On which timescales do gas transfer velocities control North Atlantic CO₂ flux variability?

Matthew P. Couldrey¹, Kevin I. C. Oliver¹, Andrew Yool², Paul R. Halloran³

and Eric P. Achterberg^{1,4}

³ Key Points:

- -Global ocean carbon flux variability is simulated in a general circulation model
- $_{\scriptscriptstyle 5}\,$ -Concentration gradient & transfer velocity control interannual flux variability
- 6 -Gas transfer velocity does not control pentadal North Atlantic flux variability

Corresponding author: M. P. Couldrey, University of Southampton, Waterfront Campus, European Way, Southampton, Hampshire, SO143ZH (M.P.Couldrey@soton.ac.uk)

¹Ocean and Earth Science, University of

DRAFT

Abstract. The North Atlantic is an important basin for the global ocean's uptake of anthropogenic and natural carbon dioxide (CO_2) , but the mechanisms controlling this carbon flux are not fully understood. The air-sea flux q of CO_2 , F, is the product of a gas transfer velocity, k, the air-sea CO_2 con-10 centration gradient, $\Delta p CO_2$, and the temperature and salinity-dependent 11 solubility coefficient, α . k is difficult to constrain, representing the dominant 12 uncertainty in F on short (instantaneous to interannual) timescales. Previ-13 ous work shows that in the North Atlantic, $\Delta p CO_2$ and k both contribute 14 significantly to interannual F variability, but that k is unimportant for mul-15 tidecadal variability. On some timescale between interannual and multidecadal, 16 gas transfer velocity variability and its associated uncertainty become neg-17 ligible. Here, we quantify this critical timescale for the first time. Using an 18 Southampton, National Oceanography

Centre, Southampton, UK

²National Oceanography Centre,

Southampton, UK

³Geography, College of Life and

Environmental Sciences, University of

Exeter, UK

⁴GEOMAR Helmholtz-Zentrum für Ozeanforschung, Kiel, Germany

ocean model, we determine the importance of k, $\Delta p CO_2$ and α on a range 19 of timescales. On interannual and shorter timescales, both $\Delta p CO_2$ and k are 20 important controls on F. In contrast, pentadal to multidecadal North At-21 lantic flux variability is driven almost entirely by $\Delta p CO_2$; k contributes less 22 than 25%. Finally, we explore how accurately one can estimate North At-23 lantic F without a knowledge of non-seasonal k variability, finding it pos-24 sible for interannual and longer timescales. These findings suggest that con-25 tinued efforts to better constrain gas transfer velocities are necessary to quan-26 tify interannual variability in the North Atlantic carbon sink. However, un-27 certainty in k variability is unlikely to limit the accuracy of estimates of longer 28 term flux variability. 29

1. Introduction

Since the onset of the industrial era in the middle of the 18th Century, human activities 30 have altered oceanic and atmospheric chemistry, affecting the climate system. Fossil fuel 31 consumption, changes in land use and cement production rapidly release carbon as carbon 32 dioxide (CO_2) gas from geological reservoirs into the atmosphere, oceans and terrestrial 33 biosphere. This adds large amounts of 'anthropogenic carbon' to the biogeochemically 34 and/or radiatively active 'natural carbon' pool. The effects of CO_2 on the Earth system 35 are numerous and complex, but as a 'greenhouse gas' it is a prominent control on climate 36 [Myhre et al., 2013]. Of the 555 \pm 85 petagrams of carbon emitted to the atmosphere 37 between 1750 and 2011 by human activities, about half has remained in the atmosphere 38 while $28\% \pm 5\%$ has been taken up by the oceans, with the remainder taken up by the 39 terrestrial biosphere [*Ciais et al.*, 2013]. 40

The flux equation, (1), describes the net exchange of CO_2 between the air and the ocean 41 (F). Here, $\Delta p CO_2$ is the disequilibrium between the partial pressures of CO_2 in the air 42 and ocean $(pCO_2^{air} - pCO_2^{ocean})$. Under this sign convention, an excess of CO₂ in the air 43 gives positive $\Delta p CO_2$ and F, and driving exchange into seawater. If $p CO_2^{ocean}$ is greater, 44 outgassing occurs. pCO_2 in seawater is primarily a function of temperature (T), and 45 dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC), but salinity (S) and alkalinity also affect this. The gas 46 transfer velocity, k_{i} is a parameterization of how several aspects the physical environment 47 enable CO_2 flux. Wind velocity is the main variable affecting k (increasing winds increases 48 k), but ice, surfactants, bubbles and other factors also play important roles [Wanninkhof 49 et al., 2009]. The Schmidt number (the ratio between kinematic viscosity and molecular 50

DRAFT

April 13, 2016, 11:39am

diffusion) also affects k, varying with water temperature. α is Henry's constant of CO₂ solubility in seawater [*Weiss*, 1974], quantifying how temperature, salinity and pressure affect solubility.

$$F = \Delta p C O_2 \times k \times \alpha \tag{1}$$

 CO_2 flux is difficult to measure directly due to the need for high temporal resolu-54 tion measurements of pCO_2 and small scale turbulence [McGillis et al., 2001], and so a 55 more common approach is to measure or estimate each quantity on the right hand side 56 (RHS) of equation (1). α is the most straightforward to determine, varying primarily 57 with temperature, but also with salinity. α 's contribution to flux variability is generally 58 well-constrained, and found to be minor on interannual timescales (e.g. [Doney et al., 59 2009]). $\Delta p CO_2$ and k, however, present distinct challenges for ocean carbon research. 60 The primary challenge with studying global $\Delta p CO_2$ variability is to place as many mea-61 surement systems in as many locations as possible, and to maintain those observations 62 through time. The Surface Ocean CO_2 Atlas (SOCAT) is an example of a global effort to 63 compile measurements of ocean surface CO_2 gathered by autonomous underway systems 64 on commercial vessels and research cruises [Bakker et al., 2014]. 65

The main difficulties in quantifying gas transfer velocity stem from its dependence on several elements of the physico-chemical environment. The main variable used to derive a gas transfer velocity is wind speed, but k is also dependent on the smoothness of the sea surface (i.e. the presence of breaking and non-breaking waves [*Frew et al.*, 2007]), bubble entrainment, rain, buoyancy generated turbulence, surfactants and other factors [*Wanninkhof et al.*, 2009]. Given the large range of variables, and poor constraints of

DRAFT April 13, 2016, 11:39am DRAFT

their effects on k, field measurement of gas transfer velocity is difficult. In attempts to 72 refine these uncertainties, several parameterizations have been proposed, derived using 73 a number of techniques, but there is no consensus which is the most accurate [Bender 74 et al., 2011]. Instead, authors tend to attempt to quantify k uncertainty in two ways: 75 the uncertainty inherent to a particular parameterization (resulting from the spread of 76 datapoints about the polynomial fitted) and the variation in derived k from the use of 77 different parameterizations. Published uncertainties relating to k are often not statistically 78 sound, and represent ad-hoc best estimates of error [Wanninkhof, 2014]. The result is 79 that considerable CO_2 flux uncertainty originates from uncertainties in the gas transfer 80 velocity. 81

While the whole global ocean represents a large net sink of CO_2 for the atmosphere, 82 its uptake is not uniform spatially or temporally. The tropical oceans are net CO_2 out-83 gassing regions, whereas at higher latitudes there is net uptake by seawater [Takahashi 84 et al., 2009; Landschützer et al., 2014]. The major upwelling regions are outgassing zones, 85 and the strongest sites of ocean CO_2 uptake are areas of deep waters formation. In the 86 North Atlantic, the combination of deep water formation and high biological carbon fix-87 ation create ideal physical and biogeochemical conditions for strong ocean CO₂ uptake, 88 distinguishing it from other basins [Sabine et al., 2004; Khatiwala et al., 2009]. It is 89 therefore an important focus region in the ocean carbon cycle. 90

The evolution of the North Atlantic carbon sink on decadal and longer timescales is unclear, yet its quantification is necessary for future climate change prediction [Halloran *et al.*, 2015]. Bates [2007] and Takahashi et al. [2009] call attention to this gap in knowledge, highlighting that a major limitation to our ability to understand this variability

DRAFT

April 13, 2016, 11:39am

stems from limited spatiotemporal coverage of CO_2 observations. Although datasets with 95 large spatial coverage exist (e.g. SOCAT [Bakker et al., 2014]), they lack the temporal 96 duration required to study long timescales [Halloran et al., 2015]. Equally, the long time-97 series sites with sufficient data to quantify multiannual variability, such as the Bermuda 98 Atlantic Time Series (BATS) and others reviewed recently by *Bates et al.* [2014] may not 99 necessarily represent the systems at the basin scale [McKinley et al., 2004]. Given these 100 temporal and spatial data gaps, numerical modelling studies provide unique insight into 101 an incompletely observed system. 102

It is necessary to understand where observational uncertainties limit our ability to con-103 fidently predict future climate change. Previous work investigating global ocean carbon 104 flux interannual variability has found both $\Delta p CO_2$ and k to be important drivers [Doney 105 et al., 2009; Long et al., 2013]. Other work has found that North Atlantic multidecadal 106 CO_2 flux variability is controlled chiefly by the contribution from $\Delta p CO_2$ [McKinley et al., 107 2011]. Therefore, on these multidecadal timescales, uncertainty in gas transfer velocity 108 variability does not considerably limit estimates of flux variability, because the contribu-109 tion from k is minor. On some intermediate critical timescale between interannual and 110 multidecadal, flux variability transitions from a regime that is k- and $\Delta p CO_2$ -controlled 111 to purely $\Delta p CO_2$ -controlled. Presently, neither the magnitude of this critical timescale 112 nor its spatial structure are known, yet both are needed to understand where uncertainties 113 in $\Delta p CO_2$ and k add uncertainty in derived fluxes. 114

Here, we attribute CO_2 flux variability to contributions from all flux equation components on a range of timescales, to identify the timescales where k becomes unimportant. We hypothesise that on interannual and shorter timescales, both k and ΔpCO_2 will both

DRAFT

be important in controlling flux variability, but that for longer term variability, $\Delta p CO_2$ 118 will be the dominant contributor. We examine 150 years of ocean biogeochemical model 119 output, forced with two scenarios: 1) sharply rising, following historical measurements 120 and RCP 8.5 [*Riahi et al.*, 2011] and 2) fixed preindustrial atmospheric CO₂ concentra-121 tions. First, we determine that our setup is appropriate to test our hypothesis, comparing 122 observed and modelled variability. Next, we compare our model's representation of inter-123 annual flux variability with those of previous studies, before expanding our methodology 124 to examine more specific timescales of variability. We then identify which long timescales 125 of flux variability, if any, are driven entirely by the $\Delta p CO_2$ contribution, with negligible 126 influence from k. Finally, we examine how successfully one can estimate flux variability 127 with only a very limited knowledge of the contribution of k. 128

2. Methods

2.1. Model Setup

We investigate the controls of ocean carbon flux variability on different time scales 129 using a numerical ocean general circulation model (GCM); version 3.2 of the Nucleus 130 for European Modelling of the Ocean (NEMO) physical ocean model [Madec, 2008]. This 131 model includes sea-ice; version 2 of the Louvain-la-Nueve Ice Model (LIM2, [Timmermann 132 et al., 2005]). NEMO was run with a 1° horizontal resolution using the ORCA-1 grid 133 [Madec and Imbard, 1996]. This grid is not sufficient to resolve the mesoscale, but has a 134 finer scale of about $1/3^{\circ}$ of latitude at the equator to better represent equatorial upwelling. 135 The grid has 292×362 horizontal points and 64 vertical levels (with smaller spacing at 136 the surface, increasing with depth). 137

DRAFT

April 13, 2016, 11:39am

NEMO is coupled with an intermediate-complexity ecosystem model, MEDUSA 2.0 138 [Yool et al., 2013a]. MEDUSA 2.0 separately simulates "large" organisms (mesozooplank-139 ton and microphytoplankton like diatoms) and "small" ecosystem members (to represent 140 the microbial loop). MEDUSA 2.0 resolves nitrogen, silicon, iron, carbon, alkalinity and 141 oxygen cycles. The model includes representations of sinking of detrital matter and ben-142 thic interactions. The Nightingale et al. [2000] gas transfer velocity parameterization is 143 used, with the Schmidt number of Wanninkhof [1992]. This parameterization is com-144 monly used as it is considered to be one of the more robust; the function shows a high 145 proportion (82%) the variance of dual-tracer release data explained by wind speed [Ho 146 et al., 2011]. 147

Output from the HadGEM2-ES Earth system model is used as the atmospheric forc-148 ing set [Yool et al., 2013b]. HadGEM2-ES includes physical models of the ocean and 149 atmosphere, the terrestrial and ocean carbon cycles, tropospheric chemistry and aerosols 150 [Collins et al., 2011]. The surface fluxes of heat, momentum and freshwater, and atmo-151 spheric chemistry from HadGEM2-ES were used to force NEMO at 6-hourly intervals. 152 The atmospheric forcing set for the 'anthropogenic' run prescribes concentrations of at-153 mospheric CO_2 (and other greenhouse gases: methane, nitrous oxide and halocarbons) 154 following RCP 8.5 [Jones et al., 2011]. RCP 8.5 is a high greenhouse gas emissions sce-155 nario, with atmospheric pCO_2 exceeding 900ppm by the year 2100 [*Riahi et al.*, 2011] 156 (Figure 1a, green curve). This prescribed anthropogenic source of greenhouse gases into 157 the atmosphere affects the radiative forcing balance and causes a net rise in global tem-158 peratures, including Sea Surface Temperature (SST) (Figure 1b). The integration was 159 run for 240 years. 160

DRAFT

April 13, 2016, 11:39am

X - 10

A control run was also generated using a very similar setup to the experimental run, 161 except with a different atmospheric pCO_2 scenario. In this run, atmospheric pCO_2 is 162 held at a preindustrial value of 286 ppmv (Figure 1a, red curve). Only 30 years of this 163 forcing set (i.e. output from HadGEM2-ES run with fixed preindustrial atmospheric 164 CO_2) were available to force NEMO-MEDUSA. Therefore, to obtain a comparable 240 165 year control run, NEMO-MEDUSA was forced with eight repetitions of the forcing set. 166 The control provides insight into the system's internal variability, without forced changes 167 in the radiation budget (observable in global mean SST: Figure 1, right panel) and global 168 biogeochemistry. Internal variability in the control run on timescales longer than 30 years 169 is evident (e.g. in atmospheric pCO_2 and SST, Figure 1, red curves), but given the forcing 170 setup of this run, it is not included in our analysis. 171

2.2. Decomposition of CO₂ Flux Variability

To explore the drivers behind CO₂ flux variability, we use a Reynolds decomposition to separate the time-varying (y') and time-mean (\bar{y}) components of monthly averaged model output, as in equation (2). The time-varying component is therefore the monthly anomaly from a time mean, representing non-seasonal variability.

$$y = y' + \overline{y} \tag{2}$$

The flux of CO_2 is the product of three variables, equation (1). Therefore, a Reynolds decomposition for three forcing components is needed. The generalised decomposition for three components and its expansion is shown in equations (3-5), where *a*, *b* and *c* are the forcing components, corresponding to the three RHS variables in equation (1).

DRAFT April 13	, 2016, 11:39am	DRAFI
----------------	-----------------	-------

$$y = abc \tag{3}$$

$$y' + \bar{y} = (a' + \bar{a})(b' + \bar{b})(c' + \bar{c})$$
(4)

$$= \bar{a}\bar{b}\bar{c} + a'\bar{b}\bar{c} + \bar{a}b'\bar{c} + \bar{a}\bar{b}c' + \bar{a}b'c' + a'\bar{b}c' + a'b'\bar{c} + a'b'c'$$

$$\tag{5}$$

The time-mean component, \bar{y} , is time mean of each of the RHS terms in equation (5), as in equation (6). Terms in equation (6) containing the time means of two forcing components $(\overline{a'bc}, \overline{ab'c} \text{ and } \overline{abc'})$ always have values of zero, giving equation (7).

$$\bar{y} = \overline{\bar{a}\bar{b}\bar{c}} + \overline{a'\bar{b}\bar{c}} + \overline{\bar{a}b'\bar{c}} + \overline{\bar{a}\bar{b}c'} + \overline{\bar{a}\bar{b}c'} + \overline{a'\bar{b}c'} + \overline{a'b'\bar{c}} + \overline{a'b'c'}$$
(6)

$$= \bar{a}b\bar{c} + \bar{a}b'c' + a'bc' + \bar{a'b'}\bar{c} + \bar{a'b'c'}$$

$$\tag{7}$$

¹⁸³ We subtract \bar{y} from both sides of equation (5) to solve for the time-varying component ¹⁸⁴ of y, equations (8-9). This gives an expression for y' in terms of the contributions from ¹⁸⁵ separate components, equation (10). Note that $\overline{a}\overline{b}\overline{c} = \overline{a}\overline{b}\overline{c}$, so the difference between the ¹⁸⁶ two terms cancels to zero in equation (10).

$$y' = y - \bar{y}$$

$$= (\bar{a}\bar{b}\bar{c} + a'\bar{b}\bar{c} + \bar{a}b'\bar{c} + \bar{a}\bar{b}c' + \bar{a}b'c' + a'\bar{b}c' + a'b'\bar{c} + a'b'c')$$

$$-(\bar{a}\bar{b}\bar{c} + \bar{a}\bar{b}c' + \bar{a}'\bar{b}c' + \bar{a}'b'\bar{c} + \bar{a}'b'c')$$

$$= a'\bar{b}\bar{c} + \bar{a}b'\bar{c} + \bar{a}\bar{b}c' + (a'b'c' - \bar{a}'\bar{b}c') + (a'b'\bar{c} - \bar{a}'\bar{b}'\bar{c})$$

$$(9)$$

$$+(a'\bar{b}c' - \overline{a'\bar{b}c'}) + (\bar{a}b'c' - \overline{\bar{a}b'c'}) \tag{10}$$

DRAFT April 13, 2016, 11:39am DRAFT

¹⁸⁷ We arrive at an equation for flux anomalies by expressing anomalies in the flux equation ¹⁸⁸ (1) using the expansion in equation (10):

$$F' = \underbrace{\Delta pCO_{2}'\bar{k}\bar{\alpha}}_{term1} + \underbrace{\Delta pCO_{2}k'\bar{\alpha}}_{term2} + \underbrace{\Delta pCO_{2}\bar{k}\alpha'}_{term3} + \underbrace{(\Delta pCO_{2}'k'\bar{\alpha} - \overline{\Delta pCO_{2}'k'\bar{\alpha}})}_{term4} + \underbrace{(\Delta pCO_{2}'\bar{k}\alpha' - \overline{\Delta pCO_{2}'\alpha'\bar{k}})}_{term5} + \underbrace{(\Delta pCO_{2}k'\alpha' - \overline{\Delta pCO_{2}'k'\alpha'})}_{term6} + \underbrace{(\Delta pCO_{2}'k'\alpha' - \overline{\Delta pCO_{2}'k'\alpha'})}_{term7}$$

$$(11)$$

The physical interpretation of these terms is the anomaly in CO_2 flux from a long term 189 monthly mean produced by variability in $\Delta p CO_2$ (term 1), in k (term 2) and in α (term 190 3) and through non-linear interactions between components (terms 4 to 7). Rather than 191 consider each of the cross terms (terms 4 to 7) in equation (11) separately, we consider their 192 sum as one term. This is because the role of the cross terms (even when added together) 193 in controlling F' is minor, demonstrated in section 4.1. When summed, the decomposed 194 contributions reliably reconstruct monthly mean fluxes, suggesting that the decomposition 195 is not compromised by covariances between components of the flux equation and synoptic 196 scale variability. 197

To investigate how much each term in equation (11) contributes to variability in F', we regress the values of terms 1, 2 and 3 at each gridpoint for each month against the monthly flux anomaly at that gridpoint. This method is detailed further by *Doney et al.* [2007] and *Doney et al.* [2009]. For example, to solve for the change in y' due to the first forcing component $a'\bar{b}\bar{c}$, we regress the former against the latter:

$$\frac{\partial y'}{\partial a'\bar{b}\bar{c}} = \beta_a \tag{12}$$

April 13, 2016, 11:39am D R A F T

X - 13

This yields a slope, β , which quantifies how strongly a given RHS term in equation (11) 203 contributes to anomalies in the CO_2 flux. In equation (12), the subscripted *a* denotes 204 that in this example, β_a signifies the change in y' with respect to variability in the forcing 205 component, a. β close to one indicates that a term contributes strongly to the value of 206 F', whereas a slope of 0 shows that F' is insensitive to that term. Values of β may be less 207 than 0 if a term is anticorrelated with F'. In such cases, one or more terms will have slopes 208 greater than 1 to compensate for a different β being smaller than 0. In general, $\Sigma \beta = 1$ 209 (i.e. the linearity assumption of the regression) does not hold due to cross-correlations, 210 but we find that the sum of all slopes is predominantly in the range $0.8 < \Sigma\beta < 1$. This 211 suggests that the assumption of linearity in the response of y' to its predictors is effectively 212 met. 213

3. Validation

Previous work has compared output from MEDUSA 2.0 to biogeochemical observations 214 on global and regional scales in more detail [Yool et al., 2013a], which we briefly summarise 215 before elaborating our own validation. In general, the model captures much of the spatial 216 and seasonal patterns of primary productivity, but shows a low bias in the subtropics, a 217 high bias in high nutrient/low chlorophyll regions and underestimates the strength of the 218 North Atlantic spring bloom. MEDUSA 2.0 tends to show 'higher highs' of surface DIC 219 than the GLODAP [Takahashi et al., 2009] fields ([Yool et al., 2013a], their Figure 16), 220 but the broader spatial patterns are well reproduced. Similarly, air-sea $\Delta p CO_2$ seasonal 221 highs and lows are somewhat exaggerated, particularly the North Atlantic winter ([Yool 222 et al., 2013a], their Figures 21 and 22). While these findings are useful to bear in mind, 223

DRAFT

²²⁴ our study focuses on carbon flux variability on interannual and longer timescales that has ²²⁵ not been thoroughly validated.

We first assess the ability of our setup to reproduce the major spatial features of the cli-226 matological CO_2 flux by comparing observational time-mean fluxes (the Lamont-Doherty 227 Earth Observatory, or LDEO flux climatology [Takahashi et al., 2009]) with model output 228 (Figure 2). The most prominent large-scale features are well represented in our model: 229 low latitude efflux and high latitude influx. Some of the largest discrepancies between the 230 model and observations occur in the South Pacific, where measurements are sparse. For 231 the purposes of our study, these differences are unimportant, since we focus on the North 232 Atlantic. After interpolating the model North Atlantic CO_2 flux climatology onto the 233 coarser grid of the Takahashi observational climatology, the two can be compared quanti-234 tatively. The North Atlantic climatological CO_2 flux is one of the best represented basins 235 in our setup; here, the model somewhat underestimates high values of flux, but otherwise 236 the two are well correlated (with a correlation coefficient r value of 0.80, p < 0.01) (Figure 237 2c). 238

Next, we attempt to validate the model's temporal variability. Direct CO_2 flux obser-239 vations representing large spatial and temporal scales do not exist, so instead we validate 240 our model's fCO_2 fields (CO₂ fugacity is almost equivalent to pCO_2 , but is scaled for 241 the non-ideal nature of real world gases). We compare our model output against 1) the 242 SOCAT database of surface $f CO_2$ observations (which maximises spatial coverage at the 243 expense of temporal length) [Bakker et al., 2014] and 2) data collected at the BATS site 244 (to compare variability on the longest timescale possible, although only for a limited area). 245 We compare fields of $f CO_2$ rather than $\Delta p CO_2$ because in our setup, the atmospheric 246

DRAFT

 pCO_2 only varies with the increase prescribed under RCP8.5, and so all of the modelled ΔpCO_2 variability arises from the oceanic side. Spatial and temporal (other than the trend) variability in atmospheric pCO_2 are omitted in our setup, but are small (order 1-10ppm) in comparison to the oceanic pCO_2 variability of interest (order 10-100ppm) [Wanninkhof et al., 2013].

We compare our model output with $1 \times 1^{\circ}$ monthly mean gridded $f CO_2$ fields from the 252 SOCAT database (version 2) [Bakker et al., 2014]. For this comparison, we first regrid 253 our model output onto the SOCAT grid. Although the dataset includes values from the 254 1970s, the most consistent temporal coverage in the North Atlantic is between 2002 and 255 2011. We chose three locations in zonally distinct regions on the basis that they had the 256 most complete set of observations for this period. We select data from $5 \times 5^{\circ}$ degree areas 257 across the North Atlantic (subtropical: northeast of the Carribbean, mid-latitude: east 258 of the Bay of Biscay, and high-latitude: south of Greenland/Iceland) to compare against 259 our model output (Figure 3a, orange boxes). The comparison is insensitive to the exact 260 location of the boxes (shifting their positions by a few degrees gives similar results), and 261 the time period of model output used. It was not possible to apply this comparison to 262 the equatorial Atlantic, as there were insufficient monthly mean $f CO_2$ values (Figure 3a). 263 We calculate a monthly climatology of time mean $f \text{CO}_2$ fields (Figure 3b, d and f), and 264 monthly anomalies from this climatology for the 2002-2011 period. We then calculate 265 frequency spectra of the fCO_2 anomalies for each box (Figure 3c, e and g). Data gaps 266 were filled with that month's mean value, plus the contribution of the linear trend. Where 267 gaps existed in the SOCAT data, the model output was accordingly subsampled and the 268 resulting gaps were filled in the same way as for the observations. 269

DRAFT

COULDREY ET AL.: CARBON FLUX CONTROLS

Clear differences exist between the modelled and observed seasonal cycles of $f CO_2$ 270 (Figure 3b, d and f). These differences are unimportant for our study, which does not focus 271 on seasonal variability. The comparison between the frequency spectra of the model output 272 and the observations is similar across all boxes: high frequency (short timescale) variability 273 is similar or slightly higher in observations, and low frequencies (long timescales) show 274 slightly more energy in the model. The discrepancies at high frequencies are unsurprising, 275 as the observations will reflect features that are unresolved by the model, such as mesoscale 276 eddies. Although the fCO_2 variability at low frequencies is larger in the model, the 277 agreement with observations is within a factor of 2. 278

The carbon system data collected at BATS, Bermuda (64° W, 31.5° N), are among the 279 longest and most consistent, covering the years 1991 to 2011. The seasonal cycle am-280 plitudes of all four parameters are well resolved in the model, with systematic offsets in 281 salinity and alkalinity (Figure 4c, e). Non-seasonal variability is well represented (Figure 282 4b, d, f and h). As with the SOCAT-NEMO comparison, there is substantial high fre-283 quency variability in the observations not present in the model output, since the former 284 represents snapshots of real world features, while the latter represents monthly-mean out-285 put from a $1 \times 1^{\circ}$ model grid cell. Overall, the model tends to underestimate sub-annual 286 variability, but captures the amplitudes on longer timescales that are relevant for this 287 study. 288

The gas transfer velocity is primarily a function of wind speed, so it is important that our setup reproduces realistic wind fields and variability. Other work has explored the performance of the HadGEM2 models more generally [*Martin et al.*, 2011; *Collins et al.*, 2011]. We compare the wind fields used to force NEMO-MEDUSA with monthly mean

DRAFT

Cross-Calibrated Multiplatform (CCMP) sea surface (10m) winds [Atlas et al., 2011], 293 which cover the period 1988-2011. CCMP zonal wind speed variability is similar to other 294 products' [Wanninkhof et al., 2013], and so our comparison would likely produce similar 295 results if other wind datasets were chosen. We regrid the data from its $0.25 \times 0.25^{\circ}$ grid onto 296 a $1 \times 1^{\circ}$ grid for comparison with our model output. We construct a monthly climatology 297 and fields of anomalies of wind speeds. Similarly to the other aspects of the validation, 298 we construct frequency spectra of the model and observation anomaly fields (Figure 5). 299 In general, agreement between the model and observations is good for variability with 300 frequencies higher than 0.25 year^{-1} , and somewhat poorer for lower frequencies (longer 301 timescales). In the subpolar and polar North Atlantic, the model underestimates low 302 frequency wind variability. 303

4. Results

4.1. The roles of flux components in interannual variability

In this section, we investigate the drivers behind interannual CO₂ flux variability, quantifying the contributions of its components, $\Delta p CO_2$, k and α . This approach builds on the methodology of *Doney et al.* [2009], attributing interannual flux variability to each component. First, we establish that our model setup is able to represent CO₂ flux variability comparable to previous estimates using the portion of the simulation which overlaps the observational record.

To assess global CO_2 flux interannual variability, we calculate the root mean square (RMS) or standard deviation of globally integrated monthly flux anomalies. From monthly averaged CO_2 flux fields at each gridpoint, we subtract a long-term mean flux (spanning 1980-2009) for each month to generate anomaly fields. For this time period, variability is

DRAFT April 13, 2016, 11:39am DRAFT

insensitive to the choice of RCP because the scenarios have not yet substantially diverged 314 [Myhre et al., 2013]. We globally integrate those flux anomalies, and calculate the square 315 root of the mean squared anomaly, yielding the RMS. The metric is quite sensitive to 316 the duration over which it is calculated. We calculate the RMS over a similar time 317 period to other studies (1980 to 2009), finding a value of 0.29 Pg C yr⁻¹, comparable 318 previous estimates (Table 1). Two recent observational estimates of interannual flux 319 variability differ by a factor of two ([Rödenbeck et al., 2014] and [Landschützer et al., 320 2014]), which the authors attribute to differing time periods of study. Landschützer et al. 321 [2014] comment that their data do not cover the strong 1997/1998 El Niño period, which 322 made the *Rödenbeck et al.* [2014] estimate much larger. 323

Qualitatively, our setup captures many of the key regional hotspots of interannual vari-324 ability between 1980-2009 (Figure 6a): the equatorial Pacific, the subpolar and subtropical 325 oceans, and the south Southern Ocean [e.g. Doney et al., 2009; Rödenbeck et al., 2014]. 326 The North Atlantic is a notable region for its large interannual CO_2 flux variability. The 327 areas with the strongest variability $(>1.0 \text{ mol m}^{-2} \text{ yr}^{-1})$ are in the subpolar gyre, along 328 the sea ice edge of the Labrador Sea, along the Greenland coast and along the path of the 329 North Atlantic Current (NAC). The subtropical gyre shows a relatively moderate level 330 of variability (up to 1 mol $m^{-2} yr^{-1}$) which decays with distance from the NAC. The 331 equatorial Atlantic shows the lowest overall CO_2 flux variability. 332

To investigate the causes of the interannual variability illustrated in Figure 6a, we estimate the contribution of each component of the flux equation (1) using the linear expansion of F' (equation (11)). At each grid point for all months, we calculate the contribution of each term in equation (11). Taking each of these contributions, we regress

DRAFT

them against the gridpoint's monthly CO₂ flux anomalies (F') to quantify the influence of that particular term on F', as in equation (12). This allows us to compare the contributions of Δp CO₂, k, α and the cross terms (Figure 6b-e, respectively) to variability in F'.

Over much the global ocean, $\Delta p CO_2$ is the most important contributor to interannual 341 CO_2 flux variability (Figure 6b), in agreement with the findings of *Doney et al.* [2009]. 342 The global area-weighted mean $\Delta p CO_2$ contribution is 0.20 mol m⁻² yr⁻¹; about 60% 343 of the global interannual CO_2 flux variability. The role of k is also important in almost 344 all regions, contributing about 35% of global interannual flux variability, but is the most 345 significant where the role of $\Delta p CO_2$ is smaller (6c). Indeed, Figure 6b and c mirror each 346 other, since nearly all interannual variability in the CO_2 flux comes from variability in 347 either $\Delta p CO_2$ or k. This is because the contributions from α and the cross terms are 348 minor (Figure 6d and e). Furthermore, most of the variability observed when considering 349 k and α together as one component comes from k, as was assumed by Doney et al. [2009]. 350 Many of the locations where k is an important driver behind interannual CO_2 flux 351 variability coincide with the edges of the seasonally ice-covered oceans. This is because 352 k is scaled by the proportion of each ocean grid cell area that is ice-free. Away from ice 353 edges, k is an important control on F' in such locations as the tropical Pacific and the 354 storm track of the North Atlantic (and to a lesser extent the Pacific). Here, interannual 355 variability in winds is considerable, probably associated with low-frequency modes of 356 climate variability such as the ENSO and the NAO, respectively. 357

Overall, this analysis yields findings that agree with many of those of *Doney et al.* ³⁵⁹ [2009] insofar as that interannual variability in the global oceanic flux of CO₂ is controlled

DRAFT

primarily by $\Delta p CO_2$, but that k contributes about 40% of this. In the following section, we build upon these findings, exploring the longer multiannual to multidecadal timescales of variability, with an emphasis on the North Atlantic.

4.2. Critical timescale of $\Delta p CO_2$ dominance of CO_2 flux variability

In this section we identify at what time scale, if any, does variability in F become dom-363 inated by variability in $\Delta p CO_2$. To explore which parameters dominate flux variability 364 over specific timescales, we average each component's contributions (i.e. $\Delta pCO'_2 \bar{k}\bar{\alpha}$ for 365 the contribution of $\Delta p CO_2$, etc.) over various zonal areas to obtain mean contributions 366 on the sub-basin scale. We define zones as polar (Baffin Bay and the Greenland-Iceland-367 Norwegian, or GIN, Sea), subpolar (60° N-35° N), subtropical (35° N-10° N) and equa-368 torial (10° N-10° S) (Figure 7a). We construct frequency spectra of these zonal mean 369 contributions to quantify the energy of each contribution at specific timescales. Since 370 the contributions from each component are in units of CO_2 flux (mmol m⁻² d⁻¹), one 371 can compare their magnitudes directly. We also employ Welch's method of segmenting 372 signals to better constrain estimates of the spectra [Welch, 1967]. Briefly, this involves 373 segmenting a signal into shorter segments of equal length, calculating the spectra of each 374 segment and then averaging over all segments' spectra to obtain one more robust estimate 375 of the spectrum. In our case, we segment the 150 year series of zonally averaged CO_2 flux 376 anomalies and the contribution from k into 5 non-overlapping segments of 30 year length. 377 This method improves the confidence intervals of the spectrum calculated at the cost of 378 being unable to solve for variability on timescales longer than the segment length. This is 379 because the timescales of interest correspond to the lowest frequencies of variability, and 380 so we plot the spectra in period space to highlight this end of the domain. 381

Across the North Atlantic, most of the variability in CO_2 flux is attributable to the

382

contribution from either $\Delta p CO_2$ or k; the roles of α and the cross terms are minor (not 383 shown). Therefore, almost all of the spectral energy in CO_2 flux anomalies (Figure 7b-e, 384 blue lines) that does not correspond with the spectrum of k (red) is attributable to the 385 contribution from $\Delta p CO_2$. In other words, where the energy in CO_2 flux anomalies is 386 high, but the energy of k's contribution is lower, most of the discrepancy comes from 387 the contribution of $\Delta p CO_2$. In general, the long period CO_2 flux variability comes from 388 the variability of $\Delta p CO_2$, rather than k. We quantify the CO_2 flux variability that is 389 dominated by the contribution from $\Delta p CO_2$ as being the shortest period of variability 390 where the amplitude of F' variability is at least twice as large as the contribution from 391 k for all longer periods. A factor of two was chosen as it identifies the point at which a 392 clear majority (at least half) of flux variability is attributable to the $\Delta p CO_2$ contribution. 393 To do this, we search along the spectrum from long to short periods for the first period 394 where the spectrum of F' is equal to or less than double the energy of the contribution 395 from k. The vertical dashed lines in Figure 7b-e show the value of this critical timescale 396 for each zonal band. If this number is small, then it means a wider band of long period 397 CO_2 flux variability is controlled entirely by $\Delta p CO_2$. 398

In the equatorial and subtropical latitudes, a very wide band of long-period variability in CO₂ flux is controlled by Δp CO₂ (all timescales to the right of the vertical dashed lines in Figure 7c-e). That is to say that the roles of k and α are negligible for these long periods. The same is also true at subpolar latitudes, but the band of timescales is narrower: approximately decadal and longer-term variability in CO₂ flux is almost entirely controlled by Δp CO₂. The separation of the (95% confidence) error envelopes

DRAFT April 13, 2016, 11:39am DRAFT

around the best estimates of the subpolar, subtropical and equatorial spectra (darker 405 blue and pink lines) indicate that the differences between the spectra at the large-period 406 end are significant. For the polar zone, both $\Delta p CO_2$ and k have an important role in 407 driving flux variability for all timescales longer than interannual (even without curtailing 408 the series length by segmentation), and so there is no long period dominated by $\Delta p CO_2$. 409 In addition to the strong influence of $\Delta p CO_2$, there is also long period variability in k. 410 As k is scaled by sea-ice cover, a negative trend in ice area (in response to a warming 411 climate) will therefore force F' in the long term at high latitudes. Such a decline has been 412 documented in this model setup [Yool et al., 2013b]. Taken over the whole North Atlantic, 413 we find that flux variability on pentadal and longer timescales is greatly dominated by the 414 influence of $\Delta p CO_2$, and k contributes to less than quarter of long period flux variability. 415 To more fully interpret the spectra of zonally averaged contributions, it is helpful to 416 examine the critical timescale of $\Delta p CO_2$ dominance at each grid point for the anthro-417 pogenic run (Figure 8a). At the grid-point scale, one can infer which physical phenomena 418 give rise to the spectra in Figure 7. The polar zone in both runs is dominated by points 419 with no long timescale of $\Delta p CO_2$ dominance: much of Baffin Bay and the western GIN 420 Sea. These regions are strongly influenced by sea ice, but in the eastern ice-free GIN Sea 421 long-period variability is dominated by $\Delta p CO_2$. 422

The subpolar zone features a soutwest-to-northeast band of gridpoints whose flux variability is only dominated by $\Delta p CO_2$ on multidecadal timescales (higher than elsewhere in the basin). This location coincides with the southern boundary of the NAC. Here, there is long period variability in wind speeds in the model, which drives the critical timescale

DRAFT

⁴²⁷ of $\Delta p CO_2$ dominance in the subpolar zone (~10 years) to be longer than the subtropical ⁴²⁸ or equatorial zones (~3 and ~1 years respectively).

We also estimate the critical timescale using observations in the three locations described 429 in section 3. In the three 5-by-5 degree areas with the largest number of SOCAT monthly 430 mean $f CO_2$ values, we construct and decompose CO_2 fluxes using these $f CO_2$ data (as in 431 Figure 3), monthly mean CCMP winds, SST values from the EN4 gridded dataset [Good 432 et al., 2013], and atmospheric pCO_2 from Mauna Loa, Hawai'i [Thoning et al., 2014]. In 433 these locations, there is a sufficient history of ocean $f CO_2$ data to determine the critical 434 timescale: 2 years in the subtropical box, 0.5 years in the mid-latitude box and 4 years 435 in the high latitude box (values shown as color within black squares in Figure 8a). These 436 values are comparable to those determined using model output in the same locations; 4.6, 437 3.7 and 4.6 years, respectively. 438

By examining the same metric for the control run, we can learn the extent to which 439 $\Delta p CO_2$ controls natural variability in the global ocean, without the influence of antho-440 pogenic CO₂ input. For much of the North Atlantic, Δp CO₂ variability controls most 441 of the CO_2 flux variability in the control run (Figure 8b). Due to the construction of 442 the control run, it is not possible to comment on variability on timescales longer than 443 30 years, yet this period is sufficiently longer than the $\Delta p CO_2$ critical timescale for most 444 of the ice-free North Atlantic. This means that natural, internal ocean multiannual CO_2 445 flux variability is quite insensitive to the contribution from k, and therefore that much of 446 the control exerted by the $\Delta p CO_2$ is not purely the product of anthropogenic emissions. 447 In other words, the strong influence of the $\Delta p CO_2$ in many parts of the North Atlantic 448 is naturally occurring, and not purely due to rising atmospheric carbon concentrations. 449

DRAFT

Such variability in $\Delta p \text{CO}_2$ may arise without a rise in atmospheric pCO2 due to ocean circulation (particularly horizontal and vertical advection). Advection acts to reorganise the surface inventories of heat, DIC and alkalinity, thereby modulating ocean $p\text{CO}_2$ [Doney et al., 2009; Halloran et al., 2015].

4.3. CO_2 flux estimation with simplified k

Here, we explore the extent to which flux variability can be reliably estimated in cir-454 cumstances where we have a minimal knowledge of the variability in gas transfer velocity. 455 In section 1, some of the uncertainties associated with k were outlined. A key question is 456 understanding the extent to which those uncertainties limit our ability to estimate oceanic 457 CO_2 flux variability. We can approximate equation (11) by assuming that variations in 458 the gas transfer velocity (k') and the role of the cross terms (terms 4 to 7) are small 459 (demonstrated in section 4.2). Under these assumptions, terms 2, 4, 5, 6, and 7 vanish, 460 yielding equation (13). 461

$$F' \approx \Delta p C O_2' \bar{k} \bar{\alpha} + \overline{\Delta p C O_2} \bar{k} \alpha' \tag{13}$$

If these assumptions are valid and equation (13) is a reasonable approximation, the uncertainties associated with k would also become irrelevant in the determination of flux variability. This estimation would be useful in estimating multidecadal flux variability using limited observations, or simple box models. The 'true' simulated CO₂ flux is known in the model, and we are therefore able to determine the error due to the approximation in equation (13). By omitting some contributions, the estimated flux will necessarily have less variability than the actual flux. We therefore assess our estimation by quantifying

DRAFT April 13, 2016, 11:39am DRAFT

actual fluxes that are significant beyond a level of 95% confidence and 2) the proportion actual fluxes that are significant beyond a level of 95% confidence and 2) the proportion of the flux variability that is captured by the estimation relative to the model's actual flux variability. The error in observational reconstructions of CO_2 flux is likely to differ due to the parameterization of gas transfer in the model, but the model validation (section 3) indicates that the statistical properties of the error should be similar on interannual to decadal timescales.

The longest-term variability in the North Atlantic CO_2 flux is primarily controlled 476 by the positive trend in atmospheric pCO_2 . Correspondingly, the estimated CO_2 flux 477 correlates very closely with the model's actual series (Figure 9a). However, even without 478 this trend (as in the control run), the actual and estimated fluxes correlate well (Figure 479 9d). In general, the correlations are weaker in the control than in the anthropogenic run, 480 and several local minima are apparent; these also correspond to regions where variability 481 is generally small (Figure 9b and f). The good correlation between estimated and actual 482 fluxes in both the anthropogenic and control runs suggest that the estimation captures 483 the key patterns of flux variability; both anthropogenically and internally driven. 484

In addition to reproducing patterns of flux variability, it is also necessary for the estimation to correctly predict magnitudes. Since the estimation omits some contributions, it will naturally show either equal or lower variability than the actual flux. To quantify this, we show the ratio between the estimated and actual modelled CO_2 flux variability (as the RMS of monthly anomalies) (Figure 9c,f). Where the value is 1, the estimation reproduces all the modelled variability; values between 0 and 1 indicate the proportion of variability retained by the estimation. This metric indicates that the estimation is

DRAFT

robust at reproducing most of the modelled variability across the Atlantic, in both the
 anthropogenic and control runs.

The main area where the flux estimation fares poorly is in the ice-covered North At-494 Here, non-seasonal sea ice variability is an important control on fluxes. Our lantic. 495 estimation implicitly excludes interannual variability in the ice edge and the multidecadal 496 decline of ice extent, so the fluxes in the region are not well represented. To the south of 497 the NAC there are local minima in correlations and the RMS retained, which are more 498 pronounced in the control run than the anthropogenic. Although these areas are less well 499 estimated than elsewhere in the Atlantic, the variability in these regions is small, and so 500 flux variability on the basin and sub-basin scale will still be well captured. 501

5. Discussion

Presently, large uncertainties are introduced into calculated CO_2 fluxes via the gas 502 transfer velocity. The choice of wind speed parameterization can vary k by approximately 503 50% at global mean wind speeds ($\sim 7 \text{ m/s}$) and by 100% at speeds higher than 15 m/s 504 [e.g. Woolf, 2005]. The choice of wind product can affect k by 10-40% [Wanninkhof et al., 505 2002], and variability differs between products [Wanninkhof et al., 2013; Wanninkhof, 506 2014; Kent et al., 2013. The roles of breaking waves and bubbles are not taken into 507 account when using a purely wind speed-based parameterization of k, so these phenomena 508 introduce poorly constrained uncertainty [Prytherch et al., 2010]. Certainly, these factors 509 all limit our ability to accurately estimate CO_2 flux variability on interannual and shorter 510 timescales, and ongoing work is needed in these areas. 511

DRAFT

April 13, 2016, 11:39am

In the high-latitude North Atlantic, the gas transfer velocity controls CO_2 flux variabil-512 ity on longer timescales than elsewhere in the basin. In the regions of the Labrador Sea, 513 Baffin Bay, Denmark Strait and Fram Strait, sea ice cover is an important mediator of 514 gas exchange. Here, long period variability in sea ice cover controls CO_2 flux variability 515 via the gas transfer velocity, since k is scaled by the fraction of area that is ice-free. As 516 a result, there is no long period of variability over which $\Delta p CO_2$ predominantly controls 517 the carbon flux. Therefore, to accurately quantify estimates of the high-latitude North 518 Atlantic carbon flux, a detailed knowledge of sea ice dynamics is necessary. 519

Over the whole North Atlantic, pentadal and longer-term CO_2 flux variability is dom-520 inated by the influence of $\Delta p CO_2$. These longer timescales contrast the shorter, where 521 the role of k is crucial. This suggests that a detailed knowledge of the pentadal to multi-522 decadal control of k on F may not be necessary to quantify the longer term variability of 523 the North Atlantic carbon sink. This finding therefore lends support to the approaches of 524 studies such as that of *McKinley et al.* [2011], which attempt to make judgements about 525 multidecadal variability of the North Atlantic CO_2 sink based purely on pCO_2 observa-526 tions. In their study, it was found that the oceanic trend in pCO_2 converges to that of 527 the atmosphere when examined over the full 29 year period between 1981 and 2009, but 528 when only decadal timescales are considered the two trends differ. Therefore, if on these 529 same multidecadal timescales, the present day air-sea pCO_2 difference is maintained as 530 McKinley et al. [2011] suggest, then the North Atlantic CO_2 sink is approximately stable; 531 neither a decline nor an enhancement of the flux is apparent. Our work would support 532 this approach, since we find the roles of k and α in governing flux variability over this 533 timescale to be minor. 534

DRAFT

There is a broad increase in the critical timescale with latitude in the North Atlantic, 535 which is explainable in terms of wind speed variability. At the low latitudes, wind speed 536 variability is lower, increasing toward the poles (Figure 5). In addition, mean wind speeds 537 are higher at the poles than the equator, so a given magnitude of wind speed variability 538 at subpolar latitudes will produce greater variability in k than at the equator. This is 539 because k scales with the square of the wind speed in our setup [Nightingale et al., 2000]. 540 This zonal increase in k variability, in addition to the presence of sea ice at the highest 541 latitudes, is what causes the comparable zonal increase of the critical timescale (Figures 7 542 and 8). Furthermore, wind speed (and hence k) variability is a stronger control on carbon 543 fluxes in the control simulation than the anthropogenic run. This is because the control's 544 fixed atmospheric CO₂ concentration mean there is much less variability in Δp CO₂ (and 545 therefore also in the CO_2 flux) than in the anthropogenic run. As a result, wind speed 546 variability patterns become relatively more important in setting the critical timescale for 547 the control run than the anthropogenic (Figure 8). This means that k is a more important 548 controller of variability of preindustrial carbon fluxes, although not more important than 549 $\Delta p CO_2$ on pentadal and longer timescales. 550

⁵⁵¹ Through the comparison of modelled ocean $f \text{CO}_2$ fields against observations from SO-⁵⁵² CAT and Bermuda, it was shown that our setup underestimates variability on timescales ⁵⁵³ shorter than 1 year. This result is to be expected, since GCMs of this scale will tend ⁵⁵⁴ not to represent high frequency and small spatial-scale variability well [e.g. *Taylor et al.*, ⁵⁵⁵ 2012]. This could indicate that the $\Delta p \text{CO}_2$ contribution may be a stronger control on ⁵⁵⁶ fluxes on shorter timescales than our study suggests. Our forcing set underestimates ⁵⁵⁷ multiannual wind speed variability at high latitudes, which may be associated with an

DRAFT

⁵⁵⁸ inability to appropriately represent the NAO (an issue common to many GCMs [*Lee and* ⁵⁵⁹ *Black*, 2013]). This could cause the real world critical timescale to be longer than what ⁵⁶⁰ the model suggests. In the polar zone, the low bias does not affect the critical timescale, ⁵⁶¹ since k variability on all timescales is non-negligible. In the subpolar zone, the critical ⁵⁶² timescale may be underestimated, due to the low bias, yet the observation-derived critical ⁵⁶³ timescales are comparable to the model prediction (~1-5 years for all three locations, ⁵⁶⁴ using both model output and observations, Figure 8a).

Current ocean models (including NEMO-MEDUSA) do not derive k from the full range 565 of kinetic factors that control it, and instead parameterize it purely from wind speed. It is 566 likely then, that k variability on interannual and shorter timescales will be underestimated 567 too; since real-world, shorter timescale variability in processes as wave breaking and bubble 568 dynamics etc. is not represented in GCMs. Until a more thorough understanding of the 569 mechanisms underlying k is developed, we will not know exactly how important it is in 570 governing short timescale flux variability. While the unmodeled factors are very likely 571 strong controls on k on short timescales, it is not clear if their variability on longer 572 timescales (decadal and longer) is large, relative to the effect of wind speed. If on these 573 long timescales k variability is dominated by the contribution from wind speed, then 574 wind speed parameterizations of k should be sufficient to estimate decadal gas transfer 575 variability. 576

It is worth exploring the caveat that we have derived our findings from GCM output. One could expect that other models and configurations would yield slightly different timescales for the emergence of $\Delta p CO_2$ dominance of flux variability. Yet our choice of model and setup appears reliable for the purposes of our study. This experiment has been

DRAFT

shown to produce interannual flux variability comparable to other models as well as obser-581 vational estimates (Table 1). In addition, it captures real world multiannual $f CO_2$ variance 582 (Figures 3 and 4) and a reasonable degree of wind speed variability (Figure 5 and [Lee 583 and Black, 2013). Therefore, other models similarly capable of representing multiannual 584 flux, $f CO_2$ and wind variability would likely give results consistent with those presented 585 here, even if the mechanisms underlying that variability differ. Finally, the choice of gas 586 transfer velocity parameterization can have some effect on the critical timescale derived. 587 Functions [e.g. McGillis et al., 2001] that produce a wider range of k values over the 588 most commonly occurring wind speed range (3 to 15 m/s [Wanninkhof, 2014]) impart 589 greater variability into the CO_2 flux, and so would increase the critical timescale. Many 590 of the most commonly used parameterizations, however, show the greatest concordance 591 of derived k values over the range of commonly occurring wind speeds, and so the critical 592 timescale is generally insensitive to the choice of function (see Supporting Information). 593 While we have clearly identified the roles of each of the components of the flux equation 594 in governing F variability, our methodology only hints at which underlying processes are 595

⁵⁹⁶ important. To derive a more complete and mechanistic understanding of the controls on ⁵⁹⁷ carbon flux variability, further work is necessary. A very broad range of physical, chemical ⁵⁹⁸ and biological processes cause ocean pCO_2 variability, and so future work should seek ⁵⁹⁹ to quantify the relative importance of these drivers, while attributing them to specific ⁶⁰⁰ timescales of variability.

DRAFT

April 13, 2016, 11:39am

6. Conclusions

We have examined the relative importance of the three components of the air-sea CO_2 601 flux equation $(k, \Delta p CO_2 \text{ and } \alpha)$ in controlling flux variability on a range of timescales. In 602 the North Atlantic, as for much of the global ocean, we find that sub-annual to interannual 603 variability in $\Delta p CO_2$ and k both have important roles in controlling the air-sea carbon 604 flux, in agreement with previous work (e.g. [Doney et al., 2009]). On these timescales, it 605 is critical to obtain estimates of $\Delta p CO_2$ and k for accurate flux variability to be derived. 606 On pentadal and longer timescales, variability in k is not important, and can be ignored 607 when estimating flux variability. The critical timescale increases from interannual at low 608 latitudes to decadal at high latitudes. 609

Acknowledgments. The authors are grateful for the input of two reviewers, whose 610 feedback improved the clarity and strength of this manuscript. This work was supported 611 the RAGNAROCC NERC directed research programme (NE/K002546/1, NE/K00249X/1 612 and NE/K002473/1). The observational data used are available via the relevant refer-613 ences that accompany them in the text. The authors are very grateful to those who have 614 produced and made freely available the CCMP, MLO Atmospheric CO₂, EN4, SOCAT, 615 LDEO Flux Climatology and BATS datasets. The Surface Ocean CO2 Atlas (SOCAT) is 616 an international effort, endorsed by the International Ocean Carbon Coordination Project 617 (IOCCP), the Surface Ocean Lower Atmosphere Study (SOLAS) and the Integrated Ma-618 rine Biogeochemistry and Ecosystem Research program (IMBER), to deliver a uniformly 619 quality-controlled surface ocean CO2 database. The many researchers and funding agen-620 cies responsible for the collection of data and quality control are thanked for their con-621

DRAFT

tributions to SOCAT. The model output used in this analysis is available as Supporting Information to this manuscript.

References

- ⁶²⁴ Atlas, R., R. N. Hoffman, J. Ardizzone, S. M. Leidner, J. C. Jusem, D. K. Smith, and
- ⁶²⁵ D. Gombos (2011), A cross-calibrated, multiplatform ocean surface wind velocity prod-
- ⁶²⁶ uct for meteorological and oceanographic applications, *Bulletin of the American Mete-*⁶²⁷ orological Society, 92(2), 157–174.
- Bakker, D., S. Hankin, A. Olsen, B. Pfeil, K. Smith, S. Alin, C. Cosca, B. Hales, S. Ha-
- rasawa, A. Kozyr, et al. (2014), An update to the Surface Ocean CO_2 Atlas (SOCAT version 2), *Earth System Science Data*, 6, 69–90.
- Bates, N., Y. Astor, M. Church, K. Currie, J. Dore, M. González-Dávila, MelchorálezDávila, L. Lorenzoni, F. Muller-Karger, J. Olafsson, and M. Santa-Casiano (2014), A
 time-series view of changing ocean chemistry due to ocean uptake of anthropogenic CO₂
 and ocean acidification, *Oceanography*, 27(1), 126–141.
- Bates, N. R. (2007), Interannual variability of the oceanic CO_2 sink in the subtropical gyre of the North Atlantic Ocean over the last 2 decades, *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 112(C9), C09,013.
- Bender, M. L., S. Kinter, N. Cassar, and R. Wanninkhof (2011), Evaluating gas transfer
 velocity parameterizations using upper ocean radon distributions, *Journal of Geophys- ical Research: Oceans (1978–2012), 116* (C2).
- 641 Ciais, P., C. Sabine, G. Bala, L. Bopp, V. Brovkin, J. Canadell, A. Chhabra, R. De-
- ⁶⁴² Fries, J. Galloway, M. Heimann, C. Jones, C. L. Quéré, R. B. Myneni, S. Piao, and

- P. Thornton (2013), IPCC, 2013: Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science Basis.
 Contribution of Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, chap. 6 Carbon and Other Biogeochemical Cycles,
 Cambridge University Press.
- 647 Collins, W., N. Bellouin, M. Doutriaux-Boucher, N. Gedney, P. Halloran, T. Hinton,
- J. Hughes, C. Jones, M. Joshi, S. Liddicoat, et al. (2011), Development and evaluation of an Earth-System model–HadGEM2, *Geoscientific Model Development*, 4(4), 1051– 1075.
- ⁶⁵¹ Doney, S. C., S. Yeager, G. Danabasoglu, W. G. Large, and J. C. McWilliams (2007),
- Mechanisms governing interannual variability of upper-ocean temperature in a global ocean hindcast simulation, *Journal of Physical Oceanography*, 37(7), 1918–1938.
- ⁶⁵⁴ Doney, S. C., I. Lima, R. A. Feely, D. M. Glover, K. Lindsay, N. Mahowald, J. K.
 ⁶⁵⁵ Moore, and R. Wanninkhof (2009), Mechanisms governing interannual variability in
 ⁶⁵⁶ upper-ocean inorganic carbon system and air-sea CO₂ fluxes: Physical climate and at⁶⁵⁷ mospheric dust, *Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography*, 56(8),
 ⁶⁵⁸ 640–655.
- Frew, N. M., D. M. Glover, E. J. Bock, and S. J. McCue (2007), A new approach to
 estimation of global air-sea gas transfer velocity fields using dual-frequency altimeter
 backscatter, *Journal of Geophysical Research: Oceans (1978–2012), 112* (C11).
- Good, S. A., M. J. Martin, and N. A. Rayner (2013), EN4: Quality controlled ocean
- temperature and salinity profiles and monthly objective analyses with uncertainty esti-
- mates, Journal of Geophysical Research: Oceans, 118(12), 6704–6716.

- Halloran, P. R., B. B. B. Booth, C. D. Jones, F. H. Lambert, D. J. McNeall, I. J. Totterdell, 665 and C. Völker (2015), The mechanisms of North Atlantic CO_2 uptake in a large Earth 666 System Model ensemble, *Biogeosciences*, 12(14), 4497–4508, doi:10.5194/bg-12-4497-667 2015.668
- Ho, D. T., R. Wanninkhof, P. Schlosser, D. S. Ullman, D. Hebert, and K. F. Sullivan 669 (2011), Toward a universal relationship between wind speed and gas exchange: Gas 670 transfer velocities measured with 3he/sf6 during the southern ocean gas exchange ex-671 periment, Journal of Geophysical Research: Oceans, 116(C4). 672
- Jones, C., J. Hughes, N. Bellouin, S. Hardiman, G. Jones, J. Knight, S. Liddicoat, 673
- F. O'Connor, R. J. Andres, C. Bell, et al. (2011), The HadGEM2-ES implementation 674 of CMIP5 centennial simulations, Geoscientific Model Development, 4(3), 543–570. 675
- Kent, E. C., S. Fangohr, and D. I. Berry (2013), A comparative assessment of monthly 676 mean wind speed products over the global ocean, International Journal of Climatology, 677 33(11), 2520-2541.678
- Khatiwala, S., F. Primeau, and T. Hall (2009), Reconstruction of the history of anthro-679 pogenic CO₂ concentrations in the ocean, Nature, 462(7271), 346-349. 680
- Landschützer, P., N. Gruber, D. Bakker, and U. Schuster (2014), Recent variability of the 681 global ocean carbon sink, Global Biogeochemical Cycles, 28(9), 927–949. 682
- Le Quéré, C., J. C. Orr, P. Monfray, O. Aumont, and G. Madec (2000), Interannual 683 variability of the oceanic sink of CO_2 from 1979 through 1997, Global Biogeochemical 684 *Cycles*, 14(4), 1247–1265, doi:10.1029/1999GB900049.
- Lee, Y.-Y., and R. X. Black (2013), Boreal winter low-frequency variability in CMIP5 686 models, Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 118(13), 6891–6904. 687

685

- Long, M. C., K. Lindsay, S. Peacock, J. K. Moore, and S. C. Doney (2013), Twentieth-Century oceanic carbon uptake and storage in CESM1 (BGC), *Journal of Climate*, 26(18), 6775–6800.
- ⁶⁹¹ Madec, G. (2008), NEMO reference manual, ocean dynamic component: NEMO-OPA, 27,
- ⁶⁹² Note du pôle de modélisation, Institut Pierre Simmon Laplace, France, Institut Pierre
 ⁶⁹³ Simmon Laplace, France.
- ⁶⁹⁴ Madec, G., and M. Imbard (1996), A global ocean mesh to overcome the North Pole ⁶⁹⁵ singularity, *Climate Dynamics*, 12(6), 381–388.
- Martin, G. M., N. Bellouin, W. J. Collins, I. D. Culverwell, P. R. Halloran, S. C. Hardiman,
- T. J. Hinton, C. D. Jones, R. E. McDonald, A. J. McLaren, F. M. O'Connor, M. J.
- Roberts, J. M. Rodriguez, S. Woodward, M. J. Best, M. E. Brooks, A. R. Brown,
- ⁶⁹⁹ N. Butchart, C. Dearden, S. H. Derbyshire, I. Dharssi, M. Doutriaux-Boucher, J. M.
- Edwards, P. D. Falloon, N. Gedney, L. J. Gray, H. T. Hewitt, M. Hobson, M. R.
- ⁷⁰¹ Huddleston, J. Hughes, S. Ineson, W. J. Ingram, P. M. James, T. C. Johns, C. E.
- Johnson, A. Jones, C. P. Jones, M. M. Joshi, A. B. Keen, S. Liddicoat, A. P. Lock,
- A. V. Maidens, J. C. Manners, S. F. Milton, J. G. L. Rae, J. K. Ridley, A. Sellar,
- C. A. Senior, I. J. Totterdell, A. Verhoef, P. L. Vidale, and A. Wiltshire (2011), The
- HadGEM2 family of Met Office Unified Model climate configurations, *Geoscientific*
- Model Development, 4(3), 723-757, doi:10.5194/gmd-4-723-2011.
- ⁷⁰⁷ McGillis, W., J. Edson, J. Hare, and C. Fairall (2001), Direct covariance air-sea CO₂
- ⁷⁰⁸ fluxes, Journal of Geophysical Research: Oceans (1978–2012), 106(C8), 16,729–16,745.
- ⁷⁰⁹ McKinley, G. A., M. J. Follows, and J. Marshall (2004), Mechanisms of air-sea CO₂
- ⁷¹⁰ flux variability in the equatorial Pacific and the North Atlantic, *Global Biogeochemical*

 $_{711}$ Cycles, 18(2).

- McKinley, G. A., A. R. Fay, T. Takahashi, and N. Metzl (2011), Convergence of atmospheric and North Atlantic carbon dioxide trends on multidecadal timescales, *Nature qeoscience*, 4(9), 606–610.
- ⁷¹⁵ Myhre, G., D. Shindell, F. Bréon, W. Collins, J. Fuglestvedt, J. Huang, D. Koch, J. Lamar-
- que, D. Lee, B. Mendoza, T. Nakajima, A. Robock, G. Stephens, T. Takemura, and
- H. Zhang (2013), IPCC, 2013: Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science Basis. Con-
- ⁷¹⁸ tribution of Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental
- Panel on Climate Change, chap. 8 Anthropogenic and Natural Radiative Forcing, Cam bridge University Press.
- Nightingale, P. D., G. Malin, C. S. Law, A. J. Watson, P. S. Liss, M. I. Liddicoat,
 J. Boutin, and R. C. Upstill-Goddard (2000), In situ evaluation of air-sea gas exchange
 parameterizations using novel conservative and volatile tracers, *Global Biogeochemical Cycles*, 14(1), 373–387.
- ⁷²⁵ Obata, A., and Y. Kitamura (2003), Interannual variability of the sea-air exchange of CO_2 ⁷²⁶ from 1961 to 1998 simulated with a global ocean circulation-biogeochemistry model, ⁷²⁷ Journal of Geophysical research, 108(C11), 3337.
- Prytherch, J., M. J. Yelland, R. W. Pascal, B. I. Moat, I. Skjelvan, and M. A. Srokosz
 (2010), Open ocean gas transfer velocity derived from long-term direct measurements
 of the CO₂ flux, *Geophysical Research Letters*, 37(23).
- Riahi, K., S. Rao, V. Krey, C. Cho, V. Chirkov, G. Fischer, G. Kindermann, N. Nakicenovic, and P. Rafaj (2011), RCP 8.5—a scenario of comparatively high greenhouse gas
- $_{733}$ emissions, *Climatic Change*, 109(1-2), 33-57.

DRAFT April 13, 2016, 11:39am DRAFT

- Rödenbeck, C., D. C. Bakker, N. Metzl, A. Olsen, C. Sabine, N. Cassar, F. Reum,
 R. Keeling, and M. Heimann (2014), Interannual sea–air CO₂ flux variability from
 an observation-driven ocean mixed-layer scheme, *Biogeosciences*, 11, 4599–4613.
- ⁷³⁷ Sabine, C. L., R. A. Feely, N. Gruber, R. M. Key, K. Lee, J. L. Bullister, R. Wanninkhof,
- C. Wong, D. W. Wallace, B. Tilbrook, et al. (2004), The oceanic sink for anthropogenic
 CO₂, Science, 305(5682), 367–371.
- Takahashi, T., S. C. Sutherland, R. Wanninkhof, C. Sweeney, R. A. Feely, D. W. Chipman, B. Hales, G. Friederich, F. Chavez, C. Sabine, A. Watson, D. C. Bakker, U. Schus-
- ter, N. Metzl, H. Yoshikawa-Inoue, M. Ishii, T. Midorikawa, Y. Nojiri, A. Körtzinger,
- T. Steinhoff, M. Hoppema, J. Olafsson, T. S. Arnarson, B. Tilbrook, T. Johannessen,
- A. Olsen, R. Bellerby, C. Wong, B. Delille, N. Bates, and H. J. de Baar (2009), Climatological mean and decadal change in surface ocean pCO₂, and net sea-air CO₂ flux
 over the global oceans, *Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography*,
 56(8-10), 554 577, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.dsr2.2008.12.009, surface Ocean
- ⁷⁴⁸ CO2 Variability and Vulnerabilities.
- Taylor, K. E., R. J. Stouffer, and G. A. Meehl (2012), An overview of CMIP5 and the
 experiment design, *Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society*, 93(4), 485–498.
- Thoning, K., D. R. Kitzis, and A. Crotwell (2014), Atmospheric Carbon Dioxide Dry Air
 Mole Fractions from quasi-continuous measurements at Mauna Loa, Hawaii., 2014-08
 ed., National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA), Earth System Research Laboratory (ESRL), Global Monitoring Division (GMD), Boulder, Colorado,
 USA, doi:10.7289/V54X55RG.

- Timmermann, R., H. Goosse, G. Madec, T. Fichefet, C. Ethe, and V. Duliere (2005),
 On the representation of high latitude processes in the ORCA-LIM global coupled sea
- ice-ocean model, Ocean Modelling, 8(1), 175-201.
- ⁷⁵⁹ Wanninkhof, R. (1992), Relationship between wind speed and gas exchange over the ⁷⁶⁰ ocean, *Journal of Geophysical Research: Oceans (1978–2012)*, *97*(C5), 7373–7382.
- ⁷⁶¹ Wanninkhof, R. (2014), Relationship between wind speed and gas exchange over the ocean
 ⁷⁶² revisited, *Limnology and Oceanography: Methods*, 12(6), 351–362.
- Wanninkhof, R., S. C. Doney, T. Takahashi, and W. R. McGillis (2002), The effect of using
 time-averaged winds on regional air-sea CO₂ fluxes, *Gas transfer at water surfaces*, pp.
- ⁷⁶⁶ Wanninkhof, R., W. E. Asher, D. T. Ho, C. Sweeney, and W. R. McGillis (2009), Advances
 ⁷⁶⁷ in quantifying air-sea gas exchange and environmental forcing, *Marine Science*, 1.
- ⁷⁶⁸ Wanninkhof, R., G. H. Park, T. Takahashi, C. Sweeney, R. Feely, Y. Nojiri, N. Gru-
- ber, S. C. Doney, G. A. McKinley, A. Lenton, C. Le Quéré, C. Heinze, J. Schwinger,
- H. Graven, and S. Khatiwala (2013), Global ocean carbon uptake: magnitude, variabil-
- ity and trends, *Biogeosciences*, 10(3), 1983–2000, doi:10.5194/bg-10-1983-2013.
- Weiss, R. (1974), Carbon dioxide in water and seawater: the solubility of a non-ideal gas,
 Marine Chemistry, 2(3), 203-215.
- Welch, P. (1967), The use of Fast Fourier Transform for the estimation of power spectra: a
 method based on time averaging over short, modified periodograms, *IEEE Transactions*on Audio and Electroacoustics, pp. 70–73.
- ⁷⁷⁷ Woolf, D. K. (2005), Parametrization of gas transfer velocities and sea-state-dependent ⁷⁷⁸ wave breaking, *Tellus B*, 57(2), 87–94.

April 13, 2016, 11:39am

351 - 356.

765

- 779 Yool, A., E. Popova, and T. Anderson (2013a), MEDUSA-2.0: an intermediate com-
- ₇₈₀ plexity biogeochemical model of the marine carbon cycle for climate change and ocean
- acidification studies, *Geoscientific Model Development*, *6*, 1767–1811.
- Yool, A., E. Popova, A. Coward, D. Bernie, and T. Anderson (2013b), Climate change
- ⁷⁸³ and ocean acidification impacts on lower trophic levels and the export of organic carbon
- to the deep ocean, Biogeosciences, 10, 5831–5854.

7. Tables and Figure Captions

 Table 1. Comparison of global interannual variability (RMS or Standard Deviation of monthly

 CO2 flux anomalies) from various studies

Variability (Pg C yr^{-1})	Approach	Time Period	Reference
0.20	Model	1979-1997	[Le Quéré et al., 2000]
0.23	Model	1961-1998	[Obata and Kitamura, 2003]
0.28	Model	1980-1998	[McKinley et al., 2004]
0.34	Model	1979-2004	[Doney et al., 2009]
0.20	Obs and Model	1990-2009	[Wanninkhof et al., 2013]
0.31	Observations	1993-2008	[Rödenbeck et al., 2014]
0.12	Observations	1998-2011	[Landschützer et al., 2014]
0.29	Model	1980-2009	This Study



Figure 1. Annual mean atmospheric pCO_2 (a) and Sea Surface Temperature (SST, b) for the anthropogenic (green) and control (red) runs, for 1950-2099 (model year 1 is 1860)

April 13, 2016, 11:39am



Figure 2. a) LDEO climatological flux of CO_2 into the ocean for the reference year 2000, positive values indicating ocean uptake of gas, [*Takahashi et al.*, 2009], b) Modelled mean CO_2 flux over 1995-2005 for the anthropogenic run, c) LDEO versus modelled North Atlantic climatological CO_2 flux (mol C m⁻² yr⁻¹)

April 13, 2016, 11:39am



Figure 3. Comparison of data from the SOCAT database and output from the anthropogenic run. a) Coverage of SOCAT monthly mean fCO_2 values 2002-2011, orange squares: locations of comparison regions, orange cross: location of BATS site. b), d) and f), Monthly mean fCO_2 climatologies for the three comparison regions (high-latitude, mid-latitude and subtropical, respectively) for 2002-2011: for SOCAT (blue) and NEMO-MEDUSA (orange). c), e) and g), frequency spectra of monthly fCO_2 anomalies, smoothed with a 5 point running mean



Figure 4. Comparison of (from top to bottom) Temperature, Salinity, Alkalinity and fCO_2 from BATS, Bermuda (blue) with corresponding NEMO-MEDUSA anthropogenic run output (orange). a), c), e) and g), Climatological monthly means for 1991-2011. b), d), f) and h), 5 point smoothed frequency spectra of monthly anomalies for 1991-2011

April 13, 2016, 11:39am



Figure 5. Comparison of wind variability from the CCMP wind product ([*Atlas et al.*, 2011]) and the anthropogenic run. a) Division of zones. b), d), f) and h), Monthly mean wind speed climatologies for the four zonal areas (Polar, Subpolar, Subtropical and Equatorial, respectively) for 1988-2011: for CCMP (blue) and NEMO-MEDUSA (orange). c), e), g) and i), frequency spectra of monthly wind speed anomalies, smoothed with a 5 point running mean

April 13, 2016, 11:39am



Figure 6. Interannual CO₂ flux variability as the RMS of deseasonalised monthly anomalies (a) and contributions of Δp CO₂, k, α and cross terms (b to e) to interannual variability in the CO₂ flux for the period 1980-2009 of the anthropogenic run, as in equation (11)

April 13, 2016, 11:39am



Figure 7. North Atlantic zones (a) and their period spectra of zonally averaged CO_2 flux (blue), and the contribution to flux variability from k (red) for in the anthropogenic run, 1950-2099 (b-e). The dark coloured lines denote best estimates of spectra, lighter shaded regions show the spectra within 95% confidence. Vertical dashed lines indicate the critical timescale: the shortest timescale that for all longer timescales, the best estimate of CO_2 flux variability is at least twice as large as that of k

April 13, 2016, 11:39am



Figure 8. Largest timescale of CO₂ flux variability for which the contribution of k is nonnegligible, beyond which variability is dominated by $\Delta p \text{CO}_2$ for the anthropogenic (a) and control (b) runs. Shades of purple indicate this timescale, orange areas show where $\Delta p \text{CO}_2$ never dominates on the longest timescales and white non-Atlantic areas are out of bounds. Colors inside the three black squares in a) show the timescale derived using observations in the same locations as Figure 3 (CCMP winds [Atlas et al., 2011], SOCAT oceanic $p\text{CO}_2$ [Bakker et al., 2014], MLO atmospheric $p\text{CO}_2$ [Thoning et al., 2014], and EN4 SST [Good et al., 2013])

April 13, 2016, 11:39am



Figure 9. Evaluation of flux estimation applied to the anthropogenic (a-c) and control (d-f) runs, 1950-2099. a) and d), correlation between modelled and estimated fluxes (all values are >95% significance). b) and e), RMS of modelled CO₂ flux anomalies (a measure of variability). c) and f), ratio between estimated and modelled CO₂ flux RMS (the proportion of variability captured by the estimation)

April 13, 2016, 11:39am