of palynomorphs would be revealed by studying more
354 slides of the $(NaPO_3)_6$ residue. This means that, at least for routine analyses, the
355 $(NaPO_3)_6$ technique is an eminently viable alternative to acid digestion. Only a tiny
356 proportion of the palynomorphs extracted from a sample are ever studied, so this
357 factor is unlikely to be a serious problem with palynologically-productive material. It
358 seems clear that the $(NaPO_3)_6$ method does not cause any significant oxidation of the
359 palynomorphs. However, the AOM content of the organic residue was markedly
360 reduced, so the $(NaPO_3)_6$ treatment does somehow affect the AOM. This is probably
361 by physico-chemical means, and appears not to be through oxidation. This confirms
362 the findings of Riding and Kyffin-Hughes (2004; 2006; 2010), who also noted this
363 phenomenon. This means that any reduction in effectiveness is due to physical
364 factors. This will hence allow future development of the technique to increase
365 efficacy. This study has analysed the concentrations of individual taxa, and this has
366 proved that the $(NaPO_3)_6$ method does not cause any significant taxonomic biases.
367 However, the concentrations of bisaccate pollen and *Classopollis classoides* seem to
368 be similar in both the mineral acid and the $(NaPO_3)_6$ preparations. The reason for this
369 slight disparity to the majority of the remaining palynomorph taxa is not clear.
370
371

5.2. The hydrogen peroxide technique

The H_2O_2 protocol used here produced reasonable palynomorph associations, but these were relatively sparse compared with the other methods tested. This significantly reduced effectiveness is consistent with the findings of Riding and Kyffin-Hughes (2006) and Riding et al. (2007). This profoundly reduced palynomorph recovery, coupled with the reduced levels of AOM, means that the H_2O_2 technique unequivocally destroys significant proportions of the organic residue by oxidation. This is a significant problem with the use of H_2O_2, which is known to be an aggressive oxidising agent (Hopkins and McCarthy, 2002). These results strongly suggest that the $(NaPO_3)_6$ method is significantly superior to the H_2O_2 technique. However the H_2O_2 method will clearly produce workable palynomorph assemblages which can, for example, produce satisfactory biostratigraphical data and interpretations. The reason for this is that the palynomorph diversities in this study were comparable to those produced by the $(NaPO_3)_6$ technique (Table 1). Analysis of the concentrations of individual taxa has proved that the H_2O_2 method does not cause any significant taxonomic biases. This is probably largely due to the fact, in this study, the dinoflagellate cysts are overwhelmingly gonyaulacacean and hence not especially susceptible to destruction by oxidation. Peridiniacean dinoflagellate cysts are known to be more prone to damage by oxidation in comparison to gonyaulacalean forms (Dale, 1976; Schrank, 1988; Harland, 1989; Head, 1996; Williams et al., 2005; Riding et al., 2007). However, the concentration of bisaccate pollen is similar in both the mineral acid and the H_2O_2 preparations (Table 2). The reason for this slight disparity is not known.

6. Summary

Acid digestion using HCl and HF generally is the most efficient method of extracting palynomorphs from sediments and sedimentary rocks in terms of absolute numbers and diversities, however this protocol is potentially hazardous. Alternative methods using $(NaPO_3)_6$ and H_2O_2 have been developed recently, and these techniques are relatively safe. However, in most cases, these techniques are not as effective as acid digestion in terms of absolute palynomorph extraction. For example,

406 in this experiment on two samples of palynomorph-rich Upper Jurassic claystone, the
407 $(NaPO_3)_6$ method proved approximately 50% as effective as acid digestion. It appears
408 that the effectiveness of the $(NaPO_3)_6$ method is indirectly proportional to the levels of
409 lithification/induration of the material studied. Despite the disparity in effectiveness,
410 the $(NaPO_3)_6$ method produces clean (i.e. largely AOM-free) residues, and is suitable
411 for most projects using palynology. However, the apparent reduction in AOM may
412 make this technique unsuitable for palynofacies work. This is because the majority of
413 the taxa present were recovered in representative relative proportions using the
414 $(NaPO_3)_6$ method. This means that the key marker taxa will be recovered, and the
415 final interpretations will not be adversely affected by the reduced palynomorph
416 concentrations. No taxonomic biases were introduced by the $(NaPO_3)_6$ method.
417 The H_2O_2 technique was significantly less efficient, at around 10% of the acid
418 digestion level probably because it destroys palynomorphs by oxidation. Hydrogen
419 peroxide is hazardous as it is an oxidant and gives off a highly combustible mixture of
420 hydrogen and oxygen, hence a fume hood is required for this technique. Therefore the
421 $(NaPO_3)_6$ technique is safer and more effective. The latter thus appears to have
422 significant advantages over the H_2O_2 method. However, the H_2O_2 technique may be
423 useful in breaking down more indurated lithotypes, and can be used in isolation or in
424 combination with the $(NaPO_3)_6$ method (Riding and Kyffin-Hughes, 2004, appendix
425 2).
426 It is evident that the $(NaPO_3)_6$ protocol is a viable alternative to acid digestion.
427 This method clearly does not introduce any taxonomic biases. Furthermore, it is safe,
428 quick and inexpensive. It does not require particularly sophisticated laboratory
429 equipment and significant infrastructure such as a fume hood, and it is thus ideal for
430 work on drilling rigs and in remote fieldwork operations. Future research should be
431 undertaken to attempt to increase the effectiveness of this procedure in terms of the
432 absolute numbers of palynomorphs extracted using the acid digestion as a benchmark.
433
434
435 **Acknowledgements**
436
437 This contribution was supported by the British Geological Survey Laboratory
438 Maintenance and Development of Capability Project. Mr Graeme Dagg helped with
439 the production of the Plates. The authors thank Stewart G. Molyneux and Michael H.

Stephenson for their very helpful reviews of the manuscript. The authors publish with the permission of the Executive Director, British Geological Survey (NERC).

References

Benninghoff, W.S., 1962. Calculation of pollen and spores density in sediments by addition of exotic pollen in known quantities. Pollen et Spores 4, 332-333.

Dale, B., 1976. Cyst formation, sedimentation, and preservation: factors affecting dinoflagellate assemblages in Recent sediments from Trondheimsfjord, Norway. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 22, 39-60.

Doher, L.I., 1980. Palynomorph preparation procedures currently used in the paleontology and stratigraphy laboratories, U.S. Geological Survey. United States Geological Survey Circular 830, 29 p.

Fensome, R.A., Williams, G.L., 2004. The Lentin and Williams index of fossil dinoflagellates 2004 edition. American Association of Stratigraphic Palynologists Contributions Series 42, 909 pp.

Gray, J., 1965. Extraction techniques. In: Kummel, B., Raup, D. (Eds.), Handbook of Paleontological Techniques. W.H. Freeman and Company, San Francisco, U.S.A., pp. 530-587.

Green, O.R., 2001. Chapter 25. Extraction techniques for palaeobotanical and palynological material. In: A manual of practical laboratory and field techniques in palaeobiology. Kluwer Academic Publishers, Dordrecht, The Netherlands, pp. 256-287.

Harland, R., 1989. A dinoflagellate cyst record for the last 0.7 Ma from the Rockall Plateau, northeast Atlantic Ocean. Journal of the Geological Society 25, 113-117.

473 Head, M.J., 1996. Modern dinoflagellate cysts and their biological affinities. In:
474 Jansonius, J., McGregor, D.C. (Eds.), Palynology: principles and applications.
475 American Association of Stratigraphic Palynologists Foundation, Dallas 3, 1197-
476 1248.
477
478 Hopkins, J.A., McCarthy, F.M.G., 2002. Post-depositional palynomorph degradation
479 in Quaternary shelf sediments: a laboratory experiment studying the effects of
480 progressive oxidation. Palynology 26, 167-184.
481
482 Kunz, R., 1990. Phytoplankton und Palynofazies im Malm NW-Deutschlands
483 (Hannoversches Bergland). Palaeontographica Abteilung B 216, 1-105.
484
485 Mertens, K.N., Verhoeven, K., Verleye, T., Louwye, S., Amorim, A., Ribeiro, S.,
486 Deaf, A.S., Harding, I.C., de Schepper, S., González, C., Kodrans-Nsiah, M., de
487 Vernal, A., Henry, M., Radi, T., Dybkjaer, K., Poulsen, N.E., Feist-Burkhardt, S.,
488 Chitolie, J., Heilmann-Clausen, C., Londeix, L., Turon, J.-L., Marret, F., Matthiessen,
489 J., McCarthy, F.M.G., Prasad, V., Pospelova, V., Kyffin Hughes, J.E., Riding, J.B.,
490 Rochon, A., Sangiorgi, F., Welters, N., Sinclair, N., Thun, C., Soliman, A., van
491 Nieuwenhove, N., Vink, A., Young, M., 2009. Determining the absolute abundance of
492 dinoflagellate cysts in recent marine sediments: The *Lycopodium* marker-grain
493 method put to the test. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 157, 238-252.
494
495 Phipps, D., Playford, G., 1984. Laboratory techniques for extraction of palynomorphs
496 from sediments. Papers of the Department of Geology, University of Queensland
497 11(1), 23 p.
498
499 Poulsen, N.E., Riding, J.B., 2003. The Jurassic dinoflagellate cyst zonation of
500 Subboreal Northwest Europe. In: Ineson, J.R., Surlyk, F. (Eds.), The Jurassic of
501 Denmark and Greenland. Geological Survey of Denmark and Greenland Bulletin 1,
502 115-144.
503
504 Riding, J.B., 1982. Jurassic dinocysts from the Warboys Borehole, Cambridgeshire,
505 England. Journal of Micropalaeontology 1, 13-18.
506

507 Riding, J.B., 1987. Dinoflagellate cyst stratigraphy of the Nettleton Bottom Borehole
508 (Jurassic: Hettangian to Kimmeridgian), Lincolnshire, England. Proceedings of the
509 Yorkshire Geological Society 46, 231-266.
510
511 Riding, J.B., 1992. On the age of the Upper Ostrea Member, Staffin Bay Formation
512 (Middle Jurassic) of north-west Skye. Scottish Journal of Geology 28, 155-158.
513
514 Riding, J.B., 2005. Middle and Upper Jurassic (Callovian to Kimmeridgian)
515 palynology of the onshore Moray Firth Basin, northeast Scotland. Palynology 29, 87-
516 142.
517
518 Riding, J.B., Kyffin-Hughes, J.E., 2004. A review of the laboratory preparation of
519 palynomorphs with a description of an effective non-acid technique. Revista
520 Brasileira de Paleontologia 7(1), 13-44.
521
522 Riding, J.B., Kyffin-Hughes, J.E., 2006. Further testing of a non-acid palynological
523 preparation procedure. Palynology 30, 69-87.
524
525 Riding, J.B., Kyffin-Hughes, J.E., 2010. The use of pre-treatments in palynological
526 processing. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 158, 281-290.
527
528 Riding, J.B., Kyffin-Hughes, J.E., Owens, B., 2007. An effective palynological
529 preparation procedure using hydrogen peroxide. Palynology 31, 19-36.
530
531 Riding, J.B., Thomas, J.E., 1997. Marine palynomorphs from the Staffin Bay and
532 Staffin Shale formations (Middle-Upper Jurassic) of the Trotternish Peninsula, NW
533 Skye. Scottish Journal of Geology 33, 59-74.
534
535 Riding, J.B., Wilkinson, I.P., Jones, L.D., Freeborough, K., 2006. The occurrence of
536 dinoflagellate cysts in calcareous/siliceous microfossil preparations from the Eocene
537 of southeast England. Journal of Micropalaeontology 25, 35-36.
538

539 Schrank, E., 1988. Effects of chemical processing on the preservation of peridinioid
540 dinoflagellates: a case from the Late Cretaceous of NE Africa. Review of
541 Palaeobotany and Palynology 56, 123-140.
542
543 Smelror, M., 1988a. Late Bathonian to Early Oxfordian dinoflagellate cyst
544 stratigraphy of Jameson Land and Milne Land, East Greenland. Grønlands Geologiske
545 Undersøgelse Rapport 137, 135-159.
546
547 Smelror, M., 1988b. Bathonian to early Oxfordian dinoflagellate cysts and acritarchs
548 from Kong Karls Land, Svalbard. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 56, 275-
549 304.
550
551 Stockmarr, J., 1971. Tablets with spores used in absolute pollen analysis. Pollen et
552 Spores 13, 615-621.
553
554 Sykes, R.M., Callomon, J.H., 1979. The *Amoeboceras* zonation of the Boreal Upper
555 Oxfordian. Palaeontology 22, 839-903.
556
557 Williams, G., Payne, S.N.J., Dyer, R., Ewen, D.F., Patrick, N., Watson, P., 2005.
558 Non-acid wellsite palynology: widening opportunities. In: Powell, A.J., Riding, J.B.
559 (Eds.), Recent Developments in Applied Biostratigraphy. The Micropalaeontological
560 Society, Special Publication. The Geological Society, London, 219-235.
561
562 Wood, G.D., Gabriel, A.M., Lawson, J.C., 1996. Chapter 3. Palynological techniques
563 – processing and microscopy. In: Jansonius, J., McGregor, D.C. (Eds.), Palynology:
564 principles and applications. American Association of Stratigraphic Palynologists
565 Foundation, Dallas 1, 29-50.
566
567 Woollam, R., 1980. Jurassic dinocysts from shallow marine deposits of the East
568 Midlands, England. Journal of the University of Sheffield Geological Society 7.5,
569 243-261.
570
571

572 **APPENDIX 1 – BRIEF DESCRIPTIONS OF THE THREE PALYNOMORPH**
573 **PREPARATION TECHNIQUES USED IN THIS STUDY**
574
575 This Appendix provides brief descriptions of the three preparation methods used
576 herein.
577
578 **i) Acid digestion**
579 1 Air-dry the sample material and crush ca. 25-40 g to approximately five mm
580 fragments.
581 2 Decalcify the crushed sample using 36% HCl until there is no more reaction
582 with fresh HCl.
583 3 Decant-wash the decalcified sample residue until the supernatant liquor is
584 neutral.
585 4 Treat the neutral residue with 40% HF to remove the silicate fraction until the
586 reaction is complete.
587 5 Decant-wash the sample residue until the supernatant liquor is neutral.
588 6 Remove any resistant minerals and dense woody material by centrifugation
589 and/or swirling in a large watch glass.
590 7 Concentrate the palynomorph concentrate and mount on microscope slides.
591
592 **ii The sodium hexametaphosphate technique (adapted from Riding and**
593 **Kyffin-Hughes, 2004, p. 42; 2006, p. 86)**
594 1 Air-dry the sample material and crush ca. 100 g to approximately five mm
595 fragments.
596 2 Add ca. 400 ml of water to the sample material and bring to the boil.
597 3 Add around 40 g of $(NaPO_3)_6$ to the mixture, stir very thoroughly and simmer
598 for approximately 20 minutes.
599 4 Sieve the mixture using a 10 μm mesh to remove the <10 μm fraction of
600 deflocculated clay particles, then wash out the $(NaPO_3)_6$ from the retained >10
601 μm fraction.
602 5 If any of the sample material remains undisaggregated, treat with H_2O_2 (see
603 below) as necessary until it has all broken down.
604 6 Centrifuge and/or swirl the final residue to remove any resistant mineral grains.
605 7 Concentrate the palynomorph concentrate and mount on microscope slides.

606

607 **iii The hydrogen peroxide technique (adapted from Riding et al., 2007, p. 34)**

608 1 Air-dry the sample material and crush ca. 50-100 g to approximately one mm
609 fragments.

610 2 Place the sample material into a ceramic dish and place this on a pre-heated (to
611 ca. 100 °C) hot plate in a fume hood for around one minute.

612 3 Cover the sample material with 15%-30% H_2O_2, and heat extremely gently with
613 great care until the rock/sediment begins to disaggregate.

614 4 Decant off any floating disaggregated sample material into a beaker of cold
615 water to stop the reaction.

616 5 Repeat steps three and four as necessary until all the sample material has been
617 disaggregated.

618 6 Centrifuge and/or swirl the final residue to remove any resistant mineral grains.

619 7 Concentrate the palynomorph concentrate and mount on microscope slides.

620

621

622 **APPENDIX 2 – LIST OF PALYNOMORPH SPECIES AND SUBSPECIES**

623

624 This Appendix lists all valid, formally defined palynomorph taxa below generic level
625 which were identified in samples DUN 42 and DUN 43 with full author citations. The
626 palynomorphs are listed alphabetically within their constituent groups. References to
627 the dinoflagellate cyst author citations can be found in Fensome and Williams (2004).

628

629 **Dinoflagellate cysts:**

630 *Ambonosphaera*? *staffinensis* (Gitmez 1970) Poulsen & Riding 1992

631 *Atopodinium prostatum* Drugg 1978

632 *Chytroeisphaeridia chytroeides* (Sarjeant 1962) Downie & Sarjeant 1965

633 *Ctenidodinium ornatum* (Eisenack 1935) Deflandre 1939

634 *Downiesphaeridium polytrichum* (Valensi 1947) Masure in Fauconnier & Masure
635 2004

636 *Endoscrinium galeritum* (Deflandre 1939) Vozzhennikova 1967

637 *Evansia deflandrei* (Wolfard & Van Erve 1981) Below 1990

638 *Fromea tornatilis* (Drugg 1978) Lentin & Williams 1981

639 *Gonyaulacysta centriconnata* Riding 1983

640 *Gonyaulacysta dentata* (Raynaud 1978) Lentin & Vozzhennikova 1990
641 *Gonyaulacysta eisenackii* (Deflandre 1939) Górka 1965
642 *Gonyaulacysta jurassica* (Deflandre 1939) Norris & Sarjeant 1965
643 subsp. *adecta* Sarjeant 1982
644 subsp. *jurassica* (autonym)
645 *Meiourogonyaulax caytonensis* (Sarjeant 1959) Sarjeant 1969
646 *Mendicodinium groenlandicum* (Pocock & Sarjeant 1972) Davey 1979
647 *Nannoceratopsis pellucida* Deflandre 1939
648 *Pareodinia ceratophora* Deflandre 1947
649 *Pareodinia halosa* (Filatoff 1975) Prauss 1989
650 *Rhynchodiniopsis cladophora* (Deflandre 1939) Below 1981
651 *Rigaudella aemula* (Deflandre 1939) Below 1982
652 *Rigaudella filamentosa* (Cookson & Eisenack 1958) Below 1982
653 *Scriniodinium dictyotum* Cookson & Eisenack 1960
654 *Sentusidinium rioultii* (Sarjeant 1968) Sarjeant & Stover 1978
655 *Sirmiodinium grossii* Alberti 1961
656 *Surculosphaeridium*? *vestitum* (Deflandre 1939) Davey et al. 1966
657 *Trichodinium scarburghense* (Sarjeant 1964) Williams et al. 1993
658 *Tubotuberella dangeardii* (Sarjeant 1968) Stover & Evitt 1978
659
660 **Gymnospermous pollen:**
661 *Cerebropollenites macroverrucosus* (Thiergart 1949) Schulz 1967
662 *Classopollis classoides* (Pflug 1953) Pocock & Jansonius 1961
663 *Perinopollenites elatoides* Couper 1958
664 *Vitreisporites pallidus* (Reissinger 1950) Nilsson 1958
665
666 **Pteridophyte spores:**
667 *Concavissimisporites verrucosus* Delcourt & Sprumont 1955
668 *Ischyosporites variegatus* (Couper 1958) Schulz 1967
669
670
671 **Display material (Figure/Plate/Table) captions:**
672
673

674 **Fig. 1.** The location of Dunans at Staffin Bay, northwest Skye, western Scotland. A –
675 a sketch map of the Staffin Bay area illustrating the foreshore at Dunans where
676 samples DUN 42 and DUN 43 were collected. B, C – the broader geographical
677 context of the Staffin Bay area. Adapted from Riding (1992) and Riding and Thomas
678 (1997).
679
680
681 **Plate I.** Photomicrographs of the different preparations of sample DUN 42. Figures 1-
682 3 are representative low-magnification photomicrographs of the organic residues from
683 each of the three preparation methods used.
684 1 Acid digestion preparation. Slide MPA 14067Acid/1, England Finder
685 coordinate U61/1. The specimen of *Medicodinium groenlandicum* in the top left hand
686 corner is 69 µm wide. Note the presence of AOM; for consistency with the non-acid
687 preparations, this was not removed by oxidation.
688 2. Hydrogen peroxide preparation. Slide MPA 14067H_2O_2/1, England Finder
689 coordinate H59. The specimen of *Rhynchodiniopsis cladophora* in the centre left is 91
690 µm long. Note the abundant dark wood fragments and the lack of AOM.
691 3. Sodium hexametaphosphate preparation. Slide MPA 14067$(NaPO_3)_6$/2,
692 England Finder coordinate N43. The specimen of *Gonyaulacysta dentata* in the top
693 left hand corner is 111 µm long. Note the lack of AOM.
694 4. *Rhynchodiniopsis cladophora.* Sodium hexametaphosphate preparation. Slide
695 MPA 14067$(NaPO_3)_6$/2, BGS figured specimen MPK 14208, England Finder
696 coordinate N39/4. The specimen is 87 µm in length.
697
698
699 **Plate II.** Photomicrographs of the different preparations of sample DUN 43. Figures
700 1-3 are representative low-magnification photomicrographs of the organic residues
701 from each of the three preparation methods used.
702 1 Acid digestion preparation. Slide MPA 14068Acid/2, England Finder
703 coordinate N64. The specimen of *Wanaea* sp. in the centre left is 84 µm wide. Note
704 the presence of AOM; for consistency with the non-acid preparations, this was not
705 removed by oxidation.

706 2. Hydrogen peroxide preparation. Slide MPA 14068H_2O_2/2, England Finder
707 coordinate J52/1. The specimen of *Meiourogonyaulax* sp. in the top right hand corner
708 is 67 µm long. Note the abundant dark wood fragments and the lack of AOM.
709 3. Sodium hexametaphosphate preparation. Slide MPA 14068$(NaPO_3)_6$/2,
710 England Finder coordinate T54. The specimen of *Medicodinium groenlandicum* in the
711 centre left is 69 µm wide. Note the sparsity of AOM.
712 4. *Sirmiodinium grossii.* Sodium hexametaphosphate preparation. Slide MPA
713 14068$(NaPO_3)_6$/1, BGS figured specimen MPK 14209, England Finder coordinate
714 R63. The specimen is 60 µm in length.
715
716
717 **Table 1.** Key data on palynomorph counts and kerogen maceral distributions. This
718 table illustrates the numbers of indigenous Jurassic palynomorphs and the spiked
719 *Lycopodium* spores counted for the three subsamples each for samples DUN 42 and
720 DUN 43 prepared using the three different protocols. Occurrences recorded outside
721 the main count are indicated with an 'X'. Three dots (…) indicate that the respective
722 palynomorphs are absent. The palynomorphs are listed alphabetically in five groups.
723 The totals of in situ marine palynomorphs, in situ terrestrial palynomorphs, all in situ
724 palynomorphs and exotic *Lycopodium* spores are given. The diversities of indigenous
725 marine palynomorphs, terrestrial palynomorphs and all palynomorphs are listed. The
726 information on the distribution of the four main kerogen macerals are given as
727 percentages.
728
729
730 **Table 2.** Key data on palynomorph concentrations. This table illustrates the
731 concentrations per gram of indigenous Jurassic palynomorphs for the three
732 subsamples each of samples DUN 42 and DUN 43 prepared using the three different
733 protocols. The palynomorphs are listed alphabetically in four groups. The total
734 concentrations of in situ marine palynomorphs, in situ terrestrial palynomorphs and all
735 in situ palynomorphs are listed.